

Bedouin Women in the Naqab, Israel: Ongoing Transformation

By Marcy M. Wells

Since its inception in 1948, the state of Israel has based development plans on an agenda of nation-building that has systematically excluded Palestinian Arab citizens such as the indigenous Bedouin. Policies of relocation, resettlement, and restructuring have been imposed on the Bedouin, forcing them from their ancestral lands and lifestyle in the Naqab (or Negev, as it is called in Hebrew) desert of southern Israel. The rapid and involuntary transition from self-sufficient, semi-nomadic, pastoral life to sedentarization and modernization has resulted in dependency on a state that treats the Bedouin as minority outsiders through unjust social, political, and economic structures. The exclusionary and discriminatory policies and practices of the state have brought poverty and degradation to the Bedouin, rather than the improved quality of life and higher standards of living normally associated with modernization. The Bedouin population has the lowest socio-economic status within Israel. This has been particularly harmful to Bedouin women, for whom modernization has resulted in greater social restrictions and loss of power. Thus, Bedouin women face overlapping forms of discrimination. For them, the policies of the state have become an instrument of oppression in both the public and private spheres.

About 75,000 Bedouins (half the population) live in one of seven villages that were established by the state with the intention of concentrating the Bedouin into urban centers. These villages were designed without the participation or consultation of the intended inhabitants, and with a complete lack of consideration for cultural norms and historic living patterns. In these villages, women suffer from deprivation of essential services and adequate housing, exclusion from development plans, and cultural norms that do not permit them to work outside of the home. These seven towns rank the poorest in all of Israel.

The other half of the Bedouin population lives in one of approximately forty-five villages that are either long-established Bedouin communities or that were developed by the Bedouin after they were forced off of their ancestral lands. These villages are not recognized by the state and therefore have no access to public services; they do not appear on official maps, are subject to demolitions by the state, and are not allowed representation in government. In these unrecognized villages, women do not have access to basic services and are not allowed by the state to own property, to have permanent homes, or even to list their places of residence on I.D. cards. Additionally, there is no official local government for which to vote or run for office. Because the residential location of Bedouin families is normally chosen by the husband, a woman has little say in whether she lives in an unrecognized village. Nevertheless, women are most affected by the lack of services in these villages.

In the private sphere, the denial of the right to adequate housing has had a devastating effect on women. Though Bedouin society has traditionally been patriarchal, women once enjoyed a level of authority associated with their clearly defined and essential roles. Historically, Bedouin residences were tents that were designed, built, and maintained by women. Female and male living quarters were separated and women had sole responsibility for running the home. Tribes lived separately from one another, preventing interaction between women and men of different tribes. Yet, in the government-developed towns, multiple tribes are consolidated in the same village. To avoid

encountering men of different tribes, women are confined to the home. The new homes are designed without separate quarters for women and have a single entrance. If a male from another tribe enters through the doorway, a woman has no way of exiting the home and no female quarters to which she can retreat. Consequently, women exist in the periphery of their own homes.

In unrecognized villages, tin shacks have now replaced tents as the most common housing structure. In the process, the design and construction has become a responsibility of men. Through this transfer of responsibility, the home has now become dominated by men, leaving no space under the control of women. Thus, what was once a woman's domain has become a new structure of oppression. A more extreme violation of the right to adequate housing takes place through state directed demolitions of non-permitted homes. These demolitions (which have included entire villages so that Jewish settlements can be erected on the site) frequently occur without notice, provision, or recourse for the dispossessed, leaving women in an even more vulnerable position.

The right to water and the right to grow food are other human rights that Israel does not uphold for its Bedouin citizens. Though Israel has highly technical water management capabilities and a developed water economy, the state primarily reserves its resources for Jewish-Israeli citizens. While 99% of Israel's total population has access to modern water services, these benefits are not enjoyed by the inhabitants of the unrecognized Bedouin villages (Keinan 2005). Citizens of these villages are not permitted to connect to running water systems or to irrigate their crops – which are often systematically destroyed by the state – while Jewish landowners who farm ancestral Bedouin land have broad access to water. Crop destruction has taken place through such excessive measures as aerial spraying of herbicides without warning – and without regard for the health risks to those caught in the spray, even when the victims are children.

Modernization, in combination with inadequate housing and infrastructure, has exposed women to new health hazards in the form of chemicals, pesticides, and improperly disposed waste. The polluting industries and power lines that have been placed in or near the unrecognized villages further compromise the health of the women residing there. Yet health care is unavailable in the unrecognized villages and most female residents lack transportation to the limited health care offered in the recognized villages. Mental health care is even scarcer, despite high rates of depression and other mental illnesses among Bedouin women. Where care does exist, utilization is low due to the cultural inappropriateness of the care provided and the stigmatization of mental illness that still prevails in Bedouin culture. While a positive that may be linked to modernization is the apparent disappearance of female genital mutilation from the Naqab, domestic abuse poses a genuine threat to the well-being of many young Bedouin women. The minimal availability of support services means that few women receive assistance.

The educational system in Israel further exemplifies the institutionalized discrimination and exclusionary practices against the Bedouin. Though the government is mandated to provide free, compulsory education for all citizens, this responsibility is sorely neglected in the case of the Bedouin, particularly those in unrecognized villages, where there are only sixteen primary schools and two secondary schools serving the forty-five villages. In order to access education for their children, many families must move to one of the recognized villages. In this way, education is used as a tool to relocate the Bedouin to state-sanctioned towns. The Israeli school system is ethnically segregated and the disparate allocation of resources to Bedouin schools combined with the poor

quality of the curriculum serves to subjugate the Bedouin to a privileged Jewish-Israeli class. Thus, education perpetuates the inequalities and discrimination inherent in the Israeli socio-economic structure.

The state's practice of using education as a means for control and suppression, rather than for the sake of developing the individual as a human being, is especially harmful to Bedouin women. Because the Bedouin schools are designed without regard for cultural norms, such as segregation by gender, the majority of girls drop out of school when they reach puberty, if they enroll at all. The overall dropout rate for Bedouin females is 67%, with some schools having rates as high as 100% (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2006). Female honor, which Bedouin culture values more highly than formal education, is considered compromised by interaction with male classmates. An education system that fails to take this into account cannot serve the needs of Bedouin women.

The low rate of secondary school completion contributes to the underrepresentation of Bedouin women in higher education. As of 1998, only twelve Bedouin women had completed a bachelor's degree (Abu-Rabia-Queder, 2007). For those who do attend university, the transition to the modern, liberal, individualist Israeli-Jewish society, followed by post-education re-integration into the collective, traditional Bedouin society can be alienating and traumatizing. The women are often required to put aside the personal preferences and intentions developed at university and must attempt to reconcile their new identities with the restrictions of the traditional Bedouin feminine model, which include few personal freedoms and the prospect of arranged marriages. Women cope with the cognitive dissonance in different ways and a common response is the sacrifice of emotions for independence or for re-integration into the tribe.

Despite the fact that Bedouin women in the Naqab are denied the simple dignities that are the birthright of all people, the agency of Bedouin women, and indeed of the Bedouin population as a whole, to affect change should not be underestimated. The very existence of the unrecognized villages attests to Bedouin self-determination, resistance to the state and collective goals. The recent development of a collective Arab identity is connecting Bedouins to the larger Israeli-Palestinian struggle and the Bedouin are self-advocating, mobilizing and developing new networks. Greater numbers of Bedouin women are training to become teachers and are raising social questions that have not previously been on the agenda and which will undoubtedly enrich the education system and its outcomes. The proliferation of non-governmental and civil society organizations is challenging traditional structures of power, both internal and external to Bedouin society, and is creating new spaces for women's involvement in the movement towards a more just social, political, and economic future.

Annotations

Alexander, E. R. 2007. "Planning Rights in Theory and Practice: The Case of Israel." *International Planning Studies* 12 (1): 3-19.

Annotation: Written by a member of an Israeli advocacy planning organization, *Bimkom*, this article is an excellent resource for the consideration of planning rights at both the conceptual

and practical levels, with specific application to planning rights in Israel. The article includes a detailed table showing the normative principle underlying each right (such as human dignity, social justice, and equality), the interpretation and status of the right in Israel, and the governmental authority for ensuring fulfillment of each right. The author raises a series of issues, such as the relationship between planning and property rights, that provide important material for consideration and discussion. The author notes that Israel makes exceptions in its non-discrimination policy to specifically discriminate against the Bedouin through the planning process.

Al-Krenawi, Alean. 2003. "Cross-Cultural Psychotherapy with Indigenous Peoples: The Bedouin Arab Case." In The Future of Indigenous People's: Strategies for Survival and Development. Edited by Duane Champagne and Ismael Abu-Saad. Los Angeles: UCLA American Indian Studies Center. 153-174.

Annotation: The accelerated and volatile shift to modernization has resulted in an array of issues for the Bedouin in Israel. Among these are the problems of well-being, mental and physical health. The author notes that the Bedouin are caught in the tension between localization and globalization as they attempt to preserve their culture and yet cannot avoid the influences of modern, Western values. In this chapter, the author discusses the psychosocial development of individuals in Bedouin society and the implications for psychotherapy. He concludes with the recommendation that human service providers to the Bedouin must develop cultural competency to in order to effectively meet the needs of their clients.

Al-Krenawi, Alean. and Graham, John R. 2006. "A Comparative Study of Family Functioning, Health, and Mental Health Awareness and Utilization Among Female Bedouin-Arabs from Recognized and Unrecognized Villages in the Negev." *Health Care for Women International* 27: 182-196.

Annotation: This article analyzes Bedouin women's sense of well-being and the relationship to their utilization of health and mental health services in the Negev region of Israel. The information in this article is based on a study that shows significant differences in the awareness and use of women residing in villages recognized, and therefore serviced, by the Israeli state and of women residing in unrecognized villages. The authors offer suggestions for improving the quality and accessibility of health services. The information would be helpful for anyone concerned about the condition of Bedouin women in the Negev region. It would be particularly helpful to those interested in policy regarding the design of mental health services for Bedouin societies and for practitioners who seek to better understand the significance of service utilization factors for Bedouin women.

———. 2008. "Localizing Social Work with Bedouin-Arab Communities in Israel: Limitations and Possibilities." In Indigenous Social Work Around the World: Towards culturally relevant

education and service. Edited by Mel Grey, John Coates, and Michael Yellow Bird. Hampshire: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

Annotation: The authors of this chapter have both been engaged in social work with Bedouin communities and offer a valuable perspective on the nature and value of social work in the Negev. They give careful treatment of the two prevailing narratives of the contested land in the Negev, placing the struggle in the broader context of colonialism. The authors propose that social work in the region should be oriented towards social and political change and suggest that spirituality can be used to localize social work. The issue of how to approach social work for the Bedouin is the focus of the article and the authors raise pertinent questions of how to promote genuine social change, emancipation, and politicized social work without supporting violent responses to oppression.

Abu-Lughod, Lila. 2009. "Dialects of Women's Empowerment: The International Circuitry of the *Arab Human Development Report 2005*." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 41: 83–103.

Annotation: In this essay, Abu-Lughod addresses problems with the language and perspective of the United Nations Development Programme's report *The Arab Human Development Report 2005: Towards the Rise of Women in Arab World*. She uses this report as a means of reflecting on a broader set of questions regarding the problematic ways in which Arab women's interests are framed by the transnational conversation on women's rights and empowerment. In this essay, the author raises pertinent questions on the discourse of women's rights and advancement and, though it does not attempt to resolve those questions, it would be of interest to those concerned with the rise of women in the Arab world.

Abu-Rabia-Queder, S. 2006. "Between tradition and modernization: understanding the problem of female Bedouin dropouts." *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 27(1): 3-17.

Annotation: This article provides an overview and brief analysis of gender and modernization discourse in traditional societies and asserts that this discourse falls short when applied to the unusual situation of Bedouin women in the Negev desert in Israel. Problematically, modernization efforts that do not recognize the unique needs of women ultimately fail to improve women's status and emancipation. The author believes that the Israeli educational system has failed Bedouin women in this way. In light of this, she calls for a post-modernist approach that embeds feminine traditional values in development in the Negev. The article reports on and discusses the findings of a study that draws on personal interviews with young women in the Negev who experienced the school system and compares the perspectives, experiences, and influencing factors of women who were able to stay in school and those who dropped out.

———. 2007. "Coping with 'forbidden love' and loveless marriage: Educated Bedouin women from the Negev." *Ethnography* 8: 297-323.

Annotation: This article reports on and discusses the findings of a study of the experiences of Bedouin women in the Negev who were the first of their tribes to be educated at institutions of higher learning. Conducted from a feminist perspective, the study explores the difficulties that educated women face as they returned to their tribe after completing their education. Many of them face the prospect of arranged marriages. Based on personal interviews, this article is important because it includes individual narratives and is the first of its kind to investigate the practical and emotional implications of higher education for romantic relationships, marriage, and family life for Bedouin women. This article has special value since the author is, herself, an educated Bedouin woman from the Negev whose experiences are similar to those of the women she interviewed for the study. This connection allows the author to draw out information and personal histories that may have otherwise been inaccessible.

Abu-Saad, Ismael. 2004. "Education as a Tool of Expulsion from the Unrecognized Villages." *Adalah's Newsletter of the Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel* 8: 1-5.

Annotation: Abu-Saad asserts that the state of Israel uses public education as yet another means of controlling and oppressing the Arab Bedouins in the Negev. The Bedouin are treated as minority outsiders by the state and governmental policy serves to subjugate Bedouins to the Jewish majority. Because education is largely unavailable in the unrecognized villages, the Bedouin are coerced into relocating to the state-sanctioned areas in order to access the schools. Yet these schools fail to prepare Bedouin children for success in Israeli society. The author makes a convincing case, drawing on statistical information to compare conditions for Bedouin and Jewish Israelis and on theories of educational equity to highlight the injustices in the treatment of the Bedouin in Israel.

———. 2006. "Bedouin Arabs in Israel: Education, Political Control and Social Change." In The Education of Nomadic Peoples: Current Issues, Future Prospects. Berghahn Books. Edited by Caroline Dyer. New York: Berghahn Books.

Annotation: Abu-Saad is the founder and director of the Center for Bedouin Studies at Ben Gurion University of the Negev, Israel. In this chapter, he provides an overview of historical methods of education within the Bedouin community as well as the development of the state's modern education system, which the author claims does not prepare Bedouin students for integration into modern Israeli society. Instead, the system promotes an educational hierarchy that privileges Jewish-Israeli students and does not incorporate multicultural theory. The poverty and degradation experienced by the Bedouin is the adverse outcome of an intentionally exclusive educational system. The author concludes that, as a liberal society that claims to support the education and development of all citizens, Israel must fulfill its responsibility by developing a new approach to education that the Bedouins have an equal role in shaping and that allows them to enjoy the full rights to which they are entitled as citizens.

Arab Association for Human Rights. "By All Means Possible: Destruction by the State of Crops of Bedouin Citizens in the Naqab (Negev) by Aerial Spraying with Chemicals". Press Release, July 12, 2004. Available online: www.caiaweb.org/files/aahra-negev.pdf.

Annotation: This press release details incidences of destruction of Bedouin crops by the state of Israel. The authors of the press release draw on the expertise of two Israeli scientists to confirm the serious long- and short-term health threats associated with the aerial spraying of the herbicide, Roundup. The residual nature of the product means that it lingers in the contaminated area and victims suffer prolonged exposure. Administrators of the spraying ignore the presence of humans in the spray area – including settlements and individuals working in the fields. The devastating effects on livestock demonstrate how dangerous this chemical is; in one instance, 150 goats died and 400 goats miscarried pregnancies after consuming produce polluted by Roundup. The author is an Israeli who contributes his expertise to show how Israel is violating its own environmental laws through the destruction of crops in this manner.

Brooks, D. B. 2007. "Human Rights to Water in North Africa and the Middle East: What is New and What is Not; What is Important and What is Not." *International Journal of Water Resources Development* 23(2): 227-241.

Annotation: In this article, the author uses the disciplines of hydrology, geography, economics and political science to provide boundaries to the discussion of the human right to water in the Middle East and North Africa. He dismisses, as unproductive digressions in the conversation, the two common questions of whether water is a commodity or whether it should be privatized. He posits that it is more useful to approach water as a necessary requirement for the widely recognized rights to grow food and to live in a viable environment and suggests effective ways to make use of these arguments. This piece is designed to stimulate thinking on this topic, rather than to provide definitive answers. Though the author only briefly mentions water resources in the case of Bedouins specifically, this article is helpful for understanding water issues in the region and, therefore, for realizing the human rights implications of water policy and practice for the Bedouin people.

Elbedour, Salman et al. 2006. "The scope of sexual, physical, and psychological abuse in a Bedouin-Arab community of female adolescents: The interplay of racism, urbanization, polygamy, family honor, and the social marginalization of women." *Child Abuse & Neglect* 30(6): 215-229.

Annotation: Written by a team of five professors with an array of academic backgrounds from both the United States and from Israel, this report draws from an exploratory study of the abuse of female adolescents in a conservative and traditional Palestinian Arab Bedouin community in southern Israel. Though child abuse has become a global concern and a topic of scholarly and public awareness, there has been very little research that takes into account the cultural variables of the Middle East. This study addresses a topic that has never before been fully investigated – the maltreatment of females in a conservative, tribal Arab community. Although this was an

exploratory study that may not reflect the full scope of the problem, the results attest that female abuse is a serious social problem in this community and that the rate of abuse exceeds that of other Palestinian groups. These findings demonstrate an immediate need for professional intervention and prevention, though the authors do not make recommendations for ways to address this problem.

Gan-Mor, Gil. 2008. "Real Estate or Rights: Housing Rights and Government Policy in Israel An English Summary of ACRI's Report on the Right to Housing." Available online: www.acri.org.il/pdf/state2008.pdf.

Annotation: In this report summary, the author gives definition and meaning to the term 'right to adequate housing', differentiating it from property rights. He makes the compelling case that housing rights are indeed human rights. This perspective of housing rights is essential to those seeking to understand the situation of the Bedouin in Israel. The author gives detailed reports of the housing issues facing various demographics in Israel. He also reviews the state's policies and provisions and asserts that there are myriad violations of the right to housing, in both the public and private sectors, and in the rental and property markets.

Gruenberg, Yehuda. 2009. "Not All Who Wander Should Be Lost: The Rights of Indigenous Bedouins in the Modern State of Israel." *Brooklyn Journal of International Law* 24(1): 185-204.

Annotation: The author argues that Israel has an ethical and legal imperative to uphold the rights of all Israeli citizens, and to rectify the historic maltreatment of indigenous Arab Bedouins. The article examines the implications of international law, Israeli domestic law, and Jewish religious law and calls on Israeli citizens, as members of a democratic state, to hold their government accountable for its systematic mistreatment of the Bedouin people. He asserts that equitable treatment of Bedouins as an ethnic minority is not only necessary to Israel's legitimacy as a democratic state, but is also an essential component to lasting peace between Israel and the Arab world. The majority of the article is dedicated to examining the legal basis for the protection of human rights and concludes with advocating full realization of rights for Bedouin citizens.

Halila, Suhil, RH Belmaker, Yunis Abu Rabia, Miron Froimovici, and Julia Applebaum. 2009. "Disappearance of female genital mutilation from the Bedouin population of Southern Israel." *Journal of Sexual Medicine* 6(1):70-3.

Annotation: The authors of this article conducted a survey of the Bedouin population in the Negev desert of Israel to determine the prevalence of female genital mutilation. The study focused on tribes that had been found to practice female genital mutilation in a similar study conducted by these same authors in 1995. The authors conclude that the practice of female genital mutilation has disappeared in the Bedouin population in the Negev. They suggest that this might be a result of the Westernization and modernization of the Bedouin, and the

associated improvements in health care and education. They do not, however, offer conclusive evidence that these are factors.

Human Rights Watch. 2008. "Off the Map: Land and Housing Rights Violations in Israel's Unrecognized Bedouin Villages." Volume 20, No. 5 (E). Available online: <http://www.hrw.org/en/reports/2008/03/30/map-0>.

Annotation: With this publication, Human Rights Watch offers an extensive 130 page report of the disastrous effects of Israel's discriminatory policies towards the Bedouin. The report includes well-documented evidence of violations of the right to adequate housing, including sample administrative and judicial demolition orders, and a table of home demolition statistics that tallies the number of homes by year and by village. Reviews of recent practices of other governments in other countries to address indigenous land claims provide informative comparisons. The final portion of the report offers detailed recommendations to institutional bodies of the United Nations, to the United States and other donors, and to administrations of the Israeli government. This often cited report is a reliable, indispensable source of information.

Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada. 2008. "Israel: Situation of Bedouin women, including whether they can live and be accepted in Jewish communities outside of Bedouin villages; protection available to Bedouin women victims of domestic violence or of honour crimes including whether there are any shelters to help them." Available online: <http://www.unhcr.org/refworld/docid/49b92b405.html>.

Annotation: This report draws on an array of studies, articles, interviews, reports and organizations to provide an overview of key issues faced by Arab Bedouin women in the Negev region of Israel. This resource is helpful for obtaining information regarding poverty rates, domestic violence, access to and participation in social services, participation in the labor force, health care and maternal health, and housing and accommodation rights. The authors do not attempt to interpret the information nor do they make recommendations on how the issues should be addressed. Rather, the findings are presented in an objective manner with the disclaimer that it is not intended to serve as conclusive evidence. The report concludes with a helpful list of resources for further information on the topic.

Keinan, Tamar. 2005. "Water Justice: Water as a Human Right in Israel." *Global Issue Papers*, 15. Available online: www.foeme.org/index_images/dinamicas/publications/publ31_1.

Annotation: Published by the Heinrich Boll Foundation, a non-profit that is affiliated with the German Green Party and that has an office in Tel Aviv, and Friends of the Earth Middle East, a grassroots environmental organization, this paper presents information provided by Israeli non-governmental organizations regarding water usage and management in Israel. Providing extensive analysis of water sources, regulations, and access, the authors show that there is great disparity between the water rights enjoyed by Jewish-Israeli citizens and Bedouin-Israeli citizens.

The authors use the criteria established by the United Nations to determine that the Israeli state is in violation of the Bedouin population's human right to water.

Law-Yone, Hubert. 2003. "From Sedentarization to Urbanization: State Policy towards Bedouin Society in Israel." In The Future of Indigenous People's: Strategies for Survival and Development. Edited by Duane Champagne and Ismael Abu-Saad. Los Angeles: UCLA American Indian Studies Center. 175-183.

Annotation: This chapter provides an in-depth look at the Israeli state's policies toward the Bedouin, exploring the range of issues that prompted the flawed and failed sedentarization and urbanization attempts. The author makes an interesting note regarding nomenclature: since all the Bedouin in Israel have been sedentarized, the term "Bedouin" is no longer a technically correct name and its use has sometimes been considered patronizing or a challenge to the Bedouin's Arab-Palestinian identity. The author felt it necessary to continue using the term in order to preserve the historical context of Bedouin identity and the social transformation that they have undergone.

Lithwick, Harvey. 2003. Urbanization Policy for Indigenous Peoples: A Case Study of Israel's Negev Bedouin. In The Future of Indigenous People's: Strategies for Survival and Development. Edited by Duane Champagne and Ismael Abu-Saad. Los Angeles: UCLA American Indian Studies Center. 184 – 202.

Annotation: With the intention of informing policy decision-making, the author of this chapter provides detailed documentation of the negative outcomes of Israel's policy of modernization and sedentarization of the Negev Bedouin and outlines several reasons why Israel's approach to the Bedouin was doomed to failure. He also reminds the reader that it is important not to condemn all Israeli administrators because of the flaws in the system, which is the fault of the powerful centralized government. There are administrators who are genuinely concerned with improving conditions for the Bedouin and are working to affect positive change. He challenges the notion, on lack of evidence, that one of the reasons the state set out to urbanize the Bedouin was to create a concentrated proletariat labor force.

Meallem, Ilana and Garb, Yaakov. "The exposure to Bedouin Women to Waste Related Hazards: Gender, Toxins and Multiple Marginality in the Negev (Israel)." *Women & Environments*, Fall/Winter 2008. 44-48.

Annotation: The authors of this article describe the development and implications of a major waste management problem in the Negev. This problem is largely attributed to the modernization and marginalization of the Bedouin in combination with oppressive conditions for women. In the traditional Bedouin lifestyle, virtually no waste was produced. As the Bedouin have become sedentarized and engaged in consumer behavior, there has been a sharp increase in the amount of solid, toxic waste produced. In both the recognized and unrecognized villages,

waste disposal services do not exist or are inadequate. Because of the gendered division of labor in Bedouin society, women are primarily responsible for waste removal and, lacking the means to dispose of it properly, they often resort to burning the waste, exposing themselves to toxins, chemicals and degraded environments. Using waste hazards as a metaphor for the social conditions experience by Bedouin women, the authors advocate for equity and recognition as a solution to the issues.

Meir, Avinoam. 2005. "Bedouin, the Israeli state and insurgent planning: Globalization, localization or glocalization?" *Cities* 22(3): 201-215.

Annotation: The author of this article examines the Bedouin planning process of the unrecognized villages in the Negev and suggests that the process is a localized response to the forces of globalization. Through unauthorized 'insurgent' planning, the Bedouin challenge the planning practices of the state. The author discusses a development plan for the Negev devised by the Bedouin and identifies three elements that amount to insurgent planning: resistance, resilience and reconstruction. The author shows how the Bedouin call on their local culture to inform both their engagement with the unavoidable impacts of globalization and their approach to planning in the modernized, westernized Israeli society.

Pessate-Shubert, Anat. 2005. "Retelling Herstory: to be a female Bedouin teacher differently." *Comparative Education* 41(3): 247-266.

Annotation: Using the personal stories of Bedouin women in training to be teachers, the author explores the emerging position of women in Bedouin society. After outlining the Bedouin transition to modernity and the ensuing loss of power for Bedouin women, the author suggests factors that may have contributed to the prevailing silence surrounding the experiences of Bedouin women. She contends that the academic discourse has emphasized the foreignness of Western education for the Bedouin and should move beyond the discussion of limited 'traditional and modern' or 'Jewish and Bedouin' binaries to a fuller discussion that considers the personal histories of educated Bedouin women. Accordingly, the author relays and discusses the findings of a study aimed at discovering the individual perspectives and experiences of Bedouin women as they prepare to enter the teaching field. Importantly, the study finds that the women teachers are raising new questions which challenge the traditional teaching practices and structures of power within the educational system.

Qupty , Maha. 2007. "Between Segregated inclusion, Transfer and Concentration." The Regional Council of the Palestinian Bedouin Unrecognized Villages. Available online: <http://www.docstoc.com/docs/42317924/Regional-council-of-the-Palestinian-Bedouin-of-the--Office-of-the>.

Annotation: Maha Quity is a representative of the Regional Council of the Palestinian Bedouin Unrecognized Villages (RCUV) and in this report he makes recommendations to the Israeli Minority Affairs Working Group for specific actions that the RCUV would like to see taken by the government to redress the devastating effects of the state's development policy in the Naqab. The author draws attention to Israel's practices towards the Bedouin and emphasizes areas where the state is violating its own declaration on minority rights. It concludes with a set of recommendations designed by the RCUV. This report offers an example of the self-advocacy and community organizing work that is being done by the Bedouin.

Ratcliffe, Richard. 2009. "The Battle for Recognition: Civil Society, Citizenship, and the Political Rise of the Negev Bedouin." In Civil Organizations and Protest Movements in Israel: Mobilization around the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict. Edited by Elisabeth Marteu. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Annotation: The development of new organizations, advocacy and activist groups has increased the prominence of the Bedouin in Israel. According to the author, this has also contributed to a more democratic Bedouin society as new spaces open up for leadership. Participation in movements around issues of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict has contributed to the development of a stronger Palestinian identity for the Bedouin, prompting them to assert themselves as a national minority group. In this chapter, the author highlights the increased inclusion and participation of the Bedouin in local governments and asserts that these are the signs of new approaches to the continued struggle for civil equity.

Swirski, Shlomo and Yael Hasson. 2006. "Invisible Citizens: Israeli Government Policy Toward the Negev Bedouin: Executive Summary." Available online: www.adva.org/uploaded/NegevEnglishSummary.pdf.

Annotation: The report opens with a brief, but useful, history of the Negev and explains the influence of the former British and Ottoman rulers in the granting of land rights that has resulted in the Bedouin claim on the Negev. The author offers a well-informed perspective on factors affecting the Bedouin and includes elements of history not found in the other sources. Also included is a discussion of the Israeli government's attempt to "Judiaze" the Negev and marginalize the Bedouin citizens there. Most importantly, the report highlights the actions and achievements of Bedouin activists and organizations responding to the discrimination of the state.

Swirski, Shlomo. 2007 "Current Plans for Developing the Negev: A Critical Perspective". Adva Center. Available online: <http://www.adva.org/UPLOADED/AdvaNegevJanuary2007.pdf>

Annotation: The mission of the Adva Center is to promote equality, including gender equality, for Israeli citizens of all ethnic and socio-economic minority backgrounds. This report outlines and analyses *A National Strategic Plan for the Development of the Negev (Negev 2015)* that was adopted

by the Israeli government in 2005. According to the author, the plan is based in flawed neo-liberal economic theories and does not deal with the two most pressing issues affecting the condition of the Bedouin: violation of land rights and exclusion of the unrecognized villages. The report also reviews *The National Outline Plan (NOP 35)* and the *Beersheba Metropolis Plan (DOP 4/14/23)*, both of which are development plans implemented by the Israeli government. Finally, the report considers two alternate development proposals submitted by the Regional Council of Unrecognized Villages and the Center for Bedouin Studies and Development at Ben Gurion University of the Negev, two non-governmental organizations that serve the interests of the Bedouin population. This report is valuable for grasping the development plans of the Israeli government in contrast to the recommendations of those most affected by development in the Negev.

Tarazi, Monica. 2009. "Planning Apartheid in the Naqab." *Middle East Report* 253: 32-36.

Annotation: The author of this article outlines the history of systematic oppression of Bedouin citizens by the state of Israel and claims that the expropriation of Bedouin lands, exclusion of the Bedouin from planning processes, and misallocation of resources have resulted in a system of apartheid. An agenda to "Judaize" the Naqab has informed the development goals in the region, and the state has expropriated Bedouin lands for settlements and agricultural use. Relocation of the Bedouin has also served to disconnect them from their ancestral home and increase control of the state. According to the author, in the state's most recently developed plan for the Naqab, 40% of the budget is allocated to the demolition of unauthorized Bedouin homes and relocation activities. These issues call into question the very definition of citizenship in Israel and the author advocates for democratic reform.

Yonah, Yossi , Ismael Abu-Saad, and Avi Kaplan. 2004. "De-Arabization of the Bedouin: A Study of an Inevitable Failure." In *Israelis in Conflict: Hegemonies, Identities, and Challenges*. Adriana Kemp et al. Brighton: Sussex Academic Press.

Annotation: The author of this chapter discusses the inevitable failure of the Israeli state's efforts to 'de-Arabize' the Bedouin in order to control them and make them invisible, thereby invalidating their claims for recognition as an ethnic minority group within the state. The state is now attempting to 're-Arabize' the Bedouin so that their demands for recognition and inclusion can be characterized as radical threats by an 'outsider' group to the law and order in Israel. The author contends that the political rise of the Bedouin and the formation of civil society organizations have contributed to both external recognition and internal democratization. Importantly, the movements have opened up new spaces for women and are challenging traditional structures of power within Bedouin society. This is an important work that contributes well to the body of knowledge of the growing civil society sector in the Negev.

Yiftachel, Oren. 2009. "'Creeping Apartheid' in Israel-Palestine." *Middle East Report* 253: 7-15 &37.

Annotation: Oren Yiftachel is a widely-published professor of Geography and Environmental Development at Ben Gurion University of the Negev, Israel. In this article, Yiftachel analyses the Israeli government's emerging promotion of the concept of "two states for two people" as a solution to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. He suggests that this endorsement is really more about developing a system of apartheid rather than recognizing the rights of Israeli-Palestinians. He persuasively likens Israel's developing racial and ethnic class system to those in South Africa's system of apartheid and effectively places the Bedouin struggle in the context of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. According to Yiftachel, Israel seems more liberal than it actually is; the freedoms associated with the Westernized markets, media and culture are enjoyed primarily by Israel's Jewish citizens, while Arab citizens and Palestinians in the Occupied Territories experience disparate sets of rights.

———. 2009. "Critical theory and 'gray space': Mobilization of the colonized." *City* 13 (2 & 3): 246-263.

Annotation: In this paper, Yiftachel draws on critical urban theories to trace how the Israeli government has forced the indigenous Bedouins into impoverished and criminalized 'gray space' – which has neither the 'lightness' of legality, safety and full membership, nor the 'darkness' of eviction, destruction and death. Yiftachel asserts that the practice of 'gray spacing' by the Israeli government has resulted in a more radicalized Bedouin struggle against urbanization and Israelization. He emphasizes the need for a revised critical urban theory that would allow for a better understanding of both oppression and resistance in urban colonialism. The article provides enough explanation of critical urban theory for the topic to be accessible to anyone wishing to gain a deeper understanding of the condition of Bedouins within the Israeli state and it would also be useful for scholars of urban societies.

Zaher, Sawssen. 2006. "The Right of Arab Bedouin Women to Adequate Housing and Accommodation." *Adalah's Newsletter of the Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel* 23: 1-6.

Annotation: This article addresses the violation of the rights of Bedouin women living in the Negev region of Israel to adequate housing and accommodation. The author gives an overview of the history and policy of the Israeli government's development and planning procedure and condemns the intentional exclusion of the Bedouin people from the process. Believing that the policies are designed to give the state greater control over the Bedouin minority, the author gives particular attention to the enormous and negative impact of the planning process on the rights of Bedouin women. The author briefly links state policy and practice with increased violence against women in the home, though she does not offer a thorough explanation of these correlations.