

Human Rights in Russia and the Former Soviet Republics

Introduction by Arianna Nowakowski

Ph.D. Candidate

Graduate School of International Studies, University of Denver

Following the collapse of the Soviet Union in 1991, a state of political, economic, and social disarray was accompanied by a renewed hope for improved human rights conditions in Russia and the former Soviet Republics. However, transitions toward more democratic forms of governance and market economies have faced many obstacles, and have not necessarily facilitated the protection of such rights. As this eclectic compilation of essays and bibliographies in the current digest reveals, many legacies of Soviet rule persist and continue to plague the region today.

Although Russia has stabilized dramatically since 1991, progress toward a liberal democracy is frequently called into question. Political and legal corruption, lack of transparency, insufficient public participation, and increased governmental control of media enterprises have contributed to such doubt. Viewing a lack of democratic progress as a hindrance to the development of human rights in much of the post-Soviet region, the contributors to this digest evaluate the prospects for democracy by discussing many historical and political impediments for democratic development. As an important component of democracy, the current state of civil society in Russia is also addressed, focusing primarily on the hindered operation of NGOs and religious groups. Together, these works provide an image of Russia's apparent transition away from a liberal democracy, which many scholars argue is having a negative impact on significant human rights issues.

Acutely problematic during Soviet times, rights of women, sexual minorities, and disabled people, continue to be denied in post-Soviet Russia. Arguably, these problems are worsening as the operation of NGOs, freedom of speech, and representation in civil society become increasingly curtailed. An assemblage of topics such as changes in gender identity, employment issues, health care, and public and private violence present a comprehensive image of gender inequality as a larger social and political human rights problem. Regarding disability rights, issues of public discrimination and lack of access to health care, particularly for children and the elderly, are presented as central, yet insufficiently addressed issues in contemporary Russia.

Lack of access to quality health care is perhaps one of the most all-encompassing human rights issues facing the region today, as social discrimination, corruption, and poverty all come into play. In an extended overview of some of the main health problems afflicting Russians in particular, issues such as alcoholism, smoking, HIV/AIDS, and a number of preventable diseases are viewed in light of their contribution to Russia's rapidly declining population. Many of the sources in this section inform on the healthcare system in Russia, in addition to addressing political and economic contributions to the aforementioned problems. The inadequate health care and abuse faced by military personnel in particular is also discussed.

Although class, gender, and disability affect access to quality health care in contemporary Russia, an additional portion of the demographics that experiences widespread discrimination is that of the Roma. As the essay on the Roma reveals, lack of access to health care, education and social institutions are only a few of the problems afflicting them. Central to this piece is the legacy of

authoritarian rule, which in many ways continues to legitimate the unequal treatment of this segment of the population.

The legacy of authoritarian rule undoubtedly presents challenges for human rights reform in Russia and in much of Eastern Europe, but such political repression is more detrimental for human rights in regions still under this form of governance. Extending beyond Russia proper, research on authoritarianism in Turkmenistan brings many significant issues of political repression to the forefront. Following the death of President Saparmurat Niyazov on December 21, 2006, the current state of affairs in Turkmenistan remains uncertain. As the essay on this topic illustrates, the pervasiveness of control established by Niyazov's regime makes substantial change unlikely in the foreseeable future.

With respect to most areas of the former Soviet Republics and Russia, issues of religious freedom and the treatment of ethnic minorities are particularly germane to a discussion on human rights in the region. Research on the repression of Islam in Tajikistan, as well as hardships faced by repatriated ethnic groups in Russia and the CIS bring such issues to the light. Finally, a problem of immense proportion that extends well beyond Russia's borders is that of human trafficking. Addressing trafficking of women and children, as well as men, the research on this topic illuminates the ways in which economic perils, coupled with corruption in the political and legal systems, can lead to the trafficking of people worldwide.

The wide array of topics addressed in this digest is by no means all encompassing of the human rights issues plaguing Russia and the former Soviet Republics today, nor is each topic addressed in complete detail. Rather, the digest is intended to serve as a representation of many pertinent issues, and to provide useful sources for future research. We hope readers will find this installment informative, bringing to light many problems that must be addressed as the post-Soviet transformation in the region continues.

Researchers

Kirsten Benites
Ken Bonneville
Jill Collum
Christine Danton
Susan Freese
Hayden Gore
Annika Johnson
Kristina Libby
Florinda Lucero
Cathy Smith
Nick Stokes
Amy Swift
Lisa Weilminster

Instructor

Arianna Nowakowski

Editors

Sarah Bania-Dobyns
Eric Dibbern
Arianna Nowakowski
Stephanie Raessler

Civil Society and Human Rights

By Ken Bonneville

A dynamic civil society is essential to a functioning democracy. After the fall of the Soviet Union there was hope that Russia could create a robust civil society to compliment its burgeoning democracy, but 15 years after the fall neither occurrence appears to be the case. Instead of an open society, Russian civil society faces challenges of oppression, threats of violence, an overbearing bureaucracy, and a constitution open to interpretation. The following research outlines some of the obstacles facing Russia's civil society and addresses how the government is restricting civil society functions.

The Russian executive branch employs numerous means to oppress civil society, but Article 59 of the Russian Constitution is the executive branch's primary means. This article states that Russians may join any society free of persecution, but it continues to say that it is every Russian's duty to defend the fatherland. An extensive bureaucracy is another means that the Russian government uses in order to inhibit NGO functions. Finally, the government fails to fully investigate the abuse and killings of activists and reporters.

This research covers four aspects of civil society, including the media, nongovernmental organizations (NGOs), religious institutions, and business participation. In terms of the media, there are two aspects that must be considered: the suppression of freedom of the press, and governmental influence on media production. The nationalization of NTV is a prime example of both of these features.

Social and political activism is inherent to nongovernmental organizations, but they are encountering as many restrictions as the media. Government bureaucracies are restricting groups from organizing contrary to government action. Groups opposed to Russian action in Chechnya are particularly harassed. In general, nongovernmental organizations are facing violent persecution, intimidation, and bureaucratic threats that the executive branch does little to dissuade.

Religious groups are facing a similar line of persecution from the government as the NGOs. The Russian Orthodox Church has gained a position virtually beyond reproach, but other religions are not as lucky. If a religious group does not gain the "traditional" status within Russia, they are open to various forms of prosecution from the government. Furthermore, if an artist or activist wishes to express their opinions about the Russian Orthodox Church or religion, they leave themselves open to prosecution and threats as well.

Businesses face a different problem altogether. Like the NGOs, they also face restrictions that result from the massive Russian bureaucracy. The real issue, however, has to do with the executive branch of the government putting pressure upon businesses to open themselves up to government intervention. If the business community refuses to allow the government to gain partial ownership, the companies may face nationalization and prosecution.

Agadjanian, Alexander. 2006. "The Search for Privacy and the Return of a Grand Narrative: Religion in a Post-Communist Society." *Social Compass*. 53:169-184.

Annotation: This article provides a case study analyzing an avant-garde art exhibit on Russian Orthodoxy that was attacked by militant followers of the Russian church. Instead of prosecuting the militants, charges were dropped due to insignificant evidence. However, the art directors and exhibitors were nevertheless put on trial for offending Russian Orthodox beliefs. This case is used to show how the state protects "traditional" Russian religions; without being granted that term religions cannot gain protection from the state.

Danchin, Peter G. and Elizabeth A. Cole, eds. 2002. Protecting the Human Rights of Religious Minorities in Eastern Europe. New York: Columbia University Press.

Annotation: Chapter eight specifically deals with religious minorities within Russia. In particular, it discusses a law in 1997 that reestablished state control over religion by turning back some of Perestroika's reforms. Furthermore, this change created a relationship between the Russian state and the Orthodox church, while restricting all other "new" religions.

Glenn, John K. and Sarah Mendelson 2000. "Democracy Assistance and Ngo Strategies in Post-Communist Societies." *Democracy and Rule of Law Project*. 8.

Annotation: This article discusses mixed results from NGO based development strategies. The authors conclude that not only does Russia's communist past account for NGO failures, but also that Western NGOs fail to hire individuals with regional knowledge.

Graham, Thomas E. 2002. "Russia's Decline and Uncertain Recovery." Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. <http://www.carnegieendowment.org>.

Annotation: This article surmises that Russia's power structure did not fundamentally change after the 1991 collapse, and that leaders failed to implement reforms that would create a stable and dynamic society after the collapse of the USSR. Furthermore, after September 11th, the view of Russia has changed internationally. No longer do people blindly trust that Russia is improving. However, a warming trend in US-Russian relations has continued because Russia offered assistance to U.S. needs.

Hoffman, David E. 2002. *The Oligarchs: Wealth and Power in the New Russia*. New York: Public Affairs.

Annotation: This book covers the rise of the 6 main Russian oligarchs. In particular, it stresses the relationship between the oligarchs and the government.

Klebnikov, Paul. 2000. Godfather of the Kremlin. New York: Harcourt.

Annotation: This is an insightful book that covers the rise and corruption of the Yeltsin government via Boris Berezovsky. Written before Putin truly came to power, it does not give any insight into Russia's business workings today, but the takeover of Russian business by the oligarchs in the early 1990s provides insight.

Lipman, Maria. 2005. "How Russia Is Not Ukraine: The Closing of Russian Civil Society." *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace*. <http://www.carnegieendowment.org>.

Annotation: The book's premise is that the Ukrainian Orange Revolution will not occur in Russia. It uses examples like the recent dissolution of Yukos and the poor justice system to substantiate this claim. In fact, Lipman believes that the Orange Revolution is only influencing further oppression by the Russian state. She indicates that the Kremlin needs to dictate civil society projects in order to try to keep the population in line. Lipman covers the oppression of the media, religious groups, and human rights activists.

Markus, Stanislav. "Western Capital Versus the Russian State: Towards an Explanation of Recent Trends in Russia's Corporate Governance." *Center for European Studies: Central and Eastern Europe Working Papers*. 63: 26.

Annotation: This work investigates corporate governance within Russia. It concludes that among Russia's top companies, corporate governance has become increasingly honest while among other firms it has decreased. Boards and minority shareholder rights are becoming increasingly respected while accounting standards have not increased. The role the Russian state has actually increased within large Russian firms, and a more active managerial role has developed in firms that are partially state owned.

McFaul, Michael and Timothy J. Colton. 2001. "Are Russians Undemocratic?" *Carnegie Endowment Working Papers*. <http://www.carnegieendowment.org>.

Annotation: The authors present a proposition that the Russian government needs to represent the peoples' interests in order to defend the democratic institutions that Russia quickly built after the fall of the USSR. Currently there is a very low satisfaction with democracy in Russia by the Russians, partially because there are no obstacles within Putin's path, and because most democratic checks have been removed.

Murano, Raffaella. 2005. "Political Abuse of Judicial Process in Europe's East: A New Security Threat?" *The Foreign Policy Centre: The European Think Tank with a Global Outlook*.

Annotation: Discusses the Khodorkovsky affair and possible motives for his arrest and for the nationalization of Yukos. Recommends reform for the Russian government in order to improve the Rule of Law, and in order to decrease executive branch abuses of it.

Prozorov, Sergei. 2004. "Russian Conservatism in the Putin Presidency: The Dispersion of a Hegemonic Discourse." *Danish Institute for International Studies*. Working Papers. 20

Annotation: The article outlines the emergence of Russian conservatism within the presidency. In Putin's first term 'conservatism' became a type of political self-identification in Russia. Yet this article demonstrates the way in which the conservative discourse is internally fractured into two antagonistic strands, liberal and left conservatisms. The article concludes with a critical discussion of the relation the two strands of Russian conservatism established in the period of the 1990s, as the 'moment of the political' in the Russian post-communist transformation.

Richardson, James T. 2006. "Religion, Constitutional Courts, and Democracy in Former Communist Countries." *The Annals of the American Academy*. 129-138.

Annotation: Religion has played a major role in the collapse of the USSR and has also helped increase democratic institutions. However, in Russia there is continued suppression of separation of powers from the constitutional court that was put in place after the fall of the USSR. In general this article has a much positive view of individual rights through constitutional courts, and covers the role of religion in constitutional courts in several former communist countries.

Ryavec, Karl W. 2003. Russian Bureaucracy: Power and Pathology. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield.

Annotation: This source provides an in-depth history of the Russian bureaucracy that details its impact on Russian society. The book brings up the extent to which Russian bureaucracy has changed throughout the country's history, and evaluates which reforms are necessary in order for Russia to work much more efficiently.

Serageldin, Ismail and Partha Dasgupta, eds. 2000. Social Capital: A Multifaceted Perspective. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Abstract: Richard Rose's chapter "Getting Things Done in an Antimodern Society: Social Capital Networks in Russia" is a different work that sets the tone for how society really functions in Russia. Terming it an "antimodern society" Rose sees different connections being formed within Russia. While some capital networks are used to produce goods and services in every society, their form is distinctive in an "antimodern" society—that is, a society characterized by organizational failure and the corruption of formal organizations. In response, individuals can invoke networks that involve informal, diffuse social cooperation—begging or cajoling public officials, using connections to "bend" rules, or paying bribes that break rules. When formal organizations of state and market do not work, those who rely solely on formal organizations become socially excluded, since they have no other network

to fall back on. The paper draws on the author's specially designed nationwide Russian social capital survey of spring 1998, which asked people about the networks they use to compensate for organizational failure in different situations.

Skyner, Louis. 2003. "Property as Rhetoric: Land Ownership and Private Law in Pre-Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia." *Europe-Asia Studies* 55 (6): 889-905.

Annotation: The article summarizes the reforms put in place in 2001 that broadened the government's ability to regulate the sale of property within Russia. This increased the executive branch's power by stating that the state has the right to purchase any piece of property when it goes up for sale. In general, this points to a larger trend in Russia of heavy-handed government.

Struyk, Raymond. 2003. "Contracting with NGOs for Social Services: Building Civil Society and Efficient Local Government in Russia." *The Urban Institute*.

Annotation: Discusses local governments contracting out social services to NGOs within Russia. It emphasizes that local governments have the power to delegate authority to other organizations to deliver social services, and therefore need to work more closely with NGOs, and offers extensive ideas on how governments and NGOs can work together. The article also goes over some of the reasons for non-cooperation between governments and NGOs within Russia.

Sundstrom, Lisa McIntosh. 2006. Funding Civil Society: Foreign Assistance and Ngo Development in Russia. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Annotation: This book argues in favor of Western assistance to Russian NGOs in order to increase participation in Russian civil society. Compares the funding and workings of a women's group and a soldier's group in order to investigate their inner workings. The belief is presented that foreign assistance will work as long as it promotes international norms and is not at odds with local governments.

Tismaneanu, Vladimir. 1995. *Political Culture and Civil Society in Russia and the New States of Eurasia*. Armonk: M.E. Sharpe.

Annotation: The first third of this collection of essays covers the early possibilities for the creation of civil society within the former USSR and Russia.

Uhlen, Anders. 2006. *Post-Soviet Civil Society: Democratization in Russia and the Baltic States*. New York: Routledge.

Annotation: This is a comparative study between civil society development in the Baltic States and Russia. Particularly, it focuses on the field of democratization and transition. It concludes that NGOs in Russia are more focused on networking and are less confrontational to the government than in the Baltic States.

U.S. Senate. 2005. "Democracy in Retreat in Russia."
<http://lugar.senate.gov/pressapp/record.cfm?id=232250>.

Annotation: U.S. Senate Committee hearing from 2005 that discusses the lack of progress in building democratic institutions and the rule of law within Russia. It particularly focuses on the Yukos trial that was going on at the time. It also touches on the length that Putin's government goes to in order to control the media.

Weiler, Jonathan. 2004. Human Rights in Russia: A Darker Side of Reform. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers.

Annotation: In Chapter 5 of this summary of human rights violations within Russia, Weiler discusses the case and research of slain journalist Anna Politkovskaya and the issues she was researching in Chechnya. It does not deal with her recent murder but will give the reader knowledge of the issues she was bringing attention to the international media.

Disability Rights

By Annika Johnson

Disability rights are often ignored in discussions of human rights. Recently, however, scholars and activists have begun producing a body of literature on disability rights in Russia and the former Soviet bloc states. Much of the literature focuses on children's rights with an emphasis on the right to inclusive education. The literature addressing adult issues includes articles considering civil society, civil rights, and community integration. Finally, several articles address the intersection of disability rights with gender rights and ethnic minority rights.

Many children with disabilities in former Soviet states are placed in special institutions. The rights of parents are violated by doctors and other state officials who place pressure on them to relinquish guardianship of their children. Families who choose to raise children with disabilities in the home face a lack of adequate resources that exacerbate already poor economic circumstances. Due to low expectations, children in segregated institutions are often given a second class education, which poses a barrier to the attainment of higher education. Children with severe disabilities often graduate from children's institutions to institutions for adults. Many have advocated for more inclusive education that more closely approximates the Western model of mainstreaming. Integrative education is difficult where educators refuse flexibility in curricula. Architectural barriers also pose a barrier for children with physical disabilities in primary, secondary, and post-secondary general education settings.

Adults with disabilities often face appalling living conditions. The most prominent human rights violation in recent history has been the continued use of caged beds for adults with mental disabilities in the Czech Republic. A recent death attributed to the use of cages has prompted high profile attention from various NGOs. The continued problem of understaffing, however, has prompted Czech officials to continue using the cages, citing a lack of viable alternatives. Civil society organizations in several countries are trying to provide a viable alternative to institutionalization by providing community support services allowing adults independence and dignity. Lack of funding, however, makes NGO efforts limited.

Additionally, several articles address the intersection of disability rights with gender and ethnic minority rights. Many former Soviet bloc states have patriarchal cultures in which women are expected to be caregivers. However, in the Soviet period, women were expected to work outside the home as well, resulting in a dual burden. Mothers of children of disabilities who choose not to institutionalize their children face an even greater burden. Violence against women with mental disabilities is common in institutional settings. The Roma, an ethnic minority in much of Central and Eastern Europe, are often put into special schools for the mentally disabled due to ethnic discrimination and thus receive sub par education.

The future of disability rights in former Soviet states is unclear. Legal protections are granted by U.N. declarations, E.U. directives, and national legislation. The implementation of legal protections is difficult in many countries due to lack of adequate resources. Support from international disability organizations can help domestic NGOs in their attempt to provide services and advocate for people with disabilities in each national context.

Education

Batukhtin, V.D., A.D. Shcherbov, and E.A. Martynova. 1999. "Access to Higher Education for Disabled People: A Systematic Approach at Chelyabinsk State University in Russia." *Higher Education in Europe* 24 (3): 385-395.

Annotation: The article provides a general overview of access to higher education which they define as a person's ability to access the kind of higher education that they desire. The authors distinguish four different levels of access: institutional, regional, national, and global. People with disabilities have limited access to higher education due to "the absence of a barrier-free environment, lack of financial support for higher education establishments, underdeveloped distance education, the insufficient level of secondary education and health services, financial and transportation problems, etc."

Gindis, Boris. 1995. "The Social/Cultural Implication of Disability: Vygotsky's Paradigm for Special Education." *Educational Psychologist* 30 (2): 77-81.

Annotation: The author provides an overview of Les S. Vygotsky's contributions to the field of special education. Vygotsky is a 20th century Russian psychologist known for contributing to the field in the areas of methodology, cognitive development, psycholinguistics, and learning theory. The author claims that Vygotsky's study on defectology, literally the study of defect, "constitutes an important part of his scientific legacy." In "defectology," children with disabilities were categorized into four groups: hard of hearing, visually impaired, mental retardation, speech and language impaired. Children with emotional disorders and learning disabilities were not served under defectology. Vygotsky argued that it is society's reaction to the organic handicap, not the handicap alone, that is the more disabling for the child. The author concludes the article by admitting that Vygotsky did not provide a complete picture for special education, citing the need for further study, particularly cross-cultural studies, but pays tribute to Vygotsky's important contributions to providing a humane framework for special education in the 20th century.

Korkunov, Vladimir V., Alexander S. Nigayev, Lynn D. Reynolds, and Janet W. Lerner. 1998. "Special Education in Russia: History, Reality, and Prospects." *Journal of Learning Disabilities* 31 (2): 186-192.

Abstract: *To describe special education in Russia, this article (a) explains the background information on the formation of a Russian-American partnership, (b) offers an historical perspective of special education in Russia, (c) reviews the current status of special education in Russia and in particular the Svverdlovsk Oblast, and (d) forecasts the future of Russian special education. In considering new goals and future directions for special education in Russia, the authors suggest that the policies and legislation developed by the Provinces in Canada may offer a workable model for a Russian special education system.*

Leonhardt, Annette. 1995. "Educational Reform in Slovakia." *European Education* 27(2): 37-46.

Annotation: The final section of the article addresses educational reform and its effects on special education in Slovakia. While Slovakia continues to have special schools for children with various disabilities, educational reform has also focused on integrating them into non-disabled classrooms. There has been some resistance on the part of teachers to this integration who want to see children with disabilities put into special boarding schools but more parents are refusing. The author recognizes that integration can be a slow process but believes teachers and administrators must accept integration as a basic principle and offers several suggestions for educators to achieve that goal.

Malofeev, Nikolai N. 1998. "Special Education in Russia: Historical Aspects." *Journal of Learning Disabilities* 31 (2): 181-185.

Abstract: *Tracing the history of special education services in Russia from its beginnings in the early nineteenth century through the rapid expansion of both private and government-supported programs and institutions until the restrictive Soviet period provides both understanding and appreciation of current Russian special education services and institutions. Theoretical principles guiding special education formulated by L. Vygotsky, and sources outside the USSR, were officially repressed, as were testing and statistical data on handicapped individuals. Official mandates to bring students with handicaps up to state-approved standards resulted in the development of creative, effective approaches. The framework of special education changed little until the breakdown of the USSR. The new Russian Federation ratified U.N. resolutions protecting the rights of children. Categorical language is a recent development, and terms such as defective, retarded, and pedagogue are gradually being replaced. The final decade of this century is witnessing rapid change at the initiation of the Ministry of Education that is beginning to produce needed reform. One of the major initiatives is to provide LD specialists in all schools so that students will not need to be a great distance from home to receive needed services.*

McMillan, Ian. 2003. "Amnesty Report Condemns Russia's Human Rights Record on Children." *Learning Disability Practice* 6 (9).

Annotation: An Amnesty report claimed that the human rights of children with learning disabilities were being violated in Russia. Parents of newborns diagnosed with a learning disability were encouraged to relinquish guardianship and the children would go to live in a children's institution. Such institutions are understaffed and many children are confined to their beds. Children are written off as "uneducable" and have no chance of "review or release."

Neustadt, Nurit. 1998. "Breaking Boundaries: The Expansion of Services for Visually Impaired Estonians." *Journal of Visual Impairment & Blindness* 92 (8): 2.

Annotation: The author observes the changes in education available for both children and adults with visual impairments in Estonia. Orientation and mobility training, independent living skills, and mainstreaming have been introduced as concepts in the Estonian educational system post-independence. Orientation and mobility training is now offered as a part of the curriculum at the

special school for the blind. They also use the school's dormitories in the summer months to provide training for adults with visual impairments. In addition, the Federation for the Blind offers orientation and mobility training to newly blinded and older adults. Mainstreaming has become an option for children with disabilities with children with low vision being the primary beneficiaries. In the future, it is hoped that university support for people with visual impairments will be available.

Pervova, Irina. 1998. "Children and Youth with Special Needs in Russia, and Educational Services to Meet Them." *Education & Treatment of Children* 21 (3).

Annotation: The author provides an overview of the special education system in Russia in the second section of the article. The special education system is divided into various kinds of programs which included pre-schools and kindergartens, children's houses, special schools, special classes in regular schools, special vocational technical schools, psycho-medical pedagogical commissions, and centers of rehabilitation. The author addresses the scope of special education in Russia and notes an increase in the diagnosis of children with learning disabilities from 1991 to 1995. New standards in special education have been adopted. Special education remains primarily segregated from general education in contrast to western trends. The author favors integration of children with disabilities in education and believes that Russia could benefit from examples in the United States. Western examples of inclusion in education, however, may not be realistic given the cultural and economic context in Russia.

Racheotes, N.S. 1997. "The Education of Blind and Visually Impaired Children." *Journal of Visual Impairment & Blindness* 91 (5).

Annotation: The author uses personal interviews with individuals with visual impairments to assess the changes that have been made in Post-Soviet Russia with regards to educating the visually impaired. Even under the Soviet regime, people advocated for changes in early intervention and preschool, vocational and medical services, and greater family involvement. Later, Russia would adopt the Educational Rights of Disabled Children law that guarantees children with disabilities education from pre-school to post-secondary education. While there has been reform in special education, there has been a lack of enforcement of the new norms. Another problem lies in the centralization of the education system which may not allow for flexibility and creativity. While the author believes that special education teachers are better educated and better paid than in the past, lack of supplies, stubborn supervisors, and hardships in rural areas are barriers to effective education of individuals with visual impairments.

Radoman, Vesna, Virxhil Nano, and Alison Closs. 2006. "Prospects for Inclusive Education in European Countries Emerging from Economic and Other Trauma: Serbia and Albania." *European Journal of Special Needs Education* 21 (2): 151-166.

Annotation: The authors present a comparative analysis of the possibilities for inclusive education of children with learning disabilities in Serbia and Albania. They look at historical,

social, and economic factors that influence the viability of inclusive education. The role of NGOs and international funding are considered. Some barriers to inclusive education are societal apathy, poor economy, lack of infrastructure, additional needs of pupils experiencing poverty, social disruption, or other distress, a lack of flexibility in curricula, and educators' belief that children with learning disabilities are uneducable. The authors give an overview of small steps in each country toward inclusive education profiling one school in each country. In order for inclusive education to develop further, support from international NGOs, economic and social stability, and a political orientation toward Europe and inclusive standards will be necessary.

Rich, Vera. 1995. "First College for the Disabled Opens in Russia." *Lancet* 16 December: 1.

Annotation: Since social security benefits are only minimally adequate due to inflation, it has been necessary for people with disabilities to find work in order to earn an adequate income. The first college for disabled persons was established in order to meet this need. The Moscow State Social University provides degrees in business, finance, economics of technology, and management for individuals registered as disabled. The courses are fairly expensive at \$1200 a year with MSSU paying \$700 and local governments, personal sponsors, or social security necessary to pay the remainder. The establishment of a university is a step towards the integration of people with disabilities in Russian society.

Romanov, P.V. & E. R. Iaskara-Smirnova. 2006. "The Problem of Access to Higher Education." *Russian Education and Society* 48 (8): 54-71.

Annotation: The author looks at the barriers that people with disabilities face in access to higher education. While federal law guarantees equal access, architectural barriers, lack of resources for capital improvements, and lack of government funding in general complicate access. State policies addressing higher education for people with disabilities are still oriented toward segregated facilities in certain regions denying students choice. Another barrier to enrollment in higher education is the real or perceived lack of adequate secondary education that leads students to believe they are not qualified. While there is still discrimination in admission policies, the authors note development of higher education for people with disabilities. They also fear integration in a general higher education setting will not provide the necessary supports including barrier-free facilities and special equipment that they would receive in special schools. The authors cite the delay in the passage of the Law on Special education designed to regulate the integration of students with disabilities as another obstacle. Finally, attitudes of fellow students, staff, and faculty must be changed to accommodate students with disabilities in higher education.

Civil Society, Civil Rights, and Community Integration

Amariei, Razvan. 2003. "Including the Excluded." *Transitions Online*, 8 December.

Annotation: Under communism in Romania the goal was to hide people with disabilities either by leaving them with their families or institutionalizing them. State institutions were and are often abusive environments for the people living in them. The author offers an alternative citing Pentru Voi Center in western Romania as an example that allows for community integration of people with disabilities. Pentru Voi was started as a parent organization and developed into a day-care center for children (now adults) with disabilities. The center has since expanded its capabilities to include social and practical skills acquisition, housing placement, and support for employment. The center has limited resources and a high turnover rate since employees are paid approximately the same as public employees. The local government supports the center financially, to the extent that is possible, but laws regulating public-private partnerships make adequate support difficult. Although the center would like to reintegrate people with disabilities from an institutional to a community setting, the abusive environment of institutions can often cause violent behavior in clients and the center cannot help such people although the center's director would like to expand its services to include them. The author has a clear bias against institutions and the tone of the article suggests it is written for an activist audience.

2004. "Ban on Caged Beds Premature: Czech Officials." *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 171 (6): 557.

Annotation: People with mental disabilities were commonly restrained using caged or netted beds before such forms of restraint were banned in the Czech Republic, Slovenia, and Hungary. The problem of understaffing in institutions, however, may cause mental health officials to resort to worse forms of physical restraint of patients who are a danger to themselves or others. While most officials agree that the caged beds are a human rights violation, they believe a ban is premature given the reality of understaffing. In Hungary, the caged beds were phased out in July 2004. Slovenia, which had only two such devices, also plans to phase them out. The Czech Republic, however, had between 750-1000 such devices and phasing them out will cost millions of dollars. The director of a Prague psychiatric hospital said that "banning them is a political solution" and does not solve the problem of understaffing. This article shows the complexity involved in finding a solution to a specific human rights violation.

Bridge, Gillian. 2004. "Disabled Children and Their Families in Ukraine: Health and Mental Health Issues for Families Caring for Their Disabled Child at Home." *The Journal of Health Care Social Work* 39 (1/2): 89-105.

Abstract: *In the Eastern European countries included in the communist system of the USSR, parents of disabled children were encouraged to commit their disabled child to institutional care. There were strict legal regulations excluding them from schools. Medical assessments were used for care decisions. Nevertheless many parents decided to care for their disabled child at home within the family. Ukraine became an independent country in 1991, when communism was replaced by liberal democracy within a free market system. Western solutions*

have been sought for many social problems existing, but “hidden,” under the old regime. For more of the parents of disabled children, this has meant embracing ideas of caring for their disabled children in the community, and providing for their social, educational, and medical needs, which have previously been denied. The issue of disability is a serious one for Ukraine where the nuclear disaster at Chernobyl in 1986 caused extensive radiation poisoning. This almost certainly led to an increase in the number of disabled children being born and an increase in the incidence of various forms of cancer. This paper is based on a series of observation visits to some of the many self-help groups established by parents, usually mothers, for their disabled children. It draws attention to the emotional stress experienced both by parents and their disabled children in the process of attempting to come to terms with the disabling conditions, and the denial of the normal rights of childhood resulting from prejudice, poor resources, ignorance, and restrictive legislation. Attempts have been made to identify the possible role and tasks of professional social workers within this context. International comparisons show that many parents and their children do not benefit from the medical model of disability, and that serious consequences include the development of depressive illness among those who find that little help is available from public services.

1996. “Civil Rights Law.” *Journal of Visual Impairment & Blindness* 90 (2) (1996).

Annotation: In December of 1995, the Russian government passed a piece of disability rights legislation addressing pensions, rehabilitation services, and architectural barriers. The World Institute on Disability and the All-Russian Society of the Disabled worked for three years to get the legislation passed.

Holland, Daniel. 2003. “Grass Roots Promotion of Community Health and Human Rights for People with Disabilities in Post-Communist Central Europe: A Profile of the Slovak Republic.” *Disability & Society* 18 (2): 133-143.

Annotation: The author uses a case study of the Slovak Republic to demonstrate the ability of grassroots organizations to provide community support for people with disabilities and chronic illness in contrast to the highly centralized and institutional care most commonly in practice. Grassroots organizations provide support services and advocacy that allow people with disabilities to live in the community. The author notes the varying degrees to which economic and political support is given to disability NGOs and Civil Society more generally. The survival of such organizations will depend on their ability to connect with international networks of disability rights organizations to obtain information and collaborative grants.

Iarskia-Smirnova, Elena. 2001. “Social Change and Self-Empowerment: Stories of Disabled People in Russia.” In *Disability and the Life Course: Global Perspectives*, ed. Mark Priestley. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 101-112.

Annotation: The author uses a biographical narrative approach to understand the experiences of several adults with disabilities in Saratov, Russia between 1999-2000. The article uses the oral histories of two adults with disabilities, Anna Vassilievna Semionova and Yuri Nikolaevitch Kazakov, who lived during the Soviet and Post-Soviet periods. Both were disability rights advocates, fighting for the recognition and implementation of civil rights for people with

disabilities. The author concludes the article by comparing the gendered nature of the two stories epitomized in two quotes. Semionova's approach to disability involves negotiation while Kazakov's is a strategy of "noncompliance" and "rebellion." Each person's "social context," taking into account space, time, gender, and social class, shaped the identity of each person and led them to adopt different strategies of social change and self-empowerment.

Krosnar, Katka. 2006. "Czech Government to Be Sued over Caged-Bed Death." *The Lancet*, 6 October.

Annotation: In spite of a 2004 pledge to ban caged beds in the Czech Republic, a legal ban is still not in effect and there are still at least 700 such devices in use. The death of a woman in a Prague psychiatric facility who died in the cage by choking on her own feces has caused her family and a European NGO to file suit. The case will be fought out in the Czech courts before moving on to the European Court of Human Rights at Strasbourg. The director of the hospital defended its actions claiming the patient was a danger to herself and others. The mother of the woman said that when she visited her daughter she was caged, dirty, with her hair shaven. The director of the Budapest-based Mental Disability Advocacy Center argued against the use of the cages saying that they caused patients conditions to deteriorate since it was psychologically isolating and often unhygienic. The article is highly critical of the Czech government but does allow officials to defend their actions.

Otrebski, Wojciech. 2000. "Quality of Life of People with Mental Retardation Living in Two Environments in Poland." *Cross Cultural Perspectives on Quality of Life*, ed. Kenneth D. Keith & Robert L. Schalock. Washington, D.C.: American Association on Mental Retardation: 83-92.

Annotation: The author uses both objective and subjective indicators to compare "quality of life" of individuals with mental retardation in an institutional context and those that live in the open community in Poland. He combines the standardization of social services with the subjective opinions of people with mental retardation to ascertain quality of life. He studies a group of 57 individuals with mental retardation with subgroup A comprising 37 people living with families or in group homes and with subgroup B comprising 20 people who resided in institutions. He translated and adjusted the Quality of Life Questionnaire to Polish conditions. He finds a statistically significant difference in the quality of life of people with mental retardation living in a community context and those living in an institutional context with the former having the higher quality of life. The author has a pronounced bias toward deinstitutionalization and thus favors information supporting the theory that people with mental retardation have a better quality of life in a community context. He believes his findings support the reorganization of social services to allow people with mental retardation to live in the community.

Raymond, Paul D. 1989. "Disability as Dissidence: The Action Group to Defend the Rights of the Disabled in the USSR." In *The Disabled in the Soviet Union: Past and Present, Theory and*

Practice, ed. William O. McCagg and Lewis Siegelbaum. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press: 235-252.

Annotation: Iurii Kiselev and Valerii Fefelov, both disabled in industrial accidents, and Faizulla Khusainov, a Crimean parapalegic, founded the Action Group to Defend the Rights of the Disabled in the USSR in May of 1978. They were prompted to found the group by the Helsinki accord of 1975 and asked Soviet approval for an all-union society for the disabled. Initially the group viewed themselves not as a dissident group but as a legally sanctioned official association. The basic objectives were (1) to collect and disseminate information on the situation of the disabled in the USSR; (2) to petition before competent Soviet organs for the improvement of social security for the disabled; (3) to garner help from world opinion in the event that their appeals were turned down and (4) to establish contact with international organization for the disabled. One of the most important demands was for improvements in accessibility and one of the first publications of the group addressed the issue of transportation. Despite the group's insistence that they were not politically motivated in the dissidence movement, the Soviet authorities began to harass members within weeks of its foundation. This brought two changes in the group: the first a shift from the view that the Soviet system would allow for change and the second an association of the group's activities with the broader human rights movement. The group produced Information Bulletin which distributed fourteen issues between 1978 and 1982 when Fefelov would emigrate to West Germany. The U.N. International Year of the Disabled in 1981 and the Soviet regime's nonobservance provoked harsh commentary in the Bulletin and the state responded by charging him. The article provides a useful history of the formation of an important disability rights organization in the Soviet period.

Smith-Davis, Judy. 2000. "People with Disabilities in Russia: Progress and Prospects." In Cross-Cultural Perspectives on Quality of Life, ed. Kenneth D. Keith & Robert L. Schalock. Washington, D.C.: American Association on Mental Retardation: 219-229.

Annotation: This article provides a general overview of the progress of rights of people with disabilities in Russia and places disability rights in the broader human rights framework. The author observes favorable changes in the legal status of people with disabilities in Russia in human rights, special education legislation, health care, material well-being, and self determination but has not observed a corresponding compliance with norms. Widespread pollution under the former regime has resulted in only 14 percent of children being considered "practically healthy." Children with physical and mental disabilities in the Moscow school system number close to 20 percent. Chemical, biological, and nuclear test cities of the former Soviet Union have an extremely high incidence of congenital birth defects. The health care system in Russia suffers from lack of equipment, lack of medical personnel, and a lack of public trust in the system leading to decreased numbers of people who seek medical advice. While unemployment and poverty are common problems for the entire Russian society, individuals with disabilities suffer disproportionately. While students with disabilities were segregated and their education was standardized under the Soviet regime, recently there has been an effort to bridge the gap between special and general education as well as individualize the education process. Civil society among citizens with disabilities grew under glasnost and have been

advocating for adults (particularly disabled veterans) and children with disabilities. Associational activity and cooperation with local officials have led to some local successes and have been important in involving people with disabilities in determining their own lives.

Thomson, Kate. 2006. "Disability Organizations in the Regions." In Russian Civil Society: A Critical Assessment, ed. Jr. Alfred B Evans, Laura A. Henry and Lisa McIntosh Sundstrom. New York: M.E. Sharpe: 229-245.

Annotation: The author examines the extent to which civil society can promote local welfare change by comparing the activities of two Russian nongovernmental organizations in two cities. The author provides a theoretical context of the state-voluntary sector relationship as well as a theoretical model of disability, which argues for a social or civil rights model that distinguishes between biological defect or impairment and disability as socially constructed. The author critiques herself by acknowledging the limitations of applying a "Western" approach to disability in the Russian context. The study was based on interviews with organization executives, other officials, or members and was supported by organizational documents. The study primarily focused on educational services and was decidedly anti-segregation.

UNICEF Innocenti Research Center. 2005. *Children and Disability in Transition in CEE/CIS and Baltic States*. United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF).

Annotation: The report issued by U.N. ICEF outlines the human rights issues children with disabilities face in CEE/CIS and Baltic States. Segregation and institutionalization are noted as policies with good intentions but ones which have led to further disabling conditions as well as social stigma. The report addresses rates of disability, health, poverty and raising children in families, availability of benefits and support, educational services, welfare services, lack of accessibility, and recreation and leisure. They further outline what rights children with disabilities have (and ought to have), acknowledge progress, and provide suggestions for future progress.

Vann, Barbara H. & Jan Siska. 2006. "From 'Cage Beds' to Inclusion: The Long Road for Individuals with Intellectual Disability in the Czech Republic." *Disability & Society* 21(5): 425-439.

Annotation: The author's document Czech human rights abuses that take place in institutions that purport to serve people with intellectual disabilities the most prominent being the use of cage beds in psychiatric institutions. They cite NGOs who provide community support services as a viable alternative to institutional care. Czech laws pose barriers to the ability of NGOs to provide services specifically with regard to state funding which only recognizes community care for seniors. The authors argue that individuals with intellectual disabilities must become self-advocates. E.U. law supports the right of such persons to live a life of dignity and in the least restrictive environment possible.

Vardanyan, Arman. 2003. "The Bars That Bind." *Transitions Online*, 30 June.

Annotation: The author is the director of the Mental Disability Advocacy Center in Budapest and writes the article from an activist perspective. The article focuses on the human rights abuses against people with disabilities in institutional settings in the E.U. accession countries. People in psychiatric and other institutions have been caged for extended periods of time which is degrading, inhuman, and damaging. Institutions are overcrowded with 20-30 adults in one room. Abuse is common in such settings. The author argues for a shift from institutional settings to a community based model encouraging integration of people with disabilities. Authorities must take human rights into consideration when reforming the mental health care system.

Gender, Ethnicity, and Disability

Iarskia-Smirnova, Elena. 1999. "What the Future Will Bring I Do Not Know': Mothering Children with Disabilities in Russia and the Politics of Exclusion." *Frontiers: A Journal of Women's Studies* 20 (2): 68-86.

Annotation: The author uses personal narratives of Russian mothers of children with disabilities in Saratov Russia between 1995 and 1997 to provide a gendered critique of the disability framework in Russia. Families who choose to raise children with disabilities at home face social exclusion due to cultural stigma. She examines motherhood as a culturally institutionalized concept that is not easily adapted to accommodate children with disabilities. Mothers in Russia already face a dual burden of being the primary care giver and working outside the home. Since there is a powerful pressure to institutionalize children with disabilities, families who raise their children with disabilities at home are faced with inadequate resources. Women often rely on family support when raising a child with a disability but often face cold and rude attitudes from those from whom they seek support. Sometimes women must break their dependency on family and other social support networks. Diagnosis of children as defective can lead to feelings of guilt on the part of the mother. The author concludes by arguing for a shift from an emphasis on diagnosis to an emphasis on civil rights.

Pallaska, Eva Szeli & Dea. 2004. "Violence against Women with Mental Disabilities: The Invisible Victims in CEE/NIS Countries." *Feminist Review* (76): 117-119.

Annotation: The authors argue that women with mental disabilities are subject to discrimination on three levels in CEE/NIS countries. First, they are subject to gender discrimination often found in patriarchal societies. Second, they are discriminated against because they have a disability. Finally, they are discriminated against even within the disability community on the basis of having a mental disability. Women with mental disabilities are not viewed as credible and thus violence against them is often ignored. Such women in institutional settings are subjected to physical and sexual abuse, forced abortions, and forced sterilizations. Often women who seek support when in an abusive situation are labeled as mentally disabled. The social

stigma associated with the label can cause women to lose the support of their communities, family, and lose custody of their children. The authors offer legal remedies including various forms of anti-discrimination, anti-domestic violence, and rights-protective legislation. They also propose more support for community based services.

Spritzer, Dinah A. 2005. "Often Shunted into Special Schools, Gypsies Fight Back." *The New York Times*, 27 April.

Annotation: The article focuses on the human rights abuses of Roma as it relates to disability in the Czech Republic. According to the State Department's human rights report, 90 percent of children in special schools for the mentally retarded are Roma. Tests diagnosing Roma children are in Czech putting the Roma speaking children at a disadvantage. Advocates for Roma rights say that Roma children receive a second-class education and many do not make it past the eighth grade. Government officials counteract accusations of bias by charging parents with a lack of involvement in their children's education. The government has, however, taken steps to improve the education of Roma children by standardizing tests which remove cultural bias, increase the number of Roma teaching assistants, and allow children attending special schools to take an extra year of coursework and apply to regular high schools. Since measures came too late for some students, 18 teenagers from Ostrava are filing suit against the government saying that their rights had been violated under Czech and European law.

Ethnic Conflict

By Kristina Libby

Since the fall of the Soviet Union, Russia has experienced high levels of ethnic conflict with regard to exit claims by former satellite states that no longer want to be part of the federation. Exit claims often antagonize the state. However, political leaders of titular ethnicities maximize ethnic revivals to keep traditions alive, and to minimize the amount of exclusion vis-à-vis the center. Massive human rights violations have resulted because of misperceptions between the center and the periphery, especially in Chechnya, the Volga-Ural's Region and Eastern Siberia.

Following the 1994 Chechen conflict, Chechen rebels have escalated their fight for independence. It has been argued that Russia's military tactics have violated the Geneva Conventions by performing extrajudicial executions, torture (including rape), "disappearances," and arbitrary detentions. The issue of collective memory must be understood when attempting to quell the conflict. When group collectives with shared histories are faced with direct violence, they will provide a strong and often insurmountable opposition; this creates a culture that is resistant to the "other" and to compromise. Regarding Chechnya in particular, government policies need to acknowledge the role of collective memory while considering group stabilization, the role of the deportations, the role of Shamil Basayev, and the role of the Russian military establishment.

The Volga-Urals region also experiences high levels of ethnic conflict, but there is less physical violence than in Chechnya due to their nationalizing policies and high levels of economic independence. Reshit Wegyizov, the Tatarstan ombudsman, stated that he receives about 1,000 appeals from people regarding human rights violations and between seven and 11 percent of them are resolved. Many of these stem from torture and police brutality against minorities. The quest for a "Great Tatarsan" could become the greatest source of ethnic instability in Russia, as it would infringe on ethnic claims in Bashkortostan, Chuvashia, Mari El and the Ulyanovsk oblast; these regions have a large number of Tatars but are currently outside of its federal borders. Concurrently, the presence of Islam affects ethnic claims—a genuine revival has been minimal but the political implications have been huge. Of larger concern is the Islamic revival in neighboring Dagestan. An increase in instability would be detrimental for Russia due to the province's economic importance.

Since 1989, Tuva, one of the four republics in Eastern Siberia, has been pursuing independence. Tuvians practice Buddhism and speak Turkish, a characteristic which makes them distinct. Rising crime and unemployment make this situation similar to that in the Northern Caucasus. Nevertheless, there is little information concerning the atrocities being committed. In part, this omission can be attributed to the relative size of Tuva.

Particularly since September 11, the U.S. and other nations in the world have become lax concerning Russia's approach to issues of ethnic conflict. The U.S. has allowed for levels of violence that previously would have been considered unacceptable as long as a tenuous claim that the violations related to Al-Qaeda existed. Frequently, this torture affected people with ethnic opinions dissimilar to those held by the Russian government rather than terrorists.

It is difficult to determine which catalysts for ethnic violence exist, and how they may be defined and differentiated. While a large amount of information exists concerning Chechnya, little information exists concerning human rights violations in other areas. If left unchecked, these

violations will become major spots of instability. The following bibliography breaks down ethnic conflict by area, beginning with a few sources on ethnic conflict more broadly.

Definitions

Ethnic Conflict

Hughes, James and Gwendolyn Sasse. 2001. "Comparing Regional and Ethnic Conflict in Post-Soviet Transition States." *Regional and Federal Studies* 11 (3): 1-35.

Annotation: This article discusses the nature of ethnic conflict as well as the literature that defines and differentiates types of ethnic conflict. The article explores various conflicts and the differences between regional and ethnic conflict.

Ethnicity

Gorenburg, Dmitry. 1999. "Regional Separatism in Russia: Mobilization or Power Grab?" *Europe-Asia Studies*, 51: 245-275.

Annotation: Gorenburg explores four Russian provinces and argues that the view of historians, who see ethnicity as a ploy for greater funding from the central government, is false. He argues that leaders of titular ethnic groups want to maximize ethnic revival while minimizing the exclusion of the Russian government. In doing so, he suggests that these findings could be applicable to other provinces, except the Northern Caucasus.

_____. 2001. "Nationalism for the Masses: Popular Support for Nationalism in Russia's Ethnic Republics." *Europe-Asia Studies* 53 (1): 73-104.

Annotation: Gorenburg provides statistical data for the theoretical framework developed earlier. However, the thesis of this article is that the strength of national identity and the extent to which it links nationalist movements is based on the ethnic institutions of the state. Comments are also made concerning those who are in favor of ethnic revival, i.e. those living in rural environments or those highly educated.

Kaufman, Eric. 2000. "Liberal Ethnicity: Beyond Liberal Nationalism and Minority Rights." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 23 (6): 1008-1119.

Annotation: This article discusses ethnicity with the framework of liberalism. It argues that the work of liberal communitarians increases in difficulty as they move from national, to cultural, to ethnic groups. Therefore, ethnic groups with high levels of exclusivity increase the difficulty involved in creating a common good and overall sense of equality.

King, Charles. 2004. "The Micro-politics of Social Violence." *World Politics* 56: 431-455.

Annotation: The author examines the field of ethnic conflict literature and policy observations and then moves on to review and criticize two recent books. In doing so, he states that all past literature is "wholly phantom or ancillary to the core concerns of studying social violence". Thus, he argues that the literature that differentiates the study of nationalism from the study of ethnic conflict is about the questions asked and not about the conflicts explored. Its focus is more on the issue of ethnic conflict than it is on Russian states.

Williams, Bryan Gills. 2000. "Commemorating 'The Deportation' In Post-Soviet Chechnya: The Role of Memorialization and Collective Memory in the 1994-1996 and 1999-2000 Russo-Chechen Wars." *History & Memory* 12 (1): 101-134.

Annotation: Williams stresses the role of collective memory and group mentality in the creation and resistance of the Chechen nation-state. In the course of the paper, he argues that "the full integration of the Republic of Chechnya into the Russian Federation is impossible—it is hindered by historical memory, the experience of the past decade's two wars and the peculiarities of Chechen mentality, customs etc." (104). The argument rests on the idea that historical memory and group collectives, when faced with unrestrained directed violence, provide a strong counter force. In order to deal with the violence, governments need to address the group feelings of betrayal and repression before countermeasures can be made to perpetuate a lasting peaceful situation. In this case, both Russian and Chechen historical memories and collective attitudes need to be worked through.

_____. 2004. "From 'Secessionist Rebels' To 'Al-Qaeda Shock Brigades': Assessing Russia's Efforts to Extend the Post-September 11th War on Terror to Chechnya." *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East*, 24(1): 197-209.

Annotation: Williams argues that the U.S. decision to side with Russia, in seeing Chechens as a nation of trans-national terrorists, is fundamentally flawed. The argument made is that the Chechens constitute a group of rebels fighting for freedom, and are separate and fundamentally different from the Muslim extremists the U.S. fears. However, an inability to acknowledge Chechen claims and the leaders of the moderate group could result in a severe dislike of the U.S. and eventually spawn anti-U.S. terror attacks. The author argues that the best move for the U.S. government would be to acknowledge the horrors perpetrated by the U.S. government and advocate a rebuilding of Chechnya as an autonomous nation.

Chechnya

2004. "Minorities at Risk. *Assessment for Chechens in Russia*" College Park: University of Maryland, 5 October. <http://www.cidcm.umd.edu/inscr/mar/assessment.asp?groupId=36504>.

Annotation: The report assesses the current situation in Chechnya. It is a surface level historical account and provides a relatively unbiased and concise history of the conflict and current (2004) policy decisions being made with regards to the Chechen situation. The article also discusses statistics relating to the number of refugees fleeing Chechnya.

2004. "The War in Chechnya and Russian Civil Society." Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe:
http://www.csce.gov/index.cfm?Fuseaction=ContentRecords.ViewDetail&ContentRecord_id=281&ContentType=B&CFID=26618717&CFTOKEN=95138370.

Annotation: This briefing to Congress is done by two Russians. They argue that much of what is known about Chechnya is simply propaganda. The article concludes with an interesting question and answer period in which the preferences of both sides are made clearer. Interestingly enough, there seems to be little debate about the fact that the Russian government was propagating much of the Chechen information. However, this may be simply out of sensitivity to the speakers.

2005. "Russia: Country Reports on Human Rights Practices, 2005." U.S. Department of State, government report. <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2005/61671.htm>.

Annotation: This report details human rights abuses; it makes special note of Chechnya and Ingushetia. In particular, it addresses torture and disappearance. The article deals with a wide range of issues, however, and therefore the topics mentioned are only discussed briefly. Yet specific examples of cases are given, which is necessary for understanding the nature of torture, free press, and disappearance in this area.

2006. "Russia Condemned For Disappearance of Chechen." Human Rights Watch.
<http://www.hrw.org/>.

Annotation: This press release details the disappearance of the Chechen, Khajimurat Yandiev.

2006. "Russia Condemned for Chechen Killings." Human Rights Watch. <http://www.hrw.org/>.

Annotation: This provides an example of Russian human rights abuses in Chechnya.

- Cassidy, Robert. 2003. "Russia in Afghanistan and Chechnya: Military Strategic Culture and the Paradoxes of Asymmetrical Warfare." Department of Defence, U.S. Government: 1-81.
<http://www.defenselink.mil/>.

Annotation: The author discusses differences in military style between the Soviet Invasion of Afghanistan and the Russia invasion in Chechnya, with the aim of offering proposals for change

in the U.S. army. It documents the Soviet approach to fighting Chechens and solidifies the Russian military view as fighting Chechen terrorists.

Staub, Ervin. 1992. *The Roots of Evil: The Origins of Genocide and Group Violence*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Annotation: Staub's book discusses the nature of genocide and the evil that begets its perpetration. While this does not relate directly to the topics, it provides an understanding of group mentality that can lead to genocide and group violence. His article is aimed at understanding the Holocaust, but the parallel associations to the Chechen genocide are enlightening.

Tishkov, Valery. 2004. *Chechnya: Life in a War Torn Society*. California: University of California Press.

Annotation: This book provides an extensive look at the history of Chechnya, the road to war, the actual war, and the direct aftermath of war. The author deals with the notion of the Chechen spirit and what it means to be Chechen. His argument is that the factual truth is not as important as the moral or interpretative truth. In understanding this, his book becomes a history of the varying sides of the war rather than a unilateral view of the conflict.

Valentino, Benjamin A. 2005. *Final Solutions: Mass Killing and Genocide in the Twentieth Century*. London: Cornell University Press.

Annotation: Valentino discusses the nature of mass killing and the government policies that can and cannot stop this act from happening. The book argues against the position of Ervin Staub, claiming that a small group of leaders without much popular support can commit mass atrocities. His argument for preventing future atrocities is that societies must be disarmed and leaders removed from power.

Tatarstan

Davis, Howard, Phillip Hammond, and Lilia Nizamova. "Media, Language Policy and Cultural Change in Tatarstan: Historic vs. Pragmatic Claims to Nationhood," 6 (2): 203-226.

Annotation: Davis claims that the problem in Tatarstan involves differences in claims of ethnic nationalism. His extensive article provides an understanding of the changing nature of ethnic culture. He claims that history should not be the only factor in explaining ethnicity and that ethnicity changes rapidly. Therefore, an understanding of the current situation involves an understanding of politics, culture, media, and education as well as ethnicity. The article provides a distinct overview of Tatar identity.

Dunlop, John and Menon Rajan. "Chaos in the North Caucasus and Russia's Future." *Survival* 48 (2): 97-114.

Annotation: The authors argue that Chechen-style turmoil is spreading across the North Caucasus and that the Kremlin seems incapable of coping with the mounting chaos, or even understanding its causes. Islam has become an increasingly powerful political force seeking a sharia-based Caliphate uniting the North Caucasus. Russia has millions of Muslims, as well as xenophobic, anti-Muslim organizations, and such sentiments are increasingly prominent in the Russian political landscape. The spread of the North Caucasus crisis to other Muslim regions, such as Bashkortostan and Tatarstan, could affect Russia's entire political trajectory.

Khakimov, Raphael. 1998. "Tatarstan's Model for Developing Russian Federalism." *Center and Periphery in Russian Politics*, 235: 43-52.

Annotation: Khakimov discusses the Treaty between Russia and Tatarstan and how this treaty can be an effective model. He notes that it is unique to the situation and provides a buffer between each entity's separate constitutions. Because of the political situation in Russia, it would have been too difficult to create a new combined constitution. This article analytically addresses the situation using Tartastan as a model.

Yemelianova, Galina. 1999. "Islam and Nation Building in Tatarstan and Dagestan of the Russian Federation." *Nationalities Papers* 27 (4): 1-25.

Annotation: Yemelianova discusses, historically, the rise of Islam and its relationship to nation-building and ethnicities. She claims that ultimately Islam in Tatarstan is more of a political revival than a true religious revival. However, in Dagestan, it is an embraced religion. Her argument discusses primarily ethnic tension in Tatarstan.

Eastern Siberia

Gorenburg, Dmitry. 1999. "Regional Separatism in Russia: Mobilization or Power Grab?" *Europe-Asia Studies*, 51: 245-275.

Annotation: Gorenburg explores four provinces in Russia and explains how the view of historians, who see ethnicity as a ploy for greater funding from the central government, is false. Instead, he argues that leaders of titular ethnic groups want to maximize ethnic revival while minimizing the exclusion of the Russian governments. His study is mainly applicable to the Volga- Urals region. However, he suggests that these findings could be applicable to other provinces, except the North Caucas.

Khamidov, Alisher. 2002. "Brewing Ethnic Tension Causing Concern in South Kyrgyzstan." *TOL WIRE*, 19 November.

Annotation: Khamidov makes a short but comprehensive comparison of recent policies attempted by the community and government in dealing with ethnic conflict. He also provides statistics concerning ethnic Uzbeks' opinions about the current government.

Political and International Responses

2003. "Georgia: What Now?" International Crisis Group, 151.

Annotation: The report concludes that a stable Georgia is in the interest of all parties: Russia, Georgia, U.S., and the E.U.. The best path forward, the report believes, is for a popularly supported and strong government that is respected internationally, who can deal with social and economic progress. These conclusions are based on a historical overview done by the committee. The report also offers recommendations for future political and international success. It does offer suggestions that need to be incorporated at the present, specifically a strong and publicly supported government who can move Georgia forward with Georgian issues at heart but also with a strong sense of the international community and its reception of those policies.

2003. "Rough Justice: The Law and Human Rights in the Russian Federation." Amnesty International. <http://www.amnesty.org/russia>.

Annotation: The report offers policy suggestions based on increased legal and governmental regulations as a means of countering human rights abuses. It also covers government, anti-terrorism projects, and the prison system.

2006. "Ethnic Minorities under Attack." Amnesty International. <http://www.amnesty.org/russia/minorities.html>.

Annotation: The web page states that Russia has not been hard enough on those who perpetrate crimes of ethnic violence. Furthermore, it discusses the state's institutional violence towards visible minorities.

Codagnone, Cristiano and Vassily Filippov. 2000. "Equity, Exit and National Identity in a Multinational Federation: The 'Multicultural Constitutional Patriotism' Project in Russia." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 26 (2).

Annotation: Cristiano Codagnone and Vassily Filippov discuss the new measures taken by the Russian government in creating a federation of "autonomous nation-states." The two authors bring to light a variety of differing opinions about the issue from the periphery, the center,

Russian, and ethnic nationals. The authors comment on the asymmetric nature of Russia's current policy and the limits of government power as an infringement upon central and effective governing of the new federation.

Kortunov, S. 1998. "Russia's Way: National Identity and Foreign Policy." *International Affairs: A Russian Journal* 4 (44).

Annotation: Kortunov presents a Russian view concerning exit claims and independence. His main argument centers on the idea that the West, especially America, is acting to destroy the Russian empire. Russia, he argues, has the right to build a democratic and economically tied union of states which could become a federation similar to the USA. However, he notes that this is not imperialism but rather a rebuilding of ethnic Russian nationalism. Ironically, the attempts to do this often result in a lack of minority nationalism.

Mendelson, Sarah. 2002. "Russian Rights Imperilled: Has Anybody Noticed." *International Security* 26 (4): 39-69.

Annotation: Mendelson examines the international community's engagement with Russian violations of human rights in Chechnya. This article posits that the international system has a high threshold for rights abuses post September 11. In fact, she argues that international human rights laws are being ignored in order to fight terrorism; the process of "global democratization" is increasing the occurrence of human rights violations because of internal and external barriers associated with the process that prevent adherence to the norms.

Pearson, Frederic S. 2001. "Dimensions of Conflict Resolution in Ethnopolitical Disputes." *Journal of Peace Research* 38 (3): 275-287.

Annotation: This article points out that elite initiatives are not always the best ways of resolving conflict in nations. Instead, grass roots attempts must also be employed in order to stimulate collective action by the people. Being the foremost paper from a series of conference papers, the article also breaks down many ideas about conflict and resolution.

Rywkin, Michael. 2006. "The Phenomenon of Quasi-States." *Diogenes* 53 (2): 23-28.

Annotation: Rywkin notes that the collapse of the Soviet Union resulted in the independence of a number of republics, which gave rise to the appearance of what the author calls "quasi-states." A quasi-state does not enjoy full international recognition, but functions nonetheless as a genuine state entity with its administration, army and financial system—all controlled by the protector. Its existence continually threatens the peace and security of the region in which it is situated, keeping it in a state of permanent tension. This article provides a base for understanding the political situation.

Gender and Human Rights

By Lisa Weilminster

Russia's historical transition from a communist society to a system of democracy and free market practices has resulted in major social changes affecting the rights of men and women. Analysis of gender and human rights in Russia requires an evaluation of the changing social relations within post-Soviet society, which are shaped by the complex factors of ethnicity, economic class, gender norms, and the role of the state in shaping present gender inequities that hinder the realization of universal human rights. Looking particularly at how gender issues relate to changing identities, employment opportunities, health care and conditions, and public and private violence, one can more closely examine how inequitable gender relations in these areas have limited the human rights of a number of people, especially women and sexual minorities.

Historically, the Soviet Union created a social order based on equal political and economic rights for women and men in the public sphere. However, such policies were primarily driven by the economic needs of the state and, as such, did little to transform social norms that cast women as the primary caretakers of the household. Under this system, the Soviet state cast itself as the universal "fatherly" provider and protector of society, and minimized the role of actual fathers by directing men's attention toward and valuing their role in the public economy. Further inequalities resulted from the social construction of the ideal Soviet society based on a heterosexual family model, which marginalized sexual minorities.

The post-Soviet transition has witnessed the declining role of the state as the general provider for its people. The rise of the liberal economic market has generated significant social instability and increased unemployment. While the new Russian state has expressed a legal commitment to equality for all and has removed homosexuality from its criminal codebooks, its weak democratic institutions do not effectively enforce or protect these legal measures. Thus, inequality remains a widespread problem in Russia as reflected by the poor economic and health conditions of men and women, the continued ill treatment of homosexuals, as well as the victimization of women through public and private violence.

Inequalities are, in part, shaped and reinforced by the dominant gender norms of society, which associate men and women with particular gender identities. The new market system and reassertion of traditional values have venerated masculinity as well as the heterosexual model of the family. These norms play a powerful role in the unequal relations between men and women, and in the continued discrimination against homosexuals. Women and homosexuals are subordinated under this social model and, as such, face inequitable economic and health treatment, as well as an increased vulnerability to being subjected to violence. Changing gender identities within Russia are, therefore, closely related to the other issues covered in this overview.

Russia has suffered incredible economic strain following its transition from communism, which has had a harsh effect on men and women in different ways. Many Russian men have found themselves unemployed, which has severely damaged their masculine identity as breadwinners and as the major workforce for the Russian state. The increasingly hands-off state policies toward the family have not been countered with an increase in male support in the home. Women therefore continue to bear a double burden. As most households require a second income, many women

continue to work in the public sphere but also remain the main caretakers in the home. Economic inequalities extend beyond this, however, to include issues of unequal wages for women and a high prevalence of sexual harassment and discrimination in the labor market that impacts women's ability to acquire steady employment. Yet, gender inequities are not simply limited to economics.

Health inequalities abound in Russia as well. High rates of unemployment have driven many men to alcoholism and suicide in significantly higher rates than females; yet, the overwhelming majority of suicide prevention centers are for women. Gender inequalities also factor into the areas of HIV/AIDS health. Male homosexuals have one of the highest rates of HIV, but the stigma against homosexuality has restricted their access to information on the disease and to healthcare. Growing numbers of women have also contracted HIV. Pregnant women and their children face incredible discrimination in terms of quality care, and child abandonment is a growing problem. Finally, the gap in mortality rates for men and women negatively affect women who may be left prematurely widowed and lacking in adequate income for themselves and their remaining family.

Economic conditions and issues of women's rights for health and safety factor very closely into the study of private and public violence in the post-Soviet Russia. Domestic violence and violence against sex workers is highly prevalent in Russian society and mostly affects women. The Russian state has done little to address the problem, as law enforcement has viewed it as a private matter outside of its jurisdiction. The increasing privatization of the state has reinforced the now limited role of the state to act in the public and private spheres. Public discrimination and violence, however, are also problematic. Despite legal changes to end the criminalization of homosexuality, discrimination and attacks against sexual minorities still occur in Russia today. State conflicts against ethnic minorities and secessionist movements have also facilitated numerous acts of rape and sexual violence by the Russian military and law enforcement against men, women, and young girls and boys. Both in the cases of violence against homosexuals and sexual crimes committed as part of state conflicts, the Russian government has taken little legal action to investigate or adequately try and punish the perpetrators.

Human rights violations that stem from the complex gender inequalities in Russian society are extensive and require further research and investigation. The following bibliography of sources is divided into the four main sections discussed above: changing gender identities, employment issues, health care and conditions, and public and private violence. One should note that many of these topics overlap and are difficult to analyze independent of these other issue areas. However, the following sources provide important foundational information to understand and further explore the specific factors and general patterns related to gender inequality and human rights in post-Soviet Russia.

Changing Gender Identities

Attwood, Lynne. 1996. "Young People, Sex and Sexual Identity." In Gender, Generation and Identity in Contemporary Russia, ed. Hilary Pilkington, New York: Routledge. 95-119.

Annotation: This source offers an analytical overview of the attitudes on gender roles and sexuality during the Soviet Union and post-Soviet Russia. Looking at issues of homosexuality, the market economy, the sex industry, and the sexual practices of youth, Attwood highlights

how popular literature and the press exemplify a continued adherence to the dichotomous view of weak and submissive females versus strong males. She notes that women's roles and their actions are directly related to the moral well-being of the state. This has particular implications for lesbians and sex workers, leading to very negative perceptions of these women as defying their duties and obligations to Russian society.

Kukhterin, Sergei. 2000. "Fathers and Patriarchs in Communist and Post-Communist Russia." In Gender, Society and the State in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia, ed. Sarah Ashwin. New York: Routledge. 71-89.

Annotation: Kukhterin explores masculinity norms and the role of men in 20th century Russia. A primary component of his argument is that the Soviet repression of the church and traditional family was not meant to empower women, but to expand the public reach of the state beyond the barriers of the private sphere. A significant implication of this was a negation of the individual male's role as a father. Instead, the state assumed the position of father of the collective, while the male members of society were valued for their role in the public, economic sphere. Post-Soviet transition has eliminated the state father-figure, and the dominant view is that men are once again meant to assert their position as head of the household. Yet, as Kukhterin's interviews highlight, men and women tend to have very different conceptions of the male role in the household. Women would like to see men play a greater part in the household but are resistant to the resurrection of a patriarchal system.

Meshcherkina, Elena. 2000. "New Russian Men: Masculinity Regained?" In Gender, Society and the State in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia, ed. Sarah Ashwin. New York: Routledge. 105-117.

Annotation: This study looks at the changing gender hierarchies among the entrepreneurial class in Russia. Whereas, men's status and position under the Soviet system was defined in relation to the state, the post-Soviet system requires men to judge themselves against other males in society. Alongside these changes, however, are adjustments in the private sphere as well. Meshcherkina notes that among the men she interviewed for this study, all had relied, at least temporarily, on their female partners for economic support during the early stages of Russian economic transition. Despite this fact, the men consistently downplayed such dependency, while focusing instead on women's role in the home and men's position in the workforce and in control of the household. This research provides an interesting look at the construction of gender norms among a particular segment of the population, and the divergence between these norms and the economic reality.

Pavlychko, Solomea. 1996. "Feminism in Post-Communist Ukraine Society." In Women in Russian and Ukraine, ed. Rosalind Marsh, 305-314. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Annotation: This article explores the history of feminism in Ukraine, and how, after the collapse of the Soviet Union, it has faced a backlash as masculine revivalism and patriarchal mythologies have begun to dominate the national identity. Feminism and feminist organizations have been

present in Ukraine since the late 1800s, but the movement has faced a crisis, recently, as changes in society have shifted to focus on men's superior role in the workforce and family. This is particularly evident given the government's policies on the family, which identify women's problems as limited to her position as mother and caretaker of the home. This article was published a decade ago, but it offers interesting information to broaden the study of gender issues and rights outside of Russia.

Riordan, James. 1996. "Sexual Minorities: The Status of Gay and Lesbians in Russian-Soviet-Russian Society." In *Women in Russia and Ukraine*, ed. Rosalind Marsh. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 156-172.

Annotation: Riordan offers a summary of changes in policy with regard to homosexuality in modern Russian history. He identifies the fact that, historically, Russia has tended to be more tolerant of homosexual behavior than its European neighbors. However, by the 1917 Revolution, the changing social and class dynamics led to the view that homosexuals posed a national threat. This led to the criminalization of homosexuality. The changing attitudes were also reflected in the increased medicalization of homosexuality, in which it was defined as a pathological disease. In post-Soviet Russia, homosexuality has been legally removed as an official crime; however, society continues to view homosexual behavior fearfully. Following this history, Riordan offers a brief synopsis of the development of gay and lesbians groups and the future challenges they face. This source provides a sound summary of homosexual issues in Russian history up to the middle of the last decade.

Roubleva, Camilla. 2007. "The Other Siberia Part 1: Gay Russia under Church and State—of Priests, Commissars, and Putin." *Gully On-line Magazine*. 08 February:
http://www.thegully.com/essays/russia/030411_gay_overview_law.html.

Annotation: This article offers a concise modern history of homophobia in Russia up to the present time. Roubleva examines the role of the church and the state in punishing and criminalizing homosexuality. The article highlights recent developments in post-Soviet Russian regarding the treatment of homosexuals by the state, which, as a means to gain the favor of the E.U., has not re-criminalized homosexuality but has faced political pressure from conservative and mainstream political parties to criminalize gay, and now, lesbian behavior. Homosexuality, and particularly, lesbianism, is presently framed within the political debates on population because it is viewed as a threat to Russia's already shrinking fertility rates. While the article provides an overview of homosexuality in Russia, it lacks depth and analysis into the various forces affecting changes in policy on homosexual rights.

Economic Issues

Ashwin, Sarah. 2002. "A Woman Is Everything': The Reproduction of Soviet Ideals of Womanhood in Post-Communist Russia." In Work, Employment, and Transition: Restructuring Livelihoods in Post-Communism, ed. Adrian Smith, et al. New York: Routledge: 117-134.

Annotation: This article offers a critical assessment of the prevailing gender norms in post-Soviet Russia regarding women's roles in the public and private spheres. Through the use of extensive interviews and non-random group sampling involving both men and women, Ashwin provides a comparative analysis of the adaptation of Soviet-era gender roles to the present time period. According to the qualitative data collected from men and women at different stages of the employment process, women continue to see their role as partially to seek employment and contribute to the household income. However, women also see their role as household managers. Ashwin therefore concludes that women have maintained their public, Soviet-era gender identity; rather than abandoning it to return to the private sphere following the post-communist transition, women have assumed the dual burden of working and serving as the primary domestic caretaker.

Attwood, Lynne. 1996. "The Post-Soviet Woman in the Move to the Market: A Return to Domesticity and Dependence?" In Women in Russia and Ukraine, ed. Rosalind Marsh, 255-266. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 255-266.

Annotation: Attwood's article is based on the argument that the transition to a market-based economic system has resulted in the "re-masculinization" of Russia and the undervaluing of women, who were formerly honored in Soviet society. The focus is on women's experiences in the new liberal economy, which has restructured the work force to reassert men's position of dominance in society. Attwood notes that women's double burden of working in the public sphere and caring for the home has left them significantly vulnerable to being viewed as less efficient compared to male workers and therefore highly susceptible to being fired. Attwood's article provides an interesting critique of the dark side of the transition from communism to capitalism, and how easily the shallow emancipation of women during the Bolshevik revolution could be reversed. Although the article is from the mid 1990s, the issues remain relevant today.

Human Rights Watch. 1995. "Russia: Neither Jobs nor Justice-State Discrimination against Women in Russia." 7(5): <http://www.hrw.org/reports/1995/Russia2a.htm>.

Annotation: Although over a decade old, this report provides a comprehensive evaluation of women's unequal legal protection in the areas of employment and domestic violence. Using information gathered from interviews with researchers as well as unemployed women, government officials, and victims of domestic violence, the report focuses on the role of the state in perpetuating sex discrimination by failing to enforce laws to protect women against unequal treatment and violence. While there have been some moves to create new laws of gender equality and improve enforcement, the report is critical of the fact that most legal adjustments focus on providing improved protections for women, which tend to include mostly

maternity benefits and perpetuate the view that women are costly to employ and are less efficient than men. The lack of effective state regulation has resulted in little protection for women against sexual abuse and harassment in the workplace, as well as domestic violence. This is a valuable source that effectively identifies how normative gender conceptions supported by state and society have very negative repercussions for women.

Kiblitckaya, Marina. 2000. "Russia's Female Breadwinners: The Changing Subjective Experience." In Gender, State and Society in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia, ed. Sarah Ashwin. New York: Routledge: 55-70.

Annotation: This article offers a comparative study of the historical changes in women's position as breadwinners in Russian society. Beginning with women from the 1920s and 30s, the research traces the changing motivations behind women's role in the labor forces. Under the early communist system women's employment was part of their civil duty; however, later periods of women's employment are increasingly linked to the economic necessities of the family rather than to the fulfillment of women's responsibility to the state. For those seeking to do more in-depth research on gender inequality in the area of economics, this article can provide a helpful summary of women's condition historically and in the present.

Roschin, S Yu. and Zubarevich, N. V. 2005. *Gender Equality and Extensions of Women Rights in Russia in the Context of the U.N. Millennium Development Goals*. UNESCO.
http://www.unesco.ru/files/docs/shs/publ/gender_mdg_eng.pdf.

Annotation: This is a thorough assessment of the different dimensions of gender inequalities in Russia. The study looks at economic, education, and health disparities between men and women; it notes that gender inequalities in Russia must be approached and dealt with differently than most other parts of the world. This is because under the Soviet system, men and women had legally recognized equal rights that enabled women equal access to education and the ability to join the labor force with men. The inequalities in Russia are, thus, more subtle and include unequal wages for, and discrimination and segregation of, women in the job market. Additionally, the study notes that health inequalities, for example those in mortality, which affect men in particular, have negative effects for women. Early widowhood, domestic violence, increased numbers of maternal-led single homes, and poverty all extend from, among other things, the excessive alcohol consumption on the part of men which has contributed to their high early death rates. Overall, this is a good source for recent statistical data. It also offers a comprehensive analysis of the "bottom-up" and "top-down" dimensions of gender inequality, which are reflected in the section conclusions and policy recommendations.

Smirnov, Aleksandr I. 2002. "Women in the Russian Army." *Russian Social Science Review* 43 (4): 61-71.

Annotation: Using survey data of 993 women in military service, Smirnov analyzes the issues of gender inequality facing women in the Russian military. Since the collapse of the Soviet Union,

women's numbers in the military have increased significantly. While their involvement has diversified the military, women tend to face inequality on several different levels. Despite having higher levels of education on average as compared to the men, women encounter discriminatory barriers to obtaining positions of leadership. Those that do achieve an officer post tend to be relegated to administrative tasks. Servicewomen are also vulnerable to aggressive attacks from their male counterparts, who may feel threatened by the influx of women into their perceived domain. The broader political and economic instability of Russia has affected the job security of military women; in particular the lax adherence to Russian legal provisions to protect women in the labor force have poorly affected servicewomen who may face unfavorable working conditions or discrimination with little effective options for recourse. Finally, military women must deal with the additional burden of unequal gender relations in the household, which require women to do more of the housework on top of their military duties.

Snezhkova, Irina. 2005. "Ethnic Aspects of Gender Social Inequality." *Russian Social Science Review* 46(3): 23-34.

Annotation: This article uses survey data collected from urban women of titular and non-titular groups in four Russian regions to test the hypothesis that economic conditions have a greater impact on different ethnic women's behavior rather than historical/cultural traditions. The regions examined include Tatarstan, Bashkortostan, Sakha, and Orenburg Oblast. Looking at work attitudes and satisfaction, supplementary employment, labor mobility, earnings, sense of well-being, and political participation, the survey results identified general inequality between men and women. However, the differences in the responses of women's perception of their well-being and political participation was more reflective of the diverse economic conditions of the regions rather than a pattern of behavior among all ethnic groups. While this article presents interesting data on ethnic men's and women's perceptions of gender roles and their own employment and political participation, it provides little critical assessment of the data specifically, and gender norms in general. It seems that a focus on urban women might somewhat bias the conclusions; further research might seek to include rural women into the investigation of gender inequity in ethnic groups.

Health Care and Conditions

Cockerham, William C., Brian P. Hinote, Pamela Abbott. 2006. "Psychological Distress, Gender, and Health Lifestyles in Belarus, Kazakhstan, Russia, and Ukraine." *Social Science & Medicine* 63: 2381-2394.

Annotation: The authors report on the findings of their large scale comparative study on psychological distress and its impact on the high mortality rates and significant gender gaps in mortality rates within these four countries. The results are based on quantitative and qualitative research, suggesting that, overall, women tend to feel more psychologically distressed than men but still live longer. Despite distress, most women do not engage in behavior that negatively affects their health to the degree of men, who tend to drink and smoke excessively. Women's

health is most negatively affected by their poor diets, which seems to reflect the trade-off of women living off lower incomes and suffering from poor economic conditions in general. Men, on the other hand, engage in the detrimental health pattern of alcoholism, not necessarily because of stress, but due to social norms which dictate drinking as a masculine activity. Thus, this study adds to previous research on alcoholism as a major contributor to the higher mortality of men by clarifying the reasons behind male alcoholism. It also subtly highlights how gender roles have affected health and lifestyle patterns in these states. While norms of masculinity require men to consume alcohol, which lowers their stress but is detrimental to their health, women adhere to their role as primary caretaker and tend to bear the burden of stress with few outlets in order to continue to care for the family.

Human Rights Watch. 2005. "Positively Abandoned: Stigma and Discrimination against HIV-Positive Mother and Their Children in Russia." 17(4): <http://hrw.org/reports/2005/russia0605/russia0605.pdf>.

Annotation: This report explores the growing problem of discrimination against mothers and children with HIV/AIDS and its implications. HIV/AIDS is stigmatized to such a degree in Russian society, that many still do not have adequate knowledge about the transmission of the disease or how to protect themselves. The Russian government has done little to address the AIDS epidemic and, just as importantly, to uphold and enforce its laws which protect HIV/AIDS patients from discrimination from employment and health care. The report offers important cases studies and policy recommendations, but it does not adequately highlight the major social norms and economic conditions that further exacerbate the particular condition of mothers with HIV.

Murcott, Anne and Annie Feltman. 1996. "Beliefs About Reproductive Health: Young Russian Women Talking." In Gender, Generation and Identity in Contemporary Russia, ed. Hilary Pilkington. New York: Routledge: 152-168.

Annotation: As a preliminary study based on the responses of sixty-three women, interviewed either collectively or individually in the cities of St. Petersburg and Samara, this source presents the opinions of women on their general and reproductive health. Part of the research is meant to compare the beliefs of Russians towards health with the views held in other parts of the world. The responses collected suggest that Russian beliefs tend to be overwhelmingly similar to beliefs prevalent in countries such as Britain. What is perhaps of greater interest in the article are the references to the poor economic and environmental issues, which were believed to be the source of women's poor health. This study, now thirteen years old, provides ample areas to conduct further research into the health conditions affecting Russian women and their views on them today.

Roschin, S Yu. and Zubarevich, N. V. *Gender Equality and Extensions of Women Rights in Russia in the Context of the U.N. Millennium Development Goals*. UNESCO, 2005.
http://www.unesco.ru/files/docs/shs/publ/gender_mdg_eng.pdf.

Annotation: This is a thorough assessment of the different dimensions of gender inequalities in Russia. The study looks at economic, education, and health disparities between men and women, and notes that gender inequalities in Russia must be approached and dealt with differently than most other parts of the world. This is because under the Soviet system, men and women had legally recognized equal rights that enabled women equal access to education and the ability to join the labor force with men. Overall, this is a good source for recent statistical data. It also offers a comprehensive analysis of the 'bottom-up' and 'top-down' dimensions of gender inequality, which are reflected in the section conclusions and policy recommendations.

Wier, Fred. 2003. "Russia Begins to Reconsider Wider Use of Abortion." *Christian Science Monitor*, 28 August. <http://www.csmonitor.com/2003/0828/p01s03-woeu.html>.

Annotation: This brief article covers issues related to a governmental decree that limits women's ability to have a late-term abortion. While political and medical opponents to abortion see this as a positive development, others view it as another attempt by the state to try to control declining population levels. Many women are also skeptic of governmental measures to effectively curb abortions, believing that abortions will simply go underground. Activists and health officials have argued that more attention should be paid to providing information on contraception and effective family planning, rather than on simply eliminating abortions. However, the article reports that the Duma withdrew all financial support for family planning centers in 1998. Although it lacks in-depth study of the topic, this article effectively highlights the tension between state population policy and women's desire to control their reproductive lives.

Williams, Christopher. 1996. "Abortion and Women's Health in Russia and the Soviet Successor States." In *Women in Russia and Ukraine*, ed. Rosalind Marsh. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press: 131-155.

Annotation: This is a study of abortion rates and their implications for low population and fertility rates in the post-Soviet states. Using survey data, the article highlights the social factors and motives behind abortions. The poor socio-economic conditions; women's desire to control family size; and widespread public suspicion and inadequate access to contraception all impact the decision of many women to seek one or multiple abortions during their fertile years. Williams notes that in Russia, abortions have often been viewed as a medical issue, and this has limited the creation and implementation of effective public policy to address the social dimensions of abortion. The article focuses blame on the government, but somewhat surprisingly, on the women's movements as well. Williams argues that these movements have not done enough to make abortion a political issue and impact legislation. It does, however, provide thorough data, which, while dated, might be useful in comparison to more recent quantitative research.

Public and Private Violence

Horne, Sharon. 1999. "Domestic Violence in Russia." *American Psychologist* 54 (1): 55-61.

Annotation: This article examines the similarities between domestic violence in Russia and other developed countries, as well as the factors that distinguish domestic violence in Russia. In terms of its uniqueness, the author argues that Russia has a historical/cultural legacy of the oppression of women. With the 1917 Revolution, women gained equal political and economic rights, but by the era of Stalin, women's issues were relegated to a lower priority level as the focus shifted to the general economic growth and production of the state. A number of factors during the post-transition era have particularly disadvantaged women and reinforced gender norms that support women's oppression. Horne notes that the market economy recognized men as the major breadwinners, which engenders a notion of superiority in men. Socially, Russia has begun to emphasize the importance of the traditional family and, within it, women's dependent position. Such notions support the subordination of women to men and can be used to justify domestic violence. Horne also explores the reasons women find it difficult to escape violence, including a lack of alternative housing, no shelters or family to turn to, and their economic dependency. Additional challenges stem from poorly defined criminal laws, weak law enforcement, and the dominant perception that domestic violence is a private matter. Finally, Horne emphasizes the need to increase pressure on the government to implement reform through the growth of civil society, the spread of information, and provision of legal training and advocacy. This is a good source for an overview of the issue, and also suggests additional areas for research including studies on Russian conceptions of violence, the motivations behind domestic violence, as well as the most appropriate intervention measures.

Johnson, Janet Elise. 2001. "Privatizing Pain: The Problem of Women Battery in Russia." *NWSA Journal* 13(3): 153-164.

Annotation: Johnson's article compares the response of the Russian state to domestic violence with the response of women's movements. Much of the difference between the two has to do with how these two entities understand and frame the battery of women. The approach of state law enforcement has been based on the conception that violence in the home is a private matter, outside the jurisdiction of the state, and that women have generally provoked the abuser to attack. Additionally, as the preservation of the family unit tends to outweigh protection of its individual members, many public services helping victims focus on reconciliation with the spouse rather than removing the woman from the violent partner. In contrast, the women's movement has supported the rise of such organizations as ANNA which seek to address and aid victims of domestic violence by providing counseling and legal aid. These groups have challenged the conception that violence within the household is a private matter, arguing that domestic violence infringes on women's human rights, which should be protected by the state. These groups face many challenges including finding adequate funding and expanding their services; yet, they are an important development to fill the vacuum left in the absence of state protection. Overall, this is a useful comparative study, and could provide further avenues for

research both in the area of state treatment of domestic violence as well as the role of civil society.

Vandenberg, Martina, and Kelly Askin. 2001. "Chechnya: Another Battleground for the Perpetuation of Gender Based Crimes." *Human Rights Review* 2 (3): 140-149.

Annotation: This brief article focuses exclusively on rape crimes resulting from the conflict in Chechnya. It outlines several cases of sexual crimes committed against women, young girls and boys, and men both in their homes and in detention centers. By and large such crimes have been committed with impunity, as the Russian government has consistently avoided effectively investigating and prosecuting the perpetrators. The authors call to mind the systematic use of rape in the Rwandan and Serbian genocides, and highlight the advancements in international law to include rape as a means of genocides. However, in the case of Chechnya, the level of sexual violence has not been viewed as crossing the threshold of being called genocide. Regardless, the authors argue that the instances of rape do count as war crimes and require attention in order to effectively stabilize Chechen society. Though it is more an advocacy piece, the article is useful for a study of gender violence due to conflict.

World Organisation Against Torture. 2003. *Violence against Women in Russia: A Report to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights*. Geneva.

Annotation: This is a very valuable source covering the various areas of violence affecting women in Russia. The report acknowledges that Russia has enacted numerous legal measures that recognize women's and men's equality; however, such laws are not well implemented. Political and economic conditions, as well as social norms supporting stereotypical divisions between men and women all contribute to discrimination against women, which as the report states, is often expressed violently. Similar to other studies, the report suggests that more efforts should be made to train law enforcement to legitimately respond to female victims needs. Overall, this report provides an updated view of how weak state enforcement of equality laws, as well as widely held public views that recognize gender divisions and accept poor treatment for women have resulted in a lack of widespread normative agreement that violent treatment of women must be confronted.

Zabelina, Tat'iana. 1996. "Sexual Violence Towards Women." In *Gender, Generation and Identity in Contemporary Russia*, ed. Hilary Pilkington. New York: Routledge: 169-186.

Annotation: Zabelina offers a summary of domestic and sexual violence issues in post-Soviet Russia during the early and mid 1990s. She notes that one of the major obstacles to effectively dealing with these issues is the popular perception among Russians that violence is only a physical act. Additionally, the remnants of Soviet definitions of collective violence that have been passed down for generations have inhibited extensive acknowledgement of violence against individuals and the rights of individuals in general. The author highlights the prevalence of victim blaming in cases of rape and domestic violence in Russia, which is used as an excuse by

authority figures and males in general and tends to be internalized by women. The consequences of this are the perpetuation of violence against women as well as the reinforcement of gender inequalities in relationships. Although it is a bit dated, this article does provide important perspectives on sexual violence in particular. It also acknowledges the incidents of violent aggression against women in situations of ethnic conflict and within minority communities, which are important areas for further research and policy protection.

Zakirove, Venera. 2005. "War against the Family: Domestic Violence and Human Rights in Russia—a View from the Bashkortostan Republic." *Current Sociology* 53(1): 75-91.

Annotation: This is partly a study of domestic violence in the Bashkortostan Republic and partly a comparative analysis between Russia and U.S. policies on domestic violence. Zakirova concludes that it is the lack of governmental management and effective social policies that have largely contributed to domestic violence in Russia and the demise of the family. She compares U.S. policy developments after the women's movement of the 1960 with Russia's continued failure to make domestic violence and healthy family relations public issues. Zakirova notes that there are still no laws criminalizing domestic violence, and that the police continue to view domestic violence as a private issue. Additionally, neither local governments nor the federal government have been overly supportive of the few women's services provided by NGOs. Zakirova's study tends to focus more on gender inequalities on a personal, psychological level rather than examining the structural factors that shape gender norms and identities. She is also not as critical of the available data as some of the other sources on the subject. Overall, however, this is a useful up-to-date source with good suggestions for areas of further research.

The Health Crisis in Russia

By Christine Danton

A health crisis has emerged in Russia due to declining health and inadequate health care. The crisis is so severe that the term “disappearing population” has been applied to Russia due to a high death rate, low birth rate, and low life expectancy among its people. These factors continue to worsen due to inefficiency and a lack of resources throughout the health care system. The government has been slow to respond to the current crisis, often ignoring calls to reform the system and sometimes passing inappropriate measures. Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and medical professionals report there is an urgent need to restructure the system, and recommend a number of programs to improve health care and reduce mortality. Continued government inaction will have a catastrophic impact on the economy, security, and quality of life in Russia. Access to health care needs to be recognized as a basic human right.

During the Soviet era, the health care system was highly centralized, wasteful, and inefficient. Despite the inefficiencies of the system, health care for patients was free—unlike the current system, which is inefficient *and* costly. The focus for the old system was on numbers, which frequently meant that patients were hospitalized unnecessarily and stayed longer so that the hospital could reach its quota. The inefficiencies of the system were fully exposed during the break-up of the Soviet Union, when the entire health care system virtually collapsed. The transition period was marked with a decline in health throughout the population due to stress, uncertainty, and poor diet. Increased demand for health care was unmet.

When Russia reformed the health care system, a monetized system was implemented. In order to function properly, this system required a free market economy, which was at the time just being constructed. Government contributions to the system have always been inadequate; patients are still having difficulty affording medications. Facilities often lack the most basic equipment, and providers of free services are forced to charge patients for care in order to keep their facilities open. Corruption and bribery are endemic to this system, which has the greatest negative impact on the poor and those who most need the care.

A number of sources estimate that the Russian population is declining by 700,000 people per year due to poor health and economic conditions. Russia is one of the few countries in the world where life expectancy is declining; it is currently at 59 years for males and 72 years for women. Fertility rates are low. Infant and under-5 child mortality rates are high. The leading cause of death among working age male and young adults is cardiovascular disease, accounting for 52 percent of deaths in Russia. Here, cardiovascular disease is attributed to stress and to harmful habits, such as smoking, drug abuse and alcoholism. Also attributed to alcoholism is the high rate of injury and poisoning, the second highest cause of death in Russia. This category includes homicide, suicide, traffic accidents and alcohol poisoning. High rates of tuberculosis, with the added challenge of drug-resistant strains and inadequate treatment, are also contributing to the overall decline in health. Despite current high levels of stress and suicide in Russia, little attention is being paid to developing mental health care.

Another factor in the current health crisis is HIV/AIDS. Russia has the highest rate of infection in Europe. High incidence of drug use meant that HIV/AIDS spread the fastest among this group

at first, but the shift has already been made to transmission among the general population. Little research has been done on HIV/AIDS in Russia and lack of data is hampering appropriate action. Current president Vladimir Putin announced a commitment of \$100 million to combat HIV/AIDS, but these funds are intended only for treatment, not for prevention or public education. Some analysts doubt that these funds will actually be allocated.

In response to declining birth rates, the government has approved financial incentives for mothers to have children by providing funds for child care. It is doubtful if the incentives are enough to substantially decrease the cost of childcare, or if mothers will actually receive the incentives. In either case, given the current health crisis, these incentives are unlikely to have any impact on birth rates.

Medical professionals and NGOs are urgently calling for a restructuring of the entire health care system. They urge the government to take the lead with appropriate comprehensive policy measures and to implement a national program to reduce mortality rates. In addition to federal policy, subprograms at the regional levels will be needed to target diseases and factors related to high mortality rates. Other recommended measures are improved emergency services, medical treatment, mental health care and road safety, as well as increased availability and affordability of medication.

If current demographic trends persist, the population of Russia is expected to decline by over 30 percent during the next 50 years. The immediate impact of this trend, however, must be recognized. It is important to acknowledge that quality of life in Russia today is dismal and needs to be addressed. During the Soviet era, Russia was the first country to implement a comprehensive health care plan for all citizens, free of charge, as a basic human right. Though the system did have its flaws and did not survive the economic reforms of the 1990s, many argue that it was far better than today's privatized system. Until health care is again recognized as a human right in Russia, quality of life will continue to decline, as will the potential for progress in all sectors of society.

2003. Health Care Systems in Transition: Russian Federation. Copenhagen: European Observatory on Health Care Systems, World Health Organization Regional Office for Europe.
<http://www.euro.who.int/document/e81966.pdf>.

Annotation: This article provides information regarding key health problems in Russia, the functioning of the health care system, and the impact of health care reforms. It provides information on delivery of health care services, plus a critique on specific areas that need to be addressed. The article closes with brief recommendations on increasing the effectiveness and efficiency of health care. It gives a comprehensive overview of how the entire system functions.

2006. "Moscow Hosts Key Aids Conference." In *BBC News*, 15 May. 2.

Annotation: This article provides brief statistics and information on the growing rates of HIV/AIDS infection across Eastern Europe and Central Asia. Ukraine and Russia have most of the region's cases, with Russia having the biggest HIV epidemic in Europe. One of the reasons for the quick spread of infection in Russia has been a lack of government response and the

assumption that HIV mainly affected foreigners. The conference is a long overdue and important step in establishing dialogue among activists, government officials and health workers on HIV/AIDS in the region.

2006. "Putin's Dwindling Russia." *International Herald Tribune*, 12 May. 1.

Annotation: This article reports on the recent state of the union address by Putin in Russia. One of the chief problems Putin addresses in his speech is the "vanishing Russian," which the reporter notes, is a very real problem. The Russian population is dwindling at a rate of 700,000 per year. In his speech, Putin promises subsidies to improve health care, to crack down on illicit alcohol, and to improve road safety. The reporter notes that democracy would be more effective in improving quality of life, as it would curb corruption and control the greedy. Unfortunately, democratic institutions cannot be installed overnight. A quicker solution would be to increase government funding for health care.

Aris, Ben. 2005. "Money for Health Care in Russia, at Long Last." *The Lancet* 366: 2.

Annotation: This article briefly outlines some key elements of the current health crisis in Russia by giving some brief but poignant information on decreasing life expectancy, annual population loss, increasing HIV/AIDS rates and high infant mortality rates. The author applauds the recent decision of the government to spend an extra \$17.8 billion to upgrade social services, including health care. While these funds are desperately needed, economists worry that more money in the system will raise inflation. The author notes that the reform announcement is part of a presidential campaign, implying that the funds are an empty promise.

Chen, Lincoln C., Friederike Wittgenstein, and Elizabeth McKeon. 1996. "The Upsurge of Mortality in Russia: Causes and Policy Implications." *Population and Development Review* 22 (3):10.

Annotation: This article discusses the increase in death rates in Russia since the collapse of communism. The article provides statistics on certain diseases and mortality rates. Average life expectancy in Russia dropped to levels lower than that of some countries in sub-Saharan Africa. The authors report that national surveys in Russia show that people have low awareness of the health consequences of various behaviors and a poor capacity to improve on or change behaviors. The authors assert that the mortality crisis cannot be attributed to one single factor, such as shock therapy, but is due to a variety of economic, social and political factors. The authors note the collapse of health care in the early 1990s, but do not correlate this with the decline in health of the population. Perhaps if they were writing in 2006 instead of 1996, their conclusions would be different.

Danisevski, Kirill and Mckee, Martin. 2005. "Reforming the Russian Health-Care System." *The Lancet* 365: 3.

Annotation: The authors assert that the Russian health care system is in dire need of reform. Life expectancy in Russia continues to decline, with many premature deaths resulting from causes that are preventable with effective health care. The authors point to the way the system is administered, through the government and inadequate regional programs, as one of the key limitations to proper functioning of the system. The article, however, does not offer any recommendations for appropriate reforms.

Eberstadt, Nicholas. 2005. "Russia, the Sick Man of Europe." *Public Interest* 158:18.

Annotation: This article is an excerpt from the author's "The Russian Federation at the Dawn of the Twenty-First Century," published in the National Bureau of Asian Research. In this excerpt, Eberstadt describes the current health crisis in Russia, citing high mortality rates, low birth rates, and increased rates of disease and infection. Adding to the crisis is the lack of adequate health care to treat these health issues, some of which are easily curable. Policymakers and government officials have been very slow to act and, promises of funding have not been kept.

Farmer, Richard G., Alexei Sirotkin, Lilia Ziganshina, and Henry Greenberg. 2003. "The Russian Health Care System Today: Can American-Russian CME Programs Help?" *Cleveland Journal of Medicine* 70 (11): 5.

Annotation: The authors discuss the decline in health of the Russian population. This decline in health is particularly due to cardiovascular disease. The authors then point out flaws within the health care system, starting with the system in general, then hospitals, staff and education. The authors suggest that a continuing medical education (CME) program for physicians is a key to improving the health care system. While the summary is limited to discussing CME programs, the body of the article provides good information on the declining health of the population and the health care system in general.

Field, Mark G. 2005. "A Comment on the Russian Health Crisis." *Eurasian Geography and Economics* 46 (7): 5.

Annotation: The author discusses the current health crisis in Russia, with a focus on the more severe issues of declining birth rates, premature mortality, HIV/AIDS, cardiovascular disease and tuberculosis. Many diseases and deaths are preventable with proper health care. The author makes an important point about the government's response to HIV/AIDS - that funds promised are for treatment rather than prevention. Overall, the health care system in Russia is inadequate, inefficient and under-financed. Since the privatization of the system in the 1990s, access to health care has become much more difficult, especially for poor people.

Fotaki, Marianna. 2006. "Users' Perceptions of Health Care Reforms: Quality of Care and Patient Rights in Four Regions in the Russian Federation." *Social Science & Medicine* 63:10.

Annotation: This article is a report on the findings of a survey carried out by the author in 1999-2000. The purpose of the survey was to explore patient perceptions of the quality of health care received, and to gauge whether they perceive an improvement in services since the health care system was reformed in the 1990s. The article also gives some in-depth information on the problems within the current system, such as lack of financing to sustain the system, scarcity and high cost of medicines and corruption. The article provides a unique perspective, via the patients, of the health care system. Survey results found that patients did not see an improvement in the system since reform.

Gerber, Theodore P. and Sarah E. Mendelson. "Crisis among Crises among Crises." *Problems of Post-Communism* 52 (4): 28-41.

Annotation: This article discusses how the increasing HIV/AIDS infection rate is viewed by the general public and by health care professionals. Overall, concern among the general public over HIV/AIDS is actually decreasing, but this perception is not consistent through different demographic groups. Concern among the youth is greatest. Health professionals overall believed the government was doing enough to address the problem, whereas NGO workers believed the opposite. In any case, lack of official data is hampering action. Passivity among the general public to HIV/AIDS, the authors assert, is due to the fact that there are many ongoing health crises that people are facing, such as cardiovascular disease, tuberculosis, alcoholism and cancer. These crises are compounded by lack of adequate health care.

Kabanov, M. M. 2006. "Mental Health Issues in Contemporary Russia." *International Journal of Mental Health* 34 (4): 6.

Annotation: This article addresses mental health issues in Russia from the Soviet period to present day. There has been a paradigm shift with regard to mental health issues. During the Soviet period research or specialization in social psychiatry, medical psychology and sociology were practically prohibited. More recently, however, fields of study and research have expanded well into these areas. In general, the stigma attached to mental illness and those seeking treatment is starting to weaken. This is a positive development, Kabanov notes, because there is a growing need for mental health care due to current instability and economic crisis. Suicide rates in Russia, especially in the army, have increased dramatically. New treatment facilities have opened and more are under construction. Kabanov cautions that some centers are not seeking input from specialists or from the general public.

Marquez, Patricio V. 2005. *Dying Too Young: Addressing Premature Mortality and Ill Health Due to Non-Communicable Diseases and Injuries in the Russian Federation*. The World Bank, Europe and Central Asia Human Development Department.

Annotation: This report is one of the most comprehensive sources of information on declining health in Russia. It discusses all of the health factors contributing to the decline in life expectancy and increase in mortality. It also discusses what measures are being taken and what

remains to be done. It suggests a program of action to improve the health of the population and highlights the potential benefits of implementing the program, namely the economic benefits of a healthier population. The report does not discuss quality of life as a benefit of improving health, nor does it mention health or health care as a human right.

Ostrovsky, Arkady. 2005. "Bribery in Russia up Tenfold to \$316bn in Four Years." *Financial Times*, 22 July.

Annotation: This article discusses the drastic increase in bribery and corruption in Russia during the past four years. The article reports that health care is among the most corrupt sectors. People are trying to escape paying bribes and seem to only be willing to pay them if their lives or the lives of their family depend on the service. The article notes that there are millions of people in Russia who don't get any medical care because they can't afford private care and they can't afford to pay bribes at states hospitals. Corruption must be addressed in order to improve access to health care.

Parfitt, Tom. 2005. "The Health of Russia's Children." *The Lancet* 366:2.

Annotation: This article provides a good overview of the children's health crisis in Russia. The author discusses the inadequacies of the health care system in general, in that it focuses on treatment instead of prevention and that health care is often unavailable in remote areas. The author then focuses in on the issues affecting children and youth, for example the infant mortality rate, the under-5 mortality rate and the high HIV infection rate among teenagers. One of the major problems is the structure of the system and, the author asserts, the frequent and destructive intervention of Western specialists and the World Bank.

_____. 2005. "Russia's Population Crisis." *The Lancet* 365: 2.

Annotation: This article provides demographic statistics and an overview of the numerous factors causing the increase in mortality rates in Russia. Circulatory diseases, alcoholism, AIDS, tuberculosis, road accidents and suicides are eroding the population at an alarming rate. Experts say that greater spending on health care is vital to improving the health of the population. Health care services will need to be improved; many facilities lack basic equipment and patients are not receiving appropriate care. The rural areas in particular are in desperate need of services. If trends continue, Russia's population could drop by at least 20 million over the 20 years.

Press, Associated. 2006. "Putin Hits Back, Criticizing U.S. In Yearly Address." *The Washington Post*, 11 May, 1.

Annotation: This article reports on Vladimir Putin's state of the nation address in Russia. In his address, Putin calls the demographic decline problem the "most acute problem of contemporary

Russia.” He calls on legislators to budget for childcare support subsidies, educational benefits for mothers, and an increase in 'birth bonuses'.

Pridemore, William Alex. 2004. “Weekend Effects of Binge Drinking and Homicide: The Social Connection between Alcohol and Violence in Russia.” *Society for the Study of Addiction* 99(8):9.

Annotation: This article is a research report based on the author’s analysis of death certificates of those aged between 20-64 years in the Udmurt Republic. The findings report a high correlation between alcohol consumption and homicide. The number of alcohol deaths was significantly higher on Fridays and Saturdays as was the number of homicides. The article includes data on the prevalence of alcohol consumption among Russians and the severe impact this consumption is having on the overall health of the population.

Rimashevskaja, N. M. “The Social Vector of the Development of Russia.” *Russian Social Science Review* 46 (6):4-51.

Annotation: This article discusses the impact of economic reforms on Russian society. Regarding health, the author notes the decline in health care at a time of increased need. The current decline in birth rates, infant mortality, the increase in mortality and the increase in diseases are all issues that need to be addressed immediately. The author calls for drastic social reforms in order to improve the health of the population and to improve access to health care. This article situates health and health care in the broader context of Russian society as a whole. This is helpful for understanding the potential impact of these issues on many different areas within society.

Reese, Andrey, Dina Balabanova, Kirill Danishevski, Martin McKee, Rod Sheaff. 2005. “Implementing General Practice in Russia: Getting Beyond the First Steps.” *BMJ* 331: 4.

Annotation: The authors give a brief background of the Soviet health care system, then discuss what reforms have been made to convert to the current monetized system. They point out that the implementation of reform has been slow in a number of areas, including primary care. Insufficient funding, lack of resources, and inadequate training are preventing full development of the new system. This article, although short, provides a good general overview of how the new monetized health care system functions.

Rimashevskaja, N. M., and Korkhova, I. V. 2004. “Poverty and Health in Russia.” *Sociological Research*, 43 (3):26.

Annotation: This article discusses the correlation between poverty and health and its reciprocal influence. Data over the past ten years shows a catastrophic decline in the health of Russia's population, with an increase in almost all of the main classes of diseases. Decline in health, coupled with economic instability, has led to a “pauperization” of the population. This article

provides information on all the main diseases. It also discusses how birth rates and reproductive health have been affected through this period. The authors recommend a restructuring of the health care system, raising medical staff salaries, and improving access to health care.

Rybakovskii, L. L., Zakharova, O. D., Ivanova, A. E. and Demchenko, T. A. 2004. "Russia's Demographic Future." *Russian Social Science Review* 45 (3):21.

Annotation: This article discusses the increasing disease and death rates, declining life expectancy, declining birth rates, and the increase of poisoning deaths in Russia today. Each of these factors is having a drastic effect on the population. Poor health and lower life expectancy will adversely affect the labor force and the potential for economic development for years to come. While this article does not discuss the impact of inadequate health care on these demographic factors, it provides good information on each factor and provides statistics for different points throughout the 1990s.

Schechter, Kate. 1992. "Soviet Socialized Medicine and the Right to Health Care in a Changing Soviet Union." *Human Rights Quarterly* 14(2):10.

Annotation: The author discusses how health care as a human right is a fairly new concept. The author notes that the Soviet Union was the first country to experiment with a fully socialized health care system, providing comprehensive health care to all of its citizens as a basic human right. Unfortunately, although health care during this period was free, there were not enough resources to carry out this plan. This article was written just after the collapse of the health care system. The author offers a number of reasons why collapse occurred. She recommends a few strategies to implement an effective health care system and stresses that the right to health care in Russia should be respected by the new form of government.

Vinogradov, Mikhail. 2005. "Putin's 'New Deal.'" *Current Digest of the Post-Soviet Press*, 5 October.

Annotation: This article reports on a recent meeting that Russian President Putin had with many government leaders. The purpose of the meeting was to discuss how, as spoken by the President, "to improve quality of life" for the population. Among his top concerns was health care, especially primary care, medical equipment, and supplies. Also, Putin demanded that doctor and nurse salaries be increased for 2006. Experts caution that extra funding in the system could cause an increase in inflation. The reporter noted that the timing of this meeting coincided with the impending start of the new political season, casting doubt over whether this meeting was aimed at improving health care or if it was a political move.

Vislogusov, Vadim and Osipova, Yulia. 2005. "Mikhail Zurabov Is Going Back to Free Medical Care." *Kommersant*, 8 September.

Annotation: This article includes a brief report of government proceedings regarding current issues. At this time, the Russian government was debating action on health care reform. The Minister of Health is quoted as saying that the medical insurance system is “down the drain”. While this article is brief, it provides information on the health care at certain date within time, which is important for understanding the intention of the government and the reform process as a whole.

Webster, Paul. 2004. “Reforms Mean 25 Million Russians Lose Free Health Care.” *Synopsis* 171(10):1.

Annotation: This article provides concise information on the impact of the newly implemented monetized health care system in Russia. Reforming the system means that health care will no longer be provided free of charge, and patients will have to begin paying for care and medicines out of pocket. The shift to the monetized system will have the greatest impact on the poor, who are often in the most need of health care services.

Wegren, Stephen K. 2003. *Russia's Policy Challenges: Security, Stability and Development*. New York: M.E. Sharpe.

Annotation: The author focuses on Russia’s foreign and domestic policies, and policy challenges now confronting the government. Wegren discusses the different ways in which economic “shock therapy” ruined the lives of many citizens. He lists the decline in quality of health care among the more pressing issues. He also points out the increase in alcoholism, showing how it has had a negative impact on the health of the population as a whole—including an increase in violence due to assault or homicide. This book covers a number of issues unrelated to health care, but was helpful to gain perspective on health care within the broader framework of Russian society and the effects of shock therapy.

Yasmann, Victor. 2006. “Russia: Health Ministry Considers Solutions To Population Decline.” In *Radio Free Europe - Radio Liberty*, 10:3.

Annotation: This author states that declining population is one of the most acute problems facing Russia today. He provides some statistics on mortality rates, low life expectancy, population decline, and suicide rates in Russia, which give perspective on the severity of a number of health issues. He reports the contrasting views between health experts and government officials as to what measures should be implemented to improve the health of the population. The author does not provide a closing statement or opinion on what measures need to be taken.

Violations of Human Rights in the Russian Military

By Cathy Smith

The military reform in Russia is a big hoax. All military reforms in other countries have amounted to the demobilization of the old army and the creation of a new one, which is based on a different recruitment mode, doctrine, etc. This has not been done in Russia. The old army has not been disbanded, no new one has been built, and meanwhile the military are decaying somewhere in between” (Anonymous Russian Officer, Russian Military Reform, 2003).

In 2005, an estimated 450 deaths were caused by injuries due to internal military violence. The degradation inflicted on Russian soldiers within their regime necessitates reformation by the government and implementation of resolutions. Since the collapse of the Soviet Union, the Russian military has been experiencing heightened levels of personnel decline despite the compulsory draft. The prestige that the Soviet Army of the 1950s received through the late 1980s is dwindling rapidly. Despite the military code of conduct, today’s army is afflicted with perpetual violations of human rights. For the future of the Russian military, extensive action must include systemic reconstruction. If modifications fail to be put in place, the system will continue to facilitate massive human rights abuses that will affect the efficacy of the military.

In terms of prestige, size, and wealth, the military had been a major contributor to the supremacy and power of the Soviet Union. With the collapse, the military has experienced significant breakdowns and economic failure. During the World War II period and thereafter, soldiers qualified under elite status. The ideal of the “Army and the People are one” infiltrated itself into public propaganda with the notion that the army had the capacity to defend and protect a plethora of republics. With the continual decline of military prestige and current resistance to the compulsory draft system, which requires two years of service by men between the ages of 18 to 27, the military system has inevitably weakened. Less than ten percent of those who are summoned for service comply with their patriotic duties, due to the inherent economic and health problems and fear of abuse associated with the military. Those who are affluent often pay bribes to avoid their two years of service. Various exemptions such as pursuing further education, primary family wage earner status, or fleeing the country are utilized to avoid the system.

Daily life for first year conscripts consists of menial and degrading tasks. There are explicit distinctions within the military between ranks; the second year soldiers, known as “Dedy,” have absolute authority over first year conscripts, a status which promotes the frequent usage of hazing; unfortunately, reprimands are seldom. Food distribution is imbalanced, and the rations given are often insect infested, spoiled, or nutrient deficient. Medical access is lacking and, when available, most first year soldiers are denied adequate care or are punished for seeking assistance. The lack of attention given to sanitation is illustrated by poor living conditions and insufficient time for cleansing especially for first year conscripts. Often labor is enforced throughout the night, which causes chronic sleep deprivation. The fear and terror that exist within the ranks has perpetrated a rise in fleeing soldiers and suicide rates. Despite the military code of conduct, which emphasizes justice, fairness, and equal rights for all, human rights violations are common among personnel. Instead of breaking the cycle of violence and creating camaraderie amongst ranks, vengeance for past abuses is the prominent cause of hazing by second year soldiers. One particular case that took place New Year’s Eve 2005 demonstrates the heightened level of torture and demise between ranks:

Andrei Sychyov, a first year conscript, had been forced to squat until he lost all blood flow to his legs and genitals; he then developed an infection and had to undergo several amputations. To date, of those responsible for the violence, only one person has been issued a four-year sentence while investigation of the officers charged with negligence has been dropped.

As demonstrated above, the current system constitutes a dysfunctional military with diminutive forces to offer protection. Without modifications, the military will fail to be effective in maintaining defense and building a secure state. Military reforms are imperative to improving the overall social, emotional and basic health status of soldiers, which will increase military morale, cohesion, and productiveness. Suggested solutions include implementing a nocturnal monitoring system, reprimanding soldiers who commit acts of brutality, weekly health check-ups, better training for officers to deal with hazing, and reconstructing ranks and duties. Accountability between soldiers and generals is essential to thwarting the incessant violence. Studies show that abuse does not occur within every barrack, which means that with the proper techniques for monitoring and leadership, hazing is preventable. In order to gain reform momentum, the public, NGOs such as the Soldiers' Mothers' Committee, and the international human rights sector must continue to challenge government ignorance to hazing. One modification that has taken place is the legal right of draftees to conscientious objection. Abstention from military obligation is replaced with an alternative, extended civil duty. And with optimistic anticipation, the present requirement of two years of service is expected to be shortened to one year in 2008.

The literature provided below is broken down into three main sections: History and Regulations of the Soviet Military; Today's Soldier; and Reforms and Solutions for establishing and conducting a stable, vigorous military. Each section provides valuable resources for conceptualizing the role of the Russian military and the incessant, massive human rights violations that are occurring.

History and Regulations of the Soviet Military

Barylski, Robert V. 1998. The Soldier in Russian Politics. New Brunswick: Transaction.

Annotation: Barylski breaks the book down into three general topics: The Military and the End of the Soviet State, The Military and the New Russian State, and Testing the Russian State's Viability. Barylski examines the rise in Soviet nationalism and explores the reasoning behind the massiveness and prestige of the military. Revolutions gave soldiers a ranking of honor, and established their role as elites amongst the public. With the fall of the Soviet Union, the military plundered with political instability and decreasing budgets, which produced irreversible upheaval. The final section examines the military's current relations with Chechnya. The author concludes with an outlook for the future of the military and what actions need to be implemented in order to recreate a viable, productive military. The book is relevant to understanding the background of the Soviet military and the effects of the Soviet Union's collapse on instability in the military today.

Finch, MAJ Raymond C. 1997. "Fall 1997 Russian Military Draft." *Foreign Military Studies Office*.

Annotation: Although the article is a bit dated, it is considerably useful for evaluating the lack of action by the government to instill a proper and safe military for draftees. To a substantial extent, fears expressed by draftees in the recruitment process in 1997 such as potential hazing, the grave situation in Chechnya, and dreadful living conditions within the barracks, are still present today. The article also evaluates public opinion about the draft, the corruption residing within the military, and potential ramifications for the United States with respect to the demise of the Russian military.

Kozyrev, Andrei. 1992. "Russia and Human Rights." *Slavic Review* 51 (2): 7.

Annotation: Andrei Kozyrev, the former Foreign Minister of the Russian Federation, evaluates how the new democratic government of Russia will implement varying shifts in politics and renunciations of double standards towards neighboring countries. Although the article is dated from 1992, it is valuable for understanding the overall human rights agenda of the Russian Federation subsequent to the collapse. The article is a valuable foundational source for comprehending the initial goals of the new, democratic government regarding human rights. In light of the past fourteen years since the article was first drafted, it is applicable for constructive criticism of the failure of the Russian government to put into practice the human rights agenda as in the case of military hazing.

Lohman, Diederik. 2002. "Conscription through Detention in Russia's Armed Forces." *Human Rights Watch* 14 (8): 22.

Annotation: The report provides information on the background of the drafting process for Russian males, and presents first hand experiences of detainees being conscripted for military duty. When a conscript fails to respond to a government summons, or if he refuses to serve, he is essentially blacklisted to police reports. If reported, most often, the conscripts are immediately enlisted into the military without the right for refusal. The report advocates a professional military system, which would resolve the escalating dilemmas of males avoiding the draft. In addition, it gives recommendations on what can be done to curb detainee drafting.

The Russian Federation. 1999 "Draft Russian Military Doctrine." 3: 4 Krasnaya Zvezda and British Broadcasting Corporation, BBC Worldwide Monitoring.

Annotation: This paper is an update of the 1993 doctrine. The paper is useful for gaining a basic knowledge of the Russian military, the goals and procedures of the military, and the guidelines for varying circumstances with the military. The doctrine is in compliance with the U.N. Charter, with the main objective of creating a multi-polar system in mind. With reference to the current military situation, the paper is helpful for deciphering whether a proper army is in place and capable of providing the security outlined in the doctrine.

Today's Soldier

Ball, Deborah Yarsike. 2000. "Social Crisis of the Russian Military." In Russia's Torn Safety Nets: Health and Social Welfare During the Transition, ed. Field, Mark G. and Judyth Twigg. New York: Saint Martin's Press.

Annotation: Chapter 14 is devoted to the social crisis of the military in terms of health issues and societal views of the military. It is reported that almost half of those drafted for service are ill equipped. The chapter examines contributing factors to detrimental health such as AIDS, drug abuse, hazing, poor housing arrangements, insufficient salary and wage arrears, lack of education, and crime. It also addresses the role of the Soviet army, loss of military prestige amongst society with the collapse, and Russia's current role in regards to the military.

Bigg, Claire. 2005. "Russia: Thousands Dodge Military Service as Draft Begins." In *Radio Free Europe; Radio Liberty*. [http:// www.rferl.org/](http://www.rferl.org/).

Annotation: The article is a relatively current account of why young men of age attempt to avoid the draft system. Also mentioned in the article is the problem with raids by local police to catch those who are defying the system. The article is brief but concise in highlighting the problems with the draft system and in analyzing why there is low quality of health by those who are successfully drafted.

Buchanan, Jane and Diederik Lohman. 2003. "To Serve without Health? Inadequate Nutrition and Health Care in the Russian Armed Forces." *Human Rights Watch* 15 (40).

Annotation: The report is divided into four major parts: background information about military service, the right to adequate food, the right to adequate medical care, and steps that need to be taken in order to diminish the rate of abuse and insufficient care of military personnel. The research for the report was gathered from over fifty military units throughout Russia. The report draws specific attention to the lack of overall basic healthcare highlighting the accounts of first year conscripts. Because of the first hand experiences noted, the report is accurate and functional for comprehending the catastrophic experiences of Russian military life.

Donnelley, Christopher. 1999. The Emerging Strategic Environment: Challenges of the Twenty-First Century, ed. Williamson Murray. Westport: Praeger Publishers.

Annotation: Chapter three assesses the crisis in the Russian military and the potential for reform. The author notes that if the Russian military were to collapse it would be disastrous for Russia in the escalation of internal conflict and loss of control over its nuclear power. In addition, there would be grave concerns from the international community, specifically the Eurasian balance of power. The author states that Russia's dilemmas are highly due to the disoriented and fragmented military. The source is a useful reference for conceptualizing the fall of the Soviet Union, the aftermath, the effects on the military, and the consequences on society. Moreover,

the author analyzes crucial parts of the military breakdown and concludes with suggestions for reform.

Glantz, David M., Anne C. Aldis and Roger N. McDermott, eds. Russian Military Reform: 1992-2002. Portland: Frank Cass Publishers.

Annotation: The book is an informative resource for a complete integration of different systems and how they connect within the military: reform after the collapse, barrack life, the current war in Chechnya, development of a security process and legislature, the influence of Yeltsin and Putin on the armed forces, strategies for nuclear force, the role of the military on the War on Terrorism, and possible reforms with reference to economic analysis, modernization, security and the harsh reality for reform. Chapters three and four focus on daily life of soldiers with reference to rule under Yeltsin and Putin. The author gives a precise account of the realities in the barracks and breaks down the seniority of soldiers into four subdivisions depending on the length of service. Each subdivision lists the functions of the pertaining group. Chapter 14 gives a detailed analysis of the prospects for a full economic military reform. The author concludes that substantial reform is unattainable during the current decade, but that the Russian military could re-emerge in post 2010 as a powerful and stable armed force. The book is a necessary read for a comprehensive outlook on the Russian military.

Lohman, Diederik. 2004. "The Wrongs of Passage: Inhuman and Degrading Treatment of New Recruits in the Russian Armed Forces." *Human Rights Watch* 16 (8).

Annotation: The report gives a comprehensive overview of the Russian military in relation to first year recruits and the trials they encounter. The report specifically draws attention to the abuse and torture that is ruthlessly performed on first year privates, including late night shifts, performance of menial tasks, forbiddance of food and health care, stolen salaries by second year privates, and sleep deprivation. In addition, first year recruits are at the general disposal of second year privates for hazing, which includes and is not limited to physical, sexual, and psychological abuse. The report gives several examples illustrating the demeanor and lack of camaraderie amongst soldiers. In addition, it offers glimpses of hope for reform and ways to implement new techniques to eradicate the army of hazing practices.

McDermott, Roger. 2004. "Russian Army Abuse: Denials and Rhetoric." *Eurasia Daily Monitor* 1 (113).

Annotation: The article was written two days after the release of the Human Rights Watch Report 2004 on military hazing. The article summarizes key points of the report and includes its own depiction of the situation. Moreover, it includes comments given by the spokesman for the Main Military Prosecutors Office, who rejects the findings within the report. According to the military, measures have been implemented to reduce the obstruction of rights such as a military hotline and a more intrusive method of monitoring within the barracks. The author ends with a

challenge to the government to acknowledge the problems within the military; otherwise, action will never surmount to viable solutions.

Miller, Steven E. and Dmitri V. Trenin, eds. 2004. The Russian Military: Power and Policy. Cambridge: MIT Press.

Annotation: The book focuses on the overall capabilities of the Russian military now and to what extent there has been reform since the collapse of the Soviet Union. The first three chapters are the most relevant to the current situation of the Russian military with regard to social conditions, downsizing, and reform. The book is effective in demonstrating and building a conception of the Russian military today.

Oliker, Olga and Tanya Charlick-Paley. 2002. *Assessing Russia's Decline: Trends and Implications for the United States and the U.S. Air Force*. Arlington: RAND.

Annotation: Chapter six is devoted to the current role of the Russian military. The authors expand on the relationship between Putin and the military. In addition, relevance is given to the notion of military regionalization, in which conscripts are permitted to be located near their families. The stability of the Russian soldier is also discussed in terms of menial pay and lack of care by the military. For example, Russia only allocates four thousand dollars a year for each soldier, while the United States spends forty-five times that amount. Furthermore, due to lack of care, corruption and hazing permeate the army on a regular basis. The authors give extensive detail to the economic downfalls of Russia and how it is internally affecting the stability of the military. The book is resourceful for an overall outlook on Russia.

Speck, Andreas. 2006. "Abuser and Abused: Human Rights and the Russian Military." *War Resisters' International: The Broken Rifle Newsletter*. <http://www.wri-irg.org/pubs/br73-en.htm>.

Annotation: The report summarizes the ongoing violence in the Russian military and gives specific attention to the justification for conscientious objection. Since the legal right to conscientious objection has been implemented, around 3,500 draftees have petitioned under the law of objection. The report also draws connections between violence within the armed forces and the war in Chechnya. The synopsis and statistics given are valuable for relevance to the current situation. The article also provides websites for further information.

The Russian Federation. 2003. "Human Rights and the Armed Forces: Report to the United Nations Human Rights Committee." *War Resisters' International*. <http://www.wri-irg.org/pubs/br73-en.htm>.

Annotation: The report is an overview of human rights violations within the Russian military and the relation to warfare in neighboring societies such as Chechnya. The report is well

developed and provides numerous examples of abuse. The report is essential for a thorough understanding of the present military situation and the occurrence of human rights violation.

Twigg, Judyth. 2004. "National Security Implications of Russia's Health and Demographic Crisis." *PONARS Policy Memo 360, Center for Strategic and International Studies*: 5.

Annotation: The memo makes the case that the health and demographic crises of Russia will inherently not only affect the national security of Russia, but also the security of the United States. The most supportive part of the memo is the first section, which highlights the military dimension of Russia's crisis. It states that due to the ongoing aggression in Chechnya, potential conscripts are dodging the system at all costs. And, according to demographic reports, the failure to successfully draft young men is only going to become more difficult due to the decrease in fertility. Additionally, those who are drafted often have medical issues and health deficiencies, which make them inadequate for proper service. The best-case scenario offered by the author is a military system that presents significant benefits to recruited soldiers and drastically improves the medical and nutritional level of the current military.

Zisk, Kimberly Martin. 2001. "Institutional Decline in the Russian Military: Exit, Voice, and Corruption." In *Russia in the New Century: Stability or Disorder?* Bonnell, Victoria E. and George W. Breslauer. Boulder: Westview.

Annotation: The author highlights several small uprisings and protests in the Russian military during the late 1990s due to economic hardships and alienation. Focus is given to commanding officers and their opinions of why corruption exists, which, according to the officers interviewed, most often reflects that of societal downfalls. The primary goal for reform is one that creates economic stability and a better-equipped army. The author concludes with implications for the current dismal military system. The author speculates that military corruption is grounds for a revolution, but comments that the current possibility of a revolution is inconceivable.

Reforms and Solutions

1997. "Russian Federation: The Right to Conscientious Objection to Military Service." *Amnesty International*, 46 (17).

Annotation: The report focuses on the lack of response by the Russian government in the case of conscientious objection to the armed forces. As of 1996, men between the ages of 18 to 27, who are refusing to serve the mandated two years and filing for objection, are being refused their rights; in some cases, imprisonment is the end result for draftees. The article gives extensive background to the issue and urges the government to reevaluate the current standings. In addition, it highlights the recent trend of soldiers to flee their duties especially when there is a risk of being deployed to Chechnya. Under International Law, refusal to adhere to conscientious objectors is a serious human rights violation. The article ends with recommendations for the

government and military. The article is comprehensive and a valuable resource for understanding the lack of acceptance by the Russian military for conscientious objectors.

Engleman, Eric. 2003. "Russian Soldiers' Mothers Work Together." Johnson's Russia List. <http://www.cdi.org/russia/johnson/default.cfm>.

Annotation: The Union of Soldiers' Mothers Committee works with draft-age men to collaborate on valid exemptions from military conscription. The Committee defends their work based on harsh statistics that estimate 3,000 soldiers die each year from causes not related to combat. The article highlights several incidents of severe abuse towards first year soldiers and the response and assistance from the Soldiers' Mothers Committee. The author summarizes that despite the criticism from the military, the Mothers Committee, which is supported by the European Union, will persevere with their work to protect and defend "their sons."

Hansen, Flemming Splidsboel. 2006. "Learning' To Offer an Alternative to Military Service: Norm Adoption in Russia." *Demokratizatsiya* 14 (1): 19.

Annotation: The journal article summarizes the history of the plea for conscientious objection to the military. The Duma finally passed a law in 2002, which was then implemented in 2004, permitting the legal rights of persons who wish to abstain from military service may do so in accordance with an alternative, extended term of service to the country. The article is broken down into five major parts, which are conducive to understanding the role of the law. The author traces the origins of the law and outlines why and how it came to be in effect with emphasis on the role of the Duma. In addition, attention is given to the potential stigmatization that goes along with filing as a conscientious objector. The detailed analysis given to the conscientious objection law by the author is beneficial for gaining imperative knowledge about the subject.

Lohman, Diederik. 2006. "Reforming the Military Culture." *Human Rights Watch*.

Annotation: The case of Sychyov is assessed as whether or not it will be the pivotal factor for a reconstruction of the military and the termination of brutality amongst conscripts. The author argues that despite the level of public discontent with military hazing, the Ministry of Defense is failing to implement the proper cautions for controlling violent acts. In addition, the Defense Minister blames society for the violence that is occurring in the military. The author concludes with four steps that could be taken to curb military brutality. The commentary is a useful resource in analyzing the potential outcome of the Sychyov case.

Meinikova, Valentina. 2002. "Annual Report 2002: Solution of Individual Complaints on Human Rights Violations and Other Serious Problems of Human Rights Protection in the Armed Forces." *Union of the Committees of Soldiers' Mothers of Russia*. <http://www.ucsmr.ru/english/ucsmr/report/report2002.htm>.

Annotation: The report provides an overview of what the Soldiers' Mothers Committee participates in and advocates for. A portion of the report is devoted to the current military situation in Russia and what the union is doing to protect soldier rights. Different parts of the report address military reform and working with the legislative authority. It is a beneficial report for an in-depth understanding of what the Union of Committees of Soldiers' Mothers does working with soldiers and other areas of human rights violations.

Muraviev, Alexey. 2001. *Russia after Yeltsin*, ed. Vladimir Tikhomirov. Burlington: Ashgate.

Annotation: Chapter ten focuses on Russian military power and the strategic position of the military concerning the former satellite states. It also briefly mentions Russia's new security concept and military doctrine. In addition, the chapter breaks down the different sectors of the military and the responsibilities each section is held accountable for. Attention is given to the role of Putin and how he may change the outlook of the military or fails to restore the once prestigious, world-class system.

Sivaeva, Tatiana. 2000. "Women NGOs and the War in Chechnya." *The Ralph Bunche Institute on the United Nations*. <http://web.gc.cuny.edu/RalphBuncheInstitute/>.

Annotation: The journal article gives a detailed analysis of active women in Russia today and compares different women's movements. The first several pages are the most relevant for understanding the progression of Soldiers' Mothers Committee and why it is deemed such a crucial movement in society. It includes background information about the crumbling of the military and the breakdown of a system once considered prestigious, which set the groundwork for the Mothers Committee to take place and essentially "save" their sons from the cruelty of war life. In addition, the article summarizes the current activities of the Soldiers' Mothers Committee and how local, pro-government media has portrayed it.

Cimbala, Stephen J. *The Russian Military into the Twenty-First Century*. Portland: Frank Cass.

Annotation: Chapter eight examines the human rights movement in Russia with focus on the Soldiers' Mothers of St. Petersburg. It highlights the origins of the movement, what the methods are of usage in defending human rights and how the organization monitors violations. It briefly mentions the army's influence on the public and what the potential remnants are if the military fails to improve and further advance. The chapter is a practical resource for comprehending how the movement developed and to what extent it has been successful.

Yablokova, Oksana. 2004. "Russia: Mothers Join the Party." *Transitions Online*.

Annotation: The Russian Soldiers' Mothers Committee has decided to form a political party. The report commented that the committee, at this time, is unsure of the probability of gaining ground for the 2007 parliament elections specifically due to funding. However, the committee's

primary goal right now is to increase public support. If, by chance, the committee would have the potential to be elected, it could prove highly favorable for the human rights sector in terms of eradicating military hazing and instituting a stable armed force.

Yasmann, Victor. 2006. "Russia: Creation of Military Police Could Help Curb Hazing." *Radio Free Europe: Radio Liberty*.

Annotation: The article briefly summarizes the rise in violence within the military and calls for a reform of the system in which military police are implemented. Military police would be used for observing and investigating crimes, and in general, they would serve as overseers of everyday activities. According to the article, the concept of military police had been brought to the attention of the Ministry of Defense in 2005, but since then, nothing has been done to put such a system into place. Additionally, the article questions the effectiveness of military police without extensive reformation of the entire military structure.

Human Trafficking

By Susan Freese

Human trafficking is one of the greatest, yet little known problems facing Russia and the former Soviet Republics. The most pertinent aspects of this topic include: who is trafficked, causes of trafficking, and the steps that have been and need to be taken to combat trafficking. Following coverage of the preceding aspects, this bibliography will include a brief section on prominent trafficking in specific countries.

The people most affected by trafficking in Russia and the former Soviet Republics are women and children. The current economic situation in Russia makes it difficult for women to find employment and provide for their families, putting themselves and their children at high risk for trafficking.

Trafficking is caused by a combination of factors including government corruption, poverty and economic instability, inefficient legal systems and the incentive of financial gain in the trade. Human trafficking has recently emerged in this region because of the dire economic situation in Russia and CIS countries, along with large levels of corruption. There is often little, if any, enforced punishment for traffickers. Since the fall of the Soviet Union, Russia's political system remains unstable as the mafia continues to infiltrate the government. The corruption is so deep that many law enforcement officers are involved in the trafficking industry. Often women and children have no one to turn to if they are trafficked.

Trafficking continues to be a problem mostly due to lack of action. The corruption is particularly problematic in neighboring countries with whom trade is conducted, as law enforcement and local police are often customers and reach deals with the traffickers. Another reason that trafficking continues to function with relative ease is because the legal systems in these countries are not as developed. Oftentimes offenders are not convicted and, if they are, their terms are minimal, usually less than a year.

Various NGOs provide needed assistance and aid for trafficking victims, but the high levels of corruption often limit their ability to make a large impact. Often, even if women are rescued, they remain scarred and they are not able to receive the psychological help they need. Many are dragged back into trafficking.

There are several main exporters and importers of traffickers. For the exporters, Russia, Ukraine and Moldova remain prominent. These countries are seen as easily accessible, in addition to the fact that there are few possibilities of legal ramifications in these countries. However, trafficking is found everywhere. Sweden, Finland and Israel are some of the main importers.

Human trafficking in Russia and the former Soviet Republics is a complex issue that is difficult to address. Much more needs to be done to stop human trafficking, but as long as it remains fueled by economic disparity and local corruption, it will continue.

People Involved in Human Trafficking

Flowers, R. Barri. 2001. "The Sex Trade Industry's Worldwide Exploitation of Children." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 575.

Annotation: The exploitation of children has exploded in the twenty-first century. This article shows how the child sex industry continues to grow at the expense of the children. These children are used for prostitution, pornography and other kinds of sexual exploitation. This study shows how these children are lured or abducted into sexual slavery and the abuse they suffer including: rape, beating, displacement, exposure to HIV/AIDS and a life with no future. This industry continues to grow, but international organizations are taking action. In particular, ECPAT is an example of an organization that remains committed to addressing some of the main issues pertaining to the prostitution and sexual exploitation of children. While this article does not focus on Russia and Eastern Europe, it is a great example of the overall exploitation that children face.

MacWilliams, Bryon. 2003. "Forced into Prostitution." *Chronicle of Higher Education* 50 (6).

Annotation: This article shows how young college age women are tricked into trafficking. They think that they will be going abroad for the summer to earn some extra money for school, but then they end up as sexual slaves in debt to their so called employers. This is terrible for these young women as they usually become stuck and do not make it back in time for school to start. Prostitution remains legal in Russia and as long as the huge profits remain, women will continue to be lured into trafficking.

Malarek, Victor. 2003. The Natashas: Inside the New Global Sex Trade. Canada: Pearson Penguin Canada, Inc.

Annotation: This book provides a good overview of human trafficking focusing on trafficking from Eastern Europe. The author, Victor Malarek, is a journalist who uses mostly interviews and personal experiences for his research. In *The Natashas*, we learn that we are now in the fourth wave of trafficking. People are lured into prostitution from answering a job ad in the newspaper, being recruited following living in an orphanage, despite choosing to do so. The women trafficked are often destitute, trying to raise money for their families. While anti-trafficking laws have been passed, it remains the third most profitable enterprise following drugs and narcotics. This practice continues and is fueled by corruption. Often local police are visitors to the brothels. Also if women speak out, they will be deported. Another problem faced by trafficking is prosecution. It is often difficult, if not impossible, to prosecute people involved in the trafficking industry. If the girls do go on trial and testify against their trafficker, they do not have witness protection. Often if they speak, then their families are at risk. Malarek argues that these people need to be held accountable for their actions.

Stephenson, S.A. 2002. "Children of the Streets and Shadow Communities of the City." *Russian Education and Society* 44 (6).

Annotation: This article shows the large increase in street children in Russia over the span of the 1990s. These children are either orphans or do not have parental supervision and wander around the streets looking for both work and amusement. Often these children, if they are lucky, end up in children's homes. But many of these children end up on the streets again. These street children are forced to fend for themselves because they have no means of support. Often these children are either abandoned, or they escape to the streets from abusive families. Other street children are migrants and refugees mostly from Central Asia. This article conducts a survey and interviews the children. They find that most of the street children come from poor families who are burdened by alcoholism and violence and many come from families living in dire poverty. These children try to work during the day for needed money. Most of these children are also involved in crime, drugs and gangs. The article argues that this problem of poverty needs to be addressed to help these displaced children.

Waters, Elizabeth. 1989. "Restructuring the 'Woman Question': Perestroika and Prostitution." *Feminist Review* 33.

Annotation: This article, written in 1989, looks at the changes that were already occurring within the Soviet Union. Waters shows the direct link between increased economic openness and prostitution. However, at the same time she also mentions instances of prostitution in the Soviet Union. Usually prostitution would occur during difficult times including wartime. The main difference during the Soviet time was the fact that prostitution was never mentioned. It existed, but minimally and was not talked about. Also there was a lot of shame connected to prostitution. It is still looked down upon, but during the Soviet period, as it was argued that prostitution should be a criminal offence. This is an interesting article showing the restructuring and the beginning of the openness and end of the Soviet Union with its focus on prostitution in Russia.

Causes of Human Trafficking

Abdullin, M., Persidskaia, N., Rogacheva, V., Kozlova, T., and Volkov, V. 2002. "The 'Pepsi Generation.'" *Russian Education and Society* 44 (2).

Annotation: This article shows the new generation of consumerism in Russia, following the Soviet Union. Children are growing up in broken homes, as 96 out of 100 marriages end in divorce in Russia. These children are growing up without any direction or any role models. This has led to riskier behavior. Both boys and girls report engaging in premarital sex. Sex is taken lightly in this new generation where most people find sex with multiple partners to be normal. This, combined with the 80% of young people surveyed who claim to feel only emptiness, has led to the rise in prostitution and narcotic abuse.

Alexander, James. 1998. "Uncertain Conditions in the Russian Transition: The Popular Drive Towards Stability in a 'Stateless' Environment." *Europe-Asia Studies* 50(3).

Annotation: The author, a professor at Northeastern State University, uses data from personal interviews that he conducted in the Russia cities of Syktyvkar and Kirovto. It shows the increasing instability that has emerged in Russia following the collapse of the Soviet Union and its current economic transition. The article finds that Russians today are most concerned with the economic and social conditions over their political concerns. Russians no longer have their survival guaranteed by the government, and as a result, are struggling to meet their basic needs. Children are growing up in an environment of increasing instability. As a result of these unstable conditions, human trafficking has emerged and is likely to continue.

Allred, Keith J. 2006. "Peacekeepers and Prostitutes: How Deployed Forces Fuel and Demand for Trafficked Women and New Hope for Stopping It." *Armed Forces & Society* 33 (1).

Annotation: This article examines the offenses committed by U.N. peacekeepers. A large number of human trafficking violations have been committed by the peacekeepers, as they entice desperate women and children to engage in sexual acts while they are on their peacekeeping missions. It is very difficult to bring justice on these offenders because they threaten possible whistleblowers who are not protected and at the same time, U.N. investigations are not conducted fairly. Often the in the U.N. investigations, witnesses are either paid off or threatened to not identify suspects. This article uses the example of violations committed by the U.S. Army and NATO to show how to combat this problem. It argues that the U.S. and NATO have taken significant steps to limit trafficking by enacting new policies, which are intended to remove their troops from the demand for women. The U.N. should follow these examples to address its trafficking problem.

Hughes, Donna M. 2004. "The Role Of 'Marriage Agencies' In the Sexual Exploitation and Trafficking of Women from the Former Soviet Union." *International Review of Victimology* 11.

Annotation: This article examines human trafficking in the form of marriage agencies. It shows how thousands of desperate women in Russia and Eastern Europe will do anything to overcome their poverty. Once they decide that the answer to the problem lies in going abroad, they will work with any agency necessary and do not mind entering countries illegally. Many of these women who end up marrying met through a marriage agency end up being beaten, trafficked, or even killed. This article focuses on the role of marriage agencies in recruiting women from the former Soviet Union countries. It examines Internet-based marriage agencies and compares countries from which women are trafficked with countries with marriage agencies. It includes helpful maps, as well as good charts and statistics of the numbers of women recruited by marriage agencies in the former Soviet Republics.

Klebnikov, Paul. 1993. "Joe Stalin's Heirs." *Forbes* 152 (7).

Annotation: This article, written by Paul Klebnikov, explains why and how Russian business is so corrupt. Klebnikov explains that the rise in murders and criminal activity in Russia, following the collapse of the Soviet Union, was not a byproduct of capitalism, but came about because of the crime that ruled during the Soviet period. Now, it is quite common for former KGB and former Olympic athletes to participate in this kind of crime. One of the main reasons it persists is because of the lack of legal enforcement. There are not enough laws or enforcement to limit this activity. This relates to trafficking because we see the increase in corruption corresponding with the increase in human trafficking from Russia.

Kranz, Patricia and Coker, Margaret. 1999. "The Tidal Wave of Cash Gushing out of Russia." *Business Week* (3646).

Annotation: This article brings to light the state of the Russian economy and its level of corruption. It shows how the Russian mafia has even used the Bank of New York to smuggle money. Russia is still going through a lot of change following the end of the Soviet Union, and it is during this time that the rich and corrupt are taking advantage of Russia and are exploiting its resources to get rich. This includes any money making venture, including narcotics trafficking and prostitution. While this article does not mention trafficking specifically, it shows the corruption in Russia and how effective the mafia is at driving this corruption with little or no political or law enforcement to stop it.

MacWilliams, Bryan. 2002. "Turning Tricks for Tuition." *Chronicle of Higher Education* 49 (11).

Annotation: This article shows how university students are working as prostitutes to help pay their college tuition. These girls either work in night clubs or carry on relationships with so-called "sponsors." This is the only way that they can afford to go to college. The article explains that so many women are involved in college prostitution that it functions as an organized business where the women and their services are advertised on websites. Out of the 2,000 rubles that can be charged, the women only retain 300 with the remainder going to one of the "madams" who dominate the sex business. Aside from working as prostitutes, this article suggests that these women lead fairly normal lives.

Miller, John R. 2006. "Slave Trade: Combating Human Trafficking." *Harvard Law Review* 27 (4).

Annotation: This article provides an overview of human trafficking including countries from around the world. It shows the direct link between the underground market and human trafficking. It is a good article overall because it examines the causes of trafficking and shows the individual effects. By providing personalized stories of victims, it also includes a personalized account of human trafficking. Human trafficking is driven by extreme poverty and it will continue as long as the demand continues. It gives an example of a success story in Sweden

where new laws and increased prosecution of customers, pimps, and brothel owners have led to a 50% decrease in female prostitutes and a 75% decrease in men buying sex.

Sandul, Irina. 2004. "Russia: Taking It Off in Moscow." *Transitions Online*. <http://www.tol.cz/>.

Annotation: This article, written by Irina Sandul, a freelance journalist in Moscow, shows three girls working in dance clubs in Moscow. It is a different take on prostitution from what is normally seen. These girls choose to dance and along with their job go to school. This article shows a more positive side of prostitution. The girls appear to be happy and normal despite choosing to be prostitutes at nights. They took the dancing jobs as a way to make money and to move to Moscow from their small town. Another interesting point in the article is that most of the girls working in the strip club are not from Moscow. These women are paid for their work and their boss seems to treat them well.

Steps Being Taken/ Need to Be Taken

2006. The Angel Coalition. *The Anti-Trafficking Coalition of Russia and CIS*. <http://www.angelcoalition.org>.

Annotation: This is an NGO that helps to combat trafficking in Russia and the former Soviet republics. They are mentioned in several of the other articles listed. They provide reports, history and trends in trafficking and also have a hotline number that trafficking victims can call to receive help.

2006. Trafficking in Persons Report. *The Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons: U.S. Department of State*. <http://www.state.gov>.

Annotation: Each year, the State Department releases a Trafficking in Persons Report in which it ranks countries based on their trafficking violations. It ranks the country according to a three tier ranking system. If a country is on tier 3, then it has committed the worst violations and that status could lead to the withholding of non-humanitarian, non-trade-related assistance from the U.S. to that country. In 2006, Russia was placed on the Tier 2 Watch List. The State Department claimed that Russia has made some progress in improving its law enforcement of trafficking, but does not provide adequate protection to victims of trafficking.

2006. (UNODC), United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns*. http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/trafficking_persons_report_2006-04.html.

Annotation: This report includes an in-depth look at human trafficking. In particular, it includes a section examining the role of organized crime involvement in human trafficking that is relevant to Russia and the former Soviet republics. It also has specific sections for countries,

including one for the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) in Eastern Europe. It is a good overall reference tool.

Haynes, Dina Francesca. 2004. "Used, Abused, Arrested and Deported: Extending Immigration Benefits to Protect the Victims of Trafficking and to Secure the Prosecution of Traffickers." *Human Rights Quarterly* 26.

Annotation: Organized crime rings exploit anywhere between 1 million to 4 million new victims of human trafficking each year; often the women are lured across borders where they become more vulnerable to abuse. Trafficking in Southeastern Europe is a relatively new phenomenon that is fueled by the dissolution of the former Soviet Union, as well as the presence of international peacekeepers who are often offenders themselves. The current two main anti-trafficking models emphasize the prosecution of the trafficker or the protection of the victim, but neither adequately addresses immigration options that could serve to protect the victim and provide better evidence with which to prosecute the traffickers for their crimes. This article examines the idea of extending immigration benefits to protect victims of trafficking.

Ontiveros, Maria. 2005. "Panel One: Women and Children First? New Strategies in Anti-Trafficking Initiatives." *Georgetown Journal of Gender & the Law* 6 (2).

Annotation: This article presents information on human trafficking including: a discussion on anti-trafficking initiatives, a focus on the Trafficking Victims Protection Act in the U.S., a description of battered women's shelters, an exploration of rape crisis centers. It focuses on federal and state laws that have engaged policy making in the struggle against violence against women. While this article focuses on the U.S., these initiatives and methods of helping victims can and should also be applied to Russia and Eastern Europe.

Orlova, Alexandra V. 2005. "Trafficking of Women and Children for Exploitation in the Commercial Sex Trade: The Case of the Russian Federation." *Georgetown Journal of Gender & the Law* 6 (2).

Annotation: This article focuses on the trafficking of women and children in Russia. It mentions earlier waves of trafficking, but its main focus is on Russia. It also explains some of the difficulties that exist in dealing with the problem of trafficking. It also explains how various governmental and non-governmental agencies are dealing with trafficking.

Parfitt, Tom. 2004. "Anti-Trafficking Law Stalls in Russian Parliament: Draft Legislation Stumbles as State Bodies Argue over Who Will Lead the Anti-Trafficking Effort." *The Lancet* 363.

Annotation: This article examines a law in Russia to combat human trafficking. At the time of writing, the law had not been passed due to a disagreement between the ministry and state agencies over which one of them would lead the anti trafficking effort. The article states that it is

important that the law is passed so that the status of the trafficking victims and the Russian government's responsibility towards them is clarified. It also mentions the services provided by the Angel Coalition NGO.

Pickup, Francine. 1998. "More Words but No Action?: Forced Migration and Trafficking of Women." *Gender and Development* 6 (1).

Annotation: This article reports about a Moscow conference on human trafficking that was held in November 1997. It shows that confusion and stigma regarding human trafficking. Human trafficking was defined, but the article explained that the stigma from prostitution continues to impede progress. Also, it is difficult for progress to be made in Russia because women are held in subservient roles. Pickup recommends that a viable solution to the problem of trafficking is that women need to be empowered. They need more opportunities to help themselves, in particular, economically.

2006. "Remedying the Injustices of Human Trafficking through Tort Law." *Harvard Law Review* 119 (8).

Annotation: This article examines human trafficking occurring in the United States. It looks in particular at trafficking in California and what is being done to combat trafficking. Congress has already enacted the Trafficking Victims Protection Act, which seeks to combat trafficking through the prosecution of traffickers, protection and support for victims, and prevention of trafficking on a global level. Unfortunately, the current legislative framework does not do enough to protect the victims. This article takes a closer look at the legal framework and addresses the need for providing the trafficking victims with greater protection to testify against their offenders.

Schuckman, Emily E. 2006. "Antitrafficking Policies in Asia and the Russian Far East: A Comparative Perspective." *Demokratizatsiya* 14 (1).

Annotation: This article examines trafficking in Russia, particularly in the far east. It looks at how trafficking emerged following the collapse of the Soviet Union and how now Russia is the largest source country for women trafficked. Most of these women are desperate for work and become lured by job ads to work abroad. The article also focuses on the role of women's organizations in anti-trafficking efforts. These organizations are located in Russia, but also in China, Japan and South Korea. In particular, the author shows how grassroots organizations addressing the social and economic factors behind trafficking have been successful. The article concludes by emphasizing the need for funding women's organizations and encouraging civil soviet developments to combat trafficking.

Stoecker, Sally. 2000. "The Rise in Human Trafficking and the Role of Organized Crime."
Demokratizatsiya 8 (1).

Annotation: This article examines the rise in human trafficking in Russia with a special focus on the role of organized crime. It shows how the problems in Russia are part of a larger global trend in human trafficking. Human trafficking is also a highly attractive business for criminal groups because it is low in risk and high in payoffs. This article claims that human trafficking is a major branch of organized crime and shows how the market drives the demand. At the moment, the market for Slavic women and children is in the developed countries of North America, Europe, and North Asia. Some of the causes for this rise in crime and increase in trafficking are the increasing number of street children. This adds to both the number of younger criminals and to children who are trafficked. Since the collapse of the Soviet Union, half of Russian adults are out of work and only one quarter of those employed are getting paid on a regular basis. This is part of the problem, as the women and the children they support are the most affected by the trends. Along with examining these causes, this article also mentions possible solutions. Stoecker argues that in order to combat trafficking effectively, a comprehensive, transnational strategy must be developed. Women and children need to be protected and warned about this criminal activity. Also the feature of internet monitoring should be increased. New legislation on trafficking in Russia needs to include violations that occur abroad.

Wolfe, Leslie R. 2005. "Fighting the War on Trafficking of Women and Girls: The Role of State Legislatures." *Georgetown Journal of Gender & the Law* 6 (2).

Annotation: This article focuses on trafficking of women and girls for exploitation in the commercial sex trade. It shows how women are easily trafficked across international borders and demonstrates the enormous profits that this trade can generate. It mentions women who are trafficked into the U.S.. Most of these women are trafficked because they are facing severe economic hardship. This article suggests that the problem of trafficking lies in the problems within our society.

Trade Partners

2004. Israel a Human Trafficking Haven Tel Aviv: Fox News Network,
http://www.foxnews.com/printer_friendly_story/0,3566,120157,00.html.

Annotation: This article examines human trafficking in Israel and reports that it is turning into a real problem. It shows that the Israeli police are also involved in trafficking. Some of the facts mentioned include the fact that traffickers spend about \$21 million a year to get the girls into Israel and that each prostitute can earn them \$200,000 annually. One year of smuggled women is about \$62 million. Israel was just promoted to Tier 2 by the State Department, but much more still needs to be done to combat human trafficking in Israel.

Alalehto, Tage. 2002. "Eastern Prostitution from Russia to Sweden and Finland." *Journal of Scandinavian Studies in Criminology and Crime Prevention* 3.

Annotation: This article examines the role of trafficking and its spread to Sweden and Finland; it focuses in particular on Russian-organized prostitution in the Tornio Valley (the border between northern Finland and northern Sweden). The author examines the deposit-sites in Finland and conducts interviews with the authorities concerned, including: police, customs agents and social services. This article describes this phenomenon, rather than explaining its particular causes. The conclusion does not directly link this particular trafficking center to organized crime, but it does claim that there is an organized trade in women in the Tornio Valley.

Bell, Bethany. 2003. Europe's Human Trafficking Hub BBC News. Available from <http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/2/hi/europe/2931646.stm>.

Annotation: In this article, the BBC reports on human trafficking in Moldova. This is one of the major export countries for trafficking. In fact, the report states that in 2001, Moldova was the largest supplier state in all of Europe. This is mostly due to the high levels of poverty in Moldova. Many are desperate to improve their conditions and as a result respond to job adds for work abroad where they become trapped working as sex slaves.

Hughes, Donna M. 2000. "The 'Natasha' Trade: The Transnational Shadow Market of Trafficking in Women." *Journal of International Affairs* 53 (2).

Annotation: This article provides an overall assessment of human trafficking with a focus on Eastern Europe, in particular on Ukraine. It shows how the trafficking of women from Eastern Europe has greatly increased following the collapse of the Soviet Union. An important focus of this article is on the transnational crime networks involved in the trafficking of women and how the slave trade continues because the traffickers are protected by their local officials, who also participate in the crime. It provides an in-depth overview of the trafficking process including how the women are recruited from their individual hometowns. The conclusion blames the increased number of women trafficked on the economic conditions in Eastern Europe, along with the fact that prostitution remains legal in many of these countries.

Pyshchulina, Olga. 2003. "An Evaluation of Ukrainian Legislation to Counter and Criminalize Human Trafficking." *Demokratizatsiya* 11 (3).

Annotation: This article examines legislation used in Ukraine to counter and criminalize human trafficking. It explains how human trafficking continues to be a serious problem for Ukraine, but the government has taken some action. In 1998, the Ukrainian legislature adopted a criminal law against trafficking in people, making Ukraine one of the first countries in Europe to formally criminalize this offense. However, as people are increasingly desperate to seek an escape from poverty, trafficking continues to occur in large numbers in Ukraine. The Ukrainian government continues to respond to this problem. In 2001, a new criminal code was introduced that states

that a person who is found guilty of involvement in, direct or indirect, open or hidden, trafficking in human beings with the intent to sell them for sexual exploitation will face criminal charges and will be punished by imprisonment for a period of three to eight years, with the consequence of confiscation of property. It is important that Ukraine is adopting these measures to prosecute traffickers, but it is still difficult for trafficking cases to be proven due to the lack of witness protection. Many women are afraid and refuse to testify in court against their offender. The Ukrainian government continues to fight human trafficking, but more measures still need to be done to encourage victims to act as witnesses.

Vandenberg, Anya Stone and Martina. 1999. "How the Sex Trade Becomes a Slave Trade: The Trafficking of Women to Israel." *Middle East Report 211 Trafficking and Transiting: New Perspectives on Labor Migration*.

Annotation: This article examines Israel's role as an importer of women from Russia and the former Soviet Union. These women are lured into trafficking by employment agencies or recruiters with false advertisements. In the case of Israel, its law is not equipped to confront the most serious aspects of the trafficking problem, in particular those relating to violations of women's human rights. There is currently no law against the sale of persons, nor are there any laws prohibiting the trafficking of women into Israel. This may explain, in part, why so many women from Russia and the former Soviet Union are trafficked into Israel.

Political Repression of Islam

By Amy Swift

Central Asia, once one of the least known regions in the world, has become important to the United States since 9/11, the resulting U.S. invasion of Afghanistan, and the new “War on Terror.” Tajikistan, often considered the poorest and most obscure of the five Central Asian “Stans,” was thrust into the public view when it became useful to the United States in its 2001 invasion of Afghanistan.

Relatively more open than most of the other Central Asian republics, Tajikistan is poised to join the rest of repressive Central Asia as President Rakhmonov solidifies his control over the country. While Tajikistan alone among the Central Asian republics has legalized an Islamic political party (the Islamic Renaissance Party), any activity outside that party is quickly labeled “extremist” and harshly repressed. In the months leading up to the November 6, 2006 presidential elections, where President Rakhmonov was reelected with 79 percent of the vote, repression of political opposition and non-state media sources greatly increased. Several opposition and independent newspapers were closed down over the preceding two years and access to international news websites was blocked by the government. No foreign broadcasts were accessible through regular television or radio, including the BBC news service.

A part of the Russian Empire since the 19th century, Tajikistan was fully under Soviet control by the early 1920s. As part of the Soviet anti-religion initiative, Tajikistan suffered through several cycles of religious repression. The 45-50 million Muslims in the USSR made it the world’s fourth largest Muslim state and this fact of such a large non-Russian, Muslim population worried Soviet leaders. In the 1920s, the Soviets, fearing a pan-Islamic opposition movement, fashioned the new Central Asian republics in such a way as to split up Muslim ethnic groups by placing them on different sides of the new borders. The repercussions of this program can be seen in the ethnic conflicts each of the Central Asian republics is facing today.

Independence from the Soviet Union was sudden and not particularly welcome by many of the leaders of Tajikistan. However, Muslims in Tajikistan saw independence as the chance to finally practice their religion in the open. Seeing a similar opportunity, an influx of Islamic missionaries, teachers and fighters from neighboring Afghanistan and other Muslim states entered Tajikistan. Tajikistan had always been somewhat isolated from the trends of the Muslim world and the version of Islam practiced in Tajikistan is more influenced by Turkic culture and Sufi traditions. Many local Muslims who initially welcomed the new Islamic “teachers” eventually lost their patience with these foreign fundamentalists and in some situations even came into conflict with them.

During the first years after independence and to a greater extent than in other Central Asian republics, a true political debate was taking shape and a free media seemed to be emerging in Tajikistan. However, by 1992, the overall struggle between nationalists, rival Islamists and Tajikistan’s old Soviet leaders broke-out into an open civil war that lasted until 1997 and effectively ended what had started to be termed the “Tajik spring.” The civil war was concluded with a peace treaty that promised a proportion of governmental posts to representatives from the Islamic party but this promise was not fully carried out.

The United States' "War on Terror" has significantly changed the political dynamics of Central Asia. The need to fight radical Islam has been used as an excuse by the leaders of the Central Asian republics to repress opposition from all Islamic groups. Even before 9/11, leaders in Central Asia, continuing a Soviet tradition, usually labeled any Islamic opposition as extremist or Wahabbist after the extreme puritan form of Islam that arose from Saudi Arabia and is practiced by Osama bin Laden. This is ironic because most Muslim activists in Tajikistan are avowedly anti-Wahabbist. While it is important to note that Tajikistan alone in Central Asia has legalized an Islamic political party, the current leaders still employ many forms of political repression against Islamic groups. Much of Tajikistan's political human rights violations are directed against alleged members of Islamist groups such as Hizb Ut-Tahir (HT), a radical Islamist political organization based in Uzbekistan. In the last year, members of HT have been tortured and beaten while in police custody. Dozens of other accused Islamic extremists have been harassed or detained by the police as the law allows for up to 15 months of pretrial detention.

While Tajikistan compares somewhat favorably to the extremely repressive regimes of other Central Asian republics such as Uzbekistan, Turkmenistan and Kazakhstan (notably, the ones with large oil and gas resources), and Tajikistan's Muslims do have more freedom to practice their religion than they did at any time under the Soviets, it still cannot be considered an open and democratic country. Recent events seem to indicate that the country is starting to return to a more repressive society and therefore if the West is interested in preventing the rise of fundamentalist Islamic governments, it should keep an eye on Tajikistan and act before too much longer to encourage its leaders to be more inclusive of moderate Islamic groups.

Islam in Central Asia before the Collapse of the Soviet Union

Crews, Robert D. 2006. *For Prophet and Tsar: Islam and Empire in Russia and Central Asia*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Annotation: Detailed pre-Soviet history of Islam in Central Asia, concentrating on Tsarist rule over Muslim subjects. Also covers some of the early Soviet years.

Hunter, Shireen, Jeffrey L Thomas, and Alexander Melikishvili. 2004. *Islam in Russia: The Politics of Identity and Security*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe.

Annotation: Detailed historical background on Islam in Central Asia before the Russian Revolution.

Islam in Central Asia in the First Decade after the Collapse of the Soviet Union

Tajikistan: From Independence through Civil War

Akiner, Shirin. 2001. *Tajikistan: Disintegration or Reconciliation?* London: Royal Institute of International Affairs.

Annotation: Extensive coverage and analysis of Tajikistan's civil war and the nation's path to recovery after the conflict. Some discussion of the rise of Islam in Tajikistan after the fall of the Soviet Union and the role of Islamic groups in its civil war.

Bliss, Frank. 2006. *Social and Economic Change in the Pamirs: Gorno-Badakhshan, Tajikistan*. New York: Routledge.

Annotation: Up-to-date and detailed, this book focuses on just one region of Tajikistan (Gorno-Badakhshan) but gives an excellent overview of the civil war in Tajikistan as well as its history under the Soviets and before (even covering the pre-Islamic period). The author goes into great detail about Tajikistan's economic collapse and the later influx of international development aid.

Denber, Rachel, Barnett R. Rubin, and Jeri Laber. 1993. *Human Rights in Tajikistan: In the Wake of Civil War*. New York: Helsinki Watch.

Annotation: Report on the status of human rights in Tajikistan at the outset of the civil war.

Djalili, Mohammad-Reza, Frederic Grare, and Shirin Akiner (eds.). 1997. *Tajikistan: The Trials of Independence*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Annotation: The articles in this book were written before the end of Tajikistan's civil war and are thus already dated. However, this book provides an excellent overview of the causes of the civil war and the situation in 1997. The final article in the book addresses the human rights situation from 1992-1993, focusing mainly on the political repression at the outbreak of the war.

Dudoignon, Stephane A., and Komatsu Hisao. 2001. *Islam in Politics in Russia and Central Asia: Early Eighteenth to Late Twentieth Centuries*. New York: Kegan Paul.

Annotation: Excellent chapter on Tajikistan that describes in detail the country's experience of independence at the collapse of the Soviet Union, the resulting unrest that led to the civil war and the position of Islam in the conflict. It also describes the current situation and the tension between Islamic groups and the government.

Jawad, Nassim and Shahrbanou Tadjbakhsh. 1995. *Tajikistan: A Forgotten Civil War*. London: Minority Rights Group.

Annotation: Provides a brief background on Tajikistan and its civil war along with a description of Tajikistan's political parties.

Naumkin, Vitaly V. 2005. Radical Islam in Central Asia. Oxford: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc..

Annotation: Good coverage of the history of Islam in Central Asia, from the initial spread of the religion to the period under the Russian Empire and then under the Soviet System. Extensive coverage of the rise of activist Islamists in Tajikistan in the last few decades of the twentieth century. Detailed review of Tajikistan's civil war and the peace process.

Rotberg, Robert I. 2003. State Failure and State Weakness in a Time of Terror. Washington, D.C.: World Peace Foundation; Brookings Institution Press.

Annotation: Case studies of failure and collapse by weak states. Excellent detailed chapter discussing the causes of Tajikistan's collapse and its slow road to recovery.

Shin, Milbert, and Rachel Denber. 1996. *Tajikistan: Tajik Refugees in Northern Afghanistan; Obstacles to Repatriation*. Human Rights Watch/Helsinki.

Annotation: Detailed report on the human rights issues arising from the refugee populations after the civil war. More a discussion of ethnic clashes than of governmental human rights abuses.

Struthers, Marie, Rachel Denber, Michael McClintock, and Dinah PoKempner. 1998. Tajikistan: Leninabad: Crackdown in the North. New York, N.Y.: Human Rights Watch.

Annotation: Post civil war report on human rights abuses with recommendations to the Tajikistan government and the international community on how to improve the situation. Discusses abuse of detainees and press censorship in the period after the civil war.

United States Congress. 1995. "Developments in Tajikistan." ed. House Committee on Foreign Affairs, 101. Washington, D.C.: U.S. G.P.O.: Supt. of Docs., Congressional Sales Office.

Annotation: Hearings on the civil war in Tajikistan and the human rights crisis arising from the war.

Other Central Asian Republics after Independence

Nissman, David. 1995. "Central Asia's Political Leaders Struggle to Control Islamic Influence." http://www.jamestown.org/publications_details.php?search=1&volume_id=1&issue_id=80&article_id=961.

Annotation: This article briefly discusses Kyrgyzstan and Turkmenistan governmental responses to rising Islamic militancy but does not address human rights violations by those nations. Somewhat dated already but useful for a historic overview of the situation by 1995.

Nissman, David. 1995. "Human Rights Not Doing Well in Central Asian States." http://www.jamestown.org/publications_details.php?search=1&volume_id=1&issue_id=47&article_id=576.

Annotation: Brief and somewhat dated overview of the problems of human rights in Central Asia in the mid 1990s, the period of Tajikistan's civil war.

Nissman, David. 1995. "Opposition Parties in Central Asia Remain under Fire." http://www.jamestown.org/publications_details.php?search=1&volume_id=1&issue_id=43&article_id=527.

Annotation: Brief overview of the status of opposition parties in each of the Central Asian republics. Somewhat dated but good for a historical snapshot of the situation in 1995.

Rashid, Ahmed. 2002. Jihad: The Rise of Militant Islam in Central Asia. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Annotation: Excellent overview of Islam in Central Asia with a good historical background, both pre- and post-Soviet Union.

Rywkin, Michael. 2001. "Militant Islamic Fundamentalism and Political Stability in Central Asia: Reviewing U.S. Policy Options." *American Foreign Policy Interests* 23 (10).

Annotation: This article discusses the Islamic traditions of Central Asia and the recent rise of more militant versions of Islam. The author analyzes the actions of the leaders of the Central Asian republics from the point of view of legitimate attempts to contain militant Islamic groups, rather than as human rights violations.

Takeyh, Ray and Nikolas K. Gvosdev. 2004. The Receding Shadow of the Prophet: The Rise and Fall of Radical Political Islam. Westport, CT: Praeger.

Annotation: The author's thesis is that radical Islam is on the decline worldwide because it has failed to deliver working governmental systems. The book covers many regions in the world with one excellent chapter to the Soviet Union with a good short overview of Central Asian Islam under both the Tsars and the Soviets. There are a few pages specifically on Tajikistan.

Tazmini, Ghoncheh. 2001. "The Islamic Revival in Central Asia: A Potent Force or a Misconception?" *Central Asian Survey* 20 (1): 21.

Annotation: Excellent overview of the status of Islam in Central Asia in 2001. The article provides a detailed background on the experience of Islam in Soviet times as well as after the collapse of the Soviet Union. The author argues that militant Islam will not succeed in Central Asia for cultural and historical reasons. The author also cites the actions of the leaders of the Central Asian republics as an effective block to militant Islam and does not discuss human rights abuses by those leaders.

United States Congress, Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe. 1993. *Human Rights and Democratization in the Newly Independent States of the Former Soviet Union*. Washington, DC: United States Congress Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe. Report.

Annotation: Compiled by the staff of the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe in 1993. Includes a historical background and overview of Central Asia's experience with democracy in the first few years after the collapse of the Soviet Union.

Weitz, Richard. 2004. "Storm Clouds over Central Asia: Revival of the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan (IMU)?" *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism* 27 (6): 25.

Annotation: The article focuses on the origins and organization of the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, and its activities in the Central Asian republics. The article reviews the policies of Russia, China and the United States toward the IMU.

Current Repression of Political Islam and Islamic Opposition in Tajikistan

Akiner, Shirin. 2002. "Prospects for Civil Society in Tajikistan," in Civil Society in the Muslim World, ed. Aryn B. Sajoo, 45. London: I.B. Tauris & Co Ltd.

Annotation: The author combines a historic overview of Tajikistan with the country's status as of 2002 to analyze its prospects for a civil society. The author examines the status of each of several facets of civil society, including the health of political parties, the media and NGOs and finds that the current conditions are poor but the outlook is more positive than any time in Tajikistan's past. No specific attention is paid to religious persecution.

Amnesty International. 2006. Tajikistan: Amnesty International Report.

Annotation: Report covers events in 2005 and primarily discusses the use of torture in Tajikistan. Excellent starting point to gather information on the current state of human rights in Tajikistan.

Committee to Protect Journalists. 2006. *Government Controls on News Compromise Vote in Tajikistan*. <http://www.cpj.org/news/2006/europe/tajik03nov06na.html>.

Annotation: The website follows the condition of press freedom around the world. This specific page is a report on the increase in media restrictions in Tajikistan in the period running up to the November 6, 2006, presidential election.

Greenberg, Ilan. 2006. "Media Muzzled and Opponents Jailed, Tajikistan Readies for Vote." *New York Times*, November 4, A7.

Annotation: Report about repression of political opposition, including restrictions on the media, leading up to Tajikistan's November 6, 2006 presidential election.

Helsinki Commission. 2006. *Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe: Helsinki Commission* Washington D.C.: Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe. <http://www.csce.gov/>

Annotation: Extensive collection of reports, hearing minutes, congressional testimony, press releases and speeches on human rights in Tajikistan and each of other four Central Asian republics.

Human Rights Watch. 2006. *Tajikistan*. New York: Human Rights Watch/Helsinki. <http://hrw.org/doc?t=europe&c=tajiki>.

Annotation: Collection of reports on the status of human rights in Tajikistan including up to the November 6, 2006, presidential election. Also has a link to a background report on human rights in Tajikistan and collections for each of the Central Asian republics as well as Russia.

Kanet, Roger E. 2005. *The New Security Environment: The Impact on Russia, Central and Eastern Europe*. Global Interdisciplinary Studies Series. Burlington, VT: Ashgate.

Annotation: This book focuses on Russia and Central/Eastern Europe but it does contain one good chapter on Russia's strategic relationship with Tajikistan that addresses the post-9/11 situation in that country. It names Tajikistan as Russia's closest ally in Central Asia and describes its intervention in Tajikistan's civil war. Tajikistan is described as an authoritarian regime that is

undergoing a slow process of democratization. The chapter also describes the secular, Islamic and ethnic political protest situation in Tajikistan.

Lawrence, James T. (ed.). 2004. Human Rights in Europe and Eurasia. Hauppauge, NY: Nova Science Publishers.

Annotation: This book presents a survey of the status of free speech and media in each of the countries of Europe and Eurasia, with specific sections on Tajikistan and each of the other Central Asian republics.

Lipton, Edward P. (ed.). 2002. Religious Freedom in the near East, Northern Africa and the Former Soviet States. Hauppauge, NY: Nova Science Publishers.

Annotation: Detailed section on the status of religious freedom in Tajikistan and in each of the other Central Asian republics, as well as for Russia and all of the former Soviet Union.

U.S. Department of State. 2006. Tajikistan: Country Reports on Human Rights Practice.

Annotation: Comprehensive report on the state of human rights in Tajikistan, including: torture and abuse of power by security forces, prison conditions, restrictions of freedom of speech, press and religion, registration denial of opposition political parties, imprisonment of political opposition (including journalists) and harassment of international NGOs.

Current Repression of Political Islam and Islamic Opposition in the Other Central Asian Republics

Amnesty International. 2006. *Human Rights Defenders in Eurasia*. <http://web.amnesty.org/pages/uzb-161105-action-eng>.

Annotation: Report on the threats to freedom of expression in Uzbekistan following the May 2005 Andijan massacre. The site has links to reports of human rights abuses in Turkmenistan and Russia.

Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe/Helsinki Commission. 2001. *Human Rights and Democracy in Kyrgyzstan*. http://www.csce.gov/index.cfm?Fuseaction=ContentRecords.ViewDetail&ContentRecord_id=204&ContentType=H&CFID=24502723&CFTOKEN=39325776.

Annotation: This hearing report is a series of statements before a U.S. Congress commission on the situation in Kyrgyzstan in 2001. Includes accounts by the Kyrgyz ambassador to the US, the People's Congress of Kyrgyzstan, the Director of the Bureau on Human Rights and Rule of Law

in Kyrgyzstan and the Deputy Assistant Secretary for European and Eurasian Affairs. Extensive first hand accounts of the human rights situation in Kyrgyzstan, including political rights violations and the problems arising from confronting more activist Islamic groups.

Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe/Helsinki Commission. 2006. *Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe*. <http://www.csce.gov>.

Annotation: Press releases, hearing reports and articles on the member nations of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe, including all five of the Central Asian republics. Categories of reporting include the status of political rights, free speech and media and religious rights.

Cornell, Svante E., and Regine A. Spector. 2002. "Central Asia: More Than Islamic Extremists." *Washington Quarterly* 25 (1): 13.

Annotation: Analyzes the conflicts in Central Asia as a dispute within Islam between traditional tolerant versions of the faith and more radical ideologies. The article discusses the Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan, the issues of importation of drugs and Taliban ideology from Afghanistan and the Huzb-ut-Tahrir and offers recommendations for U.S. policy in the region.

Council on Foreign Relations. 2006. *Central Asia*. Available from http://www.cfr.org/region/264/central_asia.html.

Annotation: This website contains links to primary documents (treaties, U.N. resolutions, speeches, etc.) and to news coverage from media sources as well as interviews with experts and agency reports. Some coverage of human rights violations in Central Asia, primarily in Uzbekistan and Kazakhstan.

Malashenko, Aleksei. 2005. "Islam, Politics, and the Security of Central Asia." *Russian Social Science Review* 46 (1): 14.

Annotation: The author analyzes the threat posed by radical Islam in Central Asia and gives an overview of the recent history, current status of and different responses to political Islam in each of the Central Asian republics. The author also discusses how the Tajikistan civil war has been used by leaders of the other Central Asia republics as an excuse in their repression of Islamic groups.

Pottenger, John R. 2004. "Civil Society, Religious Freedom, and Islam Karimov: Uzbekistan's Struggle for a Decent Society." *Central Asian Survey* 23 (1): 23.

Annotation: Extremely in-depth review of the position of Islam in Uzbekistan from Soviet times up to 2004. Outlines the challenges the government faces in dealing with radical Islam.

Rabasa, Angel. 2004. The Muslim World after 9/11. Santa Monica, CA: Rand.

Annotation: One section of this Rand report is dedicated to Islam in the Central Asia Republics and includes a brief historical background and a description of the Islamic groups in Central Asia. Discusses the governmental responses to Islam in each of the republics but does not go into detail about human rights abuses. Nice comparisons of the status of Islam in each of the Central Asian republics and a more accommodating view of the Central Asian leaders' attempts to deal with radical Islam.

Rall, Ted. 2006. Silk Road to Ruin: Is Central Asia the New Middle East? New York: Nantier Beall Minoustchine Publishing.

Annotation: Part travelogue, part graphic novel, part political analysis, *Silk Road to Ruin* is a vivid account of the severe dysfunctions of each of the five 'stans.' Rall covers the extreme political and religious repression practiced by most of the Central Asian leaders as well as the regional environmental catastrophes (Aral Sea, Nuclear tests), police corruption and the impact of oil and gas resources on the Central Asian republics. This is not an academic text but the book has the advantage of being written by a journalist who traveled to all five Central Asian republics several times beginning in 1997. Where the book lacks citations or references for some of the author's assertions, it makes up for it in first-hand reporting. Rall is not a detached observer but this is still a good starting point for further research on the region.

United States Congress. 2002. *Democracy and Human Rights Trends in Eurasia and East Europe: A Decade of Membership in the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe*. Washington D.C.: U.S. Congress Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe.

Annotation: Four to five page overviews of human rights violations in each of the five Central Asian republics as well as for Russia. Short discussion of restrictions on speech, political action and religion in those countries.

Prospects for Democracy

By Nick Stokes

Upon the disintegration of the Soviet Union in 1991, the countries of Eastern Europe and Central Asia that had hitherto lived behind the Iron Curtain inherited new independence and uncertain political futures. Since then, the world has watched a political entity that once covered 8.6 million square miles shatter into 15 new nation-states, each with the potential to throw off the shackles of the past and forge new democracies. Fifteen years after the fall, we see elections at state and local levels, multi-party systems, and constitutions touting freedoms of press and religion. While these elements are vital to the survival of any sustainable democracy, their presence alone in no way proves democracy's existence. Despite claims of democratic rule, the region today has a lengthy record of human rights abuses, intimidation of political opposition and, what is more, flawed and fraudulent elections. The former Soviet states of Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania are the obvious successes of the region, given their integration into both the European Union and NATO in 2004. Conversely, the other former Soviet states have not been so lucky, as evidenced by the fact that five of the region's countries have not seen a shift in political power since the early 1990s. With politically-appointed leaders, constitutions revised on a whim, and landslide pageant-elections, is there hope for democracy in the future of the countries of the former Soviet Union?

As evident in a number of sources presented below, a major impediment to democratic representation is the difference in opinion of what constitutes a participant democracy. In personal interviews with citizens of multiple former Soviet countries, it has been revealed that average, blue-collar citizens and wealthy, powerful upper class citizens had opposite opinions of what was most important in the democratic process. The upper class citizens felt that the most important feature of a successful democracy is the rule of law and enforcement of justice—perhaps because they are in a position to afford justice. On the other hand, the average citizen insists that democracy means political involvement, freedom of assembly and fair elections; in other words, precisely what they lack.

Given Russia's influence and dominance in the region it is only natural to begin with its president, Vladimir Putin. The former Saint Petersburg mayor, as well as KGB operative, Putin was elected as the second democratic president of the Russian Federation. In contrast to many former Soviet rulers, both Putin's first and second elections were found to be democratic and fair by the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). Putin even announced recently that he will not seek a third term in 2009 when Russia's next presidential elections are scheduled to be held. However, as we stressed earlier, none of this in any way should imply that Russia is a full-fledged democratic state. While the presidential elections may have received passing grades from international observers, the issues of gubernatorial and some legislative elections still remain points of contention. Why are these areas important? They are issues because they no longer exist. In 2003, after Russia witnessed the horrific hostage standoff and subsequent massacre of over 300 schoolchildren at Beslan, Putin was able to harness the fear of the nation to pass legislation to change the Russian Constitution. The content of these constitutional changes made it so that the elections of regional governors would no longer take place—instead governors would be politically appointees. This move almost guaranteed that no one from the opposition would be able to gain access to political power. Political dissent against the Kremlin's policies is also off-limits, as

evidenced by the recent murder of Anna Politkovskaya, a journalist and outspoken critic of the war in Chechnya.

The current situation in Belarus under the leadership of Alyaksandar Lukashenka is one that has been given Putin's own seal of approval. Widely referred to as the last dictator in Europe, Lukashenka has ruled his country with an iron fist since 1994—ironically enough, he ran as an anti-corruption reformer. His first term was slated to end in 1999, but after dodging impeachment in 1996 he enacted a referendum to extend his term to 2001. Despite the outcry from the international community and the OSCE in particular, Lukashenka won re-election in yet another landslide. Scores of protesters and members of the opposition were beaten by police and arrested when they called foul, which should seem strange given that the incumbent had garnered over 80 percent of the vote. With economic production and household income both plummeting and the international community scorning Belarus' administration, the country was in a downward spiral. The president temporarily expelled ambassadors and declared the Chernobyl zone safe and inhabitable again, urging former residents to resettle. If nothing else, at least citizens could count on him to step down in 2006 at the end of his second term. This was not in the president's plans; in 2004 he changed the constitution again to eliminate presidential term limits, leading many to wonder if he holds ambitions of a president-for-life. In 2006, Lukashenka won his third presidential election with 85 percent of the vote. The election was widely considered to mirror his previous elections—riddled with fraud and deceit.

With such dismal examples and numerous others (Tajikistan's Rakhmonov and Uzbekistan's Karimov both altered their countries' constitutions to extend their own terms and have won elections with 97 percent and 91 percent respectively in recent years), is there any prospect for democratic transition to sweep across the remainder of the territory? Between 2003 and 2005 the region saw three revolutions—in Georgia, Ukraine and Kyrgyzstan—in which ordinary citizens peacefully ousted oppressive regimes and demanded representative democracy. All three states initiated what observers viewed as open and transparent elections, but since then little seems to have changed in terms of political progress. In Ukraine, President Yushchenko sacked his entire cabinet and today his prime minister is none other than Viktor Yanukovich, the same man that the revolution sought to keep out of government. In Kyrgyzstan Bakiyev, too, fired his cabinet and his countrymen are demanding that he abdicate—overall the country is stuck in political chaos. For many the idea of revolution has a more Marxist connotation than democratic undertones. Things like term limits and representative elections mean more accountability for the politicians of the region, yet these leaders are rare. Sadly, while people clamor for political freedom and fair elections, it is the powerful leaders to whom they appeal that continually keep democracy just out of arm's reach.

1996. "How Is Russian Pressing Faring in CIS States?" *Current Digest of the Post-Soviet Press* 48: 13-14.

Annotation: The article covers censorship of television and the media in Belarus, Ukraine, Armenia, Georgia, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan. It is not extremely helpful for two key reasons: there are simply too many countries to cover in so few pages; and, written ten years ago, it does not accurately reflect several current-day situations in the aforementioned countries.

Aslund, Anders, Michael A McFaul. 2006. Revolution in Orange: The Origins of Ukraine's Democratic Breakthrough. Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace

Annotation: This book is a compilation of works written by several different authors. For the purpose of this research I focused on the chapters dealing with the role of the media and the effects that the revolution has had upon the media. The book contends that the media was poised to react years before the revolution under severe censorship and an atmosphere of largely state-owned and controlled media. The articles illustrate what the role of a free and independent media can have upon the political atmosphere of a nation in transition from communism to democracy.

Basch, Raymond M. 1998. "The Effects of Ethnic Separation on Democratization: A Comparative Study." *East European Quarterly* 32 (2): 221-237.

Annotation: This article focuses on three countries of the former Soviet Union, Belarus, Moldova and Ukraine, for an examination of how ethnic and minority composition play into the success or failure of democratization attempts. All three countries, the authors explains, have approximately the same percentages of ethnic make-up—around 70 percent of a majority and 30 percent of one minority in particular. These discrepancies in the ethnic make-up then create schisms that defeat an overall sense of unity within the states, thereby slowing the process towards democratization. The concept is interesting and certainly seems valid outside the context of the article, given that those nations that have achieved democracy after the fall of the USSR typically tend to have a greater sense of national identity and fewer ethnic lines separating them.

Clark, William A. 2004. "Russia at the Polls: Potemkin Democracy." *Problems in Post-Communism* 51 (2): 22-29.

Annotation: After the Kremlin-backed parties swept the parliamentary elections of 1999-2000 they paved the way for Putin's re-election. The authors point out the fact that almost all of Putin's opponents have gradually withdrawn from running against him, causing many to wonder if these politicians bowed out gracefully to the better opponent or if they were muscled out by the president's supporters. Instead of labeling Russia as a potential democracy the author opts for "managed democracy," meaning that Putin combines features of both democracy and authoritarian dictatorship to manage the country. While this may be true the author should pick one side for Russia--if an answer offers partially true and partially false information on the whole it must be false, the same should apply for Russia's political leanings.

Furman, Dmitrii. 1999. "Centers and Peripheries: The Political Systems of the Three East Slavic Republics." *Russian Social Science Review* 40 (6): 28-47.

Annotation: Furman analyzes three capital cities in the former Soviet Union—Kyiv, Moscow and Minsk—and their “transitions” to democracy since the collapse of the USSR. As noted in a handful of other articles, the author points out the differences in the political opinions and ideologies of the upper and lower classes. He finds that among those who have received higher education at university and beyond, a trend of Westernization and a move for democracy exists; conversely, among the lower, uneducated classes there is a persistent pining for the stability of communism. Finding the happy medium between the two appears to be the key to success, but the definition of “success” will vary dramatically. The article is useful for understanding pivotal changes since independence, but given the outcomes of elections in the three countries in question since the article was written in 1999, the implication for today are in some cases similar, but in others very different.

Hanson, Stephen. 2006. "Postimperial Democracies: Ideology and Party Formation in Third Republic France, Weimar Germany, and Post-Soviet Russia." *East European Politics and Societies* 20 (2): 343-372.

Abstract: *Post-Soviet Russia, the early Third Republic in France, & the Weimar Republic in Germany can be understood as cases of "postimperial democracy"—a situation in which a new democratic regime emerges in the core of a former empire that has suddenly collapsed & where democratic elections continue for at least a decade. However, the regimes consolidated in these cases—republican democracy in France, Nazi dictatorship in Germany, and weak state authoritarianism in Russia—vary dramatically. These divergent results reflect the impact of new ideologies, which generated collective action among converts by artificially elongating their time horizons in an environment of extremely high uncertainty. In France, ideological clarity allowed radical republicans to outflank more pragmatic parties; in Germany, ideological clarity allowed the Nazis to mobilize more successfully than centrist parties; and in post-Soviet Russia, the absence of any compelling new political ideology -- democratic or antidemocratic—has rendered political parties too weak to challenge even a very weak state.*

Hawkes, Malcom. 1998. "Republic of Belarus: Turning Back the Clock." *Human Rights Watch*, 19 July: <http://www.hrw.org/reports98/belarus/>.

Annotation: Hawkes reviews small, brief changes in the media between the collapse of the Soviet Union and the 1994 election of Alyaksandar Lukashenka. Shortly after the election this progress was quickly reversed with the new president tightening his grasp on all non-state media through assault and harassment by secret government agents. The article is a good review of how the government is steering the media away from dissent and towards absolute control. Despite being written only four years after Lukashenka's first election and eight years before his latest, the article's argument accurately predicts the path that the country has taken.

Iourine, Alexandre. 2006. "The "Blame Russia First" Syndrome in the Us." *International Affairs: A Russian Journal of World Politics*.

Annotation: The focus of this article is the nearly automatic anti-Russian sentiment shared throughout Western democracies. The author points out, however, that Russia has made progress towards implementing the democratic reforms that will classify it as a functional democracy by some Western observers. It does not go deeper into details though in order to explain how Russia is achieving its own democratic state. It interestingly counters some of the other articles that are critical of Russia, but would be more effective if it offered these crucial explanations.

Jost, Kenneth. 2005. "Russia and the Former Soviet Republics: Can Democracy Take Hold in the Former Soviet Union?" *CQ Researcher* 15 (23): 541-564.

Annotation: This entry traces the Soviet past linking the countries of the Commonwealth of Independent States, tying it to the current political situations. It is useful for understanding where the countries have come from and how they came to their present state of political affairs. According to the article, only three of the former republics can be classified as free democracies. The overall tone of the article is not completely pessimistic, however, pointing to potential breakthroughs in the region, it portrays all of these areas as hanging in the balance of current foreign policy and domestic leadership.

Kosachev, Konstantin. 2005. "From the Logic Of "Near Abroad" To the Community of Interests." *International Affairs: A Russian Journal of World Politics* 38 (2): 85-91.

Annotation: Written in the wake of democratic revolutions in Georgia and Ukraine, both former Soviet Republics, the article examines the implications for Russia's policy in the near abroad. In both cases, the Russian Federation interpreted the revolutions as breaks away from Russian influence and control, and as steps towards Western democracy. The article also raises notions of EU membership for the more Westernly-situated states such as Ukraine and Moldova, as well as how this would affect Russian foreign policy within the region. The piece raises important issues that could have been more developed in a longer work.

Kubicek, Paul. 2006. "Democracy Derailed in Russia: The Failure of Open Politics." *Perspective on Politics* 4 (2): 401-402.

Annotation: While not very substantial in length, Kubicek offers a rather comprehensive list of complaints on Russia's inability to adapt to open market economics and politics under the leadership of Vladimir Putin. Hindrances to the media and questionable elections (not to mention Putin's policy of gubernatorial appointees after the Beslan siege) have contributed to these perceived failures of the current administration.

Kuzio, Taras. 2006. "Ukraine Is Not Russia: Comparing Youth Political Activism." *S.A.I.S. Review* 26: 67.

Annotation: Like the title infers, the two Eastern European nations have come to the beginning of a potential split in direction since the days of the Soviet Union. More specifically, Kuzio focuses the Westward turn Ukraine took at the beginning of the Orange Revolution and the role that youth activists such as Pora played in the actual revolution and democratic breakthrough. While smaller in scale and number, youth groups for democratic reform are emerging in Russia as well, but face more political oppression than their Ukrainian counterparts.

Lipman, Masha. 2005. "Apathy into Anarchy Does Go." *Index on Censorship* 34 (4): 52-56.

Abstract: *A discussion of the Russian culture of popular alienation from the state, greatly intensified in the waning years of the Soviet state. Although Russians are often passive and submissive in relation to the state, adjusting to a social order of corruption and deception they perceive as inevitable, they also learn to adjust to that order by subverting its overt rules in day-to-day practice. Following a brief period of now-regretted optimism about democracy, Russians maintain a profound cynicism about the state and low moral expectations for themselves and others. As a result, overt resistance or objections to state policies and practices are rare, but noncompliance with laws is nearly universal, and it is nearly impossible for the state to implement policies.*

_____. 2005. "Constrained or Irrelevant: The Media in Putin's Russia." *Current History* 104 (684): 319-324.

Annotation: The article highlights factors impeding Russia's media from becoming truly free and independent. The argument is that to a large extent, Russia's press remains extremely oppressed to the point that journalists automatically self-censor themselves for fear of offending or opposing Putin's regime. Much of the media is also state owned and seems little more than a propaganda machine for the current administration.

Marples, David R. 2004. "The Prospects for Democracy in Belarus." *Problems in Post-Communism* 51 (1): 31-42.

Annotation: Written fairly recently, this article explores possibilities for democratic reform in Belarus 12 years after independence. It examines the administration under the leadership/dictatorship of Alyaksandar Lukashenka, who is the first and only president since independence; despite winning his last election with nearly 82 percent of the popular vote, independent polls showed that his approval rating among voting adults was less than 30 percent. One of the more interesting topics is the author's exploration of Belarus' awkward position between the United States and Russia. On the one hand, Russian influence plays a huge role in Belarussian politics, yet Russia's commitment to the US-led war on terrorism apparently creates tension, given that the U.S. considers Belarus a "rogue state."

Miller, A.H., et al. 1997. "Conceptions of Democracy among Mass and Elite in Post-Soviet Societies." *British Journal of Political Science* 27 (2): 190.

Annotation: In this article the three authors discuss the prospects for a democratic transition for the countries of the former Soviet Union using the examples of Ukraine and Russia. More specifically, the authors look at the problem through personal interviews with two different demographics within these countries: the powerful and wealthy elite on one hand, and the every day citizen on the other. When pressed for definitions, the elite of the two countries generally stressed the need for law and order and the general rule of law; average citizens, however, are more concerned with their particular freedoms (specifically speech, personal involvement in the democratic process and security). While it is interesting to note the divide between the two classes, the authors could have expanded their research to other nations of the region, perhaps one whose citizens differed linguistically and ethnically more from Russia's.

Putin, Vladimir. 2005. "Annual Address to the Federal Assembly." ed. The Kremlin. Moscow, <http://www.kremlin.ru/eng/speeches>.

Annotation: In his widely publicized address to the General Assembly of the Russian Federation in which he claims that the collapse of the Soviet Union was one of the biggest political disasters of the century, President Vladimir Putin talks about the prospects for democracy in his own country. He combats the notion that the Russian people have been silenced for centuries and unaccustomed to concepts of freedom, but dismisses this as a false interpretation of reality. While he does not specifically reference any of the former Soviet states by name, he does make numerous references to the USSR, leaving the reader with a lingering tone of nostalgia interspersed with promises for democratic rule.

Tokmazishvili, Michael; Papava, Vladimir. 2006. "Becoming European: Georgia's Strategy for Joining the E.U." *Problems in Post-Communism* 53(1): 26-32.

Annotation: The authors look at the post-communist "Rose Revolution" in Georgia and the progress (or lack thereof) in the country since then. From the transition from Shevardnadze to Saakashvili, the article looks at potential democratization successes and problems. The most effective argument is the importance of civil society linked with government as a means for maintaining a democratic state. Georgia is a good example of recent efforts towards democracy, but at the same time it was always a fierce opponent of Russification and has no ethnic or linguistic ties to Russia that were not imposed upon it.

Tumanov, Boris. 2006. "Mission Never to Be Accomplished." *New Times*: 42-43.

Annotation: The author talks briefly about Russia's failure to uphold agreed human rights policies as well as its inability to veer away from authoritarian politics and towards democratic reform. Written very recently, it is a valuable source for examining Putin and Russia's path from 1999 and his election to the present day.

Repatriation of Ethnic Groups

By Kirsten Benites

From 1943 to 1949, almost 1.5 million ethnic minorities were deported from their homes in the southern USSR to Central Asia. Thousands died either during the trip or within the first few years after their arrival. For years, it was as if they had simply disappeared off the face of the earth. It was not until 1956 that the deportations were even acknowledged by the Soviet government, and only recently has repatriation begun. While some groups have had a relatively successful repatriation experience, others have experienced ethnic discrimination, making the return to their homelands difficult and in some cases impossible.

There were six major groups that were singled out for persecution by the regime of Soviet dictator Joseph Stalin, most of whom were Muslims. For example, the Crimean Tatars are a Muslim Turkic people who settled on the Crimean peninsula, in what is now Ukraine, during the 13th century. When the Red Army recaptured the Crimea from the Germans in April 1944, Tatars who had collaborated with the Germans were killed immediately. On May 18th the remaining Tatars were rounded up to be deported to the Urals, Siberia, and Central Asia, though the majority ended up in Uzbekistan. Estimates of the number of deported Tatars range from 180,000 to 250,000 and it is estimated that between 20 percent and 40 percent of the deportees died en route or within the first year after resettlement. Even Tatars who had served in the Red Army to defend Russia were deported. This experience would be repeated with many other non-Slavic peoples across Russia in the final days of World War II.

The other major groups that were deported were from Southern Russia, between the Black Sea and the Caspian Sea. The Meskhetians (also known as Meskhetian Turks or Ahiska Turks) originally inhabited Meskhetia, a mountainous area on the Soviet-Turkish border, in what is now Georgia. The Ingush and the Chechens are two related Muslim groups from Southern Russia. They were the largest group of deportees, numbering almost half a million. The Karachays (Karachai, Karachaevtsy) and Balkars are also from Southern Russia and are among the most ancient of Caucasian peoples. The Kalmyks are the only Buddhist ethnic group in Europe, descended from Mongols, and they lived near the Volga River on the banks of the Caspian Sea. Reluctant to assimilate within the Soviet Union they were subject to persecution even before World War II.

There were many other smaller ethnic minorities living in Russia who were also deported at the whim of Stalin, although much less information exists about the experiences of these groups. They include Khemshils, Koreans, Greeks, Bulgarians, Armenians, Daghestanis and Volga Germans.

Beginning an official reconciliation policy, in 1956 Nikita Khrushchev made a secret speech to the 10th Party Congress detailing Stalin's crimes. This was the first official mention of the deportations. In his speech, Khrushchev pardoned the deported Kalmyks, Chechens, Ingush, Karachai and Balkars and paved the way for these peoples to return to their homelands. The Crimean Tatars and Meskhetians who were not mentioned were not allowed to return for several years. Even when the deported peoples did return they faced significant obstacles, many of which still persist.

All these groups were deported at a minute's notice, leaving behind homes, businesses, livestock and nearly all their possessions. They were replaced by ethnic Russians and Ukrainians, who, with

the express permission of the Soviet Government, took their possessions and lands. Now, as these groups try to return, they are also attempting to regain their homes and lands, an action which brings them into conflict with the local population.

In most areas, there was a concerted effort by the government and the populations that replaced the deportees to obliterate all traces of the deportees' culture. Books and manuscripts were burned, monuments, palaces, and mosques were destroyed. The new population also rewrote history in order to erase or change the role of the deported people. For example, the Tatars were made into the villains in many Russian films and stories, and the history of the Chechen/Ingush was changed to conceal the fact that they had inhabited the land before the Ossetians that replaced them.

Many of these peoples had inhabited Autonomous Republics in the years before World War II and had some degree of national self-rule. Following their deportation, many of the borders of these regions were redrawn to break up populations and make them minorities in regions controlled by others. Now that some of these groups have returned they want to control their own destinies and want their own nations. This is one of the main sources of conflict in Chechnya and the Prigorodnyi region between the Ingush and the Ossetians.

Another source of conflict arose in 1991, when the Soviet Union dissolved. Many of these people were left stateless, as citizens of neither Russia, the states to which they were deported, or the states that emerged in their former homelands. This has been a problem in particular for the Meskhetians, denied citizenship by Russia, Uzbekistan, Turkey and Georgia.

Because of property rights and citizenship issues, there is an increased possibility for abuse by local government and officials. Imposing arbitrary regulations, charging subjective regulatory fees, and denying basic legal rights are all frequent tactics employed by local officials to intimidate and repress these ethnic groups. For example, officials in the Krasnodar region of Russia use Cossack gangs to beat, rob and murder Meskhetians.

The situation of these exiled groups, still largely unresolved 60 years after the deportations, has led to conflict and war across the former Soviet Union. Current events such as the massacre of children at a school in Beslan, are the result of the involved governments' inability to deal with these forgotten people. Unless mutually acceptable and lasting solutions can be found, the situation will only worsen.

Deportation

1996. [The Ingush-Ossetian Conflict in the Prigorodnyi Region](http://hrw.org/reports/1996/Russia.htm). New York: Human Rights Watch/Helsinki. <http://hrw.org/reports/1996/Russia.htm>.

Annotation: This report, published by Human Rights Watch, details the conflict between Ossetians and Ingush in the Prigorodnyi region of Russia during 1992. The historical background to the conflict is the deportation of the Ingush under Stalin, which allowed many ethnic Ossetians from a neighboring province to claim the possessions and property of the deportees. The report gives a brief background to the conflict and details the events of 1992, as well as more recent developments. The author discusses the human rights abuses committed, the

process of return for those displaced, and the response of the Russian government. The report includes maps.

Comins-Richmond, Walter. 2002. "The Deportation of the Karachays." *Journal of Genocide Research* 4 (3): 9.

Annotation: Author Walter Comins-Richmond is one of the leading authorities on the Karachay; this article is an excellent treatment of the deportations. Unlike many sources, which only briefly mention the Karachay, this article on this minority specifically. It does include some information on the recent repatriation experience, but is primarily concerned with a historical account of the deportations.

Conquest, Robert. 1970. *The Nation Killers: The Soviet Deportation of Nationalities*. Glasgow: Macmillan and Company.

Annotation: This book is a comprehensive survey of the deportations of the Crimean Tatars, Volga German, Meskhetian Turks, Kalmyks, Ingush, Chechens, Karachai and Balkars. It includes an excellent chapter on the territorial modifications and cultural changes that erased these people from history and memory. Though it contains no information on the situation since 1970, it is by far one of the most detailed examinations of the deportations and immediate aftermath.

Fisher, Alan. 1978. Crimean Tatars. Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press.

Annotation: This book provides comprehensive coverage of the Crimean Tatars' history from the 15th century to the 1970s. The first section covers the group's origins and the Crimean Tatar Khanate. Section two details the uneasy relationship between the Tatars and the Russian monarchy. The third section deals with the treatment of the Tatars under communism. It offers a detailed account of the deportation and early struggles for repatriation. It also offers some well-researched theories for the reason behind the deportation.

Kappeler, Andreas, Gerhard Simon, Georg Brunner, and Edward Allworth, eds. 1994. Muslim Communities Reemerge, Central Asia Book Series. Durham: Duke University Press.

Annotation: This is a collection of articles dealing with the current Muslim experience in the former Soviet Union. Because the majority of the deported nations were comprised of Muslim peoples, a fact that may have contributed to their discriminatory treatment, this book examines their experiences from a religious perspective. Of particular note include Azade-Ayse Rorlich's article "One or More Tatar Nations?" as well as Hans Braker's article "Soviet Policy Toward Islam" and Marie Broxup's article "Political Trends in Soviet Islam After the Afghanistan War." The collection also includes some statistical tables and figures.

Mirkhanova, Malika. 2006. "People in Exile: The Oral History of Meskhetian Turks (khyskha Turkleri)." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 26 (1): 12.

Annotation: This article focuses on the history and recent experiences of the Meskhetian Turks, the deportation under Stalin, the pogrom to which they were subjected in Uzbekistan, the persecution in Krasnodar, and the subsequent removal of many Meskhetians to the United States as refugees. The author sees the deportees as victims of political and social events outside their control. She also points out their unique status as 'stateless' people, emphasizing that they have been subjected to many more involuntary deportations than many others uprooted under Stalin.

Naimark, Norman M. 2001. Fires of Hatred: Ethnic Cleansing in Twentieth-Century Europe. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Annotation: This book covers five different examples of ethnic cleansing in Europe during the twentieth-century. Section three deals with the Soviet deportation of the Crimean Tatars and Chechens-Ingush specifically. While many modern ethnographers and historians do not consider Stalin's deportations within the realm of ethnic cleansing, Naimark believes that this was a concentrated effort, if not to eliminate these peoples, then at least to completely strip them of their ethnic and national identity. Naimark's work is primarily focused on the historical events surrounding the deportations during and after World War II. It provides a concise account of the deportations, and is a good introduction to the topic.

Pohl, J. Otto. 1997. The Stalinist Penal System: A Statistical History of Soviet Repression and Terror, 1930-1953. Jefferson: Mc Farland and Company.

Annotation: This book offers brief accounts of some of the mass deportations, however, it is primarily a statistical record of the penal system under Stalin. It includes over 75 tables of statistics, including numbers and locations of exiles, numbers of deaths and births, and geographic distributions. It is comprised of two sections: incarceration, which primarily deals with individual political dissidents, and exile, which deals with entire exiled populations. The minority groups for which it includes statistics are: Volga Germans, Karachai, Kalmyks, Chechens and Ingush, Balkars, Crimean Tatars, and Khemshils.

_____. 1999. Ethnic Cleansing in the USSR, 1937-1949. Westport: Greenwood Press.

Annotation: Like Pohl's earlier book, The Stalinist Penal System, this book includes a large number of tables detailing the numbers and destination of those exiled. It includes information on all major groups: Crimean Tatars, Germans, Kalmyks, Karachai, Balkars, Meskhetian Turks, Khemshils, Chechens, and Ingush, but also has statistics for smaller deported groups such as

Koreans, Finns, Kurds, and Greeks. The focus of this book is on the events during and immediately following World War II.

_____. 2006. "Socialist Racism: Ethnic Cleansing and Racial Exclusion in the USSR and Israel." *Human Rights Review*, 22.

Annotation: J. Otto Pohl compares the Soviet treatment of minorities to the racism exhibited in Israel. Though not primarily concerned with the deportations and repatriation, it offers some possible explanations and motivations behind the way minorities were treated under Stalin and later Soviet leaders.

Richardson, Curtis. 2002. "Stalinist Terror and the Kalmyks' National Revival: A Cultural and Historical Perspective." *Journal of Genocide Research* 4 (3): 11.

Annotation: This article is a review of the historical aspects of the deportation, as well as a report on the recent cultural renewal among surviving Kalmyks in Kalmykia, and in the Diaspora. It gives a short account of the exile and discusses the fate of those who managed to escape the Soviet Union. It primarily discusses the return of the Kalmyks from a sociological perspective. The author is relatively optimistic about the survival of the Kalmyk culture, though he notes that the language is in many cases being replaced by Russian.

Sheehy, Ann. *The Crimean Tatars, Volga Germans and Meskhetians: Soviet Treatment of Some National Minorities*. London: Minority Rights Group.

Annotation: This report by Minority Rights Group is one of the most thorough sources on the subject of the deportations of the Meskhetian Turks and the Volga Germans, both of which have been somewhat neglected in the literature. It also covers the deportation of the Crimean Tatars. It focuses on these three groups out of the many national minorities that were deported, because at the time it was published, these were the three that had still not received official permission to return to their homelands. The section on each minority provides a historical background, an account of the deportation including statistics, political rehabilitation, and an evaluation of the current situation.

Simon, Gerhard. 1991. *Nationalism and Policy Towards the Nationalities in the Soviet Union: From Totalitarian Dictatorship to Post-Stalinist Society*. Translated by Karen Forster and Oswald Forster. Boulder: Westview Press.

Annotation: Originally published in Germany in 1989, this book was published in the United States in 1991. It details official policy towards ethnic minorities in the Soviet Union. This book includes information on all the major deported groups, but also some information on more obscure minorities.

Repatriation

1996. *The Ingush-Ossetian Conflict in the Prigorodnyi Region*. New York: Human Rights Watch/Helsinki. <http://hrw.org/reports/1996/Russia.htm>.

Annotation: This report, published by Human Rights Watch, details the conflict between Ossetians and Ingush in the Prigorodnyi region of Russia during 1992. The historical background to the conflict is the deportation of the Ingush under Stalin, which allowed many ethnic Ossetians from a neighboring province to claim the possessions and property of the deportees. The report gives a brief overview of the background of the conflict. It details the events of 1992, as well as the human rights abuses committed, the process of return for those displaced, and the response of the Russian government. The report includes maps.

1998. *Russian Federation: Ethnic Discrimination in Southern Russia*. New York: Human Rights Watch. <http://www.hrw.org/reports98/russia/>

Annotation: Ethnic discrimination in the Russian Federation has persisted and perhaps even worsened since the break-up of the Soviet Union. The government has failed to combat discrimination, and is in many ways responsible for perpetuating discriminatory practices. While this is evident in much of Russia, it is striking in Stavropol and Krasnodar, two provinces in southern Russia that make up part of the North Caucasus region. A common form of state-sponsored discrimination in these provinces is police harassment of ethnic Caucasians through selective enforcement of residence requirements (*propiska*) and mandatory registration of visitors. Police selectively enforce these rules, sometimes together with Cossack units—paramilitary organizations composed of ethnic Slavs that in southern Russia operate with government sanction—through arbitrary identity checks on the street, on highways, and in homes, during which victims are often forced to pay bribes and sometimes are beaten and detained.

2003. “Documenty!” *Discrimination on Grounds of Race in the Russian Federation*. London: Amnesty International.

Annotation: This Amnesty International report focuses on the rights of minorities in Russia, and mentions a few deported groups, such as Chechens and Meskhetians. The current situation in Chechnya, including human rights issues stemming from the WWII era deportations is covered, as well as the situation of minorities living outside of their homeland, such as in Moscow. It also addresses the struggle of the Meskhetians for citizenship, including violence by Cossack gangs in Krasnodar, and a hunger strike conducted in 2002. The report gives recommendations for the redress of these problems, including better education for law enforcement, and the prevention of torture.

Allworth, Edward A., ed. 1998. *The Tatars of Crimea: Return to the Homeland*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Annotation: A collection of writings about the Crimean Tatars and their repatriation, this book includes articles by American, British, Russian and Tatar authors. The articles are grouped into three sections: Forming a Modern Identity, The Ordeal of Forced Exile, and Returning to Crimea. This book also includes translations of several official documents about the Tatars, as well as an extensive bibliography of English-language sources about the Crimean Tatars.

Aydingun, Aysegul. 2002. "Ahiska (Meskhetian) Turks: Source of Conflict in the Caucasus?" *International Journal of Human Rights* 6 (2): 16.

Annotation: This article addresses the national and transnational effects of the Meskhetian problem in the Southern Caucasus. The author argues that due to the failures of the Russian and Georgian governments, the struggle of the Meskhetians began to have global effects, necessitating the intervention of uninvolved governments, such as the United States, which has allowed many Meskhetians to enter the U.S. as refugees. It documents the current situation of the Meskhetians, and is an excellent resource on the political machinations and negotiations involved.

Blacklock, Denika. 2005. Finding Durable Solutions for the Meskhetians: A Presentation of Preliminary Findings and a Roundtable Discussion with Government and Civil Society Actors in Georgia. *Report on the Joint Conference Organized by the ECMI and the State Minister of Georgia on Conflict Resolution Issues*. Tbilisi, Georgia: European Centre for Minority Issues.

Annotation: A source for up-to-date statistics and information on the Meskhetians, this report is the result of a conference held in Tbilisi which involved the Georgian government, the European Centre for Minority Issues, and several civil society groups, as well as the international community. It covers the current situation of the Meskhetians and the problems facing them upon return.

Burke, Justin. 1998. Meskhetian Turks: Solutions and Human Security. Open Society Institute. <http://www.osi.hu/fmp/html/meskpreface.html>.

Annotation: This report, published by George Soros's Open Society Institute is an excellent overall introduction to the situation of the Meskhetian Turks, including both the historical background and current information.

Comins-Richmond, Walter. 2002. "The Karachay Struggle after the Deportation." *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 22 (1): 17.

Annotation: This article is a comprehensive review of the deportation of the Karachays, their treatment under the Soviets, and their current struggle for an independent state. As opposed to the author's other article cited above, "The Deportation of the Karachays," this article focuses primarily on nationalist movements among the Karachay during the last fifty years.

Gorenburg, Dimitry P. 2003. Minority Ethnic Mobilization in the Russian Federation. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Annotation: This book does not exclusively deal with the nationalist struggles of those ethnic groups deported under Stalin, but places them in the context of a broader struggle between the state and minority groups in the ethnically diverse Russian Federation. In particular, it mentions the Balkars, Chechens, Ingush, Kalmyks and Crimean Tatars, as groups that have defined part of their repatriation experience in terms of a search for a nationalist identity.

Pentikainen, Oskari, and Tom Trier. 2004. Between Integration and Resettlement: The Meskhetian Turks. Flensburg: European Centre for Minority Issues.

Annotation: This is a report by the European Centre for Minority Issues on the current situation of the Meskhetian Turks. It includes social and demographic information from eight countries in Europe and Eurasia where Meskhetians currently live, covers Meskhetian advocacy groups, and addresses the continuing political negotiations between several countries as well as international organizations. The report also contains a review of current literature on the Meskhetians, and highlights areas for further study.

Ray, Kakoli. 2000. "Repatriation and De-Territorialization: Meskhetian Turks' Conception of Home." *Journal of Refugee Studies* 13 (4): 23.

Annotation: This article examines Meskhetian Turk refugees' ideas of home as a way of investigating repatriation. The author considers repatriation as a preferable solution, but concludes that there is some disconnect between the Meskhetian's concept of home, and the conventional view of home. The article also addresses the ability of the international refugee system to protect refugee rights.

Tishkov, Valery. 1997. *Ethnicity, Nationalism and Conflict in and after the Soviet Union*. London: Sage.

Annotation: This book offers a detailed examination of the subject of ethnicity and nationalism in the post-Soviet era. Tishkov gives the context surrounding many of the current nationalist conflicts in Russia and the CIS. Though the author mentions the Kalmyks, Karachai and Meskhetians, it is primarily a resource about the Ingush and Chechens. The Ingush-Ossetian conflict and the war in Chechnya are both covered in detail, giving an excellent (though slightly dated) picture of conditions in those regions.

Uehling, Greta Lynn. 2004. *Beyond Memory: The Crimean Tatars Deportation and Return*. New York: Palgrave.

Annotation: Beyond Memory presents an ethnographic study of the Crimean Tatars' deportation and repatriation. It has less of a focus on the actual deportation; it focuses on personal accounts and interviews with both Tatars and members of the Russian community. It is primarily an exploration of the repatriation experience, and details the struggles of this group for the national collectivity. It is an excellent source of information about the ways in which the Tatars kept their identity during the deportation through collective memory and storytelling, as well as how Russian views on the Tatars changed over time. The book includes maps and photos.

van Tongeren, Paul, Hans van de Veen, and Juliette Verhoeven, eds. 2002. *Searching for Peace in Europe and Eurasia: An Overview of Conflict Prevention and Peacebuilding Activities*. Boulder: Lynne Rienner, 2002.

Annotation: This edited book is a collection of studies about ethnic conflict across Europe and Eurasia. It includes up-to-date information on several deported minorities. In part one, Valery Tishikov's essay "History and Legacies of the USSR" examines the results of the "multiethnic experiment" that was the Soviet Union. In part two of the book Anna Matveeva has a section on the Russian Federation, with emphases on the conflicts in Chechnya, Dagestan and North Ossetia/Ingushetia. There is also an overview of the Southern Caucasus by Jonathan Cohen and Anna Matveeva, which addresses the mass return of displaced persons in a regional light, examining the economic, social and political consequences. Finally, the section on Central Asia briefly mentions the current conditions of those deported who have not yet been able to return to their homelands. Part three is a directory of human rights and peacebuilding organizations for every country in Europe and Eurasia, providing a helpful starting point for further research.

The Roma: During and After Communism

By Florinda Lucero and Jill Collum

During Communism

The Roma are an interconnected ethnic and cultural group that migrated out of India more than ten centuries ago. In the Czech Republic, they may have been present since the 15th century. Although relations within Czech lands began honorably, they quickly disintegrated into enmity and within a century Czechs could kill the Roma with impunity. Legislation restricting Roma movement came about in 1927 with Law 117: the “Law on Wandering Gypsies,” which stated that the Roma were now required to seek permission to stay overnight in any given location. In the run-up to World War II, parallel restrictions to those enforced upon Jewish populations were placed upon the Roma: the same references to their difference, and a belief in their sub-humanity. Though their numbers were smaller, the Roma of Central and Eastern Europe suffered the same fate as 6 million Jews. In camps such as Lety, Hodonin, and Auschwitz I, they were interned and murdered by the thousands. After the war only 583 of the Roma returned to Czech lands out of the more than 8,000 sent to Roma-specific camps. With the decimation of industrial populations in the Czech and Slovak lands after WWII, there was a window for rural Roma populations to enter. With historic knowledge of blacksmithing and tinkering, they were able to take part in the re-industrializing of the Czech lands. However, within a few years they were relegated to wasted ghettos and their children were routinely sent to schools for the mentally impaired.

As Communism came over to Czechoslovakia, a chilling “solution” to the proliferation of the Roma came about: the uninformed and non-consenting sterilization of Roma women, often under the guise of caesarean sections and abortions, and under pressure from social workers who would get their uninformed consent with promises of cash and tangible goods. Though this practice is meant to have stopped with the downfall of the Communist government, there are indices that suggest otherwise.

In the eyes of some, the Roma benefited under communism. From a non-Roma point of view, it might have seemed as though life was well under communism, given a strong black market through their cultural ties in neighboring countries, and government funded land to be tilled for the collective. The loss of traditional work in favor of vast Soviet factories however, was considered by some to be a forced assimilation that was not welcome. Within Russia itself they fared little better, even though they fought in the Red Army against Hitler in World War II. In Russia proper the story was the same; marginalized, ridiculed, and abused, their poverty was enforced by the systemic racism surrounding them. In fact, textbooks still exist declaring it a health hazard to touch gypsies.

Research has indicated an enduring theme of violence and pervasive bigotry towards the Roma. Initially, researchers hoped they would uncover a lessening of discrimination against the Roma as history unfolded. Unfortunately this has not been the case. They even considered the possibility that things were better under Communism than they are today for Czech populations of Roma. Yet this was not the case either. Although it is true that under Communism the Roma were sometimes allotted lands or funds or social support, they were also coerced to be sterilized in alarming percentages. When considered in conjunction with the forced removal of Roma children to be raised and educated with non-Roma, it begins to have the shape and color of extermination.

What does it take to forgive? Is there a set amount of time that must pass before an offense is softened? When the villagers in Salem three centuries ago were gripped by a mob mentality, how long did it take the survivors of the witch hunts to face their mad accusers in the market? For Eleonora Rostas, a Roma woman from a small village in Romania, more than a decade has passed since villagers torched her home, yet the pain lingers still. The reasons given for the attack were as murky as the punishment meted out in 1997, five years after Eleonora and her daughter fled into the Romanian winter night. Although a Roma man was killed and much property destroyed, only two attackers came to a faint justice of imprisonment—light sentences that were revoked within two years. This story of mistreatment, injustice, racism, and legalized persecution is a perfect example of the current state of the Roma people throughout Europe and specifically within the former Soviet bloc.

After Communism

The political and social upheaval that ensued after the fall of the Iron Curtain had profound effects on all members of the formerly communist states. There is no doubt that the changing politics of the region have altered the lives of its inhabitants, but in the case of the human rights of the Roma as a distinct social group, the question is, how much have things changed?

By all accounts, the change from communism to a free-market economy marked the beginning of a crisis period for the Roma, due to social and economic changes, and the loss of social programs and initiatives upon which many may have depended. Observers note a marked increase at hate crimes committed against Roma victims in central and Eastern Europe since the collapse of communism. Unprovoked assaults, fatal police beatings, and attacks on whole villages, in which houses are burned and people are lynched, are known to have occurred with frightening commonality. Although the Roma have always been a socially and economically marginalized population in Eastern Europe, now more than ever Roma communities and neighborhoods are often found lacking in electricity and clean water.

Statistics and trends speak volumes about the poor quality of life for the Roma people in formerly communist satellite states, as well as in Russia itself. In the Czech Republic two-thirds of Roma children are in special schools for dysfunctional students, unemployment among adult Roma is often estimated to be at 90 percent, and there has been a steep incline in racial assaults against Roma individuals since 1990. In Russia the estimated 150,000 Roma that live there are often denied health care, housing, education and employment. Racism against the Roma in Russia is acceptable enough to be called mainstream: Roma children sit at different tables in primary schools, textbooks warn to stay away from gypsies because they spread disease, and network TV documentaries describe them as kidnappers and slave traders.

In the legal arena, the Roma do not have an adequate voice. Notable court cases have been won, such as the instance in which a Czech Roma woman successfully sued a drugstore for not allowing her to apply for employment. Also, courts in the Czech Republic have fined bar and disco owners for excluding Roma, but these cases receive attention because they are exceptions to the rule. The Roma generally have little or no legal recourse when they are victims of violence or discrimination. Recently, a suit brought by 18 Czech Romany Primary students alleging discrimination in education lost in court.

Additionally, certain observers say, Roma Human Rights are negatively affected by the fact that they are often asylum seekers in the original E.U. member countries. They are therefore seen as a drain on Western European social welfare systems by Western Europeans, and as a scapegoat on whom to put the blame for a difficult or critical accession process by their fellow Eastern European citizens.

The Roma now hold the title of the European Union's largest ethnic minority. They are also Europe's most deprived minority. Racism against the Roma as a group remains deeply ingrained and surprisingly socially accepted in many parts of Europe. As the E.U. expands eastward, it brings with it several important pieces of policy on minority and Roma rights to Central and Eastern European countries. However, it also brings with it prejudices against the Roma which are just as deeply ingrained in Western Europe. Resources for a deeper understanding and further discussion of the plight of the Roma in Europe can be found in the following annotated bibliography.

During Communism

1998. "Ghettos for Czech Gypsies." *The Economist*, 30 May: 1.

Annotation: This article focuses on the difficulties facing the Czech Republic's gypsy population, in particular the reluctance of other Czechs to give them jobs, violence against gypsies, proposals to create ghettos to separate gypsies from other citizens, President Vaclav Havel urging his people to be kinder to gypsies, ghetto proposals rousing human-rights groups and politicians, and comparison of the ghettos to Nazi concentration camps.

2006. "Three Czech Romani Organisations Criticise Errc Prague: Balazova, Jarmila," in *Romano Vodi – Romany Information Service – News*, 14 November.
http://www.romea.cz/english/index.php?id=servis/z_en_2006_0300.

Annotation: This is a news article regarding criticisms of the European Roma Rights Centre, after three separate Roma organizations applied for help from the ERRC in legal cases and the ERRC failed to respond. The website is the first comprehensive site dealing with Russian Gypsies, even breaking them down into various intra-ethnic groups.

Barany, Zoltan. 2000. "The Socio-Economic Impact of Regime Change in Eastern Europe: Gypsy Marginality in the 1990s." *East European Politics & Societies* 15 (1)

Annotation: Since the fall of Communism starting in 1989, poverty amongst Roma populations has increased dramatically. Although this can be said for the population at large, it is particularly pronounced amongst Roma communities.

Erlanger, Steven. 2000. "Czech Gypsies Knock Harder on the Closed Doors." *The New York Times*, 12 May, 3.

Annotation: This article discusses the problem of discrimination against the Roma, or Gypsies, in the Czech Republic, including the lawsuit of Monika Horakova, a Gypsy member of the Czech Parliament, against a club in Brno. Though she won a discrimination case in civil court, it may have been due to her status as a Parliamentarian, and not because of changing mores. The article also discusses the treatment of Gypsies during the Communist regime in the Czech Republic.

Fawn, Rick. 2001. "Czech Attitudes toward the Roma: 'Expecting More of Havel's Country.'" *Europe-Asia Studies* 53 (8): 1193, 1219.

Annotation: This article details the crimes against the Roma within the Czech Republic, including but not limited to several killings, a piece of anti-citizenship legislation, and the running of an industrial pig farm on the site of a Nazi run Roma extermination camp.

Miklusakova, Marta and Necas, Ctibor. 2000. The History of the Roma Minority in the Czech Republic [Website]. Prague: Radio Prague, 15 November.
<http://romove.radio.cz/en/article/18913>.

Annotation: Provides a detailed history of the Roma in the Czech state since 1242 CE, including a general history of the Roma. News feed updates with stories regarding Roma rights violations and current actions taken in [their] defense.

Vladimirova, Mara. 2005. *Anti-Gypsy Persecutions in Russia* [website]. Moscow: Antifa-Net.
http://www.romea.cz/english/index.php?id=servis/monitoring/m_en_2005_0046.

Annotation: Approximately 150,000 Gypsies live in the Russian Federation, who are regularly denied all forms of social acceptance and programs. The plight of the modern Gypsy is akin to that of European Jews in the intra-war years and WWII, and black populations in the American south prior to the Civil Rights act. Interestingly, persecution of the Roma is one area in which Russia herself did not initiate proceedings. As they migrated east, they did not reach Moscow and St. Petersburg until the 19th century, though there is information that they had been in Russia since the 16th century. Migrations out of the Asian Republics from 1992-1997 into Russia proper led to heightened xenophobia against the Roma and Luli tribes.

Weyrauch, Walter O. 1997. "Oral Legal Traditions of Gypsies and Some American Equivalents." *The American Journal of Comparative Law* 45: (2) 407-442.

Annotation: This article contains anthropological research into some traditions of certain Roma tribes including but not limited to "the power of Gypsy women," "objectives of studying Gypsy law," and "ethics of uncovering facts meant to be secret."

After Communism

1998. "Slovaks V Czechs on Gypsies." *Economist* 349 (8093): 52.

Annotation: This is a succinct and informative outline of the topic. It points out several somewhat surprising historical occurrences that show how the Slovaks have traditionally been slightly more accepting of the Roma than the Czechs. It briefly touches upon how both countries have passed laws or even created ministries in an attempt to demonstrate their progressiveness on the Roma question to the greater European community, and thereby speed up their acceptance to the E.U.

2004. "The Coming Hordes." *Economist* 370 (8358): 42-43.

Annotation: This article focuses more generally on the East-to-West European migration that accompanies European Union expansion. It suggests that rather than changing labor laws and limiting who receives state aid, a better way to prevent overwhelming immigration would be to invest in the poorest parts of Eastern and Central Europe to prevent too much emigration.

2004. "Those Roamin" Roma." *Economist* 370 (8361): 54-54.

Annotation: This article is a brief discussion on how older E.U. member states are altering labor and immigration laws in response to fears that the inclusion of Central and Eastern states will lead to a wave of Roma immigration. The article mentions both the racially prejudicial and "economically reasonable" bases for these fears, and gives an account of how the Roma are regarded all over Europe, in both their official and unofficial capacities.

Barany, Zoltan. 2000. "Politics and the Roma in State-Socialist Eastern Europe." *Communist and Post-Communist Studies*. 33 (4): 421-437.

Annotation: The information in this article is useful for its sheer volume, in that it attempts to portray the struggles of various Roma communities in their respective states. This leads to a multi-dimensional and less static understanding of the Roma as a persecuted European minority. Among its more interesting points is the fact that since governments in many Soviet satellites refused to grant the Roma official "national minority" status, they were often listed as members of other groups or nationalities, which wreaked havoc with statistical data. Also of interest is its mention of the work of Romani activist Miroslav Holomek, who attempted to promote gypsy identity and nationality during the Prague Spring of 1968.

Boeles, Pieter, and Franscoise Schild. 2002. "Case Reports of the European Court of Human Rights." *European Journal of Migration & Law*. 4 (4): 1-510.

Annotation: This deeply informative and thorough piece sheds a great deal of light on minority rights as they relate to law in Europe. It is useful in that the first case it explores, dealing with Belgium's forced deportation of a Roma family under false pretenses, shows some of the challenges faced by Roma both in their countries of origin and in countries to which they have fled seeking asylum.

Cahn, Claude. 2003. "Racial Preference, Racial Exclusion: Administrative Efforts to Enforce the Separation of Roma and Non-Roma in Europe through Migration Controls." *European Journal of Migration & Law*. 5 (4): 479-490.

Annotation: This article places contemporary European racism against the Roma in the context of historical European racism, invoking the Holocaust. It takes a critical look at laws and policies that affect the Roma all over Europe and explores how E.U.-based human rights organizations have approached the resulting problems. It is very useful in pointing out how many European states have laws facilitating the compulsory, collective expulsion of Roma groups, and failing that, their segregation. It shows that several local policies have their bases in racist stereotypes, such as the Roma as "nomads" and the Roma as "con-artists." Also, it looks at how many Western European countries have border and asylum policies that aim to exclude the Roma.

Castle-Kanerova, Mit'a. 2003. "Round and Round the Roundabout: Czech Roma and the Vicious Circle of Asylum-Seeking." *Nationalities Papers* 31 (1): 13.

Annotation: This article is a detailed exploration of the harmonization of immigration policies in European Union Countries, using the plight of Czech Roma asylum seekers to illustrate how the system is flawed. It discusses the view of the Roma as the "outsiders" of Europe and shows how immigration policy reflects this view. Perhaps most interestingly, it mentions how a right to migration, though misunderstood and feared by many Europeans, is necessary for future economic prosperity.

Dacombe, John. 2004. "Rights to Roma." *Economist*, 370: 17.

Annotation: Certainly not the most informative citation in this list, this reader's letter in the *Economist* points out the valuable fact that the European Union has consistently overlooked racism and racist policies against the Roma in their accession talks while vocally criticizing prospective member states that oppress other groups.

Edwards, Alice. 2005. "New Roma Rights Legislation in Bosnia and Herzegovina: Positive, Negative or Indifferent?" *International Journal of Human Rights* 9 (4): 465-478.

Abstract: *On 31 March 2003, the Parliament of Bosnia and Herzegovina passed minority rights legislation. This article reviews its main provisions and critically asks: to what extent does this law meet international and European standards? How effective will this law be in addressing the socio-economic and political crisis facing the*

Roma minority today? Apart from granting minority status to the Roma, a right they had enjoyed under the 1974 Yugoslav Constitution, this article concludes that the new law offers little by way of additional protections beyond those already available, albeit under-utilized, under the Dayton Peace Agreement and the State and Entity Constitutions. It further notes that the limited nature of minority rights legislation to cultural, linguistic and religious rights means that it fails to address many of the critical issues facing the Roma today, such as illiteracy, poverty, widespread discrimination and prejudice, and political disenfranchisement.

Fanadova, Linda. 2003. "Update on Czech Roma." *New Presence: The Prague Journal of Central European Affairs* 5 (2): 28.

Annotation: This article provides a brief summary of treatment of the Roma from 1918 to the present. It divides this time period into three sections: 1918-1945, post-war (1945-1989), and post-communist. It helpfully demonstrates how events and policies from one period were carried over into or influential upon the next. This article is very informative on the subject of this bibliography, but it tends towards implying that the Roma are responsible for their own problems and should be charged with the responsibility of uplifting themselves.

Goldston, James A. 2002. "Roma Rights, Roma Wrongs." *Foreign Affairs* 81 (2): 146-162.

Annotation: Coincidentally or not, when the European Union began considering further eastward enlargement, movements aimed at bringing rights to the Roma were also gaining ground. This article takes an optimistic line on the convergence of these movements and the E.U. accession process, predicting that it has the potential to improve the overall plight of the Roma people. Published in 2002, it recommends several courses of action to facilitate this improvement, many of which seem to have been followed to various degrees.

Henrard, Kristin. 2003. "The Building Blocks for an Emerging Regime for the Protection of a Controversial Case of Cultural Diversity: The Roma." *International Journal on Minority & Group Rights* 10 (3): 183-201.

Annotation: This relatively optimistic work focuses on prejudice, stereotype, and racism as the root causes of Roma marginalization in Europe. It identifies an emerging "Roma protection regime" and discusses theoretical issues of race and identity, as well as cultural aspects of Roma communities that should be understood and respected.

Hepple, Bob. 2004. "Race and Law in Fortress Europe." *Modern Law Review* 67 (1): 1-15.

Annotation: Hepple focuses on what he sees as the two major impediments against human rights for minorities in contemporary Europe: the lack of rights guaranteed to non-E.U. citizens (as many Central and Eastern European Roma were at the time of writing) and the lack of policy offering positive discriminatory practices, popularly known in this country as affirmative action. He uses the Roma as an example of a European ethnic minority affected by these two factors.

Klimova-Alexander, Ilona. 2005. "A Help or a Hindrance?" *Transitions Online*: N.PAG.

Annotation: This article provides a good depiction of the gap between policy and reality regarding the Roma in the European Union. It points out that there is often more pressure on candidate states to improve their policies on the Roma than on old member states. It is critical of the policies in both candidate and member states, on the grounds that ideas for improvement of Roma communities are usually heavy on theory and light on action, and that Roma are often uninvolved in the planning and implementation of these policies.

Pogany, Istvan. 2004. "Refashioning Rights in Central and Eastern Europe: Some Implications for the Region's Roma." *European Public Law* 10 (1): 85-106.

Annotation: This article provides a summary of many of the problems faced by the Roma in Europe: unemployment is high in Roma communities while the cost of living keeps going up; Europe's minority rights legislation is ineffective where it actually exists; Roma individuals are often the victims of racially motivated violence; and they are often failed by the criminal justice system.

Ram, Melanie H. 2003. "Democratization through European Integration: The Case of Minority Rights in the Czech Republic and Romania." *Studies in Comparative International Development* 38 (2): 28.

Annotation: This lengthy article looks at the multiple ways the European Union influences its candidate and new member states. It makes clear that not only is E.U. policy largely dependent on the state in which its being enacted, but policies that deal with minority rights are shown to be linked to the status and activity level of the minority group in question.

Roberts, Andrew. 2001. "Asylum for Asylum Laws." *New Presence: The Prague Journal of Central European Affairs* 3 (3): 17.

Annotation: This article points out problems at many levels of the asylum process. It shows racist policies carried out by the British, and problems faced by Roma seeking asylum in the UK. It also demonstrates the burdens that overwhelming numbers of asylum seekers put on a system. This provides a clear and succinct summary of the racism faced by the Roma outside of their countries of origin, and the solutions suggested at the end are worthy of further discussion.

Rybkova, Eva. 2004. "Czech Republic: A Breakthrough." *Transitions Online*: N.PAG.

Annotation: This article reports one incident where a Roma woman was discriminated against and later legally compensated. She was helped by a Czech Civic organization in pursuing the issue, and when she won her case against the drugstore that had not allowed her to apply for a

job it was the first time such a case had been won in the Czech Republic. The attention the case received shed light on both racism against the Roma and weaknesses in Czech law.

Tesser, Lynn M. 2003. "The Geopolitics of Tolerance: Minority Rights under E.U. Expansion in East-Central Europe." *East European Politics & Societies* 17 (3): 483.

Annotation: This article is an interesting exploration of how imported norms, dealing with minorities' identities and rights, can interact with the society into which they have been imported. It demonstrates the possible negative impacts of even the best intended norms when they are brought into a new culture. This article would be useful for a longer, deeper and more theoretical approach to the subject of Roma rights in Europe.

Wesolowsky, Tony. 2001. "British Checks Hit Czech Minority." *Christian Science Monitor* 93 (168): 6.

Annotation: This article recounts an example of the kinds of blatant discrimination the Roma face all over Europe. British immigration officials conduct "random" interviews with UK-bound passengers at the Prague airport looking to weed out asylum seekers. The vast majority of those interviewed and pulled from their flights appear to be Roma.

Totalitarianism: The Case of Turkmenistan

By Hayden Gore

With the disintegration of the Soviet Union in 1991, Saparmurat Niyazov, the former First Secretary of the Communist Party of Turkmenistan and self-styled “Turkmenbashi” (Father of All Turkmen), became the country’s first president, quickly fashioning Turkmenistan into one of the most repressive regimes in the world. Declared president-for-life after a dubious parliamentary election in which he selected all of the candidates, Niyazov has created a Stalinistic personality cult to glorify his image and to solidify his control over the state. His “reforms” have outlawed political dissent, marginalized ethnic and religious minorities, gutted the public health system, and enforced a campaign of public indoctrination in which the state controls all media outlets, significantly degraded public education.

A purported assassination attempt in November of 2002 served as a pretext for further political repression in the country, worsening an already dismal human rights situation and extending Niyazov’s control across all sectors of society. In 2003, the “Betrayers of the Motherland Law” deemed any opposition to the government an act of treason punishable by life imprisonment without parole. Abduction, torture, beatings, internal exile, and psychiatric internment are all common tools used by the state police.

Ethnic and religious minorities have particularly suffered under Niyazov’s policy of “Turkmenization,” in which the Turkmen ethnicity is required for public employment and non-Turkmen languages, particularly Russian, have been largely phased out of public education. Additionally, the state severely restricts religious practice. Until recently, only two religious groups, the Sunni Muslim Board and the Russian Orthodox Church were permitted. Yet, those who worship outside of these faiths still suffer frequent intimidation, harassment, torture, and even imprisonment.

Although Turkmenistan inherited a solid public health infrastructure from the Soviet Union, Niyazov’s reforms have dismantled much of it, closing health clinics across the country, dismissing thousands of medical professionals and limiting rural communities’ access to medical care. The government has also officially banned diagnoses of certain communicable diseases, creating fears among global health experts of unreported epidemics.

Public education has similarly suffered under Niyazov, along with state-controlled media; they have both been used as primary tools for public indoctrination. Niyazov’s government has closed all libraries outside of the capital, reduced mandatory education from ten to nine years, and supplanted the national curriculum with the study of his pseudo-spiritual book about Turkmen heritage and culture, *The Ruhnama*. Meanwhile, the four state television channels, two radio stations, and several state-run newspapers dedicate themselves to the dual pursuit of propounding a Turkmen “Golden Age” and proclaiming Niyazov’s greatness.

Undoubtedly, Niyazov’s rule in Turkmenistan has allowed egregious human rights violations. The personality cult that he has created blurs the distinction between himself as an individual and the state and it has effectively personified the rule of law in his image. His complete control over society has also eliminated oppositional forces and made political change an impossibility. Unfortunately, Niyazov’s paranoid fear of criticism has led him to alter Turkmen society in ways that can only deleteriously affect the possibility for the future development of human rights in the

country. The bibliography that follows focuses on the ways in which Niyazov's regime has altered Turkmen society to the detriment of human rights; whether this legacy will continue after the leader's 2006 death remains to be seen.

Turkmenbashi Personality Cult & Political Repression

2004. *Turkmenistan: Human Rights Update, Human Rights Watch Submission to the EBRD*. New York: Backgrounders, 14 May: <http://hrw.org/english/docs/2004/05/14/turkme8964.htm>

Annotation: Human Rights Watch recommends the termination of all lending to Turkmenistan from the European Bank of Reconstruction and Development due to the alarming human rights environment in the country. In its submission to the EBRD, Human Rights Watch compiles a specific list of human rights violations, including the severe restrictions on civil and political rights, the harassment of ethnic minorities and religious groups, and the use of inhumane forms of punishment in contradiction to the country's commitments under international law.

2006. "Realistic Promises?" *Emerging Europe Monitor: Russia & CIS* 10 (12): 9.

Annotation: In order to solidify his personality cult and militate against discontent, President Niyazov announced that the Turkmen people will enjoy free utilities through the year 2030. Additionally, Niyazov declared his intention to double wages by 2008. These ambitious proclamations are made feasible, though not entirely possible, by the enormous oil and natural gas deposits under Turkmenistan's soil. The abundance of these coveted natural resources have perhaps buoyed Niyazov and enabled his autocratic rule. As a result, the political risk rating contained in this article is surprisingly low; however, the lack of legal structures and the absence of a natural successor could lead to political violence upon Niyazov's demise.

Andersen, Michael. 2005. "Dynasties and Dictators." *Index on Censorship* 34 (1): 141-149.

Annotation: This is a comprehensive article on the autocratic "presidents" of the Central Asian states and their connection to the Soviet past. The author, a journalist and broadcaster living and working in Kyrgyzstan, demonstrates the way in which the legacy of Soviet totalitarianism has found expression in the Central Asian republics. The current presidents, all former communist bosses, employ the old Soviet tools of state repression, electoral chicanery, and strict control of state-run media to perpetuate their rule and enrich themselves at the expense of their people's political freedom and economic development.

Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor. 2005. "Country Report on Human Rights Practices in Turkmenistan." Washington, D.C.: U. S. Department of State. <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2005/index.htm>.

Annotation: This extensive U.S. State Department report compares the human rights principles enshrined in Turkmenistan's constitution and statutory law with their inadequate implementation on the ground, creating an interesting juxtaposition between official rhetoric and practice. The report is particularly unique in its specificity: rather than speaking in general terms about the level of state repression in Turkmenistan, the report offers a thorough compilation of individual cases and examples of abuse, often naming the victims and detailing the conditions of their treatment. As a result, the report personalizes the insecurity within the country, adding an immediacy to its findings, which is often absent from other more generalized accounts.

Decaux, Prof. Emmanuel. 2003. *OSCE Rapporteur's Report on Turkmenistan*. Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. http://www.osce.org/documents/odhr/2003/03/1636_en.pdf.

Annotation: Undertaken over fears of increased repression and abuse after the November 25, 2002 assassination attempt on President Niyazov's life, the OSCE report concludes that there were serious irregularities in the investigation of the purported crime, resulting in grave violations of justice, arbitrary arrest, torture-induced confessions, and televised show trials. The report highlights the confused, often conflicting official accounts of the assassination attempt and demonstrates the way in which it has been used to eliminate potential political rivals completely disconnected from the crime. The report also includes the transcripts of the confessions made by the accused, many of which were the result of torture and forced drug use, and were widely broadcast on Turkmenistan's state-run television. The report concludes with Turkmenistan Delegation's official repudiation of the Rapportuer's investigation and conclusions.

Denber, Rachel. 2006. "Cruelty Behind a Joke." *New Statesman*. 23 July: 14.

Annotation: The bizarre, often comical nature of the Turkmenbashi personality cult belies the treachery behind Niyazov's autocratic rule. This article illustrates that when it comes to suppressing dissent—whether political, religious, or otherwise—Niyazov dispenses his own form of sadistic justice with no particular sense of humor. Among the repressive measures employed to enforce Niyazov's rule are tactics left over from the Soviet era, including torture, internal exile, and psychiatric internment. The European Union formerly took a hard line on human rights violations in Turkmenistan; however, the E.U.'s interest in the country's large natural gas reserves has softened its criticism. Ironically, a recent European delegation negotiating a trade agreement with Ashgabat arrived in the capital city days after the arrest of local human rights advocates and their families.

Greenberg, Ilan. 2003. "When a Kleptocratic, Megalomanûacal Dictator Goes Bad." *The New York Times Magazine*.

Annotation: The author, a former reporter for The Asian Wall Street Journal who lived in neighboring Kazakhstan at the time of the article, traveled to Turkmenistan to report on the dual absurdity and treachery of the Turkmenbashi personality cult. He details the curious, almost

humorous aspects of Niyazov's reign—for example, the proliferation of gaudy prestige projects, the ubiquity of self-reverential statutes—but does so with an underlying unease which points to the darker side of Niyazov's megalomania: the increasing political repression, the deteriorating public education system, and the spiraling rate of heroin addiction which the government seems unwilling or unable to control. Most impressively, he interviews Turkmen, who incredibly, given restrictions on free speech, speak candidly about their frustrations and despair over the present state of their country.

Horak, Slavomir. 2005. "The Ideology of the Turkmenbashi Regime." *Perspectives on European Politics & Society* 6 (2): 305-319.

Annotation: Since independence from the Soviet Union in 1991, Saparmurat Niyazov has attempted to solidify his rule through the construction of a Turkmen nationalist ideology centered around the president's own personality cult as Turkmenbashi, the self-proclaimed "Father of All Turkmen." Horak contextualizes this ideology within the development of other authoritarian or totalitarian regimes—Kim Jong-Il, Muammar Qaddafi, and the Ayatollah Khomeini, among others. The article traces the Turkmenbashi ideology back to its inception, providing both a chronology of its emergence and a compelling description of its central tenants.

Niyazov, Saparmurat A. "Strategic Partnership in the Ideals of Peace and Humanism." *U.N. Chronicle* 41, no. 2 (2004): 62-66.

Annotation: In an oblique defense of his policies, Niyazov paints his country as a paragon of international cooperation and peace-loving neutrality. Domestically, he describes the development of Turkmenistan since independence as an embodiment of the Turkmen people's collective spirit. Most likely in response to his many critics, Niyazov argues that the mutual trust between himself and the Turkmen people has created a "stable platform" for the establishment of democracy and the rule of law. However, he also offers a striking caveat to this assertion, cleverly framing it for today's political environment: democracy must be implemented gradually with due consideration given to the exigencies of fighting terrorism.

Rall, Ted. 2006. "The Glory That Is Turkmenbashi." In *Silk Road to Ruin*, ed. J. P. Trostle. New York: NBM: 36-56.

Annotation: The author, a syndicated columnist and cartoonist, set out on to write an adventure travel piece about Central Asia, which, due to its subject matter, equally aims to capture humor and grim reality. The second chapter, dedicated to the Turkmenbashi personality cult, reads as a "greatest hits list" of Niyazov's more absurd antics: outlawing gold-capped teeth, changing the names of the months of the year, and erecting a towering gold-leafed statue of himself in Ashgabat, the capital city, which rotates 360 degrees so that his gilded face always points toward the sun. The author also reports on the profligate construction of an \$8 billion Turkmen Lake--another one of Niyazov's gratuitous prestige projects—in the center of the Karakum Desert, while the Turkmen people languish in poverty with a reported \$1,440 per capita annual income.

Sabol, Steven. 2003. "Turkmenbashi: Going It Alone." *Problems of Post-communism* 50 (5): 49-57.

Annotation: This article provides the context for the political developments in Turkmenistan following the November 2002 assassination attempt on Niyazov's life. The author details many of the most salient peculiarities of the Niyazov personality cult, analyzes the incoherence of domestic political opposition after the failed assassination, and then contemplates the prospects of a successful post-Niyazov transition. Unsurprisingly, he does not reach very sanguine conclusions: increased political repression has effectively eliminated domestic opposition and Niyazov's own unwillingness to groom a successor, presumably for fear of creating rivals within the government, sets the stage for a tumultuous, perhaps even violent, transition whenever the Turkmenbashi personality cult reaches its end.

Stoudmann, Gerard. 2003. "Turkmenistan, a Human Rights 'Black Hole'." *Helsinki Monitor* 14 (2): 117-124.

Annotation: The article offers a critique of the "Moscow Mechanism" invoked by the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) in response to human rights violations associated with a government crackdown following a supposed 2002 assassination attempt on Niyazov's life. While the author's analysis is rather abstruse and technical, he does provide a short history of human rights developments in Turkmenistan since independence, and points to the country's increasing insularity on the international stage, particularly in its defiance of the OSCE and international human rights norms.

Turkmenbashi, Saparmyrat. 2005. Rukhnama: Reflections on the Spiritual Values of the Turkmen. Ashgabat: State Publishing Service Turkmenistan.

Annotation: Saparmurat Niyazov's pseudo-spiritual book on Turkmen heritage and culture is one of the central pillars of the Turkmenbashi personality cult. Recited by school children, quoted in mosques and churches, and compared to the Bible and Koran in importance, the Rukhnama is a rambling collection of Niyazov's homespun aphorisms and historical inventions about the Turkmen people. Purportedly revealed to him by God, the Rukhnama is considered by some to be a bizarre, chaotic text written in an attempt to elevate Niyazov's status from political leader to spiritual prophet divinely leading Turkmenistan through an unprecedented "Golden Century." The book itself is a fascinating window into Niyazov's delusions of grandeur, and yet the oath that begins the book belies any thought of him as a harmless eccentric. "At the moment of my betrayal to my motherland, to her sacred banner, to Saparmurat Turkmenbashi the Great," the oath ominously intones, "let my breath stop!"

Oppression of Ethnic and Religious Minorities

2005. Turkmenistan: The Clampdown on Dissent and Religious Freedom Continues. New York: Amnesty International.

Annotation: Amnesty International's comprehensive report compiles an exhaustive list on violations of civil and political rights in Turkmenistan. The report draws particular attention to the disparity between Turkmenistan's deplorable human rights record and its obligations as a signatory to both the International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights and the Convention Against Torture. This flagrant repudiation of the country's commitments under international law has provoked severe criticism from the international community, and a section of this report demonstrates the positive effects that international pressure has had in goading Niyazov to release prisoners of conscience and lessen restrictions on religious practice.

Corley, Felix. 2004. "Eastern Europe: Osce Conference on Discrimination--a Regional Survey." *Religion in Eastern Europe* 24 (5): 38-44.

Annotation: Despite the commitment made by all OSCE states to respect freedom of religion, guarantees of this right remain scant among some member states in Eastern Europe and Central Asia. This report identifies Turkmenistan, along with Uzbekistan, Belarus, Azerbaijan and Armenia, as a chronic violator of these fundamental principles. Some of the most worrying restrictions on freedom of religion include the required registration of religious groups, the censorship of religious literature, and the discrimination and forced deportation of ethnic minorities.

_____. 2005. *Turkmenistan: The Year of Praying Dangerously* Transitions Online. http://www.ciaonet.org/pbei-2/tol/tol_2005/jan3-jan10/jan3-jan10g.html.

Annotation: The article chronicles the demolition and confiscation of local mosques, churches, and other houses of worship by the Turkmenistan government since the late 1990s, underscoring the extent to which the state controls and proscribes religious practice. The article's sources variously report that the state has targeted mosques in which imams have rejected the imposition of Niyazov's pseudo-spiritual book, the Rukhnama, as a text on par with that of the Koran. Others report that the demolitions have targeted private mosques financed by Arab charities that practice Wahhabism, a Saudi brand of Sunni Islam condemned by the president as discordant and disputatious.

Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe. 2004. "Religious Freedom in Turkmenistan: Briefing of the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe, May 11, 2004." Washington, D.C.: CSCE, United States Congress.

Annotation: This transcript of the CSCE hearing on religious freedom in Turkmenistan highlights some of the more disturbing restrictions on religion that have developed under

President Niyazov. Although Niyazov reportedly opened official registration to religious groups beyond Sunni Islam and the Russian Orthodox Church, state control of religion still remains a salient issue and has been employed to further the Turkmenbashi personality cult. As the panel of experts testify, the Committee for Religious Affairs appoints all imams in Turkmenistan, the Rukhnama has been elevated to equal status with the Koran and the Bible, and religious leaders are required to quote it extensively in their sermons. Additionally, fear continues to suppress the free practice of religion in those groups which suffered harassment at the hands of the state before Niyazov opened registration to all religious sects.

U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom. 2003. "Annual Report of the United States Commission on Religious Freedom." U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom: 40-41, 103-104.

Annotation: The U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom, an independent federal agency that monitors religious freedom around the world, includes Turkmenistan on its list of "countries of particular concern" due to its severe restriction of religious practice and its repression of religious minorities. The report indicates that independent religious groups in Turkmenistan are strictly outlawed as an extension of Niyazov's attempt to monopolize control over Turkmen society. Only two religious groups, the Sunni Muslim Board and the Russian Orthodox Church, are officially permitted, though their practice is strictly limited by the state. The continued intimidation, harassment, torture, imprisonment, and even mass deportation of religious minorities within Turkmenistan particularly concern the Commission. The Commission makes policy recommendations to the President of the United States, the Secretary of State, and Congress on how to better promote religious freedoms in countries where the practice of those freedoms is extremely poor.

Health and Human Rights

2003. "Health and Dictatorships: Effects of Repression in Turkmenistan." *Lancet* 361 (9351): 69.

Annotation: The article provides general information that links the worsening political repression in Turkmenistan to an alarming decline in public health. The article speculates that an enforced campaign of ignorance within the country, combined with high rates of intravenous drug use and a spiraling AIDS crisis in Central Asia, could lead to an imminent epidemic, despite official indications that HIV infection is low. Additionally, the article highlights the difficulty of ascertaining reliable health statistics in a country as insular as Turkmenistan, where international organizations are restricted and governmental health reports are notoriously unreliable.

Gore, Hayden. 2006. *RPCV Sarah (Turkmenistan 2004-2006)* accessed http://web.mac.com/hayden_lisa/iWeb/biggieblog/RPCVPodcast/85064210-3DFC-4725-AC09-32FA378A918B.html.

Annotation: A Returned Peace Corps Volunteer from Turkmenistan (one of only 110 American in the country according to the U.S. Embassy) speaks in this podcast recording about her experience living and working for two years as a community health volunteer outside of Ashgabat. As one of the few foreign development workers in the country, her reflections on life under Niyazov's autocratic rule provide a unique first-hand perspective into one of the most insular countries in the world. The interview closes with a particularly harrowing experience at the Saparmurat Turkmenbashi Airport, an appropriate symbolism of the bizarre, Orwellian nature of life in Turkmenistan.

O'Donnell, Lynne. 2004. "An Autocrat's Troubled Waters; Turkmenistan Lake Project Threatens Environmental Catastrophe." *Wall Street Journal*, July 16.

Annotation: Among other prestige projects initiated by President Niyazov, the construction of the Golden Era Lake, a 75 mile long artificial lake in the middle of the Karakum Desert, is perhaps the most outlandish and potentially dangerous. Scientist fear that the project will divert water from the Amu Darya, a primary tributary of the Aral Sea, worsening the desertification of the region and contributing to an environmental disaster which is already among the worst in human history. Niyazov claims that the project will ensure water for future generations of Turkmen, yet many believe that it will aggravate the water crisis, losing more water through seepage and evaporation than it will ever save.

Salvage, Jane. 2006. "Caring in a Forgotten Land." *Nursing Standard* 20 (30): 26-27.

Annotation: The author, an international nursing consultant sent to Turkmenistan by the British Embassy, couples her first-hand observations about the astonishing lack of available health care in the country (Niyazov intended to shut down all rural hospitals outside the capital in 2004) with a London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine report about lagging health indicators in the country. As a health professional who has had access to medical facilities in Turkmenistan, her account corroborates reports of Niyazov's efforts to purge the country of qualified medical personnel and its deleterious effect on the country's health system.

Public Indoctrination and Enforced Ignorance

2005. "IFLA Blasts Turkmenistan Library Closings." *American Libraries* 36 (6): 24-26.

Annotation: The International Federation of Library Associations (IFLA) and Institutions calls on President Niyazov to revoke his order to close all libraries outside of the capital city, calling it "one of the most profound onslaughts on intellectual freedom rights . . . in many years." The IFLA expresses concern that the destruction of books and library closures are being carried out

as part of an effort to promote the Rukhnama, Niyazov's own book of spiritual musings, as a tool of public indoctrination.

2006. "Inside the Mad Despot's Realm." *Economist*, 5/27.

Annotation: This article offers a quick, comprehensive overview of life in Turkmenistan under Mr. Niyazov's repressive rule, chronicling some of the more absurd "reforms" undertaken to aggrandize the president and to strengthen his control over the country. Particular emphasis is placed on the depressing state of public education, where mandatory schooling was reduced from 10 to 9 years and the standard curriculum replaced by a youth-indoctrination program centered around the study of Mr. Niyazov's two-volume "Book of the Spirit," the Rukhnama.

2006. *Rfe/RI Correspondent Dies in Turkmen Custody* Prague: Radio Free Europe/Radio Free Liberty. <http://www.rferl.org/featuresarticle/2006/9/0F829491-5086-43FC-A870-7B4AEC160105.html>.

Annotation: This article recounts the questionable circumstances surrounding the death of Ogulsapar Muradova, a Radio Liberty reporter who died while serving a seven-year sentence in a state prison. At the time of her arrest and conviction for illegal ammunition possession, the charges against her were widely criticized as politically motivated fabrications. According to the article, her family was told Muradova died of natural causes, though her body showed significant signs of trauma.

2006. *Worldwide Press Freedom Index 2006*. Paris: Reporters Without Borders: accessed http://www.rsf.org/rubrique.php3?id_rubrique=639.

Annotation: Reporters Without Borders ranks Turkmenistan as the world's second worst violator of press freedoms, pointing in particular to the death of Radio Liberty reporter Ogulsapar Muradova as evidence of Niyazov's intolerance for criticism. Turkmenistan (No. 167 in the rankings) precedes only North Korea (No. 168) on this dubious list of the most inhospitable countries for journalists. The list was compiled by surveying press freedom organizations, correspondents, journalists, jurists and human rights activists around the globe.

2006. *North Korea Tops CPJ List of 10 Most Censored Countries* Committee to Protect Journalists. http://www.cpj.org/censored/censored_06.html.

Annotation: President Niyazov's editorial control over daily newspapers, the closure of all libraries except the one that hold the president's books, a ban on foreign publications, and a news media dedicated to the obsequious praise of the president distinguishes Turkmenistan as the third most censored country in the world according to the Committee to Protect Journalists. CPJ compiled the list based on 17 criteria established by experts in the field of human rights, press freedom, and media law.

Takhbatullin, Farid. 2006. "Rukhnamania: Fantasies of a Dictator." *Index on Censorship* 35(3): 161-167.

Annotation: Turkmen satirist Farid Takhbatullin, who served three years in a Turkmenistan prison for his environmental work, discusses the maddening irrationality of Niyazov's rule, while providing a cultural and historical context for his rise to power. As a Turkmen jailed for his moxie, Takhbatullin speaks pointedly about state censorship and its role in Niyazov's consolidation of power. Of particular interest, Takhbatullin describes how the Turkmen people have internalized official censorship, producing an insidious form of self-censorship which further silences an already closed society.