

Human Rights and Contemporary Slavery

Introduction by Dr. Kevin Bales

Emeritus Professor of Sociology
Roehampton University

The anti-slavery movement will welcome this important compilation of work on debt bondage slavery. In the academic and policy analysis of contemporary slavery, many of the fundamental areas of enslavement are yet to be explored and brought into systematic presentation. This work by the Graduate School of International Studies at the University of Denver helps to build up our understanding of debt bondage, as well as adding to the emerging discipline of contemporary slavery studies. Debt bondage slavery is one of the oldest forms of slavery that continues into the present day. The date of the establishment of hereditary debt bondage in the Indian sub-continent is lost in the pre-history of that region. Untold millions have lived and died under its yoke. In spite of its longevity, the system continues to be under-studied and little understood, which is why this publication is so very welcome. By way of introduction it is helpful to review some of the early definitions of debt bondage, in addition to examining some of the forms it takes.

In the 1956 United Nations Supplementary Convention debt bondage is defined as the “status or condition arising from a pledge by a debtor of his personal services or those of a person under his control as security for a debt, if the value of those services as reasonably assessed is not applied towards the liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined.”¹ The 1956 Convention places debt bondage within the category of practices likely to result in a “servile status”² and obliges governments to pass laws to abolish it. One of the key areas of misunderstanding of both international instruments and popular perceptions centers on that part of the definition that reads, “the value of those services ... is not applied towards the liquidation of the debt.” The confusion arises because this definition explains that the labor power is not applied to the debt, but it does not explain how that labor power is actually viewed and used within the lender-debtor relationship.

There are in fact *two* distinct forms of debt bondage, both of which meet this criterion but in different ways. The most common form of debt bondage in South Asia is hereditary *collateral debt bondage slavery*. In these cases of debt bondage the labor power (and indeed the very lives of the debtor and his/her family) becomes *collateral* held against the debt. This establishes the trap of bondage—since all the labor power of the debtor is the collateral property of the lender until the debt is repaid, the debtor is unable to ever earn enough to repay the debt by their own labor. The other form of debt bondage is *coercive fraudulent debt bondage slavery*. In this form of debt bondage the work of the debtor may ostensibly be applied to the debt, but through false accounting or extortionate interest, repayment remains forever out of reach. In the first form it is the very nature of the agreement that transforms labor power into collateral, which disqualifies the debtor from ever

¹ Supplementary Convention, 226 UNTS 3 (1956), Article 1 (a).

² Supplementary Convention, 226 UNTS 3 (1956), Article 7 (b).

repaying their debt. In the second form it is a violation of the agreement, when “the value of those services as reasonably assessed is not applied towards the liquidation of the debt,” that traps the debtor. In both types, the enforcement of the agreement is usually backed up by force, bringing an end to the free will of the debtor and crossing the line into enslavement.

The definition of debt bondage in the Supplementary Convention also highlights the important fact that the pledging of a person’s services to repay a debt becomes abusive if the terms and conditions of such an arrangement are unregulated. This criterion distinguishes between an acceptable arrangement whereby an individual is working to pay off a debt incurred and the enslavement of debt bondage. In the former, it is legitimate for a worker to accept credit for whatever reason and to repay this amount by working, so long as the repayment terms are fixed and the capital sum borrowed is subject to reasonable interest rates. In contrast, none of these safeguards exist in a situation of debt bondage slavery. The bonded laborer is often at the mercy of his or her employer or creditor and the terms of the loan or advance are either not stipulated or not followed.

The dominant position of the employer or creditor in such instances increases the risk and opportunity of abuse. This is made possible, for example, by allowing the creditor to adjust interest rates or simply to add interest without informing the bonded laborer, imposing high charges for food or tools, and making additional advances on wages resulting in increased debt. Ultimately, these conditions mean that the debtor is unable to repay the loan and remains bonded for an indefinite period, potentially throughout his or her life. In many cases, the obligation to repay the loan is inherited by the victims’ children who are born into a life of bonded labor.

In 1924, the Temporary Slavery Commission pointed out that although the contract is made with the consent of the debtor “it often happens that the creditor so arranges that his debtor gets more and more into debt, with the result that what was in the beginning only one apparently equitable contract is transformed finally into enslavement for life.”³ In theory, the laborer is only bonded for a temporary period until the debt has been repaid. In reality, repayment is impossible and the debtor remains enslaved for life.

In some instances, individuals are compelled to place a child or another member of the family in bondage in order to repay a debt or to obtain a loan, as they are unable to complete all of the work to be done. This situation perpetuates the cycle of debt from one generation to the next. The practice of placing a child or other family member in bondage is sometimes identified as “pawning” or “pledging,” while the situation of families which remain in debt bondage from one generation to the next is generally referred to as “chronic bondage.”

The evidence of debt bondage received by the U.N. Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery has mainly concerned rural areas. Indeed, the problem of bonded labor is viewed internationally as “an economic malady”⁴ linked to rural unemployment. The International Commission of Jurists Seminar on “Rural Development and Human Rights in South Asia” held in

³ Temporary Slavery Commission Report to the Council, League of Nations Doc.A 17 1924 VI.b at 1 (1924) p.9.

⁴ Whittaker, Benjamin. (1982). *Updating of the Report on Slavery Submitted to the Commission in 1966* UN Doc. E/CN.4 Sub.2/1982/20 5 July.

India during December 1982 concluded “landless and bonded laborers are among the weakest and most exploited sectors of the rural communities in South Asia.”⁵

However, debt bondage is not exclusive to rural or agricultural laborers, since it also occurs in such industries as construction, quarrying, and brick making. The debt which results in the enslavement of the victim can be incurred in many different ways, notably including travel costs, subsistence and housing, or through the activities of a recruitment agency.⁶ The definition of debt bondage in the *Supplementary Convention* is sufficiently wide to cover many migrant workers who either borrow money or unwittingly incur costs that employers or agents subsequently tell them that they must repay. This predicament can affect both migrant workers who leave their own country to seek work abroad, and those workers who leave their own community to seek work elsewhere within their own country. The definition of debt bondage in the *Supplementary Convention* was not drafted to deal specifically with the question of migrant workers, as the large flow of international migrants was not such a common phenomenon at that time.

This more recent manifestation of debt bondage, which affects migrant workers, is similar in its effect to the more traditional practice of bonded laborers who work on their creditor’s land. In both instances, the victims cannot terminate the contract until the debt is repaid; they are equally vulnerable to abuse or coercion by their creditors. It has been observed that the connection between trafficking and forced labor practices “is nowhere more clear than in the practice of debt-bondage.”⁷ The victims are enticed, procured, or kidnapped to their new work place by the agent or trafficker and must, on arrival, repay the travel and subsistence costs incurred. Oftentimes women are pushed into prostitution in order to repay this money. The threat of violence and their total dependence on the creditor/slaveholder in the new environment in many instances forces workers into the sex industry.

Debt bondage or bonded labor today affects millions of adults and children in their own countries, as well as migrant workers throughout the world. It has been suggested that one of the reasons why these practices continue is the economic pressure to retain competitive export prices.⁸ As a result, bonded labor systems continue to exist quite openly in many developing countries, despite legislation prohibiting the practice. They also flourish more clandestinely in industrialized countries, affecting migrant workers in general and illegal migrants in particular.

In view of the prevalence of bonded labor among the landless in rural areas, governments may in some instances have to reform the existing land tenure systems in order to comply with their obligations under the *Supplementary Convention* to prevent debt bondage. The U.N.’s Food and Agricultural Organization (FAO) has for many years been assisting in the reform of feudal and semi-

⁵ Report of the Working Group on Contemporary Form of Slavery at the 9th Session UN Doc. E/CN.4/Sub.2/Ac.2/1983/9 Annex II p.2.

⁶ Whitaker, Benjamin. (1982). *Updating of the Report on Slavery Submitted to the Commission in 1966* UN Doc E/CN.4 Sub.2/1982/20 5 July, p.21.

⁷ Wijers, Marjan and Lin Lap-Chew. (1997). *Trafficking in Women, Forced Labor and Slavery-like Practices in Marriage, Domestic Labor and Prostitution*, Summary April 1997 Utrecht, The Netherlands.

⁸ Ehrenberg, Daniel S. (1995). “The Labor Link: Applying the International Trading Systems to Enforce Violations of Forced and Child Labor.” *Yale Journal of International Law* (20) 361, 375.

feudal structures of land tenure and the abolition of debt bondage through the development of credit institutions.

Although the practice of debt bondage has in the past been associated mostly with landless laborers, it is now an international phenomenon affecting many trafficked and migrant workers. This means that a process of enslavement into debt bondage can begin in a country like India, but can then be transferred into rich countries of the global north. In the United States, a key mechanism for drawing workers into debt bondage is the H2-A visa for temporary agricultural or other workers. This visa allows workers to be brought into the country, normally through a labor broker, and placed with an employer. The worker is tied to the employer and not allowed to change jobs. While some employers obey the laws concerning treatment of H2-A workers, a lack of oversight or inspection means that those wishing to abuse and exploit workers often do so with impunity. Of the small number of Department of Labor inspectors assigned to H2-A visa recipients, very few have the language skills needed to interview them—although many H2-A workers speak Spanish, others may speak one of several East or South Asian languages. The result is that “contracts,” rarely understood by workers, allow labor brokers and employers to charge inflated interest rates and other costs to the worker and thus to both bind them by debt and to dramatically increase the profits made through their exploitation. Skilled workers from India, such as welders and computer programmers, have been trapped in debt bondage in the United States through abuse of the loopholes within the H2-A visa system.

Finally, it is important to emphasize that whatever form it takes debt bondage is fundamentally a mechanism for drawing the vulnerable into slavery. It works on several levels, on one hand justifying and rationalizing enslavement under the cover of debt, and on the other hand pressing the (enslaved) debtor to accept their situation by placing the responsibility for repayment upon them. By manipulating both the external presentation of the crime and the internal understanding of the victim, it is a powerful criminal tool. The eradication of debt bondage requires that scholars, policy makers, and law enforcement come to understand its complexities and to unravel its system of enslavement. This compilation is an important step in that process.

Researchers

Jessica Bell
Tim Brauhn
Chrissey Buckley
Justin Campbell
Michelle Doherty
Devin Finn
Justin Guay
Romina Halabi
Karine Lepillez
Jennifer Plante
Anil Raj
Marjie Sackett

Instructor

Arianna Nowakowski

Editors

Sarah Bania-Dobyns
Jessie Burley
Eric Dibbern
Arianna Nowakowski
Joel Pruce

Bonded Labor in India

By Devin Finn

Introduction: Types of Widespread Forced Labor

Bonded labor, which is characterized by a long-term relationship between employer and employee, is usually solidified through a loan, and is embedded intricately in India's socio-economic culture—a culture that is a product of class relations, a colonial history, and persistent poverty among many citizens. Also known as debt bondage, bonded labor is a specific form of forced labor in which compulsion into servitude is derived from debt. Categorized and examined in the scholarly literature as a type of forced labor, bonded labor entails constraints on the conditions and duration of work by an individual. Not all bonded labor is forced, but most forced labor practices, whether they involve children or adults, are of a bonded nature. Bonded labor is most prevalent in rural areas where the agricultural industry relies on contracted, often migrant laborers. However, urban areas also provide fertile ground for long-term bondage.

Characterized by a creditor-debtor relationship that a laborer often passes on to his family members, bonded labor is typically of an indefinite duration and involves illegal contractual stipulations. Contracts deny an individual the basic right to choose his or her employer, or to negotiate the terms of his or her contract. Bonded labor contracts are not purely economic; in India, they are reinforced by custom or coercion in many sectors such as the agricultural, silk, mining, match production, and brick kiln industries, among others.

Researchers of bonded labor in India seek to understand its long-standing practices through an examination of contemporary forms of labor coercion, their origins and relationships to poverty and inequality, and implications for policymaking. Child labor, agricultural debt bondage, and bonded migrant labor are persistent forms of modern slavery that fall under the Indian constitutional definition of forced labor. While child labor and bonded labor in India are typically addressed separately in the literature, many researchers focus on the causes and consequences of pervasive child labor in the world's largest democracy.

Child laborers face major health and physical risks: they work long hours and are required to perform tasks for which they are physically and developmentally unprepared. Child labor is deeply entrenched as a common practice in many sectors and states, due in part to India's economic emphasis on exports in recent years. According to a current estimate, a quarter of Indian children ages six to fourteen—roughly two hundred million children—are working, and a third of the remaining seventy-five percent are bonded laborers (Sooryamoorthy 1991: 31). The largest single employer of children in India is the agricultural sector where an estimated twenty-five million children are employed; and the second largest employer of Indian children is the service sector where children work in hotels and as household maids. An additional five million Indian children are employed in other labor-intensive industries.

Origins and Causes of India's Bonded Labor Problem

Bonded labor stems from a variety of causes, which are highly debated in the literature: an ingrained legacy of caste-based discrimination, vast poverty and inequality, an inadequate education system, unjust social relations, and the government's unwillingness to alter the status quo all exemplify a few such causes. Additionally, India's colonial background and caste system have made it difficult to delineate the history of laborers' "unfreedom," as termed by several authors, and to understand legal and actual differentiations between slavery under British rule and debt bondage and child labor today.

There are many cultural reasons for the persistence of child labor in India. An expectation that children should contribute to the socioeconomic survival of the family and community, as well as the existence of large families, land scarcity, and inadequate enforcement of labor laws are contributing factors to this problem. In urban areas, following the migration of families to overpopulated cities, the disintegration of such families due to alcoholism and unemployment often results in a proliferation of children living on the street, becoming laborers, and entering into prostitution.

Legal Restrictions and Enforcement

The domestic legal treatment of individual labor rights, which are clearly articulated but seldom enforced, reflects India's blurry history with slavery. Article 23 of the 1949 Constitution of India outlaws both the trafficking of human beings and forced labor, but the legislation defining and banning bonded labor was only approved by Parliament in 1976. The Bonded Labour System Abolition Act of 1976 stipulates that the monitoring of labor violations and their enforcement are responsibilities of state governments. The Indian government has demonstrated a severe lack of will to implement this ban on bonded labor. Such pervasive non-enforcement may be attributed to several factors, including government apathy, caste bias, corruption, a lack of accountability, and inadequate enforcement personnel.

The Supreme Court of India has interpreted bonded labor as the payment of wages that are below the prevailing market wage or the legal minimum wage. As a response to complaints of human rights violations, the Court relies on Public Interest Law (PIL) whereby citizens are able to petition India's courts if they believe their rights, or the rights of their fellow citizens, are being denied. The Supreme Court's two major examinations of child labor in 1991 and 1997 resulted in PIL rulings that emphasized the role of poverty, and promoted children's education. However, the Court refused to ban child labor outright, citing its role as a judicial and not a legislative body.

The Indian government has not yet actively linked economic development to human rights violations at work. A recent government measure to raise the minimum wage for children exemplifies a lagging commitment to the eradication of child labor in particular, by essentially legitimizing children's work obligations and conditions. Nevertheless, the decision of the Supreme Court to establish a rehabilitation and welfare program for working children, in addition to the efforts of the National Human Rights Commission, have been instrumental in sensitizing policymakers to the serious problem of child labor.

Analysis: Forced Labor and Policy Options

Interpretations of child labor as an ingrained consequence of poverty, an impediment to genuine democracy and development, and a caste-based practice reinforced by deep-seated biases, inform the range of policy recommendations. The challenge of effective policy design echoes the paradox of India's steady rise as an economic and technological powerhouse, despite the persistence of poverty and underdevelopment. Development and human rights-minded analyses of child labor as an economic phenomenon dominate the literature concerned with policy solutions. Economic-based research on bonded labor in India centers on the links between fertility, poverty, and access to education, while bearing in mind the policy options available to the government.

The struggle emerges in the debate—which receives limited official policy attention—over whether to enforce the ban on child labor, attempt to curb it, or maintain the status quo. Economists attribute the persistence of bonded labor and child labor to a variety of factors: long-standing caste-based discrimination, inequality, a lack of educational opportunities, high fertility levels among poor Indians—overall, to poverty as a self-reinforcing cycle. Others challenge the position that child labor will be eradicated after poverty has been eliminated. As labor—the engine of the country's increasing technological sophistication and growth—drives India toward a more equitable future, the state may gradually move away from its traditional roots and move in the direction of ensuring human rights protections for all citizens.

Some analysts argue that poverty alleviation is the government's most promising approach to the eradication of bonded child labor, given the self-perpetuating patterns of illiteracy, inferior or nonexistent education, and children's prevalent work participation. Welfare programs and the provision of incentives for families not to send their children to work are components of suggested strategies to fight child labor. Other researchers disagree with the notion that the link between poverty and child labor is inevitable; their approach highlights the "human security" approach to economic and social development, in which case ensuring the rights of the child is a social and state responsibility.

The case for compulsory primary education, made prolifically by Myron Weiner, suggests that change must come from within the Indian legal framework, and must be supported by official attitudes, in order to overcome profound class divisions and to achieve the government's broader free-market goals. Efforts to make primary education compulsory would require an interpretation of education as not only a constitutional principle, but also as a fundamental right enforced by the state. This perspective views education as the main alternative to lifelong labor for all Indians, and as a building block in the construction of a diverse, educated human resource base capable of supporting a more open and competitive economy.

Exploitation of children working in dangerous conditions not only results in constraints on a child's health and development, but also solidifies his or her fate as an unskilled, low-paid worker. A greater focus on female education would precipitate a decline in both fertility—seen as a self-reinforcing cause and effect of child labor—and in children's work participation.

The debate amongst analysts of the economics of forced labor, particularly of bonded working children, revolves around whether work can be eradicated completely—or whether current labor conditions in India are acceptable given the economic demands of underdevelopment. The suggestion has also been posited that "learn and earn" policies, which combine work and school,

may be feasible. For the most part, the government fails to enforce extant laws. Whether child labor should and can be completely outlawed and the ban enforced, or whether the economic system in India can realistically allow for all children to attend school, have remained at the crux of the debate for some time.

Conclusion: Culture, Human Capital, and Change

Bonded labor in India can be viewed as a product of social, historical, economic, and cultural factors. The redress of child labor, agricultural debt bondage, and other violations will require an authentic commitment by the Indian government to adhere to its constitutional ban of these practices, and to overcome class-based prejudices. The Western notion of social responsibility outside of family loyalties does not exist in India. Certain Hindu beliefs such as the notion that a person's role and purpose are determined by his or her status in society have informed attitudes about governmental and social responsibilities regarding labor violations. Within a few generations, poor, low-caste Indians enter and perpetuate a cycle of poverty and illiteracy; children often abandon school and join the workforce. The effects of an increasingly sophisticated and prosperous India have not reached its poorest and least educated citizens. What remains to be seen is whether India—as its development and economic trajectories improve—will invest meaningfully in the protection of human rights and of its labor force, which is a challenge that other rising giants like China also face.

Annotations

Agarwal, Ranjan K. 2004. "The Barefoot Lawyers: Prosecuting Child Labour in the Supreme Court of India." *Arizona Journal of International and Comparative Law* 21(3): 663-713.

Annotation: The Indian Supreme Court's reaction to human rights violations is expressed in part through the practice of Public Interest Law (PIL), whereby citizens are able to petition India's courts if they believe their rights, or the rights of their fellow citizens, are being denied. Despite India's international commitments against bonded labor, constitutional guarantees against hazardous child labor, and the enactment of the Child Labour Act and the National Child Labour Policy in 1986, India cannot claim adequate enforcement of prohibitions. Officials at various levels continue to exploit legal loopholes. The Supreme Court's two major examinations of child labor in 1991 and 1997 resulted in PIL rulings that "sought to balance the child's economic needs against his or her fundamental rights"; they did not ban child labor outright. While some critics argue that the judiciary has not gone far enough to eradicate child labor, the Court asserts that its responsibilities are not legislative: it will not make laws or change existing laws.

Arnold, Rose M. 1967. "Hindu Values and Indian Social Problems." *The Sociological Quarterly* 8(3): 10.

Annotation: In a sociological analysis of the impact of Indian cultural values on severe social problems, the author cites particular Hindu beliefs and hierarchical structures to explain

inattentiveness to long-standing rights violations. A belief in the concept of *dharma*—the idea that a person’s role and purpose are determined by his status in society—results in an acceptance of the status quo and an absence of concern for individual welfare. These themes result in a lack of genuine attention to social problems such as poverty, prostitution, child labor, and poor working conditions. The notion of social responsibility, outside of family loyalties, does not exist in India. The traditional hierarchy places women below men in the social strata. According to Arnold, women’s roles and natures dictate that they will undergo suffering and punishment. The article is valuable to readers with a desire to understand cultural explanations of forced labor, which include a tension between Hindu social ideals and social reality. Such explanations provide insight into the Indian government’s lagging enforcement of abundant legal restrictions of human rights violations such as bonded labor.

Baak, Paul E. 1999. “About Enslaved Ex-Slaves, Uncaptured Contract Coolies and Unfreed Freedmen: Some Notes about ‘Free’ and ‘Unfree’ Labour in the Context of Plantation Development in Southwest India, Early Sixteenth Century-Mid 1990s.” *Modern Asian Studies* 33(1): 121-157.

Annotation: This article places Indian agricultural debt bondage in a wider context of the practice in Asia, employing plantation labor in southwest India as a case study. The article is a discussion of ‘free’ and ‘unfree’ labor in a long-term historical context, from pre-colonial years (early 1500s) to the post-colonial period (the 1990s). The author critiques two approaches that have emerged in the literature—that plantation work was beneficial to, and knowingly chosen by laborers, and conversely, that workers’ debt contracts and highly regulated labor environments prove that coercion and poor conditions defined their plantation experiences. The author adds a third perspective: that estate workers were, and are, simultaneously free and unfree, due to the often conflicting strategies of laborers, planters, and the government. A multi-faceted, historical understanding of agricultural forced labor requires a willingness to concede that abolition of slavery in India and other legislation did little to clarify or improve laborers’ status and conditions.

Baland, Jean-Marie, and James A. Robinson, 2000. “Is Child Labor Efficient?” *Journal of Political Economy* 108 4): 663-679.

Annotation: Child labor constitutes “a facet of poverty.” The authors argue that by precluding children from obtaining an education, their human capital accumulation and future earnings potential are impaired, and their social and cognitive skills are diminished. The labor that is substituted for education also increases children’s health hazards. Child labor as an economic choice made by families is not “pareto efficient” (no individual can be made better off without another being made worse off) in two ways: when used by parents as a substitute for income, or as a substitute for borrowing. Studies of policy implications show that an effective ban on child labor may engender economic improvement because endogenous changes in wages may make parents and companies better off.

Bardhan, Pranab K. 1983. "Labor-Tying in a Poor Agrarian Economy: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis." *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 98(3): 501-514.

Annotation: Based on empirical data and econometric analyses of rural India, it is determined in this piece that agrarian bonded labor may intensify with the growth of capitalist agricultural development. Technological advances in agriculture and the tightening of labor markets may increase voluntary labor-tying contracts. However, the mechanization of some agricultural processes, and the introduction of seasonal migrant labor, may help reduce employers' dependence on bonded labor. Data collection problems may weaken the empirical evidence of this study, such as a failure to recognize those who have entered into implicit contracts with employers as bonded laborers, as well as a failure to recognize semi-attached (short-term) laborers as bonded laborers. The article provides an alternative analysis to existing development literature—in which supply and demand models fail to address significant segments of the labor force—and challenges economists' treatment of bonded labor as a signal of economic stagnation.

Basu, Arnab K., and Nancy H. Chau. 2004. "Exploitation of Child Labor and the Dynamics of Debt Bondage." *Journal of Economic Growth* 9(2): 209-38.

Annotation: In the context of an agrarian economy with overlapping generations engaged in debt bondage and child labor, the author examines the principal-agent interaction between landlords and tenants. Studies identify reasons why households put children to work to service outstanding debts, only to realize later that the children's work has been exploited, and that the household has been made worse off as a result. Debt bondage is often inherited by subsequent generations, thereby contributing to the cycle of debt, bonded child labor, and poverty. Basic labor rights, such as freedom of association and the right to organize, complement efforts to eradicate forced labor. However, the use of standard disincentives to eliminate bonded child labor such as trade sanctions on countries that condone it, ultimately generate negative impacts on agrarian households.

Basu, Kaushik. 2000. "The Intriguing Relation Between Adult Minimum Wage and Child Labour." *The Economic Journal* 110(462): 50-61.

Annotation: The author tracks the impact of rising and falling adult wages in poor and developing countries, where poverty and labor exploitation are the norms, on child labor. One argument made is that if an increase in wages is achieved by means of a minimum wage law, it can cause some adults to be unemployed and compel them to send their children to work, which in turn displaces more adult labor and sends more children to work. The article serves as a helpful companion to analyses of child labor that seek to understand the underlying economic logic and policy options behind the practice of child labor in an economically developing state such as India.

Beeman, Mark, and Geeta Chowdhry. 2001. "Challenging Child Labor: Transnational Activism and India's Carpet Industry." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*. 575(1): 158-175.

Annotation: The authors purport that transnational movements have become an important component of an emerging international civil society. They examine the success, in particular, of mobilization around the issue of child labor in India's carpet industry. Although the intersection of child labor with the carpet trade was utilized effectively by Indian and German activists to bring about changes in child labor use, the more significant impact has been the creation of Rugmark, a label that certifies child-labor-free carpets and provides services for the rehabilitation and education of children who work in the industry. The authors document progress by citing the carpet industry's provision of schools, health care facilities, and improved working conditions for laborers, but express concern that the factors that motivated the changes in the industry's child labor practices were linked more centrally to a fear of losing material benefits than to norm-driven social responsibilities.

Bhukuth, Augendra. 2005. "Child Labour and Debt Bondage: A Case Study of Brick Kiln Workers in Southeast India." *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 40(4): 287-302.

Annotation: A study conducted in Tamil Nadu state's brick kiln industry demonstrates that child labor is extremely common in this sector. In the interlinked credit-labor market, employers do not directly employ children, but they have implemented a system that compels parents to use their children in order to improve productivity. In such an environment, parents use child labor to improve their own bargaining power.

Brass, Tom. 1999. Towards a Comparative Political Economy of Unfree Labour: Case Studies and Debates. London: Frank Cass.

Annotation: The author examines the relationship between bonded labor and economic growth in the agricultural sector, through case studies of bondage in northeastern and northwestern India, and in eastern Peru. The occurrence of unfree labor is much greater than generally estimated, and it may be increasing in specific contexts; in certain scenarios rural employers prefer a bonded workforce. The author focuses on how bonded labor contributes to workforce composition and addresses the implications for the kinds of political action undertaken by rural laborers. He does so by applying Marxist and neoclassical economic theories to the role of bonded labor, and by looking at unfree labor in the context of debates over capital, modes of production, and class struggle.

Breman, Jan. 2007. Labour Bondage in West India: From Past to Present. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Annotation: Contracted slavery during the British colonial era in the Gujarat state acquired the characteristics of a patron-client regime that can be fairly described as "bondage" and not as a

relationship based on “indebtedness.” *Halipratha*, or bonded servitude, can be explained as a relationship between master (*dhaniamo*) and servant (*bali*) that is motivated primarily by economics—the master needs more labor, and the laborer needs to achieve some degree of economic security, and to a lesser degree, the establishment of social status. Colonial authorities viewed bonded labor as a natural social force. Despite later advances in the Gujarat economy toward a more capitalist system, an increase in migrant labor, and the monetization of economic exchange, a deeply embedded hierarchical culture of debt payment and domination governed the social and economic interactions of master and servant and ensured that those of low socioeconomic standing remained in that position.

Chandrashekhar, C.P. 1997. “The Economic Consequences of the Abolition of Child Labour: An Indian Case Study.” *The Journal of Peasant Studies* 24(3): 137-179.

Annotation: Through an examination of the child labor-based industry of match production in Tamil Nadu state, the author advances the uncommon argument that the abolition of child labor would result in higher earnings for adult workers. In developing countries, banning child labor is often viewed as practically infeasible because it would prevent economic activities that exist only because of access to such labor. Abolition would reduce the earnings of poor households, whose survival strategies in the context of adult unemployment depend on incomes derived from the practice. In contrast, the author asserts that any adverse impact that a ban on child labor may have on the viability of commercial production can be absorbed through a reorganization of the industry concerned. However, the abolition of child labor could have adverse consequences for those sustaining their households at near subsistence levels. State welfare expenditures to help raise employment and wages would be necessary to overcome these constraints on eradicating child labor.

Cox, Katherine. 1999. “The Inevitability of Nimble Fingers? Law, Development and Child Labor.” *Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law* 32(1).

Annotation: Rising incidences of bonded child labor demonstrates that efforts to eradicate it have been unsuccessful. The causes of child labor worldwide cannot be directly attributed to poverty and underdevelopment, but must be considered in light of other educational, cultural, and economic factors. Cultural attitudes favor child labor over compulsory primary education. Furthermore, economic development will not result directly from a reduction of child labor. The international community has responded pragmatically to child labor, recognizing that eradication of the practice is a slow process. The international framework, while it recognizes the need for a multi-dimensional solution, centers on economic development. In turn, governments resist implementing real changes; they cite poverty and inequality as elements of a vicious circle preventing labor and other human rights violations from being uprooted.

Dreze, Jean and Amartya Sen. 2002. "Democratic Practice and Social Inequality in India." *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 37(2): 6-37.

Annotation: The authors examine the role of democratic practice in contemporary India, defining human rights as key to the integrity of democracy. The achievements and limitations of Indian democracy are assessed in light of functional institutions, public participation, and equity, with special attention given to the adverse effects of social inequality on democratic practice. The authors argue that while the quality of democracy is often compromised by social inequality and inadequate political participation, democratic practice itself is an important tool for eliminating these obstacles. The paper's relevance to practices of bonded and child labor emerges in its discussion of human rights, violations of which compromise the integrity of democracy. The authors draw particular attention to class discrimination as grounds for these violations, and to the difficulty of bringing human rights issues into mainstream politics due to class differentials.

Hanchinamani, Bina. 2001. "Human Rights Abuses of Dalits in India." *Human Rights Brief* 8(1). <http://www.wcl.american.edu/hrbrief/08/2dalits.cfm>

Annotation: A report on the oppressed social status of the "untouchable" Dalit class, members of which typically comprise the bonded workforce, the article reviews the domestic and international laws that govern their treatment. Despite the 1950 constitutional ban on untouchability, Dalits, members of the lowest class in the traditional hierarchy, continue to experience severe abuse and segregation by law enforcement officials and upper caste members. Limited progress has been achieved by domestic anti-discrimination laws and "scheduled caste" provisions—in particular, the 1989 Prevention of Atrocities Act that outlaws forcing Dalits to become bonded laborers. India is in violation of the U.N. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the 1958 International Labor Organization Convention, among other global agreements. Racial and socioeconomic differentiation and lack of mobility in Indian society are symptoms and causes of bonded labor. The article includes a review of the legal norms that should apply to discrimination against Dalits.

Human Rights Watch. 1996. *The Small Hands of Slavery: Bonded Child Labor in India*. New York: Human Rights Watch/Asia. <http://www.hrw.org/reports/1996/India3.htm>.

Annotation: The report adds "societal apathy" to a litany of conditions that allow debt bondage to thrive in India, including a history of caste-based discrimination, a lack of social welfare and employment opportunities, and an unequal education system. Existing Indian laws such as the 1976 Bonded Labour Slavery Abolition Act outlaw all forms of debt bondage and forced labor, but are not enforced. The Indian government has failed to take meaningful and persistent action toward the eradication of child labor practices. The report makes detailed policy recommendations to the government, United Nations agencies, and international lenders regarding ways to combat bonded child labor. It also enumerates a range of specific international and domestic laws that have been developed since 1930, with which India mainly does not

comply. The prevalence of the bonded labor problem reinforces the need for a more updated report following this 1996 survey based on two months of field research.

International Labour Organization. 2005. A Global Alliance Against Forced Labour. In *International Labour Conference 93rd Session*. Geneva: ILO.
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/relm/ilc/ilc93/pdf/rep-i-b.pdf>.

Annotation: This ILO conference paper, its second global report on forced labor, provides a descriptive and analytical overview of forced labor based on commissioned studies and general academic literature. The report includes estimates of forced laborers, broken down by region (led by Asia and the Pacific) and form of forced labor; the ILO does not disaggregate any of its estimated figures to the country level. The 92-page document details the legal domestic and international frameworks addressing forced labor, degrees of law enforcement, ILO assistance to member-states, and the creation of a Special Advanced Programme to Combat Forced Labor. Bonded labor in India in particular, and South Asia in general, receives consideration with regard to sectoral trends, poverty and caste discrimination, and laborer rehabilitation efforts. As the only extant, empirically-based overview of forced labor worldwide, the report is a valuable research tool. Although framed as part of the organization's "fair globalization" initiative, the report fails to present the continued proliferation of forced labor in the last thirty years as explicitly linked to the globalized economy.

International Trade Union Confederation. 2007. Internationally Recognised Core Labour Standards in India. In *WTO General Council Review of the Trade Policies of India*. Geneva. http://www.ituc-csi.org/IMG/pdf/India_report_final.pdf.

Annotation: As an up-to-date assessment of India's participation in international labor law, and as part of a regular series on monitoring labor standards in the context of trade, the World Trade Organization report is helpful for the reader who is attempting to gain a clear understanding of contemporary legislation and enforcement. Bonded labor, while prohibited by domestic and international law, continues to be prevalent in India, and enforcement is lacking. The report recommends a country-wide census and survey to obtain accurate data and identify the scope of bonded labor and progress on its eradication.

Kambhampati, Uma S. and Raji Rajan. 2006. "Economic growth: A panacea for child labor?" *World Development* 34(3): 426-445.

Annotation: Through an analysis of the National Sample Survey of India and state-level data, the authors conclude that economic growth serves to increase rather than decrease child labor, because the demand for child workers rises with higher levels of expansion. State-level net domestic product (NDP), village wages, and household incomes are presented as the conduits through which growth influences the supply side of the child labor market. The authors separate out the effect of economic growth on the supply of child labor from its impact on the demand of child labor, by including variables like average village wages, state NDP per capita, and

household incomes that directly capture these supply side effects. The article directly addresses the consensus of some scholars and policymakers that poverty is the main cause of child labor. Instead of a clear link between higher growth and reduced child work, an inverted U-shaped relationship results wherein child labor initially increases with growth and subsequently declines.

Kanbargi, Ramesh and P.M. Kulkarni. 1991. "Child Work, Schooling and Fertility in Rural Karnataka, India." In Child Labour in the Indian Subcontinent: Dimensions and Implications, edited by R. Kanbargi. Delhi: Sage Publications India.

Annotation: The authors test the applicability of the hypothesis that the economic value of working children is a determinant of fertility behavior in developing countries in the context of India. A study in rural Karnataka examines the interrelationship between child labor, schooling, and fertility. The authors focus on the actual work inputs of children, the correlations between children's economic activities and their school attendance, and the effect of child labor and school attendance on the population's reproductive behavior. Results indicate that the gross association between child labor and fertility is positive, but the association between child schooling and fertility is negative. The direct effect of child labor on fertility is insignificant. Universal education for Indian children may lead to lower fertility and smaller families, but the likelihood of successfully implementing this policy—given the proclivity of even smaller families to retain children at home for work—is low.

Khan, Ali. 2001. "The Dignity of Labor." *Columbia Human Rights Law Review* 32(2): 289-382.

Annotation: Inspired by the human rights movement, positive law in recent years has attempted to dismantle embedded Hindu ideologies that characterize child labor as a product of racial servitude and caste discrimination. The author presents an unconventional interpretation of children's work, arguing that the new positive law should not seek to universalize the prohibition of manual labor for every child, irrespective of his caste, class, or race. The author asserts that current laws fail to recognize the inherent dignity of manual labor, and takes into account the realities of poor classes and lagging educational access in India. The deconstruction in international law of "traditional, fatalist concepts" that exclude the working child from intellectual opportunities and confine children to manual labor is supported. Contemporary positive law should discard the ancient prejudice against physical labor and affirm the inherent dignity of labor. Furthermore, a manual labor ethic should be universalized and incorporated into primary and secondary education, so that children develop a respect for manual labor in their formative years.

Kovasevic, Natasa. 2007. "Child Slavery: India's Self-Perpetuating Dilemma." *Harvard International Review* 29(2): 4.

Annotation: Bonded child labor in India amounts to commodification, viewing children as goods—"assets that provide debased and dehumanized sustenance"—exchanged between a child's parent and employer. Entrenched social and economic causes of bonded child labor

include the persistence of a traditional social hierarchy and the cyclical nature of poverty and under-development. Alleviation of inequality and a lagging education system, as well as reform of social relations, are required to eradicate child labor. Poorly enforced child labor laws cannot trump long-standing practices that leave child laborers with no option but to work, regardless of the conditions, their ages, and the law. Policy recommendations include India's compliance with international child labor laws, the creation of incentive and accountability mechanisms for adherence to regulations by Indian industries and employers, and improved cooperation between federal and state governments.

Lerche, Jens. 2007. "A Global Alliance Against Forced Labour? Unfree Labour, Neo-liberal Globalization and the International Labour Organization." *Journal of Agrarian Change* 7(4): 27.

Annotation: In this critique of the International Labor Organization's (ILO) 2005 report, "A Global Alliance Against Forced Labour," the author analyzes the recent international focus on combating forced labor. The ILO's treatment of the subject is evaluated through the results of empirical research in India and theoretical discussions of forced labor. Current unfree labor relations are best understood in the context of neo-liberal globalization, labor relations in general, and country-specific conditions. The analysis includes an extremely valuable, detailed summary of various unfree labor practices in India and an insightful discussion of the influence of globalization on the development of India's anti-labor policies since the 1970s. Distinctions must be made carefully among types of unfree labor relations, particularly in India. These types of unfree labor relations include bonded labor, child labor, and forced labor, the latter of which is defined by international (ILO) conventions as work "exact[ed] from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily."

Majumdar, Manabi. 2001. "Child Labour as a Human Security Problem: Evidence from India." *Oxford Development Studies* 29(3): 279-304.

Annotation: Examining bonded child labor in India from the perspective of "human rights, capabilities, and securities," the author provides an alternative framework to the common, economics-based approach to understanding child labor. The author nods to Amartya Sen's argument that human development is intricately linked to the protection and promotion of human capabilities and the ability of individuals to choose what they do with their lives. Child development—including emotional, cognitive, physical, and moral growth—is threatened by the obligation to work. The article underscores the centrality of education reform, addressing the lack of state-sponsored educational opportunities caused by child labor. The correlation between poverty and child labor is not inevitable; the author challenges the belief that sending children to work is a built-in economic necessity. Child labor as a consequence, as opposed to a cause, of a defective school system in India is also explored. Ensuring the rights and human security of the child is not only a parental but also a social responsibility.

Omvedt, Gail. 1980. "Caste, Agrarian Relations and Agrarian Conflicts." *Sociological Bulletin* 29(2): 142-170.

Annotation: Agrarian relations in India have historically been shaped by caste structure, a factor at the root of twentieth-century agrarian conflicts in both colonial and independent periods. The author's analysis illustrates two major types of struggle: the *antisamindari* struggles of the middle-caste cultivating peasants, and the struggles of the Dalit laborers for wages, land, and freedom from forced labor (*vetbbegar*). The struggles of the untouchable Dalit workers, while neglected in most historical and sociological research, constitute a primary form of modern class conflict and provide a basis for understanding the origins and persistence of bonded labor. Laborer demands for pay and for cultivable land currently under government, village, or other jurisdiction are complicated by problems of local-level organization. Although the author's documentation of class and labor struggles extends only until 1980, the article presents Indian agrarian workers' struggles for land ownership and freedom as a key element of the history of modern slavery.

Pandhe, M.K., ed. 1979. Child Labour in India. Calcutta: Indian Institute for Regional Development Studies.

Annotation: Comprised of a series of official and semi-official reports on the status and legality of child labor in India, this book provides a resource to researchers interested in an in-depth investigation of laws and practices up to 1979. Dated information limits the book's usefulness. However, two reports on child labor in a variety of sectors in Delhi and Bombay illustrate the pervasiveness of the practice through interviews with children and detailed observations of their work and treatment. International Labor Organization (ILO) conventions on minimum age of employment, prohibition of night work, and required medical examinations are included in their entirety, as are relevant excerpts from the 1959 United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, which India has not ratified. Government statutes on child labor in various industries are summarized; Indian laws do not meet ILO standards, and in most cases the government does not enforce them.

Prakash, Gyan. 1990. "Conclusion: Freedom Bound." In Bonded Histories: Genealogies of Labor Servitude in Colonial India. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Annotation: The value of studying the history of bonded labor in India is in uncovering a colonial legacy of false freedom in the evolution and persistence of debt bondage as a legitimate practice. The British colonialists' abolition of slavery in 1843 ostensibly stemmed from a worldly sense of progress and individuality, by that time guiding ideals in the minds of colonial administrators. However, the lack of freedom that abolition purported to end did not have a basis in the dependence between masters and slaves. The status of slaves was simply "reconstituted" through the British-approved contractualization of labor relations between landlords and laborers: the practice criticized as slavery nominally became debt bondage. The author's reading of history points to the relationships between capitalism and the abolition of slavery, and between the appearance of legal rights and actual freedom.

Ramanathan, Usha. 2000. "The Public Policy Problem: Child Labour and the Law in India." Edited by B. Schlemmer, *The Exploited Child*. London: Zed Books.

Annotation: Insufficient attention to adult wages and employment, the notion that poverty is "self-inflicted," and the perception that a child is an "asset" enable the persistence of child labor. The minority status of child workers, coupled with illiteracy, makes children vulnerable to exploitation. Abolition of child labor has not entered the sphere of public policy or legislation on the part of the Indian government; creating and effecting deterrence through prohibitive law as opposed to industrial regulation is imperative. If the objective is protection and freedom of the child from "hazardous employment," abolition is the only option that will restore legitimacy to child labor law.

Singh, Manjit. 1997. "Bonded Migrant Labor in Punjab Agriculture." *Economic and Political Weekly* 12(2).

Annotation: According to the author, the capitalist system takes advantage of the disparities in wealth and equality between the Bihar "hinterlands" and the productive Punjab, perpetuating a cycle of bondage and poverty. Based on field research undertaken in two Punjab districts in 1980-81 and revisited in 1990-91, this short article provides a clearly outlined case study within which to analyze common bonded labor practices. The author discusses the social relations of production and the use of migrant slave labor to finance the growth of capitalist agriculture and the "green revolution" in Punjab. The persistence of the system highlights an overall pattern: the tendency of the capitalist system to rely on rural, socioeconomically inferior areas for growth. The article is of value to those interested in the cultural and structural causes of agricultural labor and socioeconomic transformations.

Sooryamoorthy, R. 1998. "Child Labour in Kerala: The Work and Working Ambience in the Capital City." *Journal of Third World Studies* 15(2): 31-52.

Annotation: Despite the Indian state of Kerala's remarkable quality of life and demographic trends, which include significantly higher life expectancy and literacy rates and a lower population growth rate than the rest of the country, it has not been successful in preventing child labor. Found most typically in the coir and fish processing industries, children in Kerala—located on the southern coastal tip of India—form approximately four percent of the state's workforce. The author of this article undertook a detailed study on the work and working environment of 734 child laborers in the capital, Thiruvananthapuram, in 1996. The result is a comprehensive, nuanced report on working children, who are found to be older when they begin work (age thirteen), and better educated, than those in other areas. Child labor is much less prevalent in Kerala; the neat sample size and limited industry range permit an intricate description of children's types of work, hours, income and expenditures, family situations, and school dropout rates.

Srikantan, K. Sivaswamy. 1991. "Demographic and Social Dimensions of Child Labor in India.", Child Labour in the Indian Subcontinent: Dimensions and Implications, edited by R. Kanbargi. Delhi: Sage Publications India.

Annotation: Utilizing data from the 1981 Census of India, the author provides a decomposition of working children by sector, location, and gender. Poverty alleviation is the government's best policy option to eradicate child labor—given the self-perpetuating patterns of illiteracy, inferior or nonexistent education, and children's work participation. Specific policy responses such as that of providing families with government subsidies and incentives to withdraw children from work encounter major obstacles in implementation and distribution. According to the author, the Indian government should combine productive employment generation programs and child labor reduction legislation to decrease the incidence of child labor. Exploitation of workers in dangerous conditions and industries results in constraints on children's health and development, and solidifies their fates as unskilled, low-paid workers. The author stresses that a greater focus on female education, as well as "improving the quality of children desired," would precipitate a decline in both fertility (viewed as a self-reinforcing cause and effect), and in children's work participation.

Srivastava, Ravi. 2005. Bonded Labour in India: Its Incidence and Pattern. Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labor. Geneva: ILO.
http://www.ilo.org/sapfl/Informationresources/ILOPublications/lang-en/docName--WCMS_081967/index.htm

Annotation: Comprised of a compilation and assessment of the contemporary evidence on bonded labor in India that has appeared in secondary sources, this report demonstrates that new forms of bondage have emerged in modern agricultural and informal sectors of the economy. Social movements, economic modernization, and state intervention have helped to engender a reduction of bonded labor in traditional agricultural settings and in caste-based, long-duration relationships. The report includes recent academic literature, data from the Government of India, the National Human Rights Commission, other human rights organizations, and press reports—all of which contribute to a widely varied bibliography. The review of Indian constitutional law and Supreme Court rulings on the nature of bonded labor is exceptionally specific. As an up-to-date survey of the incidence of labor bondage, a widely differentiated practice that is difficult to quantify and verify, the report provides a clear and comprehensive overview.

Swaminathan, Madhura. 1998. "Economic Growth and the Persistence of Child Labor: Evidence from an Indian City." *World Development* 26(8): 1513-1528.

Annotation: Examining features of child labor in an area of high economic growth in Gujarat state in western India, the author demonstrates that growth over a fifteen-year period was associated with an increase in the number of child workers. A detailed account of the activities and occupations showed that children worked at manual, grueling, repetitive, and low-skilled jobs. When economic expansion was accompanied by deregulation of the labor market, children

were exploited. Income from child labor did not make a significant difference in the reduction of household poverty, and the skills children gained were not specialized or useful in the long term without a basic education. Legal definitions of hazardous labor practices fail to take into account the damages to children's development of all forms of work. For these reasons, the author concludes that economic growth alone is not sufficient to eradicate child labor.

Thorner, Daniel and Alice. 1962. Land and Labour in India. Bombay: Asia Publishing House.

Annotation: This 1962 volume provides a comprehensive survey of the relationship between agriculture and labor in India since 1760, and demonstrates its implications for the economy and for workers. The authors discuss Indian bonded laborers as those whose bargaining power is virtually non-existent, and who do not possess the right to refuse to work under their masters' terms. The chapter on employer-laborer relationships in agriculture provides a detailed categorization of seven types of agricultural laborers (four free and three unfree, based on duration of work and type of contract), and articulates the importance of the distinction between free and unfree labor as critical to an analysis of the market for agricultural labor in India. This dry volume, considered somewhat seminal in its field, contains interesting, although outdated, statistics and agricultural survey data. It is particularly helpful to the researcher of Indian labor and agriculture, placing forced labor in broad economic and historical contexts.

Weiner, Myron. 1996. "Child Labour in India: Putting Compulsory Primary Education on the Political Agenda." *Economic and Political Weekly*. 9-16 Nov.

Annotation: An unspoken consensus exists among India's political leaders that education should not be made compulsory, since parents should have the right to use or sell the labor of their children. This is a policy that is frequently suggested in order to end child labor in India. The Indian government falls behind most other Asian countries in terms of spending on primary education, having concentrated a disproportionate share of educational resources on higher education, which has benefited the middle classes while leaving the rural and urban poor "educationally impoverished." No country has successfully ended child labor without first making education compulsory; India has ninety million children outside of the educational system. A move toward universal education must originate in the Indian legal framework, and official attitudes must change in order to overcome profound class divisions. This shift would be a means to achieving the government's broad, free-market goals by building a human resource base capable of supporting a more open and competitive economy.

The Children of War

By Jennifer Plante

There are more than 300,000 child soldiers in the world today. Complex economic and psychological factors have contributed to this large number; while some of these child soldiers qualify as slaves, many do not. Although there are several United Nations (U.N.) conventions that protect the rights of the child, many states have had difficulty implementing such protections. This has led to the perpetuation of the child slavery problem. Unfortunately for the children involved, their troubles do not end with the fighting. After the conflict, former soldiers must undergo the oftentimes-painful process of rehabilitation and integration back into society.

For the militant groups that utilize them, child soldiers are often a necessity. In many countries, particularly in Africa, the adult population is severely diminished due to war and disease, which results in a large proportion of the population being comprised of children under eighteen years of age. So, in order to fill the ranks, militant groups use children as soldiers. Additionally, the prevalence of child soldiers has been aided by changes in weaponry from centuries past. Deadly weapons are now small and light enough for even ten year-old girls to carry and use. Furthermore, children make good soldiers because of their obedience and reported fearlessness in battle. This combination of factors makes it all but impossible for armed militant groups to overlook the use of children as a resource in war.

For militant groups, there are obviously significant advantages to using child soldiers. As a result, they will use any method available to ensure the presence of children in their ranks. The media and popular culture have made famous the plight of child soldiers who are orphaned and forcefully drugged. For many children this is a reality, as these unfortunate children are forced to partake in military operations and to commit atrocities against their own people. There is no question that these children are victims of slavery.

Some children choose to join the ranks of militant groups, which also contributes to the continuing use of child soldiers. In poor, conflict ravaged states, children find themselves without families and without structure in their lives. Militant groups often fill this void by becoming a surrogate family and by providing informal military training. Children also join militia groups for revenge. Loved ones are murdered and children find themselves with few options. They often join groups to exact revenge on those who destroyed their families.

Whether children want to directly participate in armed conflict or not, laws that protect them from such participation have been only moderately successful at best. This lack of success is due to two factors: ambiguous language in the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and difficulties associated with implementing Western ideas of childhood on non-Western states. The CRC states, "Parties shall take all feasible measures to ensure that persons who have not attained the age of fifteen years do not take a direct part in hostilities" and that recruitment of children between ages fifteen and eighteen should begin with the oldest first. This ambiguous language does not strictly prohibit the use of child soldiers and because of this, groups have continued to get away with the use of child soldiers in armed conflicts.

Many people advocate for more forceful language, as well as a stricter and more encompassing definition of a "child." While the CRC specifically defines a child as a person under the age of

eighteen years of age, the rules change in times of conflict; during these times it lists fifteen as the acceptable age for participation. Humanitarian groups want to see the “straight-18” position adopted, which would prohibit the use of children under eighteen in armed conflict. With the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict, the age for recruitment is raised. Although the language is still weak in the Optional Protocol, raising the age of recruitment makes it more difficult for militia groups to allege confusion over the age of their soldiers.

These ideas about age and how to define what constitutes a child are difficult and complex; they become even more so when Western ideas are imposed on non-Western states. Children in these places lead hard lives, and are thrown, prematurely, into adult situations. It is difficult to say that a child of fifteen cannot decide for him or herself whether or not to join a militia group when the child has been on their own and making decisions alone for a while. Conventions that are in place to protect children are not always feasible, and have proven difficult to enforce.

Rehabilitation and reintegration are also serious hurdles for child soldiers. The psychological needs of each child are different depending on the child’s experience as a soldier. Girl soldiers are often the victims of sexual abuse, and thus, require separate therapy to overcome particular emotional wounds. Also, a child who is abducted and forced into service has different needs from one who chooses to enlist as a means of revenge. Besides medical and psychological care, former child soldiers also need training and education. They need to be taught skills in order to join the workforce and to become productive members of society. Many states do not have the resources to provide for such services, and former child soldiers often turn to crime to survive.

Unfortunately, there are children around the world who not only have to witness war, but who also participate in it. Some child soldiers truly are victims of slavery, abducted and forced to commit terrible crimes, all for the benefit of their captors. But, the reasons why children participate vary—from coercion to revenge—and they are not all helpless victims. Child soldiers will continue to exist even if states agree with and attempt to abide by a set of rules that strictly prohibits their use. The problem will only cease when it is no longer beneficial for militia groups to recruit child soldiers, and when children in poor states have other options besides joining these militant groups.

Bibliography

Achvarina, Vera, Ragnhild Nordas, Gudrun Ostby, and Siri Rustad. 2007. “Regional Poverty and Child Soldier Recruitment: A Disaggregated Study of Sub-National African Regions, 1990-2004.” Conference Papers - International Studies Association. International Studies Association Annual Meeting: Chicago, IL.

Annotation: The authors of this paper seek to determine the relationship between poverty and child soldiering. While the assertion that the two go hand-in-hand has been made repeatedly, it has not been subjected to systematic tests. Therefore, this is a study with disaggregated variables. The authors generate indicators of absolute and relative regional poverty based on household assets, education levels, and infant mortality rates. Then, they investigate whether poverty does indeed lead to increased recruitment of children. Overall, the study was inconclusive, but

findings did indicate higher recruitment levels in regions with high infant mortality rates and where refugee camps are present.

Andvig, Jens and Scott Gates. 2007. "Recruiting Child Soldiers." International Studies Association Annual Meeting: Chicago, IL.

Annotation: Drawing from child labor economics, child psychology, and conflict studies, this paper examines the reasons why some militant groups recruit children while others do not. The investigation about why children make effective soldiers is particularly informative. While they do acknowledge other factors, the authors believe that by understanding the demand for child soldiers, it is possible to explain the differences in child-adult soldier ratios across different groups.

Bayer, Christophe Pierre, Fionna Klasen, and Hubertus Adam. 2007. "Association of Trauma and PTSD Symptoms With Openness to Reconciliation and Feelings of Revenge Among Former Ugandan and Congolese Child Soldiers." *JAMA: Journal of the American Medical Association* 298(5): 555-559.

Annotation: This article presents the results of an investigation into the association between posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and the openness to reconciliation in former child soldiers from Uganda and the Democratic Republic of Congo. The article presents a cross-sectional field study of 169 former child soldiers with an average age of fifteen years. The study found that more than one-third of the children interviewed met symptom criteria for PTSD. The report also notes that these children were less open to reconciliation and had greater feelings of revenge. The authors suggest the effect of physical trauma should be taken into consideration in rehabilitation and reintegration programs.

Blattman, Christopher. 2007. "The Causes of Child Soldiering: Evidence from Northern Uganda." Conference Papers - International Studies Association. International Studies Association Annual Meeting: Chicago, IL.

Annotation: In this paper, Blattman uses survey and interview evidence from former child soldiers in northern Uganda to investigate an economic rationale for rebel recruitment. Young adolescents, aged thirteen to fifteen, were three times as likely to be conscripted as a child of nine or an adult of twenty-three by the Lord's Resistance Army. The economic logic behind this finding is that these individuals offered the highest expected net benefit. In general, adolescents make more effective guerrilla soldiers than do young children, and they are more easily indoctrinated than adults. While this paper is still in the draft phase, it does offer very useful information on child soldiers from an economic standpoint.

Breen, Claire. 2007. "When Is a Child Not a Child? Child Soldiers in International Law." *Human Rights Review* 8(2): 71-103.

Annotation: In this article, Breen examines different attitudes and approaches to the use of child soldiers, as well as the pitfalls of these approaches. Some time is spent discussing the realities that child soldiers face, but the majority of the article focuses on defining "child" and addressing the efficacy of international legal mechanisms for protecting children. This article does a nice job of identifying and explaining the international laws in place to protect children, but the overall conclusion is that such laws are ineffective as they currently are.

Cheney, Kristen. 2005. "Our Children Have Only Known War: Children's Experiences and the Uses of Childhood in Northern Uganda." *Children's Geographies* 3(1): 23-45.

Annotation: Through evidence found during sixteen months of fieldwork with children in Uganda, this article examines national and generational causes of conflict. The article also examines different concepts of childhood, and discusses how these concepts are used by different groups of people. Cheney believes that children have difficulties with being rehabilitated because of the stigma society places on former child soldiers. Governments and activists need to re-evaluate their objectives and methods of helping children of war. She argues that the rehabilitation of children will be more effective if programs focus on positive social change as opposed to restoration and recuperation.

Cohn, Ilene. 1998. "The Protection of Children during the Liberian Peace Process." *International Journal of Children's Rights* 6(2): 179-220.

Annotation: In this article, Ilene Cohn examines several peace processes, and presents recommendations at each stage in the Liberian peace process that would promote measures to protect and reintegrate children. The Liberian peace process is divided into four different parts; Cohn describes how each one relates to children's issues. As children now play a relatively large role in armed conflicts in some countries, the peace process should be more child-conscious. Cohn makes several recommendations as to what can be done in Liberia, as well as making general recommendations for similar situations.

_____. 2001. "The Protection of Children and the Quest for Truth and Justice in Sierra Leone." *Journal of International Affairs* 55(1): 1.

Annotation: After conflict had subsided in Sierra Leone, a Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) was created to determine the war's impact on children and the role they played in committing abuses. At the time the article was written, both the TRC and the Special Court for Sierra Leone were in the planning stages. This was the first time that juvenile justice was brought onto the international stage. Many human rights activists, lawyers, and child protection experts disagreed on the best way to protect a child's rights without injustice.

de Berry, Jo. 2001. "Child Soldiers and the Convention on the Rights of the Child." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 575: 92-105.

Annotation: Article 38 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and its implementations are the primary focus of this article. The author argues that in order for article 38 to be effectively executed there must be a consideration of the contexts in which child soldiers appear; the two contexts that are identified in the article are state crisis and the local crisis, as each has particular contextual influences children's participation in armed conflict. The author uses child soldiers in the Teso region of Uganda as an example of how these two contexts have an impact upon the phenomenon of child soldiers.

Denov, Myriam, and Richard Maclure. 2007. "Turnings and Epiphanies: Militarization, Life Histories, and the Making and Unmaking of Two Child Soldiers in Sierra Leone." *Journal of Youth Studies* 10(2): 243-261.

Annotation: This article focuses on changing identities and actions of child soldiers during militarization and demilitarization. The story is told through the eyes of two former Sierra Leonean child soldiers, one male and one female, with regards to militarization. The two children detail their lives as combatants in Sierra Leone's civil war, discuss how they took on a militarized identity, and describe their efforts to reintegrate into civilian life during demilitarization. While the experiences of these two former soldiers cannot be completely generalized, they do offer significant insights for societies that have been affected by warfare.

Dickson-Gomez, Julia. 2002. "Growing up in Guerrilla Camp: The Long-Term Impact of Being a Child Soldier in El Salvador's Civil War." *Ethos* 30(4): 327-356.

Annotation: This article examines the long-term impacts of children's active participation in the war in El Salvador. Dickson-Gomez does this by examining four young adults, three males and one female. The four people in these case studies each experienced the brutal assassination of family members, the subsequent fleeing of the rest of their families, and finally their admission into the guerrilla ranks. The combination of such terrible events in their lives made the children unable to trust others and unable to identify themselves outside of the cause for which they were fighting. The psychological trauma suffered as children, along with difficult economic conditions, have made the transition to productive adulthood difficult for these former soldiers.

Druba, Volker. 2002. "The Problem of Child Soldiers." *International Review of Education / Internationale Zeitschrift für Erziehungswissenschaft / Revue Internationale de l'Éducation* 48(3/4): 271-277.

Annotation: In this article Volker Druba looks closely at the legal protection that is supposed to be afforded to children everywhere. The author examines positive attributes and downfalls of the Geneva Conventions, the Additional Protocols I and II, and the Convention on the Rights

of a Child, among others. Through the use of a handy chart, it is easy to see to whom each convention refers, whether there are age limitations to recruitment, and whether or not direct or indirect participation in armed conflict is prohibited.

Faulkner, Frank. 2001. "Kindergarten Killers: Morality, Murder and the Child Soldier Problem." *Third World Quarterly* 22 (4): 491-504.

Annotation: Sierra Leone is the case study used in this article to examine the issue of child soldiers. Faulkner examines international law for protocols on ending this problem, while also questioning why the enforcement of current legislation has proven problematic. He also examines the conditions under which children become soldiers, and addresses the long-term effects of combat on children. Faulkner is pessimistic about the ability of current laws to help solve the problem and views the lack of political will to stop the use of child soldiers as the main problem that needs to be overcome.

Fonseka, Bhavani. 2001. "The Protection of Child Soldiers in International Law." *Asia-Pacific Journal on Human Rights & the Law* 2 (2): 69-89.

Annotation: Although the main focus of this article is the protection of child soldiers under international law, it also gives a nice overview of the problem in general. Bhavani Fonseka provides a detailed history of international law, discussing how it is geared towards protecting citizens, and children in particular, in armed conflicts. This article is unique because it includes the problems of boy and girl soldiers, and addresses, at length, the problem of child soldiers in Asian countries. Fonseka believes that in order to reduce the number of child soldiers, it is more important to provide children with alternative options to joining militant groups.

Fox, Mary-Jane. 2004. "Girl Soldiers: Human Security and Gendered Insecurity." *Security Dialogue* 35(4): 465-479.

Annotation: This article explores the link between human security and the insecurity of girl soldiers. During her research, Mary-Jane Fox focuses primarily on girls in non-state militant groups. She does so because these groups have a higher presence of girl soldiers than state militaries, and because these groups also have the most extreme cases of child rights and gender-based abuses. Girls serve not only as combatants but also as porters, cooks, and sex slaves. Girl soldiers pose a double insecurity crisis, in that they highlight the state's inability to protect them from being enlisted into militia groups, and make apparent the failure of the state and the international community in realizing that they too need to be reintegrated into society.

_____. 2005. "Child Soldiers and International Law: Patchwork Gains and Conceptual Debates." *Human Rights Review* 7(1): 27-48.

Annotation: In this article, Mary-Jane Fox reviews the development of international humanitarian law and evaluates how it relates child soldiers. She examines the Geneva Conventions, the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC), and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child. There is a fascinating debate between a universalist approach and a contextualist approach to the problem of child soldiers. Although she describes the laws that have been written to protect children as "patchwork," she is optimistic that the remaining holes in the system will be filled.

Francis, David J. 2007. "Paper Protection' Mechanisms: Child Soldiers and the International Protection of Children in Africa's Conflict Zones." *Journal of Modern African Studies* 45(2): 207-231.

Annotation: The arrests of former Liberian warlord Charles Taylor and Congolese warlord Thomas Lubanga Dyilo have created the expectation that international bodies that protect children in conflict situations will now have more enforcement powers. However, there are still major problems with the implementation and enforcement of the conventions that protect children's rights. One of the major obstacles is the application of a Western-centric view of childhood, and the problems that arise when it is imposed on African societies. Another problem is that war-torn African communities have difficulties incorporating international laws into their domestic laws.

Hart, Jason. 2006. "The Politics of 'Child Soldiers.'" *Brown Journal of World Affairs* 13(1): 217-226.

Annotation: Jason Hart discusses the growing concern with children involved in armed conflicts. Hart asserts that although many papers and reports have detailed the exploitation of children by military groups, there is not much evidence to support it. Hart also examines the debate regarding the definition of a child, and whether or not children can and should be held responsible for their sometimes-brutal behavior. He uses David Rosen's book, Armies of the Young to support his ideas.

Kanagaratnam, Pushpa, Magne Raundalen, and Arve E. Asbjornsen. 2005. "Ideological Commitment and Posttraumatic Stress in Former Tamil Child Soldiers." *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology* 46(6): 511-520.

Annotation: This is a psychological study of the impact on present ideological commitment on posttraumatic stress syndrome in former Tamil child soldiers who are living in exile. Twenty former soldiers participated in the study, eighteen men and two women, who joined Tamil between the ages of thirteen and seventeen. Knowledge of psychology is helpful when reading this article, as it is heavy in psychological terminology and analysis. Present ideological

commitment seems to predict better mental health when exposure is less intense. The study also found that time has a negative impact on ideological commitment.

Khalil, Doris Deedei. 2006. "Abuses of the Girl Child in Some African Societies: Implications for Nurse Practitioners." *Nursing Forum* 41(1): 13-24.

Annotation: This article focuses on the general plight of girls in Africa. The article identifies and explores the potential areas of abuse of girls, naming specifically: female circumcision, child slavery, rape, child prostitution, child soldiers, teenage pregnancy, and arranged marriages. This article was written primarily for healthcare professionals and provides strategies that could be implemented in situations where girls are abused. While the section discussing girls and their role as soldiers is relatively short, this article does provide a broad picture of the adversities that many girls in Africa face.

Kuper, Jenny. 2005. Military Training and Children in Armed Conflict. Leiden: Martinus Nijhoff Publishers.

Annotation: This book aims to determine whether there are ways in which military officers can be trained that would improve the protection of children in armed conflict situations. In order to do this, the legal obligations of military personnel with regards to the treatment of children, and especially the obligations of officers of national armed forces, are examined. The author intended for this book to be used primarily by people who are involved in the training of national armed forces, such as officers and members of government. This book contains information about laws and policies pertaining to child rights and how they relate to armed conflict.

Machel, Graca. 1996. "Impact of Armed Conflict on Children." United Nations.
<http://www.un.org/rights/introduc.htm>

Annotation: This report was commissioned by the United Nations in 1993 to evaluate the effects of war and armed conflict on children. This was one of the first comprehensive reports on the status of children in states fraught with armed conflict, and it has served as a resource for many human rights and children's rights activists. In addition to her findings, Machel also includes recommendations for the protection of children during such conflicts.

_____. 2001. The Impact of War on Children. New York: Palgrave.

Annotation: This is a review of progress made since the United Nations Report on the Impact of Armed Conflict on Children that was published in 1996. This is a very comprehensive review of child soldiers, their exploitation, and the effects that war has on children. Machel also includes chapters on education, communications, and weapons, and discusses how they relate to the problem of child soldiers. She also provides recommendations for raising the standards of child

protection along with a summary of the recommendations she presented to the International Conference on War-Affected Children in 2000.

Mann, Howard. 1987. "International Law and the Child Soldier." *The International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 36(1): 32-57.

Annotation: This article was written two years before the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) was put into effect. Howard Mann examines both state and non-state use of child soldiers and the reaction of the international community about such usage. Furthermore, he provides an overview of international law as it pertained to the protection of children in armed conflict, both as participants and civilians, prior to the CRC. His critique of the CRC, which was in drafting phase at the time this was written, is that it is completely inadequate in addressing the problem of child soldiers.

Maslen, Stuart. 1998. "The Use of Children as Soldiers: The Right to Kill and be Killed?" *International Journal of Children's Rights* 6(4): 445-451.

Annotation: The article analyzes the scope of the problem, detailing the number of children acting as child soldiers, as well as pointing to some of the places in which they are most prevalently used. Malsen also discusses the need to end the use of children as soldiers, and elucidates the efforts that are already being made to do so. He briefly touches on the legal framework that is in place, as well as the work that NGOs are doing to prevent and stop the use of child soldiers. While the article does provide a nice synopsis of the problem of child soldiers, it does not offer any suggestions for possible solutions.

Mazurana, Dyan, and Susan McKay. 2001. "Child Soldiers What about the Girls?" *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists* 57(5): 30.

Annotation: The largely unknown plight of young girls involved in armed conflict is the subject of this article. While girls have been forced to join the ranks of armed combatants in more than twenty countries, their participation oftentimes goes unnoticed. The authors of this article discuss the roles girls play in armed conflicts as both soldiers and as sexual property. The problems of pregnancy and child-birth are discussed at length. Reintroduction into society is also mentioned; the authors believe that the focus of reintroduction programs is on boy soldiers, while the girls are oftentimes left to fend for themselves. Short anecdotes from girls across the world are employed in order to illustrate the atrocities these girls go through.

Mitchell, James A. 2006. "Soldier Girl?" *Humanist* 66(5): 16-18.

Annotation: In this article, James Mitchell tells the story of a sixteen-year old Sri Lankan girl, Sundari, who was abducted and forced to join a resistance army called the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE). The article primarily focuses on Sundari's experiences and her hope for the future, but it also provides basic information about the conflict in Sri Lanka and about the

activity of the LTTE, which has been around since 1983 and is considered to be one of the more successful terrorist groups. Although the article is not extremely detailed, it does allow for the story of one of war's often overlooked groups, girl soldiers, to be told.

Peters, Krijn, and Paul Richards. 1998. "Why We Fight': Voices of Youth Combatants in Sierra Leone." *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute* 68(2): 183-210.

Annotation: This very enlightening article contains excerpts from nine interviews by former child soldiers in Sierra Leone, each with a very different background and perspective. At the time of the interview, each former soldier was undergoing reintegration training through one of two programs in Freetown. The interviews support the authors' view that children who participate in armed conflict have a wide variety of reasons for doing so, ranging from revenge, to the desire for food and a warm bath, to the need for some form of education. This article is most valuable because it provides an opportunity to hear details from the perspective of those who participated.

Rosen, David M. 2005. *Armies of the Young: Child Soldiers in War and Terrorism*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.

Annotation: David M. Rosen challenges the popular notion put forth by human rights activists that children are passive victims of armed conflict. He uses historical examples from Sierra Leone, Palestine, and Eastern Europe to support his argument that the issue of child soldiers is more complicated than just child exploitation. He examines the complex legal question of what constitutes a child soldier, and addresses the problems that arise with these definitions. Furthermore, he argues that children oftentimes make conscious choices to take up arms; in some cases, this may be the necessary course of action.

_____. 2007. "Child Soldiers, International Humanitarian Law, and the Globalization of Childhood." *American Anthropologist* 109 (2): 296-306.

Annotation: Rosen investigates the development of laws and treaties that regulate the use of child soldiers. He further addresses the political, social and cultural contexts in which these developments are rooted. He argues that the problem of child soldiers has developed from use of different age categories by international, regional and local groups to advance certain political and ideological positions, which he calls "politics of age." Furthermore, he believes that the notion of childhood put forth in legal documents is too limiting to be effective in protecting children all over the world.

Shepler, Susan. 2005. "The Rites of the Child: Global Discourses of Youth and Reintegrating Child Soldiers in Sierra Leone." *Journal of Human Rights* 4(2): 197-211.

Annotation: This article is the result of eighteen months of ethnographic fieldwork in Sierra Leone. The main focus of this article is the implication of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) in the process of reintegrating child soldiers after armed conflict. There is a thorough examination of how the different notions of childhood impact reintegration and reconciliation efforts. Finally, Shepler concludes that new meanings of childhood are emerging in Sierra Leone as a result of the involvement of local members in society and of former child soldiers who are participating in the process of national reconstruction.

Singer, P. W. 2003. "Fighting Child Soldiers." *Military Review* 83(3): 26-31.

Annotation: This short article focuses on the use of child soldiers in Iraq's armed forces. At the time the article was written, half of the Iraqi population was under eighteen, so in order to keep control of society, it was militarized. By indoctrinating children into the military, it allowed the regime to tighten its grip on society. Singer even goes so far as to compare the Saddam Lion Cubs to the Hitler Youth group of child soldiers. He also provides policy suggestions on how to deal with child soldiers in war situations. He suggests that children should be subjected to the same inspection scrutiny as adults, and that the United States should consider using non-lethal weapons in situations when children are involved.

_____. 2005. *Children at War*. New York: Pantheon Books.

Annotation: This book breaks the issue of child soldiers into three parts: "Children at War," "The Process and Results of Child Soldiers," and "Responding to the Child Soldier Problem." The first section describes the scope of the child soldier problem. The second part details the causes for using children as soldiers and describes how they become soldiers. The last section discusses prevention, dealing with child soldiers in battle, rehabilitation, and reintegration. Lastly, it addresses potential courses of action for the future. In the appendix, Singer also includes the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflict.

Van Bueren, Geraldine. 1994. "The International Legal Protection of Children in Armed Conflicts." *The International and Comparative Law Quarterly* 43(4): 809-826.

Annotation: While this article is more than ten years old, it is useful because it discusses the international legal protection of children who are directly involved in armed conflict, as well as civilian children. Van Bueren examines the question of whether the involvement of children in armed conflict is justifiable or not, and whether, in terms of international law, military concerns overshadow the safety of children. The article brings up the issue of children voluntarily enrolling in the military, and questions when they can make that decision for themselves. She

contends that instead of changing treaties, the only effective way of ending the problem of child soldiers is to give children alternatives to military life.

Wessells, Michael. 2000. "How We Can Prevent Child Soldiering." *Peace Review* 12(3): 407-413.

Annotation: Wessells discusses the worldwide proliferation of the use of children in war. He presents four priorities which must be addressed in order to prevent the use of child soldiers. The first prevention priority he discusses is the need to address issues of poverty and wealth distribution. He names the construction of more effective legal and human rights standards, improved care and protection of children who are in immediate danger of becoming soldiers, and the implementation of effective programs to demobilize and reintegrate child soldiers as his three other prevention priorities.

_____. 2005. "Child Soldiers, Peace Education, and Postconflict Reconstruction for Peace." *Theory Into Practice* 44(4): 363-369.

Annotation: Wessells writes this article from the viewpoint that all children become victims when they are coerced into armed conflict. In the first section of this article, Wessells discusses the reasons why children become soldiers. Abduction, revenge, and glamour are all cited as reasons for participation. In the second section, Wessells focuses on reintegration and on the effectiveness of peace education. He outlines three stages used in peace education, and finally he employs the example of Sierra Leone, where peace education was interwoven into the reintegration process, to discuss its effectiveness.

_____. 2006. *Child Soldiers*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Annotation: Michael Wessells writes comprehensively about children involved in armed conflict. He provides general information about the topic before delving into children's lives as they enter and serve in militant groups. Much of his information comes from personal interviews that he conducted with more than 400 former child soldiers from various nations. He also looks at the impact that armed conflict has on such children, as well as addressing their integration back into society, and finally, preventive measures.

West, Harry G. 2000. "Girls with Guns: Narrating the Experience of War of Frelimo's 'Female Detachment'." *Anthropological Quarterly* 73(4): 180-194.

Annotation: West provides an anthropological account of the experiences of girls who fought for the Frelimo de Libertacao de Mocambique (FRELIMO) during the campaign for Mozambican independence. Although the fight took place between 1964 and 1974, this article still provides insight into the lives of female fighters through its narratives from former girl soldiers. FRELIMO believed female emancipation was central to their ideology. They could therefore not afford to allow half the population go unutilized in their fight. These two ideas, taken together,

compelled FRELIMO to recruit girls, who joined the fight out of fear and respect. Although many women have had difficulty reintegrating back into society, they experienced a previously unknown sense of empowerment while they were fighting with FRELIMO.

Zack-Williams, Tunde B. 2006. "Child Soldiers in Sierra Leone and the Problems of Demobilisation, Rehabilitation and Reintegration into Society: Some Lessons for Social Workers in War-torn Societies." *Social Work Education* 25(2): 119-128.

Annotation: This article is the product of three short fieldwork sessions in Sierra Leone in 2001. Zack-Williams focuses on the social reasons that cause children to join armed social movements. He sees political and economic crises as the causes for the destabilization of the Sierra Leonean family, which ultimately results in children looking for surrogate families, for which they often turn to armed militant groups. He evaluates demobilization and reintegration, utilizing Ferdinand Tonnies' dichotomy: *Gemeinschaft* and *Gesellschaft*. This article views the problem of child soldiers from a social worker's point of view, and is meant to be relevant to social work practice even in the West.

Zia-Zarifi, Saman, Anna Niestat, and Jo Becker. 2007. "Children in the Ranks: The Maoists' use of Child Soldiers in Nepal." *Human Rights Watch*, <http://hrw.org/reports/2007/nepal0207/nepal0207web.pdf>.

Annotation: Although peace talks have been in development in Nepal since November 2006, the Maoists' military group, the People's Liberation Army (PLA), has continued to recruit children. This report provides information on the methods the PLA uses for recruitment, and the impact such recruitment has on Nepali families. This information is based on interviews with twenty-one former child soldiers who were recruited by the Maoists. In addition, Human Rights Watch also provides recommendations for Maoists, the Nepalese Government, the United Nations Security Council working group on children and armed conflict, and others, regarding what they should do to ensure that this problem is eradicated.

Contemporary Slavery and International Law

By Jessica Bell

Contemporary Slavery Defined

In this essay, the definition of contemporary slavery is derived from Kevin Bales in his book, Disposable People, which states that contemporary slavery is “The complete control of a person, for economic exploitation, by violence, or the threat of violence.” Contemporary slavery includes the slave labor of men, women, and children, forced prostitution, pornography involving both children and adults, the selling of human organs, serfdom, debt bondage, and the use of humans for armed conflict.

Introduction

During the twentieth century, significant efforts were made to address issues of contemporary slavery through international law. Prior to these efforts, conflicts repeatedly arose between states regarding enslaved persons. As a result, states came to the realization that a system of laws was needed to provide an infrastructure that would manage conflicts and disputes over slavery. Related anti-slavery initiatives started to take form.

Transnational conventions and organizations established in the twentieth century, such as the League of Nations and the United Nations Working Group on Contemporary Slavery, have brought issues of contemporary slavery to the forefront. They have been instrumental in defining, combating, and solving issues of contemporary slavery through the creation of conventions and international laws. However, due to lack of enforcement and regulation of these conventions and laws, the identification and means of addressing contemporary slavery continue to pose dilemmas for those working towards a world in which slavery is not defined concurrently.

League of Nations

The League of Nations, created in 1919, was the first international body to assemble major conventions regulating contemporary slavery. It was an international organization that was focused on mediation, disarmament, and the prevention of war in pursuit of global welfare, but also was responsible for initiating steps toward the eradication of slavery. It provided a basic definition of slavery, which stood as a model for many states. Importantly, the League of Nations was responsible for the initial creation of conventions that focused specifically on slavery. These conventions were sanctioned following the findings of the Temporary Slave Commission.

Temporary Slave Commission

In 1924, the Temporary Slave Commission was established. It was responsible for the worldwide exploration and appraisal of the existence of slavery. Upon the completion of its appraisal, the Temporary Slave Commission found the existence of slavery to be internationally prevalent. Based

on these findings, the Temporary Slave Commission encouraged the League of Nations to create an international convention, the sole focus of which would be the issue of slavery. As a result, the League of Nations sanctioned the creation of the Slavery Convention of 1926.

The Slavery Convention of 1926

The Slavery Convention of 1926 provided a definition of contemporary slavery, which established a basis by means of which states could measure slavery within their borders. The definition asserted that slavery consists of a situation in which an individual is under the complete control of another, as if this individual was the property of the other. In conjunction with a basic definition of contemporary slavery, the main concern of the 1926 Convention was to monitor efforts towards its prohibition.

Despite the definition and outline provided by the 1926 Commission, a governing body responsible for the evaluation and monitoring of human rights violations in the form of contemporary slavery did not exist. Additionally, there was an absence of a universal set of laws and protocols that would abolish contemporary forms of slavery on an international level. In 1930, an Advisory Commission was created to address some of these failings, but was limited in its effect due to confidentiality agreements with states that dictated what could and could not be publicly revealed.

United Nations

In 1945, the United Nations was established as the successor of the League of Nations. Three years after its establishment, Article Four mandated the prohibition of all forms of slavery. However, it was not until the 1953 Slavery Convention that the United Nations was authorized to regulate issues of contemporary slavery. The 1953 Slavery Convention expanded upon the 1926 Convention's definition of slavery to involve international cooperation in addressing the economic and social factors that supported the existence of contemporary slavery.

1956 Supplementary Convention

Additional conventions followed the 1953 Slavery Convention. These conventions led to worldwide efforts to enforce the eradication of all forms of slavery. Established in Geneva in 1956, the Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery expanded the definition of contemporary slavery to include debt bondage, serfdom, the selling of women by their families for marriage, certain forms of abuse of women, and the buying and selling of children for labor or prostitution.

The Role of the Economic and Social Council

The Economic and Social Council within the United Nations was instrumental in monitoring the 1926 and 1956 Conventions, in addition to dealing with other issues of contemporary slavery. The

Economic and Social Council was responsible for the establishment of the Sub-Commission to explore ways in which the 1926 and 1956 Conventions could be carried out. Eventually, the Sub-Commission realized the need for a governing body that would be solely responsible for exploring the information available on slavery. Then, based on that information, the Commission would create effective proposals on ways to address the issues uncovered. In 1974, the Sub-Commission, alongside the Economic and Social Council, went on to establish the United Nations Working Group on Slavery.

United Nations Working Group on Slavery

The Working Group was established in order to see that the agreements of the Conventions were carried out. In addition, the Working Group was responsible for receiving information on slavery from states, along with researching and monitoring the existence of slavery globally. It continues to expand ways of addressing contemporary slavery by building upon present information through continual documentation, interviews, and work conducted by other organizations.

Conclusion

From the groundwork laid by the League of Nations to the 1926 Convention to the 1956 Supplementary Convention, the United Nations Working Group on Slavery expanded the defining factors of slavery, creating a broader distinction of what comprises contemporary slavery. Parallel to the existence of the Working Group, there have been numerous campaigns, intergovernmental organizations, and non-profit organizations that also have been directed toward researching and monitoring the existence of contemporary slavery. However, contemporary slavery remains difficult to identify across international boundaries and cultures. Although new policies and international laws have been proposed and created, there has yet to be an effective method established for the proper identification of contemporary slavery, nor an effective means created by which international law can be enforced. This is, in part, a consequence of the lack of an international governing body, with the requisite political power over sovereign states to properly enforce the international laws on contemporary slavery mandated by international conventions and the Working Group on Slavery.

Annotated Bibliography

Aitken, Jonathan. 2007. "The Broken and Crushed." *American Spectator* 40(5): 56-57.

Annotation: The author discusses the differences between slavery in the eighteenth century and the ways in which it exists in its contemporary forms. The Dalits, who are considered untouchables in India, are discussed as an example contemporary slavery's existence. The author provides estimates of how many Dalits are enslaved. Details of the different forms of slavery the Dalits face are provided and the importance of educating others about the existence of contemporary slavery is discussed. This is a good article if an example of contemporary slavery is needed.

“American Slavery and the Conflict of Laws.” 1971. *Columbia Law Review* 71(1): 74-99.

Annotation: This essay examines the origins of laws pertaining to slavery and slave distribution in America. An assessment is made of the social context in which slavery existed in the nineteenth century. The role of law during this time is also discussed. This article is beneficial if a historical context of slavery and corresponding legal issues is needed.

Altman, Andrew. 2004. “International Law and Crimes Against Humanity.” Conference Papers-Midwestern Political Science Association. Annual Meeting, Chicago, IL.

Annotation: In this piece, a background of the creation of international laws pertaining to crimes against humanity is given. These laws address subjects such as torture and slavery. Aspects of punishment towards those committing crimes against humanity are provided, as are details on international criminal norms.

Azmy, Baher. 2002. “Unshackling the Thirteenth Amendment: Modern Slavery and a Reconstructed Civil Rights Agenda.” *Fordham Law Review* 71(3): 981-1061.

Annotation: The author of this article challenges existing societal notions that assert the non-existence of slavery. Documentation is given for existing forms of slavery in the United States and globally. The original purpose and brief history of the Thirteenth Amendment is also provided in relation to slavery and its role discussed. The author also addresses slave labor in Latin America and the United States.

Bales, Kevin. 1999. Disposable People. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Annotation: This seminal book provides a detailed and thorough account of contemporary slavery around the globe. Slavery in a historical context is compared to its existence in contemporary forms. The connection between contemporary slavery and world economies is made.

Bales, Kevin and Robbins, Peter T. 2001. “No One Shall Be Held in Slavery or Servitude: A Critical Analysis of International Slavery Agreements and Concepts of Slavery.” *Human Rights Review* 2(2): 18.

Annotation: The authors of this article discuss in detail the construction and evolutions of the definition of slavery. They begin with the origin of the term and progress to a discussion of how it exists in the twenty-first century. Background information on and definitions of international laws relating to slavery are discussed, as are the organizations from which they were created. An in-depth discussion of the various types of slavery can also be found. The acknowledgement is

made that contemporary slavery is still improperly addressed, even with the establishment of certain international laws.

Beydoun, Khaled Ali 2006. "The Trafficking of Ethiopian Domestic Workers into Lebanon: Navigating Through a Novel Passage of the International Maid Trade." *Berkeley Journal of International Law* 24(3): 1009-1045.

Annotation: The author explores issues of migrant workers in the domestic field from Ethiopia to Lebanon. International law and definitions regarding the trafficking of persons for slavery are discussed. Notions of contemporary slavery are explored within a historical context. An explanation is given of the "Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children." This is a good article for understanding issues of the domestic slave trade in human beings.

Blagbrough, Jonathan. 1997. "Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour- a New International Standard." *International Journal of Children's Rights* 5(1): 123-127.

Annotation: The author highlights the necessity of reexamining child labor laws. Present expectations of child labor laws are summarized and the contributions of human rights conventions and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are discussed with regard to child labor and slavery. Aspects of the more difficult and dark hazards of child labor are emphasized. Statistics are also provided regarding the number of children who are working as slaves or under conditions that are not endorsed by the conventions of the United Nations.

du Plessis, Max. 2003. "Historical Injustice and International Law: An Exploratory Discussion of Reparation for Slavery." *Human Rights Quarterly* 25(3): 624-659.

Annotation: A background of international law and slavery is discussed with regard to reparation. Aspects of international law and the gaps in it are acknowledged and proposals for reparation are given. This is a brief but informative article.

Fleck, Fiona, Nicole Gaouette, and Farhan Bokhari. 1999. "Chipping Away at Child Labor." *Christian Science Monitor* 91: 145.

Annotation: The authors of this article provide information on a variety of topics related to contemporary forms of slavery, including specific countries where the practice is prevalent, the economic impact of the practice on these countries, and the sensitivity that must be used when confronting countries on this issue. Work done by the former President Bill Clinton and organizations such as Save the Children is also discussed.

Herzfeld, Beth. 2002. "Slavery and Gender: Women's Double Exploitation." *Gender & Development* 10(1): 50-55.

Annotation: The author gives clear, concise definitions of contemporary slavery. Also highlighted are the ways in which contemporary slavery can affect people of all ages and races. An in-depth discussion is provided of gender-related forms of contemporary slavery, with regard to their existence in West Africa, along with crimes associated with them. Also discussed are the steps being taken to eradicate slavery, as are pertinent conventions and organizations. Additional focus is given to issues affecting the enslaved, such as poverty and marginalization. The topic of trafficking is also touched on briefly. On the whole, this is a very well-rounded and well-organized article.

Lerner, Natan, ed. 2003. Group Rights and Discrimination in International Law. London: Kluwer Law International

Annotation: This book contains a description of the United Nations conventions that pertain to human rights and slavery. International law is discussed regarding human rights. The UNESCO Convention is discussed along with the International Labour Organization Conventions. Issues of racism, migrants, and genocide are presented. This is a good book for an outline and explanation of the conventions and international laws surrounding human rights abuses, which includes slavery.

"Modern Slavery." 2004. *Economist*. 370(8363): 81-82.

Annotation: The focus of this article is on displaced persons from Sudan in the context of the difficulties created by the war. Due to the vulnerability of displaced people of Sudan, the common practice of enslavement is highlighted in the article as an issue of concern. A case study is provided of the issue that tells the stories of individuals who have been enslaved and survived. The importance of anti-slavery campaigns is emphasized.

O'Shea, Andreas. 2002. Amnesty for Crime in International Law and Practice. London: Kluwer Law International.

Annotation: This book discusses in depth a series of treaties, crimes and trials pertinent to international human rights law. Human rights as a concept is defined. The practice of these treaties and laws is discussed, as are amnesty laws. Propositions for further development of laws are given.

Povoledo, Elisabetta. 2007. "One Woman's Crusade Against Modern Slavery; Using Her Nightmare to Help Others Escape." *The International Herald Tribune*, September 22, 3.

Annotation: A woman's story of how she was enslaved is told through her experiences as a slave. These experiences are described in detail, and the horrible things she encountered as a slave are briefly mentioned. Her case is generalized in a discussion of the ways in which people come to be enslaved, as well as ways to escape slavery. The impact of the law is also given.

Quirk, Joel. 2006. "The Anti-Slavery Project: Linking the Historical and Contemporary." *Human Rights Quarterly* 28(3): 565-598.

Annotation: Past and present forms of slavery are discussed coherently in order to illuminate issues surrounding contemporary slavery. The role of the United Nations and human rights conventions is raised. The grey area that defines what are and are not considered forms of slavery is acknowledged as a potential dilemma for addressing slavery as it exists today. This is a short but helpful article.

Rauxloh, Regina E. 2007. "Too Pure an Air: Law and the Quest for Freedom, Justice, and Equity: Essay: No Air to Breathe: Victims of Sex Slavery in the U.K." *Texas Wesleyan Law Review* 13 (749).

Annotation: The author discusses notions of slavery in terms of human rights violations. The impact of enslavement on an individual who is enslaved in the sex industry is discussed. Forms of abuse related to slavery and the sex industry are explained. Some of the ways in which the law addresses slavery are explained in addition to the ways in which the law fails to properly address it. An exploration of what is being done today regarding the issue of slavery is also provided.

Transnational Law Associates. 2005. "Political Question Doctrine." *International Law Update* 11:109-110.

Annotation: This is a short article that explores specifically a case involving international law and the sexual enslavement of "comfort women" in Japan. The case examined gives a good overview of the ways in which international law works regarding this aspect of contemporary slavery. Complications with laws pertaining to contemporary slavery issues between states are made apparent, as is the need for the implementation of more laws regarding the oversight of human rights globally.

van den Anker, Christein, ed., 2004. The Political Economy of New Slavery. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

Annotation: The book consists of different writings on the issues surrounding contemporary slavery around the world. An emphasis is placed on several aspects of contemporary slavery,

such as the role of international law, globalization, migrant workers and slavery, and development. This is a good book for an overview of several facets of contemporary slavery.

Weissbrodt, David S. 2002. Abolishing Slavery and its Contemporary Forms. New York: Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

Annotation: The existence of contemporary slavery is discussed by giving examples of contemporary forms of slavery. Methods for the abolition of contemporary forms of slavery are proposed. This book is not very helpful for readers concerned with aspects of international law in relation to contemporary slavery. However, it is very helpful if readers are concerned with the subject of contemporary slavery in general.

Wise, Steven M. 2005. Though the Heavens May Fall: The Landmark Trial that Led to the End of Human Slavery. Cambridge: Da Capo Press Books.

Annotation: This book provides a history of slavery, beginning in Africa. A discussion of the slave trade in England, as well as the abolitionist movement and important people involved in it. Featured in this book is a discussion of the creation of the law dealing with the issue of slavery, accompanied by subsequent court cases from that time.

Contract Enslavement of Female Migrant Domestic Workers in Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates

By Romina Halabi

Slavery was not abolished in Saudi Arabia until 1962, and in the United Arab Emirates (UAE) until 1963. It is unsurprising, then, that contract slavery of domestic servants continues to thrive in much of the Persian Gulf, where local economies prosper on the immigration of foreign workers. Economic incentives on the part of the sending and receiving nations encourage the migration of female workers from their home countries to Saudi Arabia and to the UAE. These incentives, coupled with restrictive contract systems, bind the female domestic worker to her employer and create an environment conducive to exploitation and involuntary servitude.

The surge of migrant workers into the Middle East began in the early 1970s, when increased petroleum production brought with it a demand for skilled and unskilled labor. As living standards rose for nationals, opportunities in the service sector for female labor expanded. It is no coincidence that once the Organization of Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) started raising oil prices, oil-importing states began sending migrant workers to the Gulf. Currently, Saudi Arabia is the largest recipient of migrant domestic labor, with the UAE close behind with over seventy-five percent of its population classified as migrant workers. Today, domestic workers primarily emigrate from Sri Lanka, Indonesia and the Philippines, choosing to leave their families and migrate for a number of economic and social reasons.

Contrary to what may be understood traditionally, the women who migrate to the Middle East do so willingly. Many are educated and skilled and are not on the edge of abject poverty; in fact, many of these women come from lower-middle class families and take a proactive role in leaving the household in search of work. Although there is a key financial incentive to migrate, many women also do so because they are seeking adventure, independence, training, and upward social mobility. Pushed by these factors, women often incur substantial debts and pay recruitment agencies exorbitant fees to finance their migration. Relying on employment agencies and brokers, migrant domestic workers enter contractual bondage with employers whom they have never met before, leaving themselves vulnerable to abuse and exploitation.

Because slavery is illegal, slave-holders often use contracts as a means to legitimate and disguise the practice. In order for a migrant to work in Saudi Arabia or the UAE, she must first secure a visa through a method of sponsorship known as *kafala*, which legally binds the worker to her employer. Although both the sponsor and worker are capable of breaking contract, this ostensible equality is merely a ruse, because if the worker breaks her contract, she must pay the cost of her return ticket (a charge that would have otherwise been paid by the sponsor). She may also be fined or forced to pay debts to the recruitment agency. Through this system of sponsorship, the fate of the migrant worker is entirely dependent upon the goodwill of an employer who, at any time, can threaten her deportation if unsatisfied. Once in their host countries, these migrants are immediately required to surrender their passports to their employers. Thus, even before the worker steps foot in her host country, the systems of exploitation are already in place.

Lacking documentation and in a foreign country, migrant domestic workers find themselves under the charge of their female employer. Because Middle Eastern households often consist of

extended families, work can be arduous. It oftentimes includes tasks such as cleaning, washing, cooking, tailoring, and taking care of children and the aged. Working hours are long, between eleven and twenty hours a day, with the maid subject to work both day and night at the whim of her employers. Since foreign maids can easily influence the upbringing of the children, cultural conflicts are numerous, and are complicated further by the potential for sexual relationships between the maid and the husband or adult male relatives. Racial discrimination and symbolic forms of prejudice against the migrant worker are also common.

Due to the individualized working environment of household labor, female domestic servants are the group most vulnerable to exploitation in Saudi Arabia and the UAE. Domestic workers are often denied freedom of movement, and are either locked inside or forbidden to leave the home without permission. Violence against maids includes physical attacks ranging from rape to slapping; other forms of violence include overwork, including forcibly working in more than one household and the refusal of days off, non-payment of wages or a reduced salary. Maids also often experience poor living conditions, such as lack of food and privacy. Physical violence is usually perpetrated by the female employer, or madam of the household. Most workers have reported suffering from more than one type of violence during the course of their employment, and many are so traumatized by the experience that it even negatively affects their ability to reintegrate into society upon returning home.

For foreign domestic servants, there are few options available to deal with abuse. If escaped maids file police complaints against their sponsors, they are often arrested for running away, or are accused of lying. Government-run shelters for “runaway” domestics are a common destination for migrant women in Saudi Arabia. However, this supposed charity is only provided until their cases are settled—either by returning the women to their sponsors or by deportation. Reminiscent of the fugitive slave laws in the United States, Saudi newspapers run bounty ads for “escaped” domestic workers. Since the employers hold the migrant’s passport, changing jobs is a nearly impossible task. Thus, fearing the termination of their employment, domestic servants often endure continued exploitation and mistreatment rather than complain and face deportation.

Due to the seemingly voluntary nature of migrant labor, it is an unfortunate reality that many of these women effectively enslave themselves abroad in hopes of improving their economic situation at home. This is not to suggest that migrants are to blame for their plights; once the choice has been made and the contract signed, all future choices are restricted or nonexistent. Most of these domestic servants are unaware of what they are getting into, expecting to be paid the equivalent of \$800 per month and instead finding their pay to be \$100 a month, if anything at all. This deception, combined with the contract system, limits the mobility of the migrant domestic worker and leaves her at the mercy of employers who may also beat or sexually assault her. Because many of these migrants incur substantial debts to emigrate, it is common for women to return to the Gulf after their contract expires, thus continuing the sequence of exploitations and contract slavery.

The recruiting agencies sending the domestic servants to the Persian Gulf are well aware of the abuses these women face, as are the labor-sending countries themselves. Despite this knowledge, countries such as the Philippines, with growing populations and economic instability, continue to send female domestic workers abroad because the financial benefit of remittances cannot be ignored. For these countries, sending workers to the Middle East and to the Persian Gulf reduces the number of unemployed, and lowers the danger of social dissatisfaction. In Sri Lanka, domestic

service workers are the most lucrative “export commodity.” This commodification of the transnational “maid trade” provides a cheap and flexible labor force willing to endure low wages—an attractive feature for both sending and receiving countries—and also reduces migrants to mere objects to be bought and sold in the global marketplace.

In comparison with other forms of slavery, the involuntary servitude of migrant domestic workers is difficult to eradicate because it is so deeply embedded in the global markets of the labor-sending and receiving countries. The women who migrate to the UAE and Saudi Arabia do so voluntarily, submitting themselves to their sponsors with the hope of bettering both themselves and their families. Unfortunately, survival itself becomes the greatest hurdle, and thoughts of visiting family and sending remittances become fantasies. Without international pressure, the exploitation of migrant domestics is certain to persist.

Annotated Bibliography

Globalization and Economic Reasons for the Maid Trade

Anti-Slavery International. 2006. “Trafficking in Women: Forced Labour and Domestic Work in the Context of the Middle East and Gulf Region.” Anti-Slavery International.
<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/traffic%20women%20forced%20labour%20domestic%202006.pdf>

Annotation: In this detailed report, which is comprised of an analysis of over seventy scholarly reports and field interviews, the author confronts the issues of forced labor and domestic servitude in the Middle East, primarily of migrant workers. Interspersed with horror stories from exploited women, this article examines the various “push and pull” factors associated with the enslavement of migrant workers and identifies possible responses and preventative strategies. Although the article mentions cases of enslavement in Saudi Arabia and the United Arab Emirates, the main focus is on trafficking, especially in the Horn of Africa. The article concludes with an analysis of trafficking in Egypt, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Lebanon, Sudan, and Yemen.

Brochmann, Grete. 1993. Middle East Ave: Female Migration from Sri Lanka to the Gulf. Boulder: Westview Press.

Annotation: With a theoretical, detached tone, Brochmann analyzes the dynamics of the “migration connection” of foreign labor between Sri Lanka and the Persian Gulf. The author compares the status of women in Sri Lanka to that of Sri Lankan women in the Gulf, underlining the working conditions and maltreatment that these housemaids often face when they migrate to the Middle East. Primarily a socioeconomic study, the author focuses on the surge of foreign labor in the Gulf and its effects on both the Arab community and the domestic servants. While well-researched and informative, this study addresses the suffering of female migrants with scientific neutrality for the sake of understanding migration—not understanding slavery.

Buijs, Gina, ed. 1993. Migrant Women: Crossing Boundaries and Changing Identities. Oxford: Berg.

Annotation: An analysis of case studies from around the world, this book is an intriguing anthropological examination of gender dynamics among migrant women. As the title suggests, the focus is on how transnational migration affects women in the world, especially in such areas as Peru, Chile, West Berlin, and Britain, and how their experiences shape their identity. While useful to anyone interested in exploring gender issues tied to transnational migration, there is no particular mention of migrants in Saudi Arabia or the United Arab Emirates.

Chin, Christine. 1998. In Service and Servitude: Foreign Female Domestic Workers and the Malaysian “Modernity” Project. New York: Columbia University Press.

Annotation: Focusing on what Chin calls “the maid trade,” this book covers the domestic servitude of Filipina and Indonesian women in Malaysia, using field research to outline the relationship between contemporary domestic service and development. Unlike many other researchers, Chin, a scholar and Malaysian, has personal experience with domestic servitude and the mistreatment migrant workers are forced to endure during their employment. From this rare perspective, the author analyzes both sides of the issue and portrays domestic servants in a sympathetic light, while also explaining how the employers themselves view their maids. This study is useful for anyone eager to understand the role of domestic servitude in modernity and globalization, but unfortunately does little to illuminate how migrant domestic workers are treated in the Middle East.

Cremer, Georg. 1988. “Deployment of Indonesian Migrants in the Middle East: Present Situation and Prospects.” *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies* 24(3): 14.

Annotation: This article, while nearly two decades old, offers an interesting analysis of labor migration in the Middle East. When this article was written, international migration to the Middle East was a relatively new phenomenon; the author analyzes the causes and effects of the surge of Indonesian migrant workers. In 1988, the majority of Indonesian workers in the Middle East were housemaids and drivers. The author analyzes the Middle East’s push to hire more skilled migrants, and even describes how many Indonesian women were treated like slaves in Saudi Arabia. While not particularly useful on its own, this article, when compared to more contemporary studies, offers an intriguing historical perspective on Indonesian migrants in the Middle East.

Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Arlie Hochschild, eds. 2003. Global Woman: Nannies, Maids, and Sex Workers in the New Economy. New York: Metropolitan Books.

Annotation: This collection of essays offers a comprehensive analysis of the role of female domestic workers around the world, and discusses how globalization drives the trend for women

to leave their home countries in search of work. Most of the essays are built around interviews with migrant women and, as a result, there are many insights into how migration changes gender roles in the villages the women leave behind, as well as the effect of migration on families. Many chapters deal with issues of slavery and abuse, but none explore the region of the Middle East in great depth, instead concentrating on countries of origin and receiving nations such as the United States.

Harzig, Christiane. 2006. "Domestics of the World (Unite?): Labor Migration Systems and Personal Trajectories of Household Workers in Historical and Global Perspective." *Journal of American Ethnic History* 25(2/3): 26.

Annotation: The author of this article discusses the system of "international debt politics" that creates incentives for women to migrate, and evaluates how migration into domestic service tends to be "invisible" to both sending and receiving governments. Framed from a historical perspective, the article goes on to examine gender issues associated with migration, including how the four major migration trends (one of which is South Asia to the Gulf) emerge and are maintained. Slavery and specific case studies are not mentioned, but the article remains useful for understanding the underpinning forces driving labor migration.

Ismail, Munira. 1999. "'Maids in Space' Gendered Domestic Labour from Sri Lanka to the Middle East." In *Gender, Migration and Domestic Service*, edited by J. Momsen. New York: Routledge.

Annotation: This compilation of case studies is a conscientious analysis of migrant women, encompassing research on the experience of domestic workers across continents. Ismail's study of domestic workers from Sri Lanka is of particular interest, going into great detail about the social and economic reasons why the women migrate to the Middle East and what type of exploitation they endure. The research is based on interviews of migrants before they depart to the Middle East and after they return to Sri Lanka. The study draws clear conclusions that contractual bondage often leads to exploitation, yet the author doesn't paint the migrants as victims. Instead, these migrants are portrayed as women who make difficult choices to emigrate for the sake of their families.

Khalaf, Sulayman, and Saad Alkobaisi. 1999. "Migrants' Strategies of Coping and Patterns of Accommodation in the Oil-Rich Gulf Societies: Evidence from the UAE." *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 26(2): 28.

Annotation: Drawing on globalization theory and case studies from both Asian and Arab migrant groups, this ethnographic article analyzes the differing political economies of labor-sending and labor-receiving countries in order to explain differences in coping strategies among migrants. Although the article was published in 1999 and does not link the exploitation of migrants to slavery, the fact that the authors are an anthropologist and sociologist in the United Arab Emirates and not Western observers adds a compelling perspective to the topic of globalization and its effect on workers migrating to the Gulf.

Lan, Pei-Chia. 2006. Global Cinderellas: Migrant Domestic Workers and Newly Rich Employers in Taiwan. Durham: Duke University Press.

Annotation: Although the central aim of this book is to analyze the transnational migration of Indonesian and Filipina domestic workers to Taiwan, the author's ethnographic study—outlining how economic disparities, immigration policies, race, ethnicity and gender intersect in the relationship between migrant workers and their employers—is applicable to the Middle East as well. Drawing on extensive fieldwork and peppered with vignettes, this book builds an informative study on the institutional mechanisms that organize migration between Taiwan and the labor-exporting countries. The book also compares the case of Taiwan to other host countries such as Saudi Arabia. Although the author does not frame her study of migrant workers as an investigation of slave-like practices, she does outline how contract laborers are often exploited under the transnational maid trade.

Moya, Jose. 2007. "Domestic Service in a Global Perspective: Gender, Migration and Ethnic Niches." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 33(4): 20.

Annotation: Taking a historical perspective, this article offers a definition of domestic service and discusses how the occupation has transformed significantly, both socially and economically, in the past two decades as a result of capitalism and industrialization. What was once slavery and bonded labor became contractual agreements and wage labor. In great detail, the author analyzes issues of gender, migration, and ethnic niches from a global perspective. While the role of maids in the Middle East is briefly addressed, the article does not delve into slavery, and it is useful only for its historical and sociological view on domestic service.

Parrenas, Rhacel Salazar. 2001. Servants of Globalization: Women, Migration and Domestic Work. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Annotation: Drawing on interviews collected between 1995 and 1996, this book offers a comparison on the dislocations migrant Filipina domestic workers face in Rome and Los Angeles, the two cities with the highest percentages of Filipina migrants in Italy and the United States, respectively. The author discusses the role of transnational agencies, class mobility, gender relations, and the effects of migration on the family. This study does not delve into the actual work that migrant domestic servants do, nor does it discuss the abuses they may face at the hands of their employers. Instead, the author examines the perceptions of non-belonging among migrant Filipinas.

_____. 2001. "Transgressing the Nation-State: The Partial Citizenship and 'Imagined (Global) Community' of Migrant Filipina Domestic Workers." *Signs* 26(4): 28.

Annotation: In this article, the author argues that Filipina workers have come to constitute a "female labor diaspora" and blames the export-led development strategy of the Philippines, the feminization of the international labor force, and the demand for migrant women in low-wage service work, as the cause of this trend. Because the author describes Filipina workers in countries throughout the world, much of this article is irrelevant to the topic of household slavery in the Middle East. However, this article is useful for anyone who wants to understand the situation of migrant work from a Filipina perspective.

Shah, Nasra M. 2004. "Gender and Labour Migration to the Gulf Countries." *Feminist Review* 77(1): 183-185.

Annotation: In this short article, the author briefly describes the surge of female migration into the Gulf in the past thirty years, especially in the domestic service sector. The "Asianisation" of the Gulf labor force is also analyzed, as well as the lack of government restrictions in sending nations, making migrants vulnerable to exploitation. The insufficiency of labor laws in the labor-receiving Gulf states is only obliquely mentioned. Although this article fails to go into substantial detail, it remains a good introduction to the topic of female migration in the Middle East.

Silvey, Rachel. 2006. "Consuming the Transnational Family: Indonesian Migrant Domestic Workers to Saudi Arabia." *Global Networks* 6(1): 18.

Annotation: In this article, Silvey analyzes the effects of Indonesian women's transnational migration on their families from an anthropological perspective. While Silvey does refer to the abuses migrants face in Saudi Arabia (rape, torture, sexual assault, overwork, and non-payment of wages), the reference is brief. The primary focus is on the women workers themselves and their motivations for migration, using fieldwork to evaluate the ramifications of "how women migrants frame, oppose and rework the meanings of motherhood and consumption." This study is useful to anyone interested in gender and transnational migration research, but contributes little toward understanding the practice of domestic slavery in Saudi Arabia.

United Nations. 2003. "The United Nations on Levels and Trends of International Migration and Related Policies." *Population Development Review* 29(2): 5.

Annotation: The goal of this article is to provide information on international migration levels, trends, and policies, in order to better understand the causes of the flows of international migration and their relationship to development. Using charts and graphs, this article illustrates the size and growth of migrant populations worldwide between 1990 and 2000. According to the article, while the United States has the largest population of migrants, the United Arab Emirates has the highest percentage. While the article does not discuss human rights abuses against migrants, it offers a useful comparison of migrant populations between countries and also

describes the conventions and protocols adopted by the international community that protect migrants.

Wickramasekera, Piyasiri. 2002. "Asian Labour Migration: Issues and Challenges in an Era of Globalization." In *International Migration Papers*. Geneva: International Labor Office.

Annotation: This report analyzes the causes and origins of labor migration, identifying many economic and structural factors that give migrants an incentive to leave their home nations. It additionally deals with trends and patterns associated with migration. Women migrants in the field of domestic service and entertainment are given particular attention, as well as irregular migrants who are undocumented. Of notable interest is the section of the report where the author seeks to dispel common "myths" regarding migrant workers. Although the Middle East is not discussed in detail, this article is useful for its description of the feminization of the migrant labor force.

Winckler, Onn. 2002. "The Demographic Dilemma of the Arab World: The Employment Aspect." *Journal of Contemporary History* 37(4): 22.

Annotation: This article takes a historical approach to the population explosion in the Middle East, the oil boom, and the consequences on the labor markets. While the article does address the reliance on foreign workers and the wage gap between foreigners and nationals, the author fails to make any relevant assessment of worker abuse, and does not broach the topic of slave-like practices in the Middle East. Instead, the author focuses on the effect of population growth on unemployment within various demographics.

The Recruitment and Migration Process

Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women. 1999. "The Migrating Woman's Handbook. Bangkok: Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women."
http://www.gaatw.net/index.php?option=com_content&task=blogcategory&id=9&Itemid=78.

Annotation: Written by the non-governmental organization (NGO) Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW), this manual provides recommendations to female migrant workers in an effort to help these women know and protect their rights while traveling abroad. The manual describes the process of immigration in great detail, outlining such issues as work permits, detention and deportation, contracts, and travel documents. Although this is not a scholarly report and no specific states are mentioned, the information is concise and offers an NGO's perspective on how to protect female migrant workers from becoming victims of exploitation.

Human Rights Watch. 2006. "Building Towers, Cheating Workers: Exploitation of Migrant Construction Workers in the UAE." <http://hrw.org/reports/2008/bhr0208/3d.htm>.

Annotation: Drawing on over sixty interviews, this extensive report from Human Rights Watch describes the exploitation of migrant construction workers in the United Arab Emirates (UAE), explaining the recruitment process, the confiscation of passports, the safety and health hazards, and the low or unpaid wages in particular. The article begins with recommendations to both the sending and receiving nations of migrant labor, and continues on to analyze UAE labor law and the government's human rights requirements under international law. Although the article does not address domestic servitude, it does represent another group of migrant laborers in the Middle East—a group equally subject to abuse and exploitation.

Longva, Anh Nga. 1999. "Keeping Migrant Workers in Check: The Kafala System in the Gulf." *Middle East Report* 211(Summer).

Annotation: In this short article, the author examines the international labor migration of workers from the Middle East and Asia into the "Gulf Cooperation Council" (GCC). The primary focus of this article is to describe the system of recruitment and Kafala (sponsorship) that allows migrants to work in the GCC. This article is useful in understanding the underpinning laws and social systems that make migrant workers subject to discrimination and abuse.

Pearce, Natasha. 2003. Migrant Workers' Rights: The Passport Issue. London: Kalayaan.

Annotation: Citing case studies and statistics, this report examines the withholding of the passports of migrant domestic workers by employers, particularly in the United Kingdom. It is a practice also common in Saudi Arabia and in the United Arab Emirates. The report features many testimonies from migrant workers worldwide, the passports of whom have been withheld, sometimes for several years. It also exemplifies the havoc that the loss of identity and status wreaks on these workers' lives. The author provides many recommendations on how the practice can be mitigated by the intervention of governments, embassies, NGOs, trade unions, and other groups.

Zachariah, K.C., B.A. Prakash, and S. Irudaya Rajan. 2003. "The Impact of Immigration Policy on Indian Contract Migrants: The Case of the United Arab Emirates." *International Migration* 41(4): 12.

Annotation: Examining the immigration policy of the UAE, this brief case study addresses the impacts of these policies on Indian contract workers from the 1990s onward. Data was collected from officials in the UAE as well as from Indian migrant workers themselves. The first half of the article explains the cause of the surge in Indian migrants, while the second half addresses the resulting impact of immigration policy on Indian expatriates. Slavery is not directly addressed; the main focus is on the reduction of wages and the misuse of the sponsorship system for

exploiting workers. While this article does not mention slavery, it is a rare description of Indian migrant workers in the Middle East.

Forms of Abuse and Framing Exploitation as Slavery

Chammartin, Gloria. 2002. The Feminization of International Migration. International Migration Programme: International Labour Organization.
www.ilo.org/public/english/dialogue/actrav/publ/129/7.pdf.

Annotation: This article focuses primarily on how the opportunities of migrant women differ from those of men, citing gender-biased migration policies and sex stereotypes as root causes of discrimination. Female domestic workers are the group most vulnerable to discrimination and abuse, due to individualized working environments and to the role of intermediaries such as brokers, agents, and recruiters. This article offers a good summary of what migrant domestic workers face in the Middle East, but does not go into great detail.

Degorge, Barbara. 2006. "Modern Day Slavery in the United Arab Emirates." *European Legacy* 11(6): 9.

Annotation: In this article, Degorge uses the UAE as a case study to examine three types of slavery in the Middle East: the use of children as camel jockeys, the sexual enslavement of women, and the migrant workers who "enslave themselves." Framing the article from a historical perspective, the author identifies the situations of these various groups as examples of slavery and concludes that what is needed is a deeper awareness of the scope, nature, and forms of modern day slavery, if there is any hope of abolishing it. The author's definition of slavery and her explanation of the related U.N. Convention make this article a valuable, succinct read.

International Labour Office. 2005. A Global Alliance Against Forced Labour. In *International Labour Conference*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.DOWNLOAD_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=5059

Annotation: This report from the 2005 International Labor Conference provides a comprehensive account of forced labor around the world. Part I begins with definitions of the various characteristics of forced labor: the terminologies, the legislation, and the differences between forced labor and slavery. Part II focuses on the situation of forced labor in selected nations, while Part III proposes the ILO global action against forced labor. Unfortunately, the scope of this report is expansive, and as a result, no subject is covered in detail. However, the report excels in quantifying statistics in charts and graphs, presenting hard data clearly and concisely. This report is useful to anyone interested in understanding the full scope of forced labor around the world.

Jureidini, Ray, and Nayla Moukarbel. 2004. "Female Sri Lankan Domestic Workers in Lebanon: A Case of 'Contract Slavery?'" *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 30(4): 27.

Annotation: Drawing on over seventy interviews with Sri Lankan women in Lebanon, the authors argue that the situations of these domestic workers fall under the category of "contract slavery" as defined by Kevin Bales. This categorization is based on the workers' living conditions, how they are treated by employers, and how the legal and administrative arrangements have facilitated the entrapment they encounter. Although the study deals with contract slavery in Lebanon, it is clear that the same situation exists in Saudi Arabia, the United Arab Emirates, and elsewhere. This provocative study is essential reading for framing the abuses of domestic servants as slavery.

Kaur Gill, Amardeep. 2007. "Today's Slavery." *Canadian Dimension* 41(3): 4.

Annotation: In this brief article, the author succinctly outlines the differences between popular conceptions of contemporary slavery and its realities, pointing to such issues as environmental degradation, conflict, economic violence, societal oppression, and the marginalization of the poor as common factors that drive the impetus for many people to take serious risks and work "illegally." Also discussed are the strategies of deceit and manipulation used to entrap workers, especially migrant domestic servants, into slavery. The article is peppered with brief narratives from exploited workers, and although the article does not go into any detail about specific regions, it offers a good overview of contemporary slavery.

Sabban, Rima. 2001. Migrant Women in the United Arab Emirates: The Case of Female Domestic Workers. In *Series on Women and Migration: International Labor Office*. Geneva: International Labor Office. www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/download/swmuae.pdf.

Annotation: A working paper from the ILO, this article uses fieldwork conducted in the years 1995 and 2001 in order to illustrate examples of domestic slavery in the UAE. The author interviewed both domestic workers and their employers in real situations of employment. In great detail, the author describes the reasons why female domestic workers emigrate to the UAE, under what conditions they work, the types of abuse they endure, and the legal framework responsible for perpetuating these abuses. The author, while careful to analyze the issue from many perspectives, fails to draw any substantial conclusions on what is to be done about these abuses. Despite this omission, the article is an informative study.

Schwenken, Helen. 2005. "Domestic Slavery versus Workers Rights: Political Mobilizations of Migrant Domestic Workers in the European Union." The Center for Comparative Immigration Studies.

Annotation: Although this article doesn't examine the treatment of migrant domestic workers in the Gulf region, instead focusing on the exploitation of migrants in the European Union, its analysis offers an intriguing comparison between the two labor-receiving regions. The article

describes the role of NGOs and their political mobilizations as they strive to improve the living and working conditions of migrant domestic workers in the European Union and discusses political efforts to frame these abuses in terms of slavery and human trafficking. Of interesting note is how the abuses migrant women face in the European Union are nearly identical to those faced by migrants in the Gulf.

Sherry, Virginia N. 2004. *Bad Dreams: Exploitation and Abuse of Migrant Workers in Saudi Arabia*, edited by W. Brown and J. Saunders. Human Rights Watch.
www.hrw.org/reports/2004/saudi0704

Annotation: This lengthy report from Human Rights Watch describes abuses against migrant workers in Saudi Arabia, covering all sectors of the workforce, not just domestic labor. The author interviewed migrant workers in their home countries after they had recently returned from Saudi Arabia. This report depicts in often-chilling detail the level of exploitation, discrimination, and abuse these migrants face by their employers and by the Saudi criminal justice system. Sherry's disgust with the treatment of these migrants is obvious. The author begins her report with set recommendations on how the Saudi government should act in response to these abuses. Despite not visiting Saudi Arabia, the author's investigation is thorough and invaluable to the study of forced labor in the region.

Sunderland, Judith, and Nisha Varia. 2006. "Swept Under the Rug: Abuses against Domestic Workers Around the World." Human Rights Watch.

Annotation: An inverse to Sherry's report detailed above, this comprehensive article focuses on the issue of domestic labor throughout the world, and follows a similar format. Relying on interviews from domestic workers, the author assesses: (1) the scope of criminal abuses against domestic workers as a whole; (2) the exclusion of domestic workers from labor laws; (3) the forms of child labor; and (4) the recruitment, training, and abuse of migrant domestic workers. Each section concludes with the author's special recommendations for correcting each crisis. Although the report examines the plight of domestic workers worldwide, a great deal of emphasis is placed on Saudi Arabia and the UAE in particular.

Toppert, Leigh, and Sameena Nazir, eds. 2005. Women's Rights in the Middle East and North Africa: Citizenship and Justice. New York: Freedom House.

Annotation: An excellent comparative study, this book is indispensable for understanding women's rights in the Middle East as a whole. Comprised of twenty months of research gathered from field consultations with women's rights leaders in the Middle East and with focus groups, the researchers seek to analyze the changing attitudes, obstacles, and opportunities for women in the Middle East and in Africa. Each country has its own chapter dedicated to its unique situation, including both the United Arab Emirates and Saudi Arabia. The various Middle Eastern and African countries are ranked relative to their neighbors in graphs that clearly illustrate how women are treated with regard to access to justice, autonomy, civic voice, and so

forth. Attention is placed on the laws that protect women; while most consideration is given to nationals, migrant women who work as domestic helpers are mentioned as the group most vulnerable to abuse.

U.S. Department of State. 2007. Trafficking in Persons Report.
<http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2007/>

Annotation: Although this report from the U.S. State Department concerns human trafficking, enough emphasis is put on slavery to make it useful for the analysis of domestic slavery in the United Arab Emirates and in Saudi Arabia. Both countries are discussed in this report and Saudi Arabia is ranked as a Tier 3 offender, a title bestowed upon nations who do not comply with the minimum standards of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVP). The report gives an overview of almost all types of modern slavery, including involuntary domestic servitude, sponsorship laws, and forced servitude. The majority of the report is dedicated to country narratives, describing the unique trafficking situation in each nation.

Legal Recourse and Redress for Abuses

Abu-Habib, Lina. 1998. "The Use and Abuse of Female Domestic Workers from Sri Lanka in Lebanon." *Gender and Development* 6 (1): 6.

Annotation: This brief article analyzes possible reasons why international NGOs fail to take action against the abuses faced by female domestics from Sri Lanka in Lebanon. Drawing on her own experiences and observations from direct contact with domestic workers, the author details the role of employment agencies in treating these women like property. Also addressed is the fact that many NGOs either deny the existence of abuses, or demonstrate a lack of interest in the problem. Abu-Habib goes on to explain that many Lebanese nationals scoff at any reports of abuse and contend that these women migrate of their own volition. Although this article does not deal with Saudi Arabia or the United Arab Emirates, the issues are easily transferable.

Amnesty International. 2000. "Saudi Arabia: Gross Human Rights Abuses Against Women."
<http://www.amnestyusa.org/document.php?lang=e&id=D2C1FC0DC59EC51C802569610071BFEC>.

Annotation: This lengthy and informative report focuses on the human rights violations women face under the Saudi justice system, in addition to addressing the plight of migrant domestic workers, who are both foreign nationals and women. More than forty domestic workers from Indonesia, the Philippines, and Sri Lanka were interviewed by Amnesty International for this well-researched report, which helpfully outlines the various international human rights and labor conventions that Saudi Arabia has approved. Narratives from both female nationals and domestic workers who have witnessed discrimination, arbitrary arrest, torture, and other human rights violations are interspersed throughout the report.

_____. 2000. "Saudi Arabia: A Woman Migrant Worker Sentenced to Death." *Amnesty International Women's Rights Action 2000*, <http://www.amnestyusa.org/document.php?lang=e&id=BF2B01B339C57943802568790040AB76>.

Annotation: Illuminating the many inadequacies of the criminal justice system in Saudi Arabia, this brief article describes the imprisonment of a migrant domestic worker from the Philippines after she was found guilty of murdering her female employer, despite being barred from providing a viable defense. According to the article, those without access to money or influence are particularly vulnerable to human rights violations in Saudi Arabia. Because many domestic workers do not speak or read Arabic, they are often unaware of the laws and can be easily tricked into signing confessions.

_____. 2000. "Saudi Arabia: Gross Human Rights Abuses Against Women." <http://www.amnestyusa.org/document.php?lang=e&id=D2C1FC0DC59EC51C802569610071BFEC>.

Annotation: This lengthy and informative report focuses on the human rights violations women face under the Saudi justice system, in addition to addressing the plight of migrant domestic workers, who are both foreign nationals and women. More than forty domestic workers from Indonesia, the Philippines, and Sri Lanka were interviewed by Amnesty International for this well-researched report, which helpfully outlines the various international human rights and labor conventions that Saudi Arabia has approved. Narratives from both female nationals and domestic workers who have witnessed discrimination, arbitrary arrest, torture, and other human rights violations are interspersed throughout the report.

Center for the Study of Human Rights. 1996. Women and Human Rights: The Basic Documents. New York: Columbia University.

Annotation: This book is a comprehensive compilation of declarations and conventions over time regarding the human rights of women. The scope is historical and encompasses aspects such as marriage, health, education, and of particular interest in the study of slavery—employment and trafficking in persons. Also covered are the components of the International Bill of Rights and other instruments of human rights legislation.

Human Rights Watch. 2007. "Saudi Arabia: Migrant Domestic Workers Killed by Employers." *Human Rights News*, <http://hrw.org/english/docs/2007/08/17/saudia16699.htm>.

Annotation: This article from Human Rights Watch describes the killing of two Indonesian migrant domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, and discusses how government inaction in Saudi Arabia leaves migrants vulnerable to abuse and exploitation by their employers. Along with

summarizing the types of abuse migrant domestic workers face, this article also delves into how the Saudi criminal justice system prevents migrants from seeking redress and often works against them as employers bring up countercharges.

Mowbray, Joel. 2003. "Maids, Slaves, and Prisoners: To be Employed in a Saudi Home." *National Review* 55(3): 5.

Annotation: Addressing the slave-like abuses migrant domestic servants face at the hands of Saudis both in Saudi Arabia and also on American soil, this article details how these women are treated under Saudi law, and addresses the actions they take in attempting to escape their bondage. These actions oftentimes include accessing government-run shelters or using the "underground railroad." The author goes on to scrutinize how the U.S. State Department willfully fails to hold Saudi diplomats accountable for the involuntary servitude of domestics in America (for fear of angering the "politically connected"), and how their treatment in America is often equally as atrocious as in Saudi Arabia.

Ofreneo, Rene, and Isabelo Samonte. 2005. Empowering Filipino Migrant Workers: Policy Issues and Challenges. In *International Migration Papers*. Geneva: International Labour Office.
www.ilocarib.org.tt/oldwww/infosources/migration/FilipinoMigrantWorkersimp64.pdf

Annotation: This report by the International Labour Office addresses ways in which Filipino migrant workers can redress abuses they face in their host countries. In great detail, the authors describe the general problems migrant workers face and the challenges NGOs must overcome in order to empower Filipinos. The report concludes with the case studies of Filipino migrant workers in Japan and in Hong Kong. Although not particularly useful in the study of domestic slavery in the Middle East, this report is valuable for understanding what measures are being taken to reverse the exploitation of migrant workers.

U.S. Department of State. 2007. Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: Saudi Arabia.
<http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78862.htm>.

Annotation: This report by the U.S. State Department offers an all-encompassing view of human rights in Saudi Arabia and puts the issue of domestic slavery in perspective. The report begins with an overview of Saudi Arabia's governing system, and then goes into greater detail on each human rights violation, ending with the country's strict limitations on workers rights, especially as pertaining to foreign workers. Discrimination, societal abuses, and human trafficking are addressed in section five, which compares Saudi law to practice. Of particular interest is how the report mentions that racial discrimination is illegal in Saudi Arabia, while discrimination based on nationality is not.

_____. 2007. Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: United Arab Emirates. <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78865.htm>.

Annotation: Much like the U.S. State Department's report on Saudi Arabia, this report details the human rights abuses most common in the United Arab Emirates (UAE). While Saudi Arabia is deemed a Tier 3 nation by the U.S. State Department, the UAE is on the Tier 2 Watch List, a lesser category. The introduction of the report gives a brief overview of the structure of the UAE government and is useful to anyone unfamiliar with the Emirates. According to this report, the UAE has made progress since 2005 in addressing the problem of human trafficking and repatriated children who had been used as camel jockeys. The rest of the report is an analysis of UAE law and human rights from a U.S. perspective.

Wickramasekera, Piyasiri. 2004. Rights of Migrant Workers in Asia: Any Light at the End of the Tunnel? In *International Migration Papers*. Geneva: International Labour Office. www.forum-asia.org/index2.php?option=com_content&do_pdf=1&id=51.

Annotation: This comprehensive report from the International Labour Office outlines the key features of the Asian labor migration, migrant worker rights in practice, the international legal instruments for protection of migrant workers, and what is currently being done by NGOs, the ILO, and other organizations to resolve human rights issues. The slave-like conditions many migrant workers face in the realm of domestic service in the Middle East is addressed at length, as are human rights abuses in other labor-receiving nations. This report is of particular utility to anyone seeking a broad understanding of forced labor of migrant workers.

The Dark Side of Labor in China

By Karine Lepillez

With a population of 1.3 billion and a gross domestic product growing at an impressive rate of 10 percent per year, China has quickly become one of the largest contributors to the global market. Deng Xiaoping's reforms of the late 1970s and early 1980s vastly improved the country's standard of living and made economic development possible; unfortunately, China's remarkable growth has a dark side: the forced labor of men, women and children. The country's unique combination of Communist ideology and decentralized economic power has contributed to the use of both state-sanctioned and unsanctioned forced labor, the latter of which is perpetuated through ineffective policies, corruption, and a lack of legal enforcement. Systematic statistics on the extent of forced labor are not available due to China's repressive political system. However, news articles, reports, research, and the testimonies of past forced laborers attest to the severity of the situation.

State-sanctioned forced labor is widely promoted and justified by the government through the Communist doctrine of "reform through labor." The philosophy extols the virtues of labor as a way to transform dissidents into new socialist men and women; however, in practice it has led to the creation of a vast network of prison labor camps known as Laogai across the country.

Since its inception, the Laogai has been used to suppress and indoctrinate petty criminals, political dissidents, religious adherents, and others who are seen as threats to governmental and social stability. Inmates are used to produce cheap commodities, which, although officially prohibited from exportation, are often indistinguishable from factory goods and continue to find their way into the global market. Prison labor is no longer as profitable of an enterprise as it once was—due in part to international concern and to the inefficiencies of prison-run businesses in general—yet it remains a cornerstone of China's "reform through labor" policy.

Reeducation-through-labor policies also affect school age children through the sanctioned use of juvenile work camps, "work study" schools, and school-related contracted work programs. A prominent example is the 2001 explosion that killed over forty people in an elementary school, the majority of which were third and fourth graders. The explosion was attributed to fireworks that the children were being forced to assemble. In rural institutions especially, students can be asked to work in order to make up for the budget or to pay teachers. Some schools also employ their students in factory work as a form of job training. In these situations, however, much of the work done is tedious and unskilled rather than career orientated.

In China, as in many areas of the world, poverty is a key player in modern slavery, propelling peasants into positions of bonded labor and young children into dangerous and tedious jobs. However, government policies concerning urban migration and public education also play a large role, exacerbating the vulnerabilities of migrants and children instead of protecting these already at-risk populations.

For migrants, China's household registration system has increased the risks involved in finding jobs in the city. Peasants seeking to move to the city for a job must obtain a permit to leave their village, a temporary residential permit to live in the city, and a work permit to begin their job. Applicants are often required to pay for their permits in a lump sum, which is usually lent to them by their employer. The cost and interest is then deducted from their future pay. It is also common

practice for employers to collect and keep worker permits, further trapping laborers in their workplace. Low pay, check withholdings, abuse, long hours, and physical restrictions are all tolerated because employees want to pay back their debt, are no longer in possession of their permit, or because they have been promised their withheld pay in the future. These practices and policies promote a system in which the employee is at the mercy of the employer.

Government policies have also supported ever-increasing fees on public education while simultaneously decreasing subsidies to local schools. According to the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education, although China's schooling is meant to be free and compulsory, fees for public education have been privatized, resulting in families paying for almost half of the cost of their child's education. For struggling rural families, the extra fees make schooling virtually inaccessible. Instead, children are often put to work, since a child's salary can contribute significantly to family income. Poverty is a root cause of much child labor. However, governmental policies concerning education have drastically reduced access to schooling for the neediest children, and have increased the likelihood of their exploitation.

Corruption, made possible by economic decentralization, has also led to forced labor abuses. Decentralization of power in favor of regional control has encouraged economic growth and entrepreneurship while creating an environment in which local officials and business owners can pursue financial incentives to the detriment of vulnerable populations. Not only is there a lack of legal enforcement; those responsible for the law's implementation are oftentimes its worst abusers. For example, police officers double as factory guards, so that when workers are abused and exploited in bonded labor, they have no authority to which they can turn for protection. Business owners make deals with state officials to turn a blind eye to the use of forced and child labor. State officials practice land theft and institute arbitrary tolls to raise extra funds from already struggling peasants. Over the summer of 2007, such corruption was blatantly exposed as 568 forced laborers were freed from kilns that were being run under the protection of local officials. Without government accountability, the very institutions created to protect the people become sources of abuse.

China has made significant efforts to reduce and penalize unsanctioned forced labor by ratifying the International Labor Organization (ILO) Convention on the Worst Forms of Child Labor and by establishing consequences for employers who use forced labor. The state has also been cooperating with the international community through projects and forums designed to eradicate contemporary forms of slavery. However, forced labor will persist as long as the systems and policies that enforce it are still in place. China's reform-through-labor programs, household registration system, and educational policies must be examined, and the widespread corruption of local officials and businessmen must be addressed if the country is going to meet the needs and vulnerabilities of its growing workforce in the years to come.

Selected Bibliography

Aikman, David. 1997. "The Laogai Archipelago." *Weekly Standard*, September 29, 4.

Annotation: Appropriately named to reflect the similarity between the Chinese Laogai and the Russian Gulag, this article offers a brief overview of China's prison reform camps, including

their history, extent, purpose, the underlying philosophy behind them, and their effect on the Chinese population. In addition to addressing the suppression and exploitation of dissidents through the reform system, the author also reveals a disturbing practice recently associated with prison camps: the illegal sale of organs of executed convicts. Aikman inserts a short, emotive biography of Harry Wu, the most influential spokesman against the Laogai system, and echoes Wu's claims that the tragedy of the Chinese Laogai is on the scale of the Russian Gulags.

Barboza, David. 2007. "U.S. Group Accuses Chinese Toy Factories of Labor Abuses." *New York Times*, August 22.

Annotation: Barboza's article provides a helpful synopsis of the labor abuses exposed by the press over the past year in China. It mentions most prominently the August 2007 report by China Labor Watch detailing the illegal and abusive practices in eight investigated Chinese toy factories, which supply brand-name toy makers including Walt Disney and Hasbro. The article mentions the case of the Chinese companies using child labor to make merchandise for the 2008 Beijing Olympics, in addition to addressing reports of labor violations by contracted Chinese companies under Apple and McDonald's. The article notes the prominent role of non-governmental organizations in exposing and holding multinational corporations accountable for their actions.

Birdsall, Nancy. 1998. "Life is Unfair: Inequality in the World." *Foreign Policy* 111 (Summer).

Annotation: Birdsall's article and related notes imply that not all child labor is bad, and that banning it could actually make children workers worse off by rendering them legally invisible if they end up working anyway. The author reviews the causes of inequality, citing factors such as history and bad economic policy. She furthermore explains remedies of the problem that are currently in use, and presents suggestions for alternatives. Her final recommendations include worker-based growth, education, and integration of the state's economy into the global market. Birdsall's views on poverty and its consequences come off as harsh and privileged, but her insights are educated, informed, and worth considering.

Bodeen, Christopher. 2007. "China Train Station Hub for Forced Labor." *Washington Post*, June 19. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/06/19/AR2007061900951.html>.

Annotation: This Washington Post article offers a snapshot of the exploitation of migrants in the Henan province. It mentions the story of 568 forced laborers who were freed from kilns over the summer of 2007, and notes that the illegal operations were being run under the protection of local officials. Bodeen speculates that corruption runs much deeper than the ensuing arrest of 168 people. Government response to the kiln operation grants hope to many by illustrating that with enough international and internal pressure, forced labor will continue to be reported and addressed.

Chan, Anita. 1998. "Labor Standards and Human Rights: The Case of Chinese Workers Under Market Socialism." *Human Rights Quarterly* (20): 886-904.

Annotation: Although this piece is almost ten years old, it is key to understanding the role of international law in the issue of labor rights in China. It gives a clear and concise account of which international human rights documents China has signed and is accountable to, which labor abuses occur in the country, and which laws are violated. It also outlines the players in the international and national field that have been and are making a difference in the area of labor rights in China. This is a solid piece that provides a foundation for understanding labor abuses in light of international human rights law.

———. 2001. *China's Workers Under Assault*. London, England: East Gate.

Annotation: This collection of case studies and reports puts a human face on the issue of forced labor in China. It examines 23 cases around the country over a period of seven years, through Chinese articles, reports, and interviews. The book focuses in particular on migrant workers—who are argued to be the group most vulnerable to abuse—and affirms the importance of non-core labor rights to the goal of heightening labor standards. Anita Chan's writing is accessible and compelling, and while many of her case studies are grim, she remains optimistic about the role of international and local organizations in advocating for forced laborers in China.

China Labor Bulletin. "As China's Economy Grows, So Does China's Child Labor Problem." http://www.china-labour.org.hk/public/contents/article?revision_id=18577&item_id=15889.

Annotation: According to recent reports, child labor is found most prevalently in toy production, textiles, construction, food production, and light mechanical work. This online article by the China Labour Bulletin briefly addresses the causes of child labor and cites recent cases, such as in 2004, when a headmaster was found to be employing 35 students between the ages of eight and sixteen in a toy factory that he owned. The author expresses concern at the lack of awareness and understanding of the general public in China, but believes the rise in child labor can also be attributed to poverty and to a rise in school fees. The article is short and informative, and treats the subject of child labor with compassion.

China Labor Watch. 2005. "Blood and Exhaustion: Behind Bargain Toys Made in China for Wal-Mart and Dollar General." <http://www.chinalaborwatch.org/upload/Huangwu.pdf>.

Annotation: This document is a case study reporting on the grueling work hours, low wages, strict rules and fines imposed to regulate behavior, and banning of workers' unions that characterize the work environment at the Huangwu Toy Factory. The Huangwu enterprise, used by Wal-Mart and Dollar General to produce cheap toys, is but one of many in which employees work in what some would arguably call bonded labor.

China Rights Forum. 2005. "Reform of the Reeducation Through Labor System." *China Rights Forum* (2): 31-33.

Annotation: This short article reports on the changes made to the Reeducation Through Labor system imposed on minor felons. The reforms are intended to reduce the maximum term for prisoners and to lessen the restrictions on them within the camp. The author downplays these small tokens of change and claims that genuine reform can only come through complete eradication of the prison labor system. Among the reasons given for the reforms, the journal cites the condemnation of the Chinese labor camps by the international community and by human rights organizations.

Committee of Experts on the Application of Conventions and Recommendations. 2007. Individual Observation concerning Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138) China (ratification: 1999) Geneva: International Labor Organization.

Annotation: This document, published by the International Labor Organization (ILO), deals largely with child labor. The Committee establishes a tie between education and child labor, and claims that China's decreased enrollment in primary and secondary schools can be linked to an increase in child employment. Significantly, it criticizes China for the extreme secrecy surrounding its child labor cases, in addition to noting statistics that make it very hard to determine the extent of the problem. The document also includes China's response to the criticism, giving the reader an indication of the measures taken by the state to address the issue of child labor. This text is important for a general understanding of child labor in China, including potential causes and recommendations.

———. 2007. Individual Observation concerning Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) China (ratification: 2002). Geneva: International Labor Organization.

Annotation: This 2007 document contains observations and recommendations made by the International Labor Organization (ILO) concerning the use of child labor in China. The main areas of concern at the time were the alleged role of Chinese authorities in trafficking children from and through China, the exploitation of child labor through school-run factories and labor camps, and the use of disabled children as professional beggars. Chinese laws already prohibit the use of child labor, so recommendations focused on imposing higher penalties for violators, and on strengthening the government's monitoring and law enforcement systems. This document is essential to understanding China's efforts in the area of child labor and its relationship and cooperation with the international community and the ILO.

Dittmer, Lowell. 2001. "Chinese Human Rights and American Foreign Policy: A Realist Approach." *The Review of Politics* 63 (3): 421-459.

Annotation: In this lengthy article, Dittmer answers the question, "can realist means be used in support of idealist ends?" More specifically, can human rights goals be met using economic sanctions? After an extensive survey of U.S. foreign policy, the author comes to the conclusion that China's economic modernization is more likely to bring about improvements in the state's human rights record than will economic sanctions. This article is pertinent in light of recent disputes between China and the United States over the communist state's exportation of goods made by children or forced laborers.

Edmondson, Gail, Kate Carlisle, Inka Resch, Karen Nickel Anhalt, and Heidi Dawley. 2000. "Workers in Bondage." *Business Week*. November 27.

Annotation: In 2000, Europe witnessed an appalling series of raids, which exposed large numbers of forced laborers trafficked in from China and Eastern Europe. Illegal Chinese immigrants form the largest target group for forced labor and trafficking in Europe; many become bonded or indebted to the mob bosses that enabled their passage to Europe. This article reveals the international side of forced labor in China, and explains the increasing financial incentive for gangs involved in trafficking and forced labor in China and in Europe. A disturbing piece of reporting, it reveals the widespread influence of the black market, which is globalizing and facilitating the use of forced labor.

French, Howard W. 2007. "Fast-Growing China Says Little of Child Slavery's Role." *New York Times*. June 21. <http://www.nytimes.com/2007/06/21/world/asia/21china.html>.

Annotation: This 2007 *New York Times* article brings to light the most recent child labor incidents in China: hundreds of forced laborers freed from a brick kiln, a fifteen year-old crushed to death in a cotton gin, seventy girls brought by their teacher to work in a processing plant for sixteen hour shifts, and a fourteen year-old boy killed in an explosion at a chemical factory. The author notes the revisions of children's rights laws made by President Hu Jintao, but remains pessimistic that without enforcement, no change will occur. Rather, local officials will continue to evade responsibility by taking advantage of overlapping jurisdictions.

Gutmann, Ethan. 2004. *Losing the New China*. San Francisco, CA: Encounter Books.

Annotation: A former journalist for the Asian Wall Street Journal, Gutmann uses his book to expose the compromises made by American businesses in China, also exposing their costly consequences. Although Gutmann does not deal directly with the issue of forced labor in China, his personal accounts of Chinese and American business relations set the stage for readers to understand the type of environment in which corruption and human exploitation can occur. Gutmann's easy-to-read book is as much a comment on human nature as it is on the nature of business in China.

Holmes, Leslie. 2006. Rotten states?: Corruption, Post-Communism, and Neoliberalism Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Annotation: Holmes' well-researched book is a comparative analysis of corruption in China, Bulgaria, Hungary, Poland and Russia. His central thesis is that there is a connection between communism and corruption; however, he finds that "examples of corruption can be found in all the political institutions of the contemporary state." Holmes outlines the scale, impact, causes, and the measures used against corruption. He acknowledges the important role of international organizations, and suggests that they work with civil society rather than with the state in keeping institutions and individuals accountable and transparent. In conclusion, Holmes argues that a state's approach to economic reform is significantly linked with corruption.

Human Rights Watch. 1991. Forced labor exports from China [microform]: update no. 1. New York: Human Rights Watch.

Annotation: This September 1991 follow-up to the April report published by Human Rights Watch (HRW) records China's reaction to the accusation that they export forced labor goods, and offers new evidence to support the organization's views. Accordingly, HRW claims that forced prison labor and the exportation of prison-made goods is and has been a part of the Chinese government's policy. This older document illustrates the international aspect of prison labor in China and shows that it has been an issue of contention between the United States and China for several decades.

———. 1991. Prison labor in China [microform]. New York: Human Rights Watch.

Annotation: This 1991 report by Human Rights Watch is one of the organization's only pieces on forced prison labor in China. It uses a series of internal Chinese documents to prove that the state was using forced prison labor products for export, and that in fact, the country was heavily dependent upon prison-made goods to meet its increasing export quotas. The purpose of this document was to discourage the U.S. government from giving China Most Favored Nation status.

Kapstein, Ethan B. 2006. "The New Global Slave Trade." *Foreign Affairs* 85 (6): 103-115.

Annotation: Kapstein's article addresses the issue of slavery around the globe, the methods that have been used to abolish it, why such methods have not worked, and recommendations for state action. He also includes a short section on the definition of contemporary slavery. Kapstein is a proponent of criminalizing prostitution worldwide, and of using the power of Western states to influence perpetrators of trafficking and forced labor. He argues for an aggressive and public strategy towards the problem of slavery, rather than one that works behind closed doors. This

recent article is a fundamental addition to the understanding of the nature of slavery in a globalizing world.

Kwong, Peter. 2007. Chinese Migration Goes Global. *YaleGlobal Online*, July 17.
<http://yaleglobal.yale.edu/display.article?id=9437>.

Annotation: China's booming economy has sparked urban as well as international migration. Kwong's article explains the challenges faced by China's growing migrant community. As competition for jobs in the city increases, many are willing to pay the price of being sent overseas—\$30,000 to be smuggled into the United Kingdom and \$70,000 for the United States. Illegal immigrants are at a high risk of exploitation, not only by their employers, but also by the trafficking rings through which they are smuggled. This article brings attention to the plight of illegal Chinese migrants.

Li, Cheng. 1996. "Surplus Rural Laborers and Internal Migration in China." *Asian Survey* 36 (11): 1122-1145.

Annotation: Although somewhat outdated, Li's article addresses the effects of the ongoing and increasing internal migration in China. The author outlines the reasons behind the migration and the characteristics of this "floating population," and makes a series of policy recommendations. He optimistically predicts that China's two hundred million internal migrants will further the country's development, industrialization, and liberalization, and will contribute to the expansion of civil society.

Mattioli, Maria C., and V. K. Sapovadia. 2004. "Laws of Labor." *Harvard International Review* 26 (2): 60-64.

Annotation: In this article, Mattioli strongly emphasizes the relationship between labor standards, investment, and ultimately, stable growth. Although the article does not deal directly with China, it deals with the issue of forced labor and child labor in general. Mattioli explains that while violating labor laws may initially cut costs and increase profit, it removes the incentive to invest in people or in new technology, and eventually hinders growth. This article is simple—almost simplistic—in its analysis of labor violations, but does highlight essential aspects of the problem: there is a correlation between a state's stable economic growth and investment, and forced and child labor.

Oi, Jean C. 1995. "The Role of the Local State in China's Transitional Economy." *China Quarterly* (144): 1132-1149.

Annotation: Jean Oi's article on the nature of the Chinese economy contributes to an understanding of the role of the local state in business. Termed local state corporatism, this state-led growth explains how local officials have become similar to board directors or CEOs in

local enterprises. Although not dealing with the ways in which the system is vulnerable to exploitation, this article lays the foundation for an understanding of the role local officials play in the corporate world, and how easily a conflict of interest can form, resulting in corruption or labor abuse.

Seymour, James D. 1998. New Ghosts, Old Ghosts: Prisons and Labor Reform Camps in China. Armonk: ME Sharpe, Inc.

Annotation: Seymour's book about prison labor camps in China is built upon fieldwork in three Chinese regions, on public and private documents, and on interviews with prisoners, guards, and local officials. The author disagrees that prison labor is a lucrative source of income for the Chinese government. Rather, he claims that the Laogai system is inefficient and unprofitable, especially since international scrutiny on forced labor exports has increased. A well-documented work, Old Ghosts, New Ghosts counterbalances previous reports on the Laogai system by Human Rights Watch and by Harry Hongda Wu.

Sun, Yan. 2004. Corruption and Market in Contemporary China. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.

Annotation: Corruption has always been present in China's political and economic system; however, Sun remarks, its intensity and frequency have changed since the state's economic reforms were implemented in the late 1970s. Sun uses published casebooks of economic crime to reveal a connection between decentralized power and the opportunities for corruption. China's economic reforms have facilitated the means for abuse and have decreased its disincentives.

The Solidarity Center. 2004. "The Struggle for Worker Rights in China." In *Justice for All*. Washington: The Solidarity Center.
<http://www.solidaritycenter.org/content.asp?contentid=501>.

Annotation: The Solidarity Center's report deals with workers' rights in China in general, but devotes several chapters to the issues of child labor and forced labor. Acknowledging the lack of transparency in China that prevents us from knowing the full extent of forced labor and child labor in the country, the author nonetheless testifies to the gravity of the problem with references to news articles, reports, and personal testimonies. Solutions mentioned revolve around education and rule of law. They include: the immediate banning of manual labor used by schools to raise funds or supplement teachers' pay, education of the most vulnerable groups (migrants, women, children) to raise awareness of forced labor and trafficking, and enforcement of laws already passed in China to ban forced labor.

Tong, Xiaojun, and Shizhen Lu. 2004. "China." In Child Labor: A Global View. Edited by Elizabeth KimJin Traver, Cathryne L. Schmitz, and Desi Larson. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.

Annotation: The third chapter of this book provides a holistic look at child labor in China, taking the reader through the history of child labor in the country, its place in politics and society, and its probable future. The authors praise the Chinese government for its legislation and hard stance against child labor, and blame the exploitation of child workers on poverty and the current business structure. A lack of effective enforcement is also listed as a cause for the continuing occurrence of child labor in China. The authors see a link between child labor and education, and recommend that China strengthen its educational programs as a way to counter and reduce the occurrence of child labor.

UNESCO Bangkok. 2006. "Getting Girls out of Work and Into School: Policy Brief." Bangkok.

Annotation: This policy brief by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization deals specifically with the plight of girls and labor in the Asia-Pacific region. It lists the international instruments developed to deal with child labor, the type of children most at risk, and the specific barriers to full school enrollment. As relates to China, the report gives a snapshot of one of the innovative practices used to get girls out of work and into school: assistance to cover all school-related costs and promotion of education and skills training relating to gender equality, public health, and hazards such as trafficking and forced labor. The document offers a number of recommendations, including collaboration in the area of research, data collection, and monitoring and evaluation.

United States. Congress. House. Committee on International Relations. Subcommittee on Africa, Global Human Rights, and Operations International. 2006. Human rights in China: improving or deteriorating conditions?: hearing before the Subcommittee on Africa, Global Human Rights, and International Operations of the Committee on International Relations, House of Representatives, One Hundred Ninth Congress, second session, April 19. Washington: U.S. G.P.O.

Annotation: A 2006 hearing before the Committee on International Relations, this document addresses the subject of human rights abuses in China. Most pertinent to the focus on forced labor is a statement made by Ms. Thea Lee, Director of Public Policy at the AFL-CIO. Lee approaches the issue from the perspective of American interest, arguing that the repressive labor environment, which includes child labor, forced labor, and prison labor, creates an unfair trade advantage and contributes to the United States' \$202 billion trade deficit with China. Her statement is brief, and is focused on the ineffectiveness of the current Bush Administration's stance towards the Chinese government.

United States. Congressional-Executive Commission on China. 2005. Forced labor in China: roundtable before the Congressional-Executive Commission on China, One Hundred Ninth Congress, first session, June 22. Washington: U.S. G.P.O.

Annotation: This 2005 Congressional Roundtable responds to concerns that China is violating the International Labor Organization's (ILO) Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, of which China is a signatory. Statements were made by Jeffrey Fielder of the AFL-CIO, Harry Wu, founder of the Laogai Research Foundation, and by Gregory Xu, a member of Falun Gong with personal experience of China's forced labor camps. The statements focused mainly on the issue of prison labor, and heatedly recommended that the United States take a hard line against the importation of any prison labor products. Fielder especially urged that in cases where forced labor products are indistinguishable from legal products, the United States should ban the product entirely, and import it from another, more reliable country. This document highlights the Committee's concern about forced labor in China, and makes clear the speakers' frustration over the United States' lack of action in the matter.

United States. Department of Labor. 2007. "China."
<http://www.dol.gov/ilab/media/reports/iclp/sweat/china.htm>.

Annotation: The U.S. Department of Labor's brief online page about child labor in China lists a number of industries in which child labor has been shown to exist: fireworks, garments and textiles, toys, sports equipment, and games. It cites the national and international laws and conventions that China has ratified, and briefly mentions the judicial steps taken in relation to child labor. China has accordingly set up 2,763 courts to deal with child labor cases, in addition to seventeen provincial committees for the protection of children. The tone of the article, however, is tentative; it argues that there is no way to assess the true extent of child labor because of China's lack of statistics and repressive political system.

Wan, Ming. 2007. "Human Rights Lawmaking in China: Domestic Politics, International Law, and International Politics." *Human Rights Quarterly* (29): 727-753.

Annotation: In this article, Ming Wan looks at China's gradual acceptance of International Human Rights Law and norms. He attributes this development not simply to international pressure, but also to economic pressure within the country. Wan speculates as to whether International Human Rights laws will begin trumping national laws, especially in cases where the two are in conflict—for example, in China's practice of reeducation through forced labor. In general, the author is optimistic that even though China remains a non-democratic, communist state, there are signs of improvement and openness in the area of human and civil rights.

Wang, Jun. 2003. "Prisons Not Profits." *Beijing Review* 46 (37): 24-25.

Annotation: This government-approved article from the *Beijing Review* shows the Chinese government acknowledging and seeking to address the corruption in their prison labor reform

camps. The author explains the changes that will be made with the reform plan; most importantly, the operating costs of prisons will no longer be met by income brought in by prisoners' work, but rather will be covered fully by central and provincial governments. At the time of the writing, this reform was to be undertaken by six provinces. While acknowledging the downfalls of the current prison labor system, the article dutifully touts the benefits of prison labor in helping prisoners develop responsibility, good work habits, and a "spirit of teamwork."

Wu, Harry. 1997. "China's Gulag." *Harvard International Review* 20 (1): 20-23.

Annotation: Harry Wu's article makes a moral appeal for dismantling China's prison reform system. Wu explains how the legacy of Deng Xiaoping's market-oriented Chinese communism precipitated the abuse of the labor reform system. He uncompromisingly declares that China's business practices make it impossible for democracy to take root. Comparing China's Laogai ("reform through labor") to the Soviet gulag and to Nazi concentration camps, Wu appeals for universal condemnation of "the world's most extensive system of forced labor camps today."

Wu, Hongda Harry. 1992. Laogai - The Chinese Gulag. Translated by T. Slingerland. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Annotation: Originally written in Chinese, this groundbreaking book by Harry Wu—a former Laogai prisoner—offers an insider's view of China's institutionalized labor reform system. Wu outlines in detail the structure of the system, its regulations, its breadth, and how it has been used by the Communist government to contribute to China's growing export market. There is a substantial Appendix with the names, locations and descriptions of almost one thousand work camps around the country. Prisoners in these camps are forced to work as part of their reeducation. Their work conditions constitute human rights concerns: grueling twelve-hour days, physical abuse, scarce food, and dangerous work environments. Wu provides first-hand insight as well as primary research on China's forced labor camps, emphasizing the need for advocacy and structural reform.

Xiaobo, Lu. 2000. "Booty Socialism, Bureau-preneurs, and the State in Transition." *Comparative Politics* 32 (3): 273-294.

Annotation: Xiaobo's article focuses on the role of the state in China's economic development; in particular, it highlights the predatory behavior of state agencies, which take advantage of the opportunities for corruption that are made possible by the state's decentralizing economic reforms. Xiaobo examines the concept, patterns, and impact of organizational corruption in China. He concludes that state power can facilitate corruption, but that it can also be its most effective remedy by promoting coherence and accountability.

Xiaolei, Jing. 2007. "Child Labor Disgrace." *Beijing Review*. July 12, 2007.
http://www.bjreview.com.cn/quotes/txt/2007-07/06/content_68382.htm.

Annotation: This article was a top story in the July edition of *Beijing Review*, an official government magazine in China. It highlights the events surrounding the Shanxi child labor scandal, in which a man named Heng Tinghan was found to be using forced labor as well as child labor in his mines and kilns. This event was under international scrutiny, and thus the article is focused on explaining how the Chinese government has been addressing the issue. Unlike many other articles concerning forced labor in China, this piece lists statistics on the spread of child labor in the Jiangxi Province, the Zhejiang Province, and the Henan Province.

Yun, Gao. 2004. Chinese Migrants and Forced Labour in Europe. In *International Labor Standards*, Geneva: International Labour Office.

Annotation: This extensive working paper by Chinese lawyer Gao Yun was written in response to the International Labor Organization's rising concern about international migration, forced labor, and human trafficking. Concentrating primarily on Chinese migrants in Europe, Yun outlines the progression by which many people become trapped in situations of forced labor as a result of the human trafficking process. Yun adds a pertinent section on Chinese legislation, and speculates that among the reasons for its ineffectiveness are a lack of enforcement, high profits and low risks, and the indistinguishability in Chinese law between trafficking victims and perpetrators.

The Economic Foundations of Contemporary Slavery

By Justin Guay

“Slavery existed before money or law” (Hochschild 2005). Indeed the “peculiar institution” is one of humanity’s oldest. It has, however, evolved and manifested itself quite distinctly in different periods of history. In contrast to historical views of slavery that are associated with Chattel Slavery, numerous forms fall under the umbrella term of contemporary slavery. The United Nations (U.N.) Working Group recognizes such radically new forms as: child labor, children in conflict, trafficking in persons, sexual exploitation, and the sale of children. The International Labor Office (ILO) approaches the topic through the lens of forced labor. The ILO recognizes slavery and abductions, compulsory participation in public works projects, forced labor in agriculture, domestic workers, bonded labor, forced labor imposed by the military, forced labor in the trafficking of persons, as well as some aspects of prison labor and rehabilitation through work. A linking factor between these varied forms of contemporary slavery, according to the U.N. Working Group, is the role that poverty plays in creating vulnerability. This link is echoed in the work of Kevin Bales, arguably the world’s foremost expert on contemporary slavery. According to Bales, contemporary slavery is “the complete control of a person, for economic exploitation, by violence, or the threat of violence.” Using this definition, it is possible to explore the economic links that all forms of slavery, despite their unique characteristics, share.

Economic conditions are decisive in the formation of slavery. Chattel slavery emerged as a disturbing manifestation of a push for labor-intensive goods created in the new world. Slaves were seen as property—as a form of investment. The ensuing ownership created a myriad of costs for slave traders and owners. These costs included cargo, shipment, and insurance during delivery, as well as the costs of maintaining the investment (food, medical treatment, and clothing) on behalf of the slave owner. Nearly forty million Africans lost their lives due to horrific conditions on slaving vessels (Anti-Slavery International 2005). Massive slave insurrections significantly added to the costs nations incurred in enforcing the trade. These economic realities, coupled with strong domestic opposition, eventually led slave traders and politicians in Great Britain to re-evaluate the desirability of the trade. This ultimately led to slavery’s abolition in Great Britain and in subsequent countries around the world.

A new set of economic forces arose from the ashes of the Trans-Atlantic trade, as slave traders demonstrated their ability to adapt to a changing environment. During the post-abolition era, the colonial holdings of the world’s imperial powers began to display an evolution towards slave-like practices. Forced labor by the state, debt bondage, and prison labor emerged to take the place of chattel slavery. These forms were markedly different for exactly what they lacked—namely, the immense costs and direct legal involvement in a trade that had been officially abolished. Imperial powers found these advantages to be economically and socially attractive. However, two devastating wars and the era of decolonization all but ended this period by the 1970s.

Economic factors have been shown to precipitate the rise and fall of different forms of slavery. The modern set of economic conditions, on which slavery now firmly rests, have arisen through the monolithic pillars of capitalism and free trade. Massive inequality and poverty have set the stage for

the most profitable form of slave trading ever seen. Slaves today are, in purely economic terms, short term, low-capital investments with incredibly high rates of return. For example, slaves in the U.S. Antebellum South cost, in real terms, around \$40,000; today, a slave goes for around \$90 (Bales 1999). This is due to the enormous supply of slaves on the market today. In contrast to chattel slavery, ownership is now officially avoided. However, illegitimate contracts are used to keep victims in subjugation. Although a dizzying array of slave-like practices are recognized, the dominating form of slavery today is debt bondage.

It is estimated that a staggering fifteen million of the world's slaves can be found in India, Nepal, Pakistan, and Bangladesh combined (Bales 2000). The primary method of enslavement in these countries is debt bondage. This involves a person using his or her labor as repayment for a loan. Unsavory accounting, astronomical interest rates, and violence then combine to keep the person in bondage that can last the rest of their life, and in many cases is passed on to generations of their descendants.

A common link in many forms of contemporary slavery is the use of illegal contracts. Domestic servants in the Philippines, textile workers in the United States, and sex workers in Thailand are all examples of contract slavery. The vulnerability of the world's poor is a key ingredient to the successful implementation of this type of slavery. Slave traders offer desperately poor people, usually in rural areas, employment through illegitimate contracts. Once the victim has been subjugated, the contract is used to keep the slave convinced that the arrangement is valid. The contract is also used to flaunt anti-slavery laws in case of problems with authorities. Despite the illegality of the practice, a lack of international enforcement allows the problem to persist.

Perhaps most disturbing is the mass exploitation of children. According to the ILO, currently over 100 million children are being exploited for their labor. Children are especially attractive to slave traders because they are easy to coerce psychologically and physically. They are also valued for their small physical statures, which allow them to work in cramped conditions. The U.N., through the ILO, has committed itself to the abolition of the worst forms of child labor. These forms have been defined by the ILO as work, which by its nature, or the circumstances in which it is carried out, is likely to harm the health, safety, or morals of children. This work includes most forms of slavery or slave-like practices (the sale of a child, trafficking of children, bonded child labor, forced or compulsory labor including child soldiers), the commercial sexual exploitation of children (prostitution, pornography, forced child marriage, and child domestic work), and the use, procuring, or offering of a child for illicit activities (drug trade) (Child Rights Information and Documentation Centre 1999).

The economic power wielded by the modern age slave holder is due to the seemingly unlimited supply of slaves in the world. According to the U.N., half of the world's six and a half billion people survive on less than two dollars per day. It is from this mass of desperately poor people that the world's slaves are culled. Never in history has there been a segment of society that is as vulnerable as today's poor.

The ideological push for the "science" of free trade has unleashed enormously destructive forces for social and cultural change that have wreaked havoc on the populations of developing countries. Rapid urbanization and restructuring of agricultural activities, upon which people have depended for centuries, has spelled disaster. In rural areas, the loss of common land combined with the switch to

the production of cash crops from subsistence farming, has in effect destroyed people's livelihoods (Bales 2000). Heaped on top of this suffering is the destruction of the communities upon which people have depended for support.

As opposed to the later eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, when slavery was confined to colonies and peripheral territorial holdings, contemporary slavery has permeated countries at every level of development in the global economy. Conservative estimates put the number of modern slaves alive today at 27 million (Bales 1999). Some human rights organizations have the number as high as 200 million (Free the Slaves 2007). This is more than all of the slaves who were captured and forced into slavery during the entirety of the Trans-Atlantic slave trade. The direct value of slave labor in today's economy is estimated between thirteen and twenty billion dollars (Bales 2000). It must be pointed out that these figures are strictly estimates. It is nearly impossible to discern any kind of verifiable, quantitative information on modern slavery, since slavery exists in the shadow of the global economy and thrives on the purposeful ignorance of states, multi-national corporations, and societies.

A market-based approach aimed at addressing the underlying factors involved must be implemented in order to combat the growing problem of contemporary slavery. Obscene profit, immense vulnerability, and lack of enforcement are the targets of such an approach. The supply and demand relationship is a good place to begin. Informing the public about goods that are produced by slaves will serve to reduce demand. On the supply side, multi-national corporations need to be held responsible for their labor practices and product sourcing. These objectives must be enforced by strictly adhering to existing laws on local, national, and international levels, thereby driving up the costs incurred by slave traders. Finally, governments and international organizations need to counterbalance the immense wealth disparity that is created by liberal economic policy. This can be achieved through economic policies aimed at human rather than economic development, including full employment and social welfare. This approach, aimed at reducing demand by developed countries, driving up the costs incurred by slave traders, and bringing up the income level of the majority of the world's poor, must be implemented globally in order to combat the ghastly effects that the slave trade has on humanity.

In order for us to end the reality of lives of servitude, which millions of people face today, and which millions more will face tomorrow, it is vital that we act now. The marriage of life and slavery may seem absolute, but it need not be. The future is defined by the actions of the present. In the words of Maya Angelou, "History, despite its wrenching pain, cannot be unlived, but if faced with courage, need not be lived again."

Annotated Bibliography

Anti-Slavery International. 2005. "1807-2007: Over 200 Years of Campaigning against Slavery," edited by Mike Kaye. <http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/1807-2007.pdf>.

Annotation: This article details the history of the Trans-Atlantic slave trade, including the various factors that led to the eventual abolition of slavery in the Great Britain. It begins with a brief history of slavery in Africa, and with a discussion of the significant change that chattel slavery and the Trans-Atlantic slave trade introduced. The factors in the decline of the trade that

are discussed by the author include the massive loss of life, slave insurrections, and a diminishing domestic support of the trade.

Anti-Slavery International. 2007. "The History of Anti-Slavery International."

<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/antislavery/history.htm>.

Annotation: This brief piece gives the history of Anti-Slavery International, the world's oldest human rights organization. The organization is responsible for the abolition of slavery in Great Britain. Today, it remains the world's foremost advocate for human rights protection and slavery abolition. The brief account of the history of the organization is supplemented by a link to a document that contains a more detailed history of the organization and its fight to end slavery.

Anti-Slavery International. 2007. "Take Action on Cocoa."

<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/campaign/cocoabackground.htm>.

Annotation: This article demonstrates the success and failure of an anti-slavery campaign in the cocoa industry. The efforts of NGOs, corporations, and governments culminated in the Cocoa Protocol, which was meant to initiate fair trade practices in the cocoa industry. However, a lack of oversight and enforcement has led to a resurgence of the problem.

Anti-Slavery International. 2007. "What is Modern Slavery?"

<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/antislavery/modern.htm>.

Annotation: This short article found on the Anti-Slavery International website gives a basic overview of contemporary slavery. It defines six different forms of modern slavery including: debt bondage, forced labor, and trafficking. It also looks at the characteristics that define modern slavery. It is a useful place to start research on the topic, although the information is by no means exhaustive.

Bales, Kevin. 1999. Disposable People. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Annotation: The book advances the view that contemporary forms of slavery are markedly different from historical forms of slavery. These new forms have arisen specifically due to economic changes in the form of globalization. The author argues that the abundance of people on the planet now makes the modern slave trade extremely profitable. The author goes on to discuss how various forms slavery have emerged in countries such as India, the United States, and Thailand.

_____. 2000. "Expendable People: Slavery in the Age of Globalization." *Journal of International Affairs* 53(2)(Spring):461-485.

Annotation: The author defines contemporary slavery in the context of globalization. The article begins by defining three widely recognized forms of modern slavery: chattel slavery, debt bondage, and contract slavery. It then contrasts the economic features of these modern forms of slavery with those of the Trans-Atlantic Slave Trade.

_____. 2002. "The Social Psychology of Modern Slavery." *Scientific American* 286(4):80.

Annotation: The author describes contemporary slavery and debt bondage in particular. He discusses the areas of the world in which human trafficking is organized through criminal rings. Finally, the article looks at psychological mechanisms that are used against victims in contemporary slavery.

_____. 2006. "Understanding Global Slavery." (February).
<https://216.235.201.228/NETCOMMUNITY/Document.Doc?id=14>.

Annotation: This article, posted on the Free the Slaves website, explains the author's theory of contemporary slavery. The article defines slavery, and shows how the typical relationship between slave and master is distinctly different in modern times due to economic changes. Using economic theory as a basis, the author gives quantifiable data that demonstrate the market factors that have given rise to the use of slaves in certain countries.

Baykudoglu, Serkan. 2003. "Did Abolishing the Slave Trade Have an Economic Cause?" *Journal of American Studies* 5 (17)(May-July):5-64.

Annotation: This article looks at economic factors behind the demise of the slave trade in the British Empire. It refutes the widely accepted notion that religious and abolitionist movements were the driving factors that ended the trade. Instead, it points to economic factors such as the costs incurred by the slave traders, as well as a decline in the overall profitability of the British West Indies, as the ultimate causes. These economic causes are seen as a part of the broader transition to capitalism that the British underwent during this time period.

Belser, Patrick. 2007. "Building a Global Alliance against Forced Labour." *Global Social Policy* 7 (1)(April): 18-21.

Annotation: Building on the ILO report, "A Global Alliance against Forced Labour," this article looks at the questions of why and where forced labor exists. It also looks at the inherent characteristics of forced labor. It refers to a statistical report that delineates how much forced labor there is in the world today. These issues and statistics are examined in order to build support for a policy change, at both the global and national levels, in order to end forced labor.

Carlander, Jay R. 2006. "Antebellum Southern Political Economists and the Problem of Slavery." *American Nineteenth Century History* 7 (3)(September): 389-416.

Annotation: This article describes the efforts of a group of southern political economists in formulating a theory, derived from classical economics, which defended the institution of slavery in the American Antebellum South. The group fused economic thought with racist ideology in order to support their claims. The article explains their attempts to reconcile the use of slavery through a discussion about the economics of Adam Smith, who denounced the practice as morally unjust and economically inefficient.

Child Rights Information and Documentation Centre. 1999. "Full Text of the C182, ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention." http://www.cridoc.net/worst_forms_of_child_labour.php.

Annotation: This short article is the full text of the C182 from the International Labor Organization's Worst Forms of Child Labor Convention of 1999. It defines forced child labor, in addition to outlining the forms it has taken, including prostitution, trafficking, and children in conflict.

Cohen, Steve. 2007. "From A Worker to a Slave." *Global Social Policy* 7 (1)(April): 14-17.

Annotation: This article focuses on wage slavery and illegal immigrants in the United Kingdom. The main thrust of the article is the "double paradox" that modern slaves face. Firstly, although their presence is unwanted, their labor is needed. Secondly, although globalization has brought down barriers to immigration for labor, it has simultaneously strengthened them through immigration restrictions. The article is unique, in that it takes a different look at slavery through the lens of immigration.

Cole, Thomas B. 2005. "Modern Slavery a Hidden Crime in the US." *JAMA: Journal of the American Medical Association* 294(5)(August 3): 541-542.

Annotation: This short article serves to highlight the problem of forced labor in the United States. It does so by providing small amounts of summary statistics and a quick overview of the problem. This overview includes the industries that are involved and the reasons why people remain in forced labor. The article is aimed at getting physicians to recognize that a person may be a victim and to take action.

Davis, David Brion. 2003. Challenging the Boundaries Of Slavery. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Annotation: This book traces slavery through various civilizations in human history. It examines the origins of the word, including who it was originally meant to define, and discusses how that definition has changed over time. The book provides detailed accounts of slavery in various time periods, showing how these definitions have influenced the definitions and stereotypes of various societies. The book also explores the economic changes that have helped to shape slavery.

Dodson, Howard. 2005. "Slavery in the Twenty-First Century." *UN Chronicle* 42(3)(September-November): 28-29.

Annotation: The article is an informative piece for people who are new to the concept of modern slavery. It contrasts the Trans-Atlantic slave trade with contemporary slavery by showing the indiscriminate nature of contemporary slavery. It has a very informative insert entitled "Child Slavery, A Global Problem," which defines various forms contemporary slavery has taken. It also provides statistics to reinforce the author's view of the global problem slavery poses.

Doyle, Rodger. 2006. "Modern Slavery." *Scientific American* 294 (1)(January): 30.

Annotation: This extremely short article summarizes an International Labor Organization report that classifies forced labor into three different categories: economic, state imposed, and sexual. It gives a figure for those subjected to forced labor in the world (12.3 million), as well as the profits cleared by those who exploit them (44 billion).

Engerman, Stanley L. 2000. "Slavery at Different Times and Places." *The American Historical Review* 105 (2)(April):480-484.

Annotation: This article looks at the basic definitions of slavery and freedom in order to understand the concept of voluntary slavery. In so doing, it refers to David Brion Davis' work on definitions of ownership. The article also outlines a relationship, which is also partially derived from Davis' work, between racism and slavery. Finally it points out the paradox of the so-called enlightened countries—those with relative levels of cultural and economic achievement, which nevertheless participate in this very base activity.

Fishman, Ted C. 1997. "The Joys of Global Investment." *Harpers* (February): 35, 8p, 3c.

Annotation: This article uses an extremely sarcastic tone to demonstrate how American foreign investments are exploiting labor in poor developing countries. Beginning with the uproar over the Kathie Lee Gifford sweatshop scandal, the author links a decline in the American economy

to increased foreign investment. Specific examples include Myanmar and Honduras. The article is extremely good at portraying the link that globalization and liberal economic policies have in driving the use of forced labor.

Free The Slaves. 2007. "Slavery in History."

<http://www.freetheslaves.net/NETCOMMUNITY/Page.aspx?pid=303&srcid=208>.

Annotation: This short Free the Slaves document contains a significant amount of information on the evolution of anti slavery organizations and conventions. The document is broken into four eras: 6800 B.C.-1800 A.D., 1800-1900, 1900-1950, and 1950 to the present. It includes information on organizations such as the International Labor Organization, the United Nations Working Group on Contemporary Forms of Slavery, and the League of Nations.

Free the Slaves. 2007. "Slavery in the 21st Century: Part1."

<http://216.235.201.228/NETCOMMUNITY/Document.Doc?id=1>.

Annotation: This short informative article gives a very good overview of slavery today. It combines statistics with general information to show where, and to what extent, slavery exists. It gives various forms of contemporary slavery, as well as the reasons why people become victims. Finally, it goes over international attempts at defining and combating modern slavery.

Free the Slaves. 2007. "Top 10 Facts About Modern Slavery."

<http://216.235.201.228/NETCOMMUNITY/Document.Doc?id=34>.

Annotation: This document is a good starting point for understanding contemporary slavery. It includes various forms that contemporary slavery takes, as well as facts and figures. Although short, the document is succinct, and the website contains other important information on slavery around the globe.

Gunderson, Gerald.1974. "The Origin of the American Civil War." *Journal of Economic History* 34 (4)(December): 915.

Annotation: This lengthy economic article examines slavery's role in the history of the American Civil War. It has good information on the profitability of slavery, as well as dollar values for slavery in the economy of the Antebellum South. The author uses these values to show the vested interests that slave traders had in continuing the practice.

Hansen, Brian. 2001. "Children in Crisis." *The CQ Researcher* 11(29)(August 31):659.

Annotation: This article highlights the growing problem of child exploitation. Although it does not focus solely on slavery, it gives a variety of statistics on slavery and slave like practices. These

practices include forced prostitution, child soldiers, and trafficking. It also looks at the crucial role poverty plays, and what nations are currently doing to combat these problems.

Hochschild, Adam. 2005. Bury The Chains. New York City: Houghton Mifflin.

Annotation: This book is an emotionally charged narrative of the abolition movement in England. It elaborates on such efforts as the sugar boycott. Figures, the treatment of slaves, as well as general attitudes are used to paint a vivid portrait of the world, and Britain in particular, during the height of the Trans-Atlantic slave trade. It has useful information on the Trans-Atlantic slave trade for comparison with modern slavery.

International Labor Conference. 2001. "Stopping Forced Labour."

http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.DOWNLOAD_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=1578.

Annotation: This report defines various forms of forced labor. It forms eight categories of forced labor, including slavery and abductions, compulsory participation in public works, forced labor in agriculture, domestic workers, bonded labor, forced labor imposed by the military, forced labor in the trafficking of persons, and some aspects of prison labor. Within each of these categories there are examples of countries or regions where the specific form is practiced.

International Labour Office. 2007. "A Global Alliance against Forced Labour."

<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/manila/downloads/flexsum.pdf>

Annotation: This short document from the International Labour Organization provides valuable information on forced labor around the world. It includes a definition of forced labor, along with regional and global statistics. It discusses the problem of state imposed forced labor in both Myanmar and China. It also links poverty in developing countries to forced labor. The article ends by outlining an action plan for a global alliance against forced labor.

Jones, Arthur. 2001. "Global Slave Trade Prospers." *National Catholic Reporter* (May 25):3-5.

Annotation: This article is a newspaper cover story that looks at modern age slavery as it pertains to the global sex trade. It uses specific stories of victims to give a human face to the problem of slavery. It has two different inserts, which give general definitions of new forms that slavery has taken in the modern era. Contact information for various organizations that are fighting global slavery is also given.

Kapstein, Ethan B. 2006. "The New Global Slave Trade." *Foreign Affairs* 85(6)(November-December): 103-115.

Annotation: This article focuses on the causes and manifestations of contemporary slavery. The article gives a good, general description of the ways in which people are coerced or tricked into slavery. The author also gives useful demographic statistics on the victims of slavery as well as an idea of the general economics of modern age slavery.

Kovasevic, Natasa. 2007. "Child Slavery." *Harvard International Review* 29(2): 36-39.

Annotation: This article focuses on child labor in general, and more specifically on child debt bondage in India. It provides statistics on global child labor, as well as the efforts launched by the International Labor Organization to combat it. The article ends by arguing that decent employment and alternatives need to be available in order to eradicate child labor.

Masci, David. 2004. "Slavery and Forced Labor." *CQ Researcher* 14 (12)(March 26): 290-291.

Annotation: This comprehensive article elucidates modern slavery's causes and its relations to past forms. It begins by showing the problem of modern slavery through stories of slaves. It discusses where slavery and human trafficking are occurring, and addresses the extent to which the problem exists in each country. It pays particular attention to the problem of child labor and the economic benefits of eliminating it. It also follows the history of slavery and traces the modern idea of abolishing the slave trade to the enlightenment thinkers. The article ends by looking specifically at the modern version of slavery, and at the influence that globalization has had on creating this version.

Matveeva, Tatiana. 2002. "Slavery in the 21st century." *International Affairs* 48(2): 102-112.

Annotation: The article begins with a discussion of historical definitions of slavery, and then proceeds toward its contemporary definition. However, it does not define contemporary slavery, opting instead to give examples of slave-like practices in the twenty-first century, with special attention paid to child slavery. Finally, it looks at the lack of laws available by which it may be possible to try slave holders and traders.

McMichael, Philip. 1991. "Slavery in Capitalism." *Theory and Society* 20(3)(June): 321-350.

Annotation: The main argument of this lengthy, economically-focused article is that slavery in the American South did not exist outside of capitalism. Slavery existed as a form of labor, alongside wage labor, in a new global capitalist system. It examines the rise of the cotton culture in the American South as a result of the use of slavery in a wage labor system. It also examines its eventual demise as a result of an industrialized demand for free labor.

Miers, Suzanne. 2003. Slavery in the Twentieth Century The Evolution of a Global Problem. Lanham: Alta Mira Press.

Annotation: This book gives a very detailed account of the efforts of the British Anti-Slavery Society in abolishing slavery. It begins with the abolition of slavery in Great Britain and follows the development of slavery in colonial Africa, as well as in other parts of the world such as Saudi Arabia and India. It shows the development of modern forms of slavery that fall under the category of forced labor. Next, attempts made by international organizations to halt these practices are discussed. The book also has a very useful chapter that defines modern forms of slavery.

Miller, John R. 2006. "Slave Trade." *Harvard International Review* 27 (4)(Winter): 70-73.

Annotation: The author looks at contemporary slavery through essentially the same lens as Kevin Bales, by examining underlying market factors for the global supply of slaves. Desperation is seen as a primary factor in leading people to be tricked or forced into slavery. He also examines the demand side of the equation by looking at people's desires for sex and by elucidating the ready supply of forced sex workers.

Musser, George. 2002. "The World of Slavery." *Scientific American* 286(4)(April): 84.

Annotation: This extremely short article looks at the uncertainty of slavery statistics used by slavery researchers. It accounts for the lack of reliability of these statistics by showing how some of them have been calculated. Finally, it provides a chart that shows which countries are involved in trafficking, as well as the estimated number of slaves in each individual country.

Quirk, Joel. 2006. "The Anti-Slavery Project: Linking the Historical and Contemporary." *Human Rights Quarterly* 28(3): 565-598.

Annotation: This article explores changing definitions of slavery over time. It examines how older definitions have helped shape modern definitions thereby providing a link between historical and contemporary slavery. This development is traced through various international organizational conferences on the subject. The article also focuses on, as the author sees it, a main limitation of emerging literature on contemporary slavery, which is "a recurrent tendency to downplay or disregard the historical dimensions of current problems, in favor of a problematic bifurcation between 'new' and 'old'."

U.S. Department of State. 2005. "The Facts about Human Trafficking for Forced Labor." (July 25). <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/fs/2005/50861.htm>.

Annotation: This short U.S. State Department document gives a brief, but informative description of human trafficking, modern forms of forced labor, and what the United States is

doing to combat the problem. The short definitions on bonded labor, involuntary servitude, domestic servitude, and child labor, are particularly useful. It ends with statistics on the problem, as well as with initiatives that the United States has implemented to combat the trade.

United Nations. 2007. "Fact Sheet no. 14, Contemporary Forms of Slavery."
<http://www.unhcr.ch/html/menu6/2/fs14.htm>.

Annotation: This short but extremely informative document provides a quick overview of debt bondage and other modern slave-like practices. However, its main focus is on the problem of child exploitation. It also provides information on international conventions aimed at enforcing the abolition of slavery. It provides a section at the end of the document that provides suggestions for individuals to get involved in ending slavery.

Van Den Anker, Christien. 2007. "Global Ethics and Contemporary Slavery." *Global Social Policy* 7(1)(April): 6-10.

Annotation: This short article looks at the root causes of modern slavery, in order to produce a coherent set of global ethics to help combat the problem. As the author sees it, poverty and gender inequality are two of the strongest factors that lead to slavery. Neo-liberal economic policy has blamed globalization as a root cause of today's immense poverty. From these roots, the author develops a set of policy initiatives to combat slavery.

Vink, Markus. 2003. "'World's Oldest Trade': Dutch Slavery and Slave Trade in the Indian Ocean in the 17th Century." *Journal of World History* 14(2): 131-177.

Annotation: This article discusses the sources, routes, and destinations of the victims of the Dutch slave trade during the seventeenth century. It is focused on the Indian Ocean and its contribution to the slave trade at this time. It provides information on the various forms of work that slaves were forced to do. However, as a general reference to older forms of slavery, the article is limited.

Zarempka, Joy. 2000. "Modern Slavery: Abuse of Domestic Workers." *Off Our Backs* 30 (7)(July):12.

Annotation: This article gives a description of the problem of slavery in the United States. Though the focus of the article is the United States, it also describes how many victims of slavery are held in servitude around the globe. It demonstrates how slave owners are implementing the use of contract slavery and force in order to strip the victims of rights, and to convince them that there is no way out of their predicament.

Forced Child Labor and Cocoa Production in West Africa

By Marjie Sackett

The cocoa industry has profited from the utilization of forced labor in West Africa since the late 1800s. Despite the Portuguese decree in 1876 abolishing slavery, and the release of cocoa plantation slaves, slave labor was quickly reemployed, aided by the exploitation of legal loopholes and government officials willing to turn a blind eye. In 1905, after hearing reports of unfavorable labor conditions, William Cadbury dispatched a member of the Anti-Slavery Society to investigate the cocoa plantations. Upon receiving confirmation of human rights violations, Cadbury boycotted Portuguese cocoa and persuaded two other chocolate firms to do the same. Cadbury's actions affected not only the British chocolate markets, but also American ones, which eventually stopped using slave-produced cocoa.

The cocoa sector has since grown into a multi-billion dollar industry, yet it cannot shake its unsavory labor issues. Present day cocoa farms "employ" hundreds of thousands of West African children. While not as clear cut as the slave/slave-owner relationship of previous centuries, contemporary slavery is characterized as the control of a person for economic exploitation by violence (or the threat of violence) or coercion (loss of choice and freedom). In poverty-stricken developing countries, it is seldom a child's choice to work, but rather a decision born out of economic necessity.

General Sources

Bales, Kevin. 2004. Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Annotation: Beginning with the story of a child who was enslaved in the 1990s, this book provides a thorough introduction to the topic of contemporary slavery. The author, Kevin Bales, defines modern slavery as roughly the control of a person for economic gain. Bales goes on to estimate the number of slaves worldwide, and to examine factors like population growth and modernization as contributions to new slavery. In addition, the author sets old slavery against new in order to define the term further, describing different forms of slavery (chattel, debt bondage, and contract slavery), as well as false labor contracts. This book is very beneficial for understanding the debate on contemporary slavery.

Clarence-Smith, William Gervase. 1993. "Cocoa Plantations and Coerced Labor in the Gulf of Guinea, 1870-1914." In Breaking the Chains. Slavery, Bondage, and Emancipation in Modern Africa and Asia. Edited by M. A. Klein. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press.

Annotation: In this chapter, Clarence-Smith imparts useful information about the boom and bust of cocoa plantations in West Africa in the late nineteenth to early twentieth century. After discussing vital factors like technological advancements and market prices, the author introduces the major industry players of the time, the Portuguese, Spanish, and German, and describes their use of slave and coerced labor from an economic point of view. Despite the creation of

abolition laws, the use of slave labor continued on cocoa plantations until a change to forced labor occurred around 1910. The historical background found here is helpful for understanding the current situation in West Africa. Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Nigeria, 2000-Present
Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Nigeria account for over seventy percent of global cocoa production today; Côte d'Ivoire is the world's largest producer. Despite this huge market share, the majority of cocoa growers operate farms ranging in size from two to ten hectares. Small farms are often solely family-run, whereas farmers with larger holdings turn to family members, wage or contract laborers, or forced labor to meet production demands.

Extent of Forced Labor

Reliable figures concerning forced child labor on cocoa farms are notoriously hard to obtain. That stated, a 2002 International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA) study estimated that some 625,000 children were involved in at least one aspect of cocoa production in Côte d'Ivoire, and of those, 12,000 had no local family connection (IITA 2002: 13, 15). This appears to demonstrate that only a small percentage of children are forced laborers. However, the IITA results have been criticized due to questions regarding survey methodology and data. A more recent International Labor Organization (ILO) study challenges the IITA findings by suggesting that the number of non-family laborers is much higher than previously thought, with possibly a third of cocoa farms utilizing labor outside the family.

Labor Conditions & Treatment

While the number of forced child laborers may be disputed, children are undoubtedly involved in hazardous activities and subjected to mistreatment. Children typically perform the same arduous tasks and work the same hours as adults, but receive less pay. Tasks include transporting heavy loads, pesticide and fertilizer application, and the use of machetes. A 2005 survey found that 92 percent of children carried heavy loads (often causing open wounds), among them some as young as five years of age (USDOL 2006: 153). Other reports indicate instances of farmers withholding meals or physically abusing children for not meeting expectations or attempting to escape.

Lack of Education

In addition to the physical ramifications, child labor has also been shown to hamper educational achievement. A recent study of children ages nine to eighteen in Ghana found that labor not only keeps children from attending school, but also hinders the learning ability of attendees. Specifically, the survey indicated that child labor directly impacts math and reading achievement, which is likely a consequence of sheer exhaustion or distracted interests. This is especially problematic, as education is crucial if individuals are to improve their quality of lives.

Sources

Anti-Slavery Society. 2007. "Do Slaves Produce Your Favorite Chocolates?" Website: <http://www.anti-slaverysociety.addr.com/chocolates1.htm>.

Annotation: This section of the Anti-Slavery Society website provides a brief overview of the issue of child labor on West African cocoa plantations. Highlighting the need for a "slave free" cocoa labeling system, the Society emphasizes the role that the consumer can play in the fight against contemporary slavery. Valuable links to other websites with consumer consumption awareness campaigns can also be found here.

Heady, Christopher. 2003. "The Effect of Child Labor on Learning Achievement." *World Development* 31(2):385.

Annotation: This technical paper examines the effect of child labor on learning achievement in children ages nine to eighteen in Ghana. As part of the 1988-89 Ghana Living Standards Survey (GLSS2), children in eighteen sampling clusters were asked to provide information about their economic and educational activities. After analyzing and describing the survey results in depth, author Christopher Heady concludes that child work in Ghana has a fairly small effect on school attendance, but that work outside the home makes a significant impact on math and reading achievement. He believes that this direct link between child labor and learning achievement may be attributed to sheer exhaustion or redirected interest.

International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA). 2002. "Child Labor in the Cocoa Sector of West Africa: A Synthesis of Findings in Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, and Nigeria." Croydon: International Institute of Tropical Agriculture. <http://www.globalexchange.org/campaigns/fairtrade/cocoa/resources.html>

Annotation: This study seeks to determine the extent and nature of child labor in cocoa production in West Africa. Specific objectives include: determining the number of children working in the cocoa industry, discovering their country of origin, how they were recruited, and if they attend school, examining working conditions, and finding out why children work in the cocoa industry. The report then outlines the investigation methods used and describes the limitations of the study. The authors conclude that only a small percentage of children could be considered forced labor, as farmers rarely employ children from outside of their families. A helpful glossary of terms used in the study is included at the end.

International Labour Organization. 2003. "Ghana Child Labour Survey." Geneva: International Labour Office. <http://www.ilo.org/ippecinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=690>

Annotation: Undertaken by the Ghana Statistical Service in 2001, this nationwide survey collected information on children ages five to seventeen in 9,889 rural and urban households. The study's objective was to obtain data on children's activities in order to determine the nature

of and reasons for child labor. Results showed that half of rural children and approximately one fifth of urban children were economically active. Poverty and low incomes are considered to be the primary causes of child labor in Ghana. The authors suggest that the survey findings can be used to raise awareness, to support campaigns against child labor, and to serve as a foundation for intervention programs.

International Labour Organization. 2006. "The End of Child Labour: Within Reach General Report under the follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work. In *International Labour Conference*." Geneva: International Labour Organization.
<http://www.ilo.org/ipecinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=2419>

Annotation: This lengthy report outlines the progress that has been made from 2002 to 2006 by the ILO and its partners in the fight against child labor worldwide. In great detail, the authors examine the causes and many forms of child labor, the policies and laws implemented, other actions undertaken, and the multitude of challenges ahead. They go on to discuss a strategy for future action, striving to abolish the worst kinds of child labor in the next decade. The data, charts, and other information found in this report are very useful. The overall tone is much more hopeful than that found in most NGO reports.

Kielland, Anne, and Maurizia Tovo. 2006. Children at Work: Child Labor Practices in Africa. Boulder: Lynne Rienner Publishers, Inc.

Annotation: In this book, authors Anne Kielland and Maurizia Tovo provide a thorough introduction to the issue of child labor in Africa. They begin by examining the various aspects of child labor and its possible causes. They also include a list of thirty-five things that can make child labor harmful. Kielland and Tovo next provide an overview of child labor in and around households, as apprenticeships, in the commercial labor market, and its worst forms. The authors then discuss the physiological, psychological, and educational consequences of child labor, and conclude by detailing some crucial strategies for ending its use.

Mull, L. Diane, and Steven R. Kirkhorn. 2005. "Child Labor in Ghana Cocoa Production: Focus upon Agricultural Tasks, Ergonomic Exposures, and Associated Injuries and Illnesses." *Public Health Reports* 120(6):649-656.

Annotation: The authors of this report, Mull and Kirkhorn, determined that children harvesting cocoa in western Ghana were oftentimes involved in hazardous activities such as strenuous labor, the use of sharp knives, and pesticide application. Supporting data were obtained through interviews with cocoa workers, who ranged in age from nine to seventeen, and through the observation of labor practices. Mull and Kirkhorn also found that children often receive no safety training or protective gear, which results in injury and sickness, including musculoskeletal disorders, sprains, strains, lacerations, fractures, eye injuries, rashes, and coughing. The authors conclude that unless changes are made to improve safety measures, long-term negative health effects are likely.

Onishi, Norimitsu. 2001. "The Bondage of Poverty That Produces Chocolate." *New York Times* 150 (51829):1.

Annotation: This article depicts the lives of Africans working in the cocoa industry in the village of Petit Tieme, Côte d'Ivoire. While few children under fifteen years of age were found, one cocoa farmer illustrated the propensity for child labor, saying that older workers are larger, less respectful, and more difficult to control. The author indicates that workers are not typically paid a set wage, but are paid based on the price of cocoa. In 2001, the price of cocoa was so low that farmers were pressed to have more family members work, or not pay their workers their due wages. This brief account highlights the difficult situation faced by both the cocoa farmers and laborers in West Africa.

Ould, David, Claire Jordan, Rebecca Reynolds, and Lacey Loftin. 2004. "The Cocoa Industry in West Africa: A History of Exploitation." London: Anti-Slavery International.
<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/PDFchildlabour.htm>

Annotation: This report gives an extensive overview of the history of the cocoa industry and the methods used in cocoa production in West Africa. The authors also discuss the global cocoa market at length, and provide detailed information on labor practices. The action taken over the last four years by cocoa manufacturers, governments, and NGOs is evaluated, and future steps to improve the industry are proposed. This report is a great source of information, providing a comprehensive account of forced child labor and cocoa production in West Africa.

U.S. Department of Labor. 2006. "The Department of Labor's 2006 Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor." U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of International Labor Affairs (ILAB).
<http://www.dol.gov/ilab/>

Annotation: This exhaustive report, covering the period from March 2006 to February 2007 and filling some seven hundred pages, thoroughly details the state of child labor around the world. Profiling 122 independent countries and nineteen non-independent countries, this report outlines key data on child labor and education in each country. The nature of child labor, pertinent laws and their enforcement, and programs and policies related to exploitive child labor are also examined in depth. A glossary of terms, as well as a list of data sources and definitions is included.

Complex Causation Factors

The causes of forced child labor in the cocoa industry are far from straightforward. An amalgamation of factors such as low cocoa market prices, the labor-intensive nature of cocoa farming, and cultural views contribute to the widespread use of child labor.

Economy & Cocoa Market

World Bank and IMF structural adjustment programs (SAP) instituted in the 1990s required the privatization of cocoa boards in exchange for debt forgiveness. Previously, governments regulated the market, guaranteeing farmers a minimum price regardless of the true market price. Following the new policy implementation, market prices fell. Unprepared and receiving no instruction on the new market workings, the price drop had a detrimental effect on farmers. Each country's economy was also negatively affected due to its lack of diversification. For example, cocoa represents approximately 40 percent of Côte d'Ivoire's GDP and 60 percent of export revenues.

Agricultural Labor & Cocoa Farmers

Low market prices mean low returns for cocoa farmers. Only able to sell harvests once or twice a year, farmers obtain food and fertilizer on credit, reducing possible profits. Further cutting into proceeds, cocoa is produced with little machine use and requires a vast quantity of labor. In an effort to keep costs low, farmers seek the cheapest forms of labor.

Cultural Views

Not only West African farmers view child labor as culturally acceptable. In general, it is seen as a way for children to learn a skill, and to sustain a community's farming culture. Surveys taken in six Nigerian farming communities found that a common reason for raising children is to help the parents. While great emphasis is placed on the importance of training children to ensure a better future, it is generally accepted that labor should not rob children of the right to attend school, nor should it put them in danger.

Sources

Ajayi, A. O., and D. O. Torimiro. 2004. "Perspectives on Child Abuse and Labour: Global Ethical Ideals versus African Cultural Realities." *Early Child Development & Care* 174(2):183-191.

Annotation: This report is a crucial assessment of African and global views on the issues of child abuse and child labor. Authors, Ajayi and Torimiro, outline global views based on characterizations from the United Nation's Children Fund (UNICEF) and the International Labor Organization (ILO). African viewpoints are determined through focus group discussions set-up in six Nigerian farming communities. Ajayi and Torimiro find that global and African views correspond on three necessities: to protect children from physical and psychological injuries; to provide children basic needs; and to allow children to be educated. In addition, the authors make a significant point: what is abuse in one culture may not be considered abuse in another.

Ashiabi, Godwin S. 2000. "Some Correlates of Childhood Poverty in Ghana." *Journal of Children & Poverty* 6(2):155-168.

Annotation: The author of this paper, Godwin Ashiabi, investigates the severe poverty in Ghana as it relates to children's schooling, nutrition, health, and general development. The author addresses details such as causation factors, measures, characteristics, and the geographical variations of poverty. Ashiabi goes on to submit that in addition to the long-term negative health effects in the form of malnutrition, poverty affects decisions relating to children's schooling and employment. Calling for governmental measures to reduce and eliminate poverty, the author notes that efforts should be directed primarily at food security.

Canagarajah, Sudharshan, and Helena Skyt Nielsen. 2001. "Child Labor in Africa: A Comparative Study." *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 575:71-91.

Annotation: In this article, Canagarajah and Nielsen investigate child labor in Ghana, Zambia, and Côte d'Ivoire. Basing their work on data from five studies conducted in the three countries, the authors analyze the causes of the high percentage of child laborers in Africa. The article outlines five main hypotheses used to explain the use of child labor: poverty, school costs, quality of schooling, household composition, and capital markets. The authors conclude that each factor, in varying degrees, plays a role in child labor. They propose that better access to credit, gradual policy change promoting education and work would help to decrease the number of child laborers. This is a valuable source in the sense that it breaks down the issue of child labor into a number of factors, and critiques them separately as well as in combination with one another.

Chant, Sylvia, and Gareth Jones. 2005. "Youth, Gender and Livelihoods in West Africa: Perspectives from Ghana and the Gambia." *Children's Geographies* 3(2):185-199.

Annotation: The interconnections between youth, gender, and livelihoods are examined in this paper. Authors Chant and Jones describe fieldwork conducted in Ghana and Gambia in 2003 that was aimed at investigating child labor and education policy. The authors found that the youth face conflicting incentives regarding education and work, because schooling often requires work, and labor markets are not accessed via education. As a result, few youth see a connection between education and income. Chant and Jones argue that despite important policy changes over the last twenty years, such changes have not had substantial effects on poverty. The authors propose that policy could be enhanced by taking local perceptions of the situation into consideration.

International Labour Organization. 2006. "Tackling Hazardous Child Labor in Agriculture: Guidance on Policy and Practice. User Guide." Turin: International Training Centre of the ILO. <http://www.ilo.org/ipeinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=2799>.

Annotation: This three hundred-page document consists of five guidebooks on child labor in the agricultural sector. It is an amazing resource on the subject, including significant information on West Africa's cocoa industry. The first guidebook includes important definitions and supplies an overview of the main international child labor conventions. The second guidebook presents numerous aspects of child labor and analyzes the forces affecting the use of child workers. Guidebook Three examines hazardous child labor in depth. A review of recent initiatives to end child labor is included in guidebook four. Lastly, Guidebook Five provides information to develop and implement policies and programs to eliminate hazardous child labor in agriculture.

Manzo, Kate. 2005. "Modern Slavery, Global Capitalism & Deproletarianisation in West Africa." *Review of African Political Economy* 32(106):521-534.

Annotation: Partially based on the work of Kevin Bales, this paper's author, Kate Manzo, examines the definition of modern slavery and distinguishes it from slavery in previous centuries. Focusing on child slavery on cocoa farms in Côte d'Ivoire, the author analyzes complicated factors that breed agricultural enslavement today, such as commodity production, labor costs, unequal terms of trade, and capitalist expansion. Straying from a more traditional argument, Manzo puts forth a Marxian, or neo-Marxian explanation, concentrating on the relationship between global capitalism and slavery. This paper makes a sound argument through methodical assessment of the various economic forces affecting the cocoa industry.

Omokhodion, F. O., S. I. Omokhodion, and T. O. Odusote. 2006. "Perceptions of Child Labour Among Working Children in Ibadan, Nigeria." *Child: Care, Health & Development* 32(3):281-286.

Annotation: The aim of this study is to determine the perspective of working children on child labor, including both perceived benefits and disadvantages. In order to achieve this, the authors conducted a cross-sectional survey of working children in southwest Nigeria. According to the results, the belief that child labor is a sign of deprivation was more common among child laborers who had only attended school through the primary level, children who had worked in excess of six months, and those who earned small sums. Concluding, the authors submit that in spite of harsh economic circumstances, schooling should be still a top priority.

Sheth, Anita. 2003. "Children Still in the Chocolate Trade: The Buying, Selling and Toiling of West African Child Workers in the Multi-Billion Dollar Industry." In *A Working Paper Series: Children in Global Trade*. Toronto: Save the Children Canada. <http://www.savethechildren.ca/canada/media/publications/cocoa2003.pdf>.

Annotation: This paper provides an in-depth investigation into the cocoa industry in Côte d'Ivoire. The author, Anita Sheth, begins by discussing the economy of Côte d'Ivoire, as well as

changes in the country's cocoa market and its effects on cocoa prices. Sheth next addresses the issue of child labor in cocoa production and examines possible causation factors. A lengthy evaluation of the success and failure of the Harkin-Engel Protocol is also included. The author then proposes a system for monitoring child labor on cocoa farms and suggests other key steps to be undertaken by international governments and financial institutions.

Tiffen, Pauline. 2002. "A Chocolate-Coated Case for Alternative International Business Models." *Development in Practice* 12(3/4):383-397.

Annotation: While not considered directly accountable for the impact of their commodity purchases on farms in the developing world, the author of this paper argues that the large chocolate companies and small-scale cocoa farmers of West Africa are "irrevocably, if unaccountably" linked. As a result of this link, the author recommends that large companies make changes to minimize devastating effects like persistent rural poverty and economic devaluation of small-scale farms. The author goes on to analyze the commercial chain developed over the last decade (1992-2002), reviews Kuapa Kokoo, the cocoa farmers' organization and trading company that was set-up in 1993, and describes the Day Chocolate Company, an international chocolate company with a farmer-oriented voice, founded in 1998.

Woods, Dwayne. 2004. "Predatory Elites, Rents and Cocoa: A Comparative Analysis of Ghana and Ivory Coast." *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics* 42(2):224-241.

Annotation: The author of this article, Dwayne Woods, examines how the cocoa sector shaped the behavior of state and cocoa farmers in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire. Woods argues that in each country, political and economic gain and crisis closely followed the cocoa industry's pattern of growth and decline. For example, growth in the cocoa sector resulted in single-party regimes, industrialization, increased rural education, and income diversification efforts by farmers. During periods of decline, land and labor disputes contributed to increased political and social tensions between classes, ethnic groups and regions. Woods asserts that this parallel is a result of the cocoa industry's dominance in each country.

Action to Reduce the Worst Forms of Child Labor

Nearly one hundred years after Cadbury's boycott, media reports again surfaced about cocoa industry labor practices. In 2000, the BBC aired a documentary uncovering the plight of children working on West African cocoa farms. This triggered a wave of international media coverage, and ignited public outrage. Ensuing efforts by governments, cocoa manufacturers, and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have ranged from improving working conditions and education for children to eliminating child labor.

U.S. Government and Governmental Organizations

Signed on September 19, 2001, the Harkin-Engel Protocol, also known as the Cocoa Protocol, proposed guidelines for producing cocoa in adherence with ILO Convention 182, which calls for the eradication of the worst forms of child labor. The Protocol included a six-step action plan for cocoa manufacturers to complete by July 2005. While supported by various governments, manufacturers, and human rights organizations, the Protocol is not legally binding.

Major programs have been undertaken by the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) and by the U.S. Department of Labor (USDOL). USAID started the Child Labor Regional Project in 2002 as part of the Sustainable Tree Crop Program. Their aim was to raise social and economic standards through agricultural and child labor training programs. To achieve this, Farmer Field Schools were set up in Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Nigeria, and Cameroon. The labor training focused on changing local perceptions regarding production tasks that are considered to be the worst forms of child labor.

Aspiring to gradually end hazardous child labor, the West African Cocoa/Commercial Agriculture Program was run by the USDOL and the ILO from 2003 to 2006. Accomplishments included the installation of the Child Labor Monitoring System in five countries, and the removal of several thousand children at risk of child labor or engaged in child labor. The lack of continued financial support, however, has raised concerns about the fate of the children rescued.

Non-Governmental Organizations

Many NGOs like Anti-Slavery International and Free the Slaves have worked to raise awareness about forced child labor in the cocoa industry. In addition, they are developing research and advocacy tools, and are lobbying governments and governmental agencies, to make child labor issues a priority. NGOs have also taken action through legal channels. In 2004, The International Labor Rights Fund, along with Global Exchange, pursued legal action in the International Trade Court. The suit sought the enforcement of customs rules, which prohibit the importation of goods produced by forced child labor. Industry members, however, moved to block the suit against the Customs Service, and the case was dismissed.

Cocoa Industry Members, Foundations, and Organizations

The International Cocoa Initiative (ICI) is a joint foundation established as step five of the Cocoa Protocol. Characteristic of many industry tactics, the ICI has taken a “bottom-up” approach by educating, motivating, and supporting communities to be proactive in solving *their* child labor problem. The industry also formed the Verification Working Group as the final step outlined in the Protocol. The Group’s aim is to establish a verification system that ensures that cocoa is grown without the use of forced labor. Despite repeated assurances, the industry failed to implement the system by the July 2005 deadline, and instead negotiated new parameters with a deadline of July 2008.

Another industry focus has been education. Established in 2005 by a number of cocoa companies and associations, the Initiative for African Cocoa Communities (IACC) has funded a handful of education programs. Among them: 1) the Winrock CLASSE program in Côte d'Ivoire; 2) a UNICEF and National Confectioners Association supported program, providing afternoon schooling in several communities in Ghana; and 3) a primary and secondary teacher training program in Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana.

West African Governments

The four main cocoa producing countries have undertaken measures to deal with the child labor issue to varying degrees. Working with NGOs and cocoa foundations, action has ranged from improving child education to sustainable crop management. In addition, Côte d'Ivoire and Ghana have instituted laws regarding forced and exploitative labor, mandatory education, and legal minimum working age; however, these laws remain largely unenforced, especially in rural areas. Cameroon and Nigeria also have forced labor and minimum working age laws, but again, such laws are infrequently enforced.

Sources

Aaronson, Susan Ariel. 2007. "Globalization and Child Labor: The Cause Can Also Be a Cure." *YaleGlobal Online* <http://yaleglobal.yale.edu/display.article?id=8907>.

Annotation: This brief article details the events leading up to the signing of the Cocoa Protocol in 2001. The author, Susan Aaronson, cites globalization as a cause of forced labor, and believes that global pressure can also be used to end this exploitation. Aaronson argues that five years after the signing of the Protocol, the problem of forced child labor in the cocoa industry is still widespread, and as a result, a new multi-sector strategy must be developed.

Anti-Slavery International. 2007. "Child Labour." Website: <http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/antislavery/childlabour.htm>.

Annotation: A major player in the fight against contemporary slavery, Anti-Slavery International's website provides a wealth of information on the topic of modern slavery, and more specifically, forced child labor. This section contains background information regarding the nature and causes of child labor, as well as case studies and a number of detailed reports on issues ranging from the cocoa industry in West Africa to camel jockeys in the United Arab Emirates.

Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor. 2007. "2006 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices." Washington, D.C.: U.S. Department of State.

Cameroon - <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78723.htm>

Côte d'Ivoire - <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78730.htm>

Ghana - <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78737.htm>

Nigeria - <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78751.htm>

Annotation: Compiled by U.S. embassies, the Country Reports on Human Rights Practices depict the adherence of foreign governments to internationally recognized human rights. Pertinent to the issue of child labor, the Country Reports cover individual, civil, political, and worker rights as outlined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. In addition to numerous other issues, these reports evaluate the occurrence of forced or compulsory labor, child labor practices, the minimum age for employment of children, and acceptable work conditions.

Cullen, Holly. 1999. "The Limits of International Trade Mechanisms in Enforcing Human Rights: The Case of Child Labour." *International Journal of Children's Rights* 7(1):1-29.

Annotation: This paper by Holly Cullen examines the issue of child labor and the reasons it is considered a human rights issue today. The author goes on to evaluate several unilateral and regional international trade mechanisms that are used to promote the elimination of child labor, highlighting their legal limitations, effectiveness, and possible incompatibility with the General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade (GATT). Cullen additionally seeks to determine whether trade sanctions should be used in the fight against child labor. The author concludes that trade sanctions alone cannot combat the causes of child labor, but they can be more effective when used as part of a larger strategy.

Free the Slaves. 2007. Website: <http://www.freetheslaves.net>.

Annotation: This website is an indispensable resource on the topic of contemporary slavery. An immense amount of information is contained here, including historical information, issues related to the numerous forms of contemporary slavery, the regions affected, success stories, and a multi-sector action plan for ending slavery in the next twenty-five years. The research and publications section of the site is especially useful.

Global Exchange. 2007. Fair Trade Cocoa Campaign. Website:
<http://www.globalexchange.org/campaigns/fairtrade/cocoa/>.

Annotation: Global Exchange is an international NGO that is working to promote social, economic, and environmental justice. This section of the NGO's website provides detailed background information on child labor in the West African cocoa industry. After discussing the causes of child labor, the authors offer solutions such as the purchase of fair trade cocoa and the implementation of an international monitoring and certification system. Once established, this system would work to guarantee a minimum price for cocoa, and would also end the use of abusive child labor. An extensive list of cocoa and child labor related resources, suggested actions for consumers, and news updates are also found here.

Harkin, Senator Tom (D-IA), and Representative Elliot Engel (D-NY). 2001. "Harkin-Engel Protocol."
<http://www.cocoainitiative.org/images/stories/pdf/harkin%20engel%20protocol.pdf>.

Annotation: This important document from 2001, also known as the Cocoa Protocol, proposes guidelines for growing and processing cocoa in order to adhere to the International Labor Organization Convention 182, which calls for the elimination of the worst forms of child labor. A key action plan, comprised of six essential steps, is outlined in detail. The six steps are: 1) industry acknowledgement of the problem and a plan to address it; 2) formation of an advisory group for continued labor practice investigation; 3) a signed joint statement on child labor; 4) a binding memorandum of cooperation by major stakeholders; 5) the establishment of an international foundation by May 1, 2002 to be financed primarily by the cocoa industry; and 6) the design and implementation of a certification process by July 1, 2005 that would guarantee that cocoa is not grown using the worst forms of child labor.

Hawksley, Humphrey. 2007. "Child Cocoa Workers Still 'Exploited.'" *BBC NEWS* (April 2)
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/africa/6517695.stm>.

Annotation: The author of this short article harshly criticizes chocolate manufacturers for the dismal progress made in reducing forced child labor since the 2001 Cocoa Protocol. A mud hut school built in the village of Petit Yammousoukro in Côte d'Ivoire serves as a model project under the Cocoa Protocol, but unfortunately, it is only one of six (out of forty slated for the area) built in the five years since the signing of the Protocol. Local project managers cite lack of funding, training, and general support from cocoa manufacturers and their foundations as reasons for this shortcoming. This article paints a simplified black and white picture of the issue, omitting a multitude of complex factors.

International Cocoa Initiative. 2007. Website: <http://www.cocoainitiative.org/>.

Annotation: The International Cocoa Initiative (ICI) is an international non-profit entity that was established in 2002 as required by the Harkin-Engel Protocol. The ICI is partnered with

NGOs, trade unions, and the chocolate industry, and is funded by cocoa industry members. Their approach to eliminating the worst forms of child labor is to support programs developed and run at the community level. The ICI's website provides a brief history on forced and child labor in the cocoa industry, links to child labor statistics, and information on cocoa growing and processing. Current ICI programs in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire are outlined here.

International Labor Rights Forum. 2005. "May 2005 Report: Child Labor in Agriculture: Focus on Child Labor on Cocoa Farms in West Africa and the Chocolate Industry's Initiative to Date." Washington, D.C.: International Labor Rights Forum.

http://www.ilrf.org/projects/childlab/cocoa_childlabor_update_May05.pdf.

Annotation: This five-page report summarizes actions by the cocoa industry, as well as those of non-industry parties, from the 2001 Harkin-Engel Protocol signing to May 2005. Portraying cocoa corporations in a poor light, the authors note that when the July 2005 deadline was looming, the industry was far from reaching its goal of guaranteeing that forced child labor would not be used to produce cocoa. Briefly highlighting several causes of child labor in West Africa, the International Labor Rights Forum (ILRF) goes on to provide an overview of approaches initiated by various governmental and non-governmental organizations.

International Labor Rights Forum. 2006. "Report on Cocoa and Forced Child Labor." Washington, D.C.: International Labor Rights Forum.

<http://www.ilrf.org/projects/childlab/CocoaProtocolUpdate101906.pdf>.

Annotation: The authors of this report thoroughly critique the 2001 Cocoa Protocol, its policies, and industry members' adherence (or lack thereof) to those policies. The report is an assessment of the success and failure in implementation of the six steps outlined in the Protocol. Other important initiatives, like the Sustainable Tree Crop Program and the West African Cocoa and Commercial Agricultural Project, are also evaluated. The authors go on to discuss important issues yet to be addressed by the industry, and recommend numerous future steps to be taken, such as greater commitment to fair trade cocoa and the re-establishment of the International Cocoa Agreement. Although mostly an unfavorable review of cocoa industry members, this report is a valuable assessment of the work done in West Africa since 2001.

International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC). 2007. Website:

<http://www.ilo.org/ipec/index.htm>.

Annotation: This site is an invaluable resource for program reports, research data, and other publications related to child labor in the West African cocoa industry. The goal of the ILO's International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) is the gradual eradication of child labor. To achieve this, IPEC works to strengthen the capacity of countries, in order to deal with the issue and to promote a worldwide movement to fight child labor. IPEC has a number of programs operating in Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana and Nigeria, both independently and in cooperation with other governmental agencies and international NGOs.

Liepziger, Deborah. 2006. "Raw Materials, Raw Issues and Progress." *Ethical Corporation* (July). <http://www.ethicalcorp.com/content.asp?ContentID=4370>

Annotation: Corporate social responsibility in the cocoa industry is highlighted and commended in this brief article. The author describes the work of the International Cocoa Initiative (ICI) and its partners, major chocolate companies, governmental organizations, and NGOs, since the ICI's mandated formation in 2002. This article portrays the ICI approach on national, local, and community levels in Ghana and Côte d'Ivoire, the major obstacles faced, and its bold strategy to expand programs into more West African countries. While details of the pilot programs outlined in this article are of use, it is important to note that the author is a consultant to the ICI.

Samin, Zam R. 2007. "Ghana: NGO Poised to Sensitise Cocoa Farmers on Child Labour." *Ghanaian Chronicle* (May 8).

Annotation: In this short newspaper article, the author describes a project currently conducted by the International Cocoa Initiative (ICI) Foundation in Ghana to educate cocoa growing communities about child labor. The premise of the program is to aid community members in understanding of why child labor needs to be reduced, and to introduce infrastructure projects to improve social and economic conditions. Illustrating the long road ahead, the local program manager makes the most telling statement, saying that after attending the weeklong workshop, many community members did not see the drawbacks of putting their children to work. This article provides a valuable insider's view of child labor in Ghana.

Tiaji Salaam-Blyther, Charles Hanrahan, Nicolas Cook. 2005. "Child Labor in West African Cocoa Production: Issues and U.S. Policy." Washington D.C.: Congressional Research Service, Library of Congress. <http://digital.library.unt.edu/govdocs/crs/permalink/meta-crs-9107>

Annotation: The authors of this report describe the nature of cocoa production and examine the use of child labor in the cocoa industry. Steps by Congress, including the Harkin-Engel Protocol to curb exploitative child labor, are outlined in detail. In addition, an assessment of current programs run by the International Labor Organization (ILO) in conjunction with U.S. support, such as the Sustainable Tree Crops Program (STCP) and the West African Cocoa/Commercial Agriculture Program (WACAP), is given. The authors also go on to identify possible policy options such as trade agreements or enhancements of the Harkin-Engel Protocol that could be implemented.

World Cocoa Foundation. 2007. Website: <http://www.worldcocoafoundation.org/default.asp>.

Annotation: The World Cocoa Foundation (WCF) is a non-profit organization that was formed in 2000, which primarily addresses child labor and sustainable farming issues. The majority of its members are cocoa manufacturers and cocoa industry associations. Similar to other cocoa

organizations, the WCF subscribes to a bottom-up approach, believing that local community participation is essential to improve conditions. The site outlines the Foundation's principles, in addition to providing information on responsible growing and on the international cocoa market. Progress reports on the Sustainable Tree Crops Program in Cameroon, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Liberia, and Nigeria are also included. Additionally, links to the Field Farmer Schools, Winrock CLASSE program, and other projects in West Africa are provided.

Conclusion

There is no quick fix for the problem of forced child labor in West Africa. Since 2001, significant progress has been made, but the complexity of the issue requires continued commitment from all parties. In particular, corporations making billions of dollars from the hazardous work of children have an obligation to play a more substantial role and make a larger financial commitment. Additionally, NGOs have recommended a number of steps that should be followed, including: greater supply chain transparency, the guaranteed purchase of a set percentage of fair trade cocoa, the implementation of the Cocoa Protocol verification system, the development of cooperatives to increase cocoa growers bargaining power, and enhanced educational opportunities for rural West African children.

Forced Child Labor in El Salvador: Contemporary Economic Servitude

By Michelle Doherty

In 2005, over half of the rural population in El Salvador was living on less than U.S. \$2 dollars per day (Programa de las Naciones Unidas para el Desarrollo 2003: 42). The harsh reality of economic subsistence obligates children in El Salvador to contribute to their family's survival. Employers providing this frail economic lifeline inevitably acquire control over the children. This economic control is a prominent aspect of contemporary slavery and is manifested through violence or exploitation. The enslavement of children in El Salvador not only steals their youth and opportunity to receive an education, but it also places innocent beings into a dangerous work force.

This essay addresses the problem of forced child laborers in El Salvador, along with the government's failed enforcement of legislation, and binding international laws. Solutions to the complex problem of contemporary economic enslavement in El Salvador call for a broad-based collaborative effort linking legal structures to educational advancement.

The Worst Forms of Child Labor in El Salvador

The enslavement of youth is an all too common attribute of the informal employment sector, where some of the worst forms of child labor are encountered. These seldom regulated industries employ a disproportionately high percentage of children. In El Salvador, the agricultural sector is responsible for fifty-one percent of all forced child labor. According to the U.S. Department of Labor, the second most prominent employer of marginalized, underage youth is the service industry at 35 percent.

The Agricultural Industry

In El Salvador, children's forced agricultural work is commonly unacknowledged due to its interconnectedness with culture, tradition, and overall way of life. Many of the children who work alongside their family members are not paid; rather, they are seen as *ayudantes*, or "helpers."

Sugarcane harvesting is recognized as one of the worst forms of child labor under the Worst Forms of Child Labour [*sic*] Convention, held in 1999. This agricultural industry in El Salvador has a dominant presence of forced child laborers, particularly in the most dangerous part of the harvesting process known the *zafra*, or cutting. The underage *zafra* workers are often given food rather than monetary compensation for their time. Within the rural population, females, impoverished children, and young adults have the highest risk by participating in this hazardous agricultural practice.

Failure to understand risks, immaturity, and a lack of experience are common causes of emotional, mental, and physical harm among child laborers. Aggravated health issues in sugarcane production involve skin exposure to irritants, headaches, respiratory problems, physical overextension, and lacerations with sharp tools. Many of the youth economically enslaved in the *zafra* are not listed as employees, and consequentially they are not eligible for medical aide if injured.

The Service Industry

The domestic sector in El Salvador is guilty of enslaving children within the service industry. Children are specifically at risk of isolation and a power imbalance, both of which can result in psychological and physical abuse. Forced confinement and familial economic pressures inhibit the report of abuses to peers or family members. Females are most at risk, as they comprise ninety-five percent of all forced child domestic workers in El Salvador. Forced domestic labor is considered to be one of the worst forms of child labor by the 1999 Convention, but El Salvador has decided to not consider it a priority, possibly due to difficulties in enforcement.

Connection between Education and Child Labor

The economically marginalized population is in a position of contemporary servitude that incites undesirable and disheartening consequences. One of these includes placing a child in the work force rather than in school. In El Salvador, although legally compulsory, primary education is not accessible, affordable, or even feasible for many families, particularly in the rural area.

Child labor studies, when compared with school enrollment rates, demonstrate that many Salvadorian children attempt to manage a low paying job while attending elementary school. Child agricultural workers miss an incredible number of school days during the harvest season. Due to physical exhaustion or time constraints, children often decide to stop attending class altogether. Not surprisingly, the average education level reached by the Salvadorian population is only the fifth grade.

In rural Salvadorian regions where forced child labor is prevalent, poor educational institutions are commonplace and do not necessarily facilitate actual education. Even if a family can make the economic sacrifice to send their children to school, this decision weighs heavily on the quality of education to be provided. If certain standards are not reached, “from the perspective of impoverished parents, sending children to school is seen as nothing but a waste of time and money” (Arat 2002: 188).

Legal Framework

Aside from passing legislation, the government of El Salvador has historically demonstrated little, if any, genuine interest in eradicating forced child labor. The labor codes in El Salvador are mostly in agreement with the Minimum Age Convention of 1973, which was ratified in 1996. This Convention permits flexibility regarding minimum age restrictions for work in countries like El Salvador, which has not sufficiently developed its economy or educational facilities. This flexibility is seen as an opportunity for complacency in enforcement.

One of the government’s most recent aspirations has been to eradicate hazardous contemporary slavery by the year 2015. This decision followed the ratification in 2000 of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, which was established in 1999. El Salvador is now responsible for eliminating all forms of hazardous child labor which are considered harmful to adolescent health and physical development or as intrusive to children’s education. In this Convention, each state has the discretion

to define the parameters of hazardous child labor. El Salvador considers the following as hazardous labor for children: commercial sex work, work in garbage dumps, fishing/shellfish harvesting, sugarcane farming, and firework production.

El Salvador's proposal includes policy interventions that are conducive to the eradication of child labor in combination with community-based service activities. The national plan for implementation focuses on the legal framework, institutions, educational intervention, health care, recreational and cultural activities, income generation, and communication-awareness campaigning.

Difficulties with Enforcement

A poor infrastructure and dire economic conditions are the excuses most prevalently used by the state for its apparent failure to respond to issues of child labor. Other challenges include the illusiveness of the informal economy where the majority of child laborers are forced to work. The repressed voice of children and their "patrimonial invisibility" pushes them out of the legal realm of prosecution (Brysk 2005).

Multi-national corporations are also culprits, undermining adherence to child labor regulations in El Salvador. The overwhelming favoritism and blind support provided to these wealthy foreign investors creates a highly unregulated informal economy. These work "opportunities" perpetuate forced child labor. Financial oppressors have more than sufficient power and money to pressure El Salvador to enforce national and international laws concerning child labor. The more important question is: if they have the capacity to indirectly force the government to be respectful of children, what holds them back?

Proposed Solutions

Education and economics are two themes that continuously reappear within different sustainable solutions. These proposals create an environment in which the eradication of contemporary enslavement of children becomes a possibility. El Salvador's plans for socio-economic development must integrate educational opportunities, broad based community participation, and positive policy improvements with guarantees of enforcement. All constituents must take part in the solution, cooperation, and progress among governments, employers, and workers who provide valuable attributes necessary for the elimination of forced child labor.

Rapid economic growth is a poverty reduction method which concomitantly reduces the prevalence of forced child labor. The relevant factors for change, like urbanization and the importance of agriculture, are of deep concern. These "improvements" tend to incite migration toward an urban center and redirect cultural focus away from traditional agricultural products in order to create a larger income. The core issues of forced child labor are not addressed by this method.

Flexible or transitional schooling is a possible alternative for children forced to work for survival. Unfortunately, this program requires a substantial monetary investment and integration into the national school system. This option is claimed to be out of the realm of economic possibilities.

Conditional Cash Transfers (CCTs) are a specific solution used to address the root of poverty in order to eliminate child labor and to encourage the enrollment of children in educational facilities. The allure of child servitude is reduced through monetary incentives that are directly related to a child's attendance and performance in school. Forced child labor is reduced, and a child's education is advanced through this program. However, this proposal is vulnerable to critiques about its high economic commitment, extended duration of the project, and the actual quality of education.

Conclusion

El Salvador's system of economic servitude is cyclical: "child labor is both a cause and a symptom of poverty" (UNESCO 2004: 10). This contemporary enslavement and its restrictions on children's health, education, and development in El Salvador are examples of the ways in which the governing system's failures perpetuate violations against children. Whether utilizing direct or indirect intervention, a broad-based collaborative effort by the international community is in order. Salvadorian children have the right to not work in hazardous environments. They also have the right to an education and to a healthy physical development. We have a legal and moral commitment to empower children's desperate demands for justice.

Selected Bibliography

Child Labor and Poverty

Arat, Zehra F. 2002. "Analyzing Child Labor as a Human Rights Issue: Its Causes, Aggravating Policies, and Alternative Proposals." *Human Rights Quarterly* 24 (1):177.

Annotation: What are the root causes of child labor? This article successfully examines this implicitly complicated global issue from a passionate, yet realistic point of view. The author begins by describing diverse economic and moral concerns of child labor critics. A more prominent apprehension expresses that child labor perpetuates poverty by depriving children of an education and a healthy physical development. The author strongly critiques simplistic efforts towards the eradication of child labor and supports the argument through an investigation of the realm of actors that are involved in perpetuating child labor at the global scale.

Bales, Kevin. 2000. Disposable People. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Annotation: Slavery, whether new or old, is intertwined into the international economy and thus thrust into the lives of the globe's population. This book does a wonderful job explaining the reality and context of contemporary slavery. The underlying theme around this exploitation is economics. Due to the cheapness of today's slave labor, people have become disposable. The book uses case studies from distinct continents in order to explain modern slavery, and it concludes with valuable suggestions for what can be done to end this perpetual exploitation of human beings.

_____. 2007. *Ending Slavery: How We Free Today's Slaves*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Annotation: This book gives a brief description of the history of slavery and then leads into a discussion about contemporary issues. This “how-to” guide gives useful advocacy advice from an experienced perspective and includes distinct examples of instances in which slaves have been saved. Chapter eight discusses the importance of ending poverty in order to end slavery and determines that their relative successes are interrelated. The author emphasizes another relationship, that between economy and slavery, where the latter has an unexpectedly depressing monetary effect on any nation. The conclusion focuses on increasing awareness and the better utilization of resources, both of which are vital in the fight to eradicate slavery.

Cortes, Rosalia. 2007. “Remittances and Children’s Rights: An Overview of Academic and Policy Literature.”
http://www.unicef.org/policyanalysis/files/Remittances_And_Childrens_Rights.pdf.

Annotation: Can remittances reduce poverty and child labor? This working paper attempts to address the growing belief that remittances can contribute to progress in social development. The author is specifically concerned about the residual effects on children’s and women’s rights. Little data exists on the social impact of remittances, but anthropological case studies reveal a range of negative effects of migration. Remittance flows can increase income, but this pressures others to emigrate; as a result, children are left behind and in vulnerable positions where exploitation may increase without the presence of a parental guardian.

Global March Against Child Labour. 2005. “Worst Forms of Child Labour Data: El Salvador.”
<http://www.globalmarch.org/worstformsreport/world/el-salvador.html>.

Annotation: This brief statistical report provides important information regarding issues relevant to the worst forms of child labor. The simplistic statistical information offers documentation links for further investigation. An overview is presented that is specific to El Salvador, including all forms of child labor that are considered under the Convention of the Worst Forms of Child Labor. The data expresses the prevalence of child labor in multiple sectors of the informal economy. Related topics on child slavery, trafficking, and prostitution are also included. This document gives useful information, but primarily serves to direct the reader to specific sources for more detailed investigation.

Human Rights Watch. 2004. “Turning a Blind Eye: Hazardous Child Labor in El Salvador’s Sugarcane Cultivation.” 16 (2 (B)).

Annotation: This report begins by reviewing country-specific information with regard to sugarcane production. The author then assesses sugarcane’s relative importance to the local

economy in El Salvador, as well as typical illegal practices seen in the fields. The international laws prohibiting these incidents are mentioned, but more focus is directed towards the root causes of the presence of child labor in sugarcane fields, and to the direct consequences of these causes. The origins of child labor and the culprits that perpetuate it are described and critiqued in this report. This case study could be useful for a wider comparison between regions where child labor is a common occurrence or an economic necessity.

_____. 2006. "Swept Under the Rug: Abuses against Domestic Workers Around The World." 18 (7 (C)).

Annotation: This detailed report assesses international and national bodies concerning widespread criminal offenses committed against domestic workers. It also addresses possible methods that can be used to combat these abuses. Children often find themselves working as domestic laborers where, according to the International Labour Organization, some of the worst forms of child labor are encountered. The ramifications like denial of education and separation from family are described and are exemplified through country specific accounts. In the conclusion, the author demands that action is taken to reduce this hidden and often unprosecuted violence. These demands are supported by suggested plans of action.

International Labor Rights Fund. 2004. "Legal, Political and Practical Obstacles to the Enforcement of Labor Laws in El Salvador." (March).
<http://www.laborrights.org/files/POLICYElSalvadorLaborLaws.pdf>

Annotation: The International Labor Rights Fund (ILRF) completed an exhaustive case study in El Salvador, where typical labor practices and laws were the focus. The findings include discrimination in employment, forced labor, and the use of child labor, which is defined as pervasive in this context. This study reviews and condemns some of the worst forms of child labor, which include sex work, fishing/shellfish harvesting, sugarcane farming, work in garbage dumps, and fireworks production. The difficulties in complying with the law reflect a lack of interest on the government's behalf, the poverty crisis, and family perceptions of work and education.

International Labor Rights Fund, and CENTRA. 2005. "Labor Conditions in the Sugar Industry in El Salvador." (May). http://ilrf.org/publications/elsalvador_sugar.pdf

Annotation: One of the worst forms of child labor is in sugarcane production in El Salvador. These conditions are explained in meticulous detail in this article. This study provides quantitative information about the demographics of employees and typical working conditions in the context of sugarcane cultivation, production, and exportation. The analysis details wage comparisons, job types, education levels, possibilities for union organization, and the international market. Child labor was only found in the cultivation step known as cutting, where the monetary compensation is often supplemented with payment in food. The lowest level of formal education is also found among the "cutters."

International Labour Office. 2003. "Working out of Poverty."
<http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/documents/publication/kd00116.pdf>.

Annotation: The International Labor Office (ILO) states that child labor is a cause and a symptom of poverty, which, in turn, is a trap for families. This lengthy report addresses and critiques this vicious system and some of the structural failures that cause it. The ILO contends that "working out of poverty" requires the identification of issues like child labor, school attendance, low wages, and informal economies. The overall proposal details many solutions relating to education, economics, and development strategies, but the ILO stresses that success is not probable without a broad-based community effort.

International Labour Organization. 2007. "IPEC Action against Child Labour: Progress and Future Priorities." <http://www.ilo.org/ipeceinfo/product/viewProduct.do?productId=7650>.

Annotation: This progress report of the International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) presents a hopeful sign of advancement. This worldwide update on the reduction of child labor explicates successful strategies, the benefits of tripartite cooperation, and organizational issues. The central thematic foci provide extensive detail on children in the agricultural sector, the relationship between employers' and workers' organizations, and conditional cash transfers (CCTs). This report affirms that child labor concerns must be integrated into the structural components of socio-economic development on a national and global scale in order to ensure progress.

Lobe, Jim. 2004. "Sweet and Sour." (June 23). <http://www.corpwatch.org/article.php?id=11379>.

Annotation: CorpWatch is a non-profit organization whose aim is to hold corporations, particularly multinationals, accountable for their actions. This article in particular focuses on the sugarcane industry in El Salvador and on Coca-Cola's indirect benefits of utilizing child labor. Coca-Cola does not purchase their sugar from the plantations where child labor is rampant. Rather, they buy from El Salvador's largest refinery, where sugar harvested by children is sent for processing. This article criticizes Coca-Cola's response to a Human Rights Watch report in which multinational corporations were blamed for indirectly supporting child laborers in a dangerous workplace. The company claimed that they would strengthen their outreach programs and monitor enforcement activities. CorpWatch criticized the company for avoiding a concrete solution.

Manacorda, M., and F. C. Rosati. 2007. "Local Labor Demand and Child Labor." In *Understanding Children's Work Project* Rome: UNICEF.

Annotation: This working paper argues that increasing the labor demand to curtail poverty may actually have negative repercussions on children of a particular age group. This determination is based on economic theory and empirical research on children's time allocation in relation to local labor demands in urban and rural regions. In this study, where a strong demand for labor existed, an increased participation among children was found. However, no official change in school enrollment was noted. Further investigation reveals that it was not younger children (ages ten to twelve) who responded to this work incentive, but rather those ages thirteen to fifteen who responded. This is speculated to be caused by parental consideration regarding an appropriate age for work.

U.S. Department of Labor: Office Bureau of International Labor Affairs. 2000. "Knocking Down the Barriers: By the Sweat and Toil of Children."
<http://www.dol.gov/ILAB/media/reports/iclp/sweat6/overview.htm>.

Annotation: This document is the fifth in a series of reports on specific aspects of child labor that was requested by the United States Congress. The focus of this document is on greatly reducing barriers that inhibit the elimination of child labor. This process was initiated in 1992 with the International Program on the Elimination of Child Labor (IPEC). This report focuses on the continual motivation of a broad alliance of world-wide partners. Target projects that have specifically addressed these discriminatory barriers are explicated, and provide regional suggestions. Child labor and poverty are inevitably bound together; the appropriate allocation of state resources is one possible solution.

_____. 2007. "2006 Findings on the Worst Forms of Child Labor."
<http://www.dol.gov/ilab/programs/ocft/PDF/2006OCFTreport.pdf>.

Annotation: This comprehensive global report on child labor proves to be logical and useful for comparative studies. Over one hundred country profiles provide quantitative data on child labor and education. The qualitative explanations include the following: the incidence and nature of child labor, child labor laws and enforcement, current governmental policies, and programs designed to eliminate the worst forms of child labor. A glossary is included that defines necessary technical terminology, international laws, and current programs. The country-specific indicators described here illuminate sectors in which improvement is needed. The authors emphasize that a collaborative effort is vital to the elimination of child labor in its worst forms.

UNICEF. 2007. "Women and Children, The Double Dividend of Gender Equality: The State of the World's Children 2007."

http://www.unicef.org/pfo/files/2007_State_of_the_Worlds_Children.pdf.

Annotation: This annual update by UNICEF addresses the duality of the world with regard to gender-based opportunities; it calls for the enforcement of equality. A cycle of gender-based discrimination is investigated through regional comparison. The central argument focuses on distinctions between opportunities in politics and government, education, the household, and employment. The lack of possibilities available to women creates a double dividend; the repercussions are determining factors in human development. Children suffer when women are denied opportunities, but they prosper when women are empowered. UNICEF expresses the importance of the relationship between gender and development, as the female population is plagued by discrimination, disempowerment, and poverty.

Education

Guarcello, L., S. Lyon, and F. C. Rosati. 2006. "Child Labor and Education for All: An Issue Paper." In *Understand Children's Work Project*. Rome: UNICEF.

Annotation: The information presented in this article argues that "education of good quality up to the minimum age for entering into employment – is a key element." The authors use an uncommon but effective quantitative analysis to provide greater global understanding of the relationship between child labor and education. Some of the comparisons made include school attendance of children working in a family versus a non-family economic activity. An essential conclusion of the data redirects the focus strictly from school attendance records to academic achievement, which is a more descriptive indicator about the effects of child labor on education. The evidence that leads to the conclusion supports suggestions for policy design changes.

López, Ramón, and Alberto Valdés. 2000. "Fighting Rural Poverty in Latin America: New Evidence of the Effects of Education, Demographics, and Access to Land." *Economic Development and Cultural Change* 49 (1):197-211.

Annotation: Using case studies in Latin America, this article investigates differences in education levels, land distribution, and family size between rural and urban populations. The authors are interested in theories about why the poor are poor; they explicate the relationship between low levels of poverty and education. This study illustrates that even if the rural population were to receive an education, the return, or economic gain, would be insignificant unless a non-agricultural, urban job was attained. If migration to an urban center was not desired, the significance of an education could only result in the slight transition from extreme poverty to poverty.

Melchiorre, Angela. 2004. "At what age?..." In *The Right to Education Project*, edited by D. Wilson: Right to Education.

Annotation: This country intensive report completed by the Right to Education organization thoroughly analyzes the national legislation of children's rights, and compares it with the reality of each country. A comprehensive report is given describing the following: the age at which children are legally bound to complete a primary education, when they can begin to work, to marry, and to be incarcerated. This information becomes a useful tool for comparing global issues concerning children's rights and the discord between national legislation and reality. A strong link between the minimum age of employment and the completion of a compulsory primary education is exemplified through this research.

Rosati, F. C., and S. Lyon. 2006. "Non-Formal Education Approaches for Child Labourers: an Issue Paper." In *Understanding Children's Work Project*. Rome: UNICEF.

Annotation: This article addresses one of the complexities inherent in the relationship between child labor and education. One possible solution, a transitional education, considers children and their economic necessity in impoverished environments. The rationale behind programs like flexible schooling and transitional education is described in this article. Although these strategies are labeled as critical for children, they are difficult to maintain due to financial limitations and due to problems concerning their integration into the traditional system of education. A diverse range of successful non-formal educational programs is presented with clarifications made about their focus. The authors see these programs as necessary in order to provide education and to reduce child labor globally.

Rosati, F. C., and M. Rosati. 2007. "Impact of School Quality on Child Labor and School Attendance: the case of CONAFE Compensatory Education Program in Mexico." In *Understanding Children's Work Project*. Rome: UNICEF.

Annotation: This article investigates the effectiveness of a poverty reduction strategy that has been implemented in Mexico, which aims to reduce the prominence of child labor and to increase school attendance. The framework of this program, which is used primarily in rural impoverished regions, is detailed and then questioned. One of the solutions involves a contingent cash transfer, which provides monetary incentives for school attendance and performance. The economic value of school attendance is twenty-two per cent higher than a typical rural wage, and thus positively reinforces education. The article, although emphasizing the relative success of the program, identifies an underlying problem with the quality of the education being received.

U.S. Department of Labor. “An Economic Consideration of Child Labor: By the Sweat and Toil of Children,”

http://www.dol.gov/ILAB/media/reports/iclp/sweat6/sweat6_html/sweat6_chap_1.html.

Annotation: This document is the sixth in a series of reports requested by the United States Congress on specific aspects of child labor. Interestingly, it investigates economic benefits to be attained through the elimination of child labor while simultaneously increasing enrollment in educational facilities. The economic benefits described are encountered on the global level but also specifically in individual countries. Statistical data is presented that shows how in countries where school enrollment is higher, the prevalence of child labor is significantly lower. The report attempts to persuade an audience with strong economic concerns that monetarily, the elimination of child labor would positively affect economic growth.

UNESCO. 2000. “The Right to Education, Towards Education throughout all Life.” In *World Education Report*. <http://www.unesco.org/education/information/wer/PDFeng/wholewer.pdf>

Annotation: This overwhelmingly extensive but equally valuable report emphasizes the importance of the universal right to education and its significance in building peace worldwide. The report explores basic primary education, the value of literacy, and lifelong learning. An explanation is given suggesting how to provide free primary education, and the most successful methods for doing so are provided. This section concludes by reporting some of the improvements that have been made by specific countries in providing free primary education. However, these developments are often undermined by national legal limitations.

———. 2003. “Gender and Education, The Leap to Equality for All.” http://www.unesco.org/education/efa_report/summary_en.pdf.

Annotation: This lengthy report is centered on Education for All (EFA), and more specifically on equality in the opportunity for an education. Literacy rates are detrimentally affected by those who don't have access to education, as they are for children who leave school prematurely. Work is the primary reason why children are held back from obtaining an education. This situation is shown to change where economic development increases, as child labor is a result of poverty. The conclusion highlights initiatives for improving gender equality, which reciprocally would improve educational opportunities for women.

UNESCO Institute for Statistics. 2004. “Global Education Digest 2004: Comparing Education Statistics across the World.” http://www.unesco.org/education/docs/EN_GD2004_v2.pdf.

Annotation: This report is a statistical analysis that compares many elements of institutionalized education on a global scale. The quantitative information spans pre-primary to tertiary levels of education and includes details about access and completion of schooling. The state has a legal

commitment to provide compulsory education, but failures are often excused due to monetary difficulties. UNESCO found an extremely low level of state-sponsored economic support through a comparison of educational expenditures as a percentage of GDP. This document can be used as an operational tool to determine where progress is possible through universal primary education, which would reduce education-based exclusion in adulthood.

The World Bank. 2007. "Raising Student Learning in Latin America."

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTLAC/Resources/Raising_Student_Learning_in_LAC_Document.pdf.

Annotation: This extensive World Bank Report decidedly focuses on the essence of education in Latin America and theorizes its importance. Economic, political and social conditions are considered interrelated in the structural system of education. Primary school attendance has improved tremendously in recent years, but this study emphasizes the more prevalent significance of educational quality. The current challenge seen in the Latin American region is in providing tertiary education indiscriminately; family wealth is demonstrated as a clear advantage. The study aspires to link an increase in educational spending with resulting economic growth, which in turn could reduce social and economic inequalities.

Legal Structure and Possible Solutions

Betcherman, Gordon, Jean Fares, Amy Luinstra, and Robert Prouty. 2005. "Child Labour and Access to Education." In Human Rights and Development, Towards a Mutual Reinforcement. Edited by P. Alston and M. Robinson. New York: Oxford University Press.

Annotation: The focus of this book is the development of human rights and inherent challenges that accompany this process in the private sector and within legal and economic issues. The third chapter contains many graphs which support the authors' conclusion that the most sustainable losses children incur while working are correlated to their health and education. In order to ensure a truly effective policy change, an understanding must be reached about how children commonly work alongside their parents. The final statement firmly claims that the incidence of child labor is directly related to poverty.

Brysk, Alison. 2005. Human Rights and Private Wrongs: Constructing Global Civil Society. New York: Routledge.

Annotation: The author of this book asserts that globalization now affects almost every aspect of our lives, regardless of our geographic location. The third chapter is comprised of investigations of the effects globalization has on children, who are in a particularly vulnerable position. The author reflects on the idea that children should theoretically be entitled to a wider range of rights than adults, but claims that their "patrimonial invisibility" pushes them out of the

legal realm. This insightful proposal concludes by providing various institutional instruments that could be useful in eradicating child labor.

Human Rights Watch. 2003. "Deliberate Indifference: El Salvador's Failure to Protect Workers' Rights." New York City.

Annotation: Why is El Salvador so indifferent to labor laws and practices? This report claims that employers are aware of the laws' weaknesses and the government's apathetic attitude towards compliance, so they take advantage of the system's deficiencies. Lack of enforcement could be caused by resource constraints, privatization, or the power of globalization. The case studies analyzed present examples of the difficulties workers confront in contrast with the companies, which often act in overall disregard for basic law or human rights. Global powers such as the United States, which direct millions of dollars in development assistance and yet take no definite action towards obvious violations, are sternly criticized.

———. 2003. "El Salvador: Government Ignores Widespread Labor Abuse." (December 4)
<http://hrw.org/english/docs/2003/12/04/elsalv6557.htm>

Annotation: The Central American Free Trade Agreement (CAFTA), which involves the United States and El Salvador, among others, was said to have strong implications for assuring labor rights. This article follows up on a Human Rights Watch (HRW) report that offered recommendations for rectifying serious human rights violations. HRW strongly criticizes CAFTA for its informalities, since it requires no international legal standards on child labor. The article details current "inexcusable" violations that were documented in a previous on-site visit to El Salvador where recommendations were given for change. HRW concludes by forewarning a continued abuse of human rights and international laws, primarily due to CAFTA's encouragement.

International Bank for Reconstruction and Development. 2005. "Pro-Poor Growth in the 1990s."
http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPGI/Resources/342674-1119450037681/Pro-poor_growth_in_the_1990s.pdf.

Annotation: This report proposes economic strategies for the reduction of poverty, which is established through a comparative study of fourteen countries. The author directs this work primarily to policy makers, and provides many recommendations for successful pro-poor growth approaches. Relevant factors for growth include urbanization, income equality, climate, fertility, institutions, and the importance of agriculture. The report suggests general policy options to raise the income of the poor, improve investment climate, increase female education, design labor market regulations, and increase available infrastructure. The underlying theme of the report's overall plan insinuates migration towards urban centers and movement towards non-agricultural employment.

International Labour Office. 2005. "A Global Alliance Against Forced Labour." In Global Report under the Follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, Edited by International Labour Office. Geneva: International Labour Organization.

Annotation: The International Labour Organization (ILO) is continually working to eliminate forced labor; the introduction of this report clarifies the framework being used in the process. The general history of international labor standards is extensively reviewed along with more recent legal implementations. Interesting quantitative and qualitative studies are examined to express the current presence of forced labor on a global scale. The graphic data presented is successful in demonstrating the complexities of forced labor and its regional trends. The ILO then proceeds to recognize the actual problems with eradicating forced labor, such as impunity. The conclusion offers future solutions towards this global problem and proposes improvement in policy, laws, advocacy work, and awareness.

International Labour Organization, and International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour. 2003. "Entendiendo el Trabajo Infantil en El Salvador." http://www.ucw-project.org/pdf/publications/trabajo_infantil_elsalvador.pdf.

Annotation: Providing an understanding of child labor in El Salvador is the main goal of this document. The extensive report begins with the national context in which specific factors are presented that encourage child labor. The report successfully explicates statistical information and transfers the data into qualitative references. Additional factors like education, health, poverty, and culture are investigated in the context of the prevalence of child labor. A section is dedicated towards all of the forms of child labor that El Salvador considers hazardous. All of the legal structures that protect children from forced labor are presented in the hope that the government and the society will encourage, if not demand, their enforcement.

Smolin, David M. 2000. "Strategic Choices in the International Campaign against Child Labor." *Human Rights Quarterly* 22 (4):942-987.

Annotation: The International Labour Organization (ILO) has been actively working on child labor issues since 1919. This article offers an interesting historical account of the ILO's specific goals during its four stages of activism. The definitions of child labor and its "worst" forms, although apparently convoluted, are explicated here to provide a greater understanding both within this article, and in the general context of child labor issues. With the hope of catalyzing improvement, the author critiques the current stage of child labor activism and specifically the 1999 Worst Forms of Child Labor Convention by calling it irrational, misdirected, and irresponsible in its priorities and direction.

Soares, Fabio Veras, and Tatiana Britto. 2007. "Confronting Capacity Constraints on Conditional Cash Transfers in Latin America: The Cases of El Salvador and Paraguay." Brasilia: International Poverty Centre.

Annotation: Conditional Cash Transfer programs (CCTs) are considered a possible strategy for reducing poverty and for ensuring social protection. This working paper explicates the CCT program in general, and then proceeds with a comparison between levels of effectiveness in El Salvador and Paraguay. Although CCTs can provide basic nutrition, health, and education to the impoverished, the potential for conflict can arise between the short term goal of alleviating poverty and the long-term aspiration of breaking the intergenerational cycle of poverty. The authors question the methodology of CCTs due to major weaknesses like sustainable financial resources and institutional constraints, but still indicate the program's considerable success.

Tomasevski, Katarina. 2005. "Globalizing What: Education as a Human Right or as a Traded Service?" *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies* 12 (1):1-78.

Annotation: The International Human Rights Law, which guarantees a free education and the International Trade Law, which is influenced by globalization, have created two parallel but disconnected regimes. Although primary education may be universally compulsory, the author argues that national governing powers are becoming increasingly complacent. Education has made a transition from being free to being a luxury for those who are less economically fortunate. After reviewing educational opportunities on a global scale, the author concludes with proposals to revert the current bifurcation in education with suggestions for legal and civic action.

U.S. Department of State. 2007. "El Salvador: Country Reports on Human Rights Practices 2006" <http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2006/78891.htm>.

Annotation: This government report, written by the Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labor, reviews human rights issues in El Salvador in 2006. The section regarding children states that El Salvador claimed to be committed to improving children's rights and welfare, but failed to allocate sufficient resources to do so. Despite this setback, the Ministry of Education coordinated a semi-successful program, APRENDO (to learn), which focused on raising awareness among teachers, students, and parents regarding sexual and commercial exploitation and harmful forms of labor. The report concludes that El Salvador has much room for improvement since child labor is still a widespread and serious problem.

Vides de Andrade, Ana Regina, Anabel la Larde de Palomo, and Lissette Calderon Martinez. 2002. "Geographical Exclusion in Rural Areas of El Salvador: Its Impact on Labor Market Outcomes." Washington D.C.: Inter-American Development Bank.

Annotation: This working paper considers the correlation between social exclusion and geographic isolation in El Salvador from a study where micro-level data was obtained. The connection between exclusion and isolation was determined through various factors of the rural area, such as poverty (sixty-one percent), the average years of schooling completed (3.2), and average labor income (less than minimum wage). Within the rural area, the study found three primary impacts on labor market outcomes: labor force participation, the sector of employment, and labor income. The conclusion reveals that education does not necessarily result in an increased income in geographically isolated regions.

Forced Labor in the United States: A Contemporary Problem in Need of a Contemporary Solution

By Chrissey Buckley

Legal slavery ended in the United States in 1865, yet the practice of forcing individuals to work against their will, oftentimes in inhumane conditions, continues today. Currently there are around 50,000 people working in forced labor situations in the United States (Bales 47). Although this number is smaller than it was during the 18th century, finding and freeing these individuals is difficult because they are hidden away and exploited. The United States is now at a critical juncture in its struggle to end forced labor. In 2000, the U.S. Government enacted legislation that holds perpetrators of forced labor accountable, and which assists the victims of this crime. Since this date, prosecutions of perpetrators, as well as social and legal services for victims, have increased. However, in order to fully eradicate the problem of forced labor in the United States, the government needs to evaluate the reasons for forced labor within the country, and identify the most useful policies to control this problem.

Victims of forced labor are trafficked into the United States from a variety of foreign countries, although the majority originates in India, China, Mexico and Vietnam. U.S. citizens have also been targeted for forced labor operations; however, most victims are young runaways and children of foreigners. Victims of forced labor are brought to the United States because there is a market for their services, coupled with poor legislation and inefficient laws that allow the problem to persist. Forced labor operations tend to thrive in industries that offer low wages, where U.S. law requires little or no regulation or monitoring of working conditions, and where a high demand for cheap labor exists. The sectors in which forced labor is most prevalent are sex services, domestic servitude, agriculture, sweatshop, and factory work. Forced labor in these industries is perpetuated by the large potential for profit, and by the small risk of being prosecuted for the crime.

The sector where forced labor is most likely to occur in the United States is sex services. This profitable industry is driven by a demand for cheap sex services and for child sex. Victims are oftentimes trafficked into sexual slavery by migrant smuggling enterprises and organized crime networks. They are brought into the United States under false pretenses of gainful employment, yet once they arrive at their destination, victims are forced to work as strippers and prostitutes for little or no compensation. The lack of safe and legal means of migration to the United States perpetuates this problem, causing people to rely on these networks as a mode for entering the country.

The second highest incidence of forced labor in the United States occurs in domestic services. Here it is driven by the demand for cheap and exploitable household help, a lack of legal protections for domestic workers, and an absence of monitoring agencies. Exploitation of domestic workers is made easy because a number of U.S. laws prevent domestic workers from having a voice. For instance, domestic workers are not considered employees under the National Relations Labor Act (NRLA), which restricts their ability to organize in order to demand higher wages and better treatment. U.S. immigration policy also plays an important role in indirectly supporting forced labor practices because the law stipulates that domestic workers brought to the United States by their employers are required to remain with their original employer or face deportation. This requirement tends to discourage workers from reporting abuses, and places a lot of power in the hands of their employers.

The agricultural sector also experiences a high occurrence of forced labor in the United States. This is due to the absence of labor standards and regulations in the industry, and to the increasing number of undocumented immigrant farm workers that have no legal protection. Currently, farm workers are excluded from the NIRA, which denies them the ability to organize and to form unions. In addition, the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) does not guarantee overtime pay to farm workers. FLSA and the Occupational Safety and Health Act (OSHA) do grant minimum wage and workplace safety protections to farm workers, but these regulations are severely under-enforced. Finally, many farm workers enter the United States illegally, and do not seek help when forced to work without pay and in poor conditions. Since they do not speak English, many are unaware of their rights and fear deportation. All of these factors cause many agricultural workers to live in a situation of poverty and powerlessness that is easy to exploit.

Sweatshop manufacturing, factories in which employers violate labor laws, is another economic sector that utilizes forced labor in the United States. Low-cost imports that create competitive pressures on U.S.-based manufacturers to cut costs perpetuate this problem. Forced labor exists in this industry because U.S. labor laws do not offer adequate protection. For instance, corporations and manufacturers are not held legally responsible when an outside firm that is sub-contracted to produce their product uses forced labor. This allows many manufacturers to profit from forced labor without being held accountable for violating the law. Finally, many manufacturers operate within the informal economy, and evade monitoring or the enforcement of labor laws.

At any given time, tens of thousands of people work as forced laborers across the United States. Of these victims, the Department of Justice estimates that fewer than 1,000 are liberated each year. There are many reasons why so few victims are able to escape their situation. For instance, most victims of forced labor originate from foreign countries and are uneducated, do not speak the language, have no social or family network, fear deportation, and do not trust or have knowledge of the outside world. In addition, many perpetrators use repeated threats and verbal abuse, involuntary confinement, torture, and sexual assault to force their victims into submission. All of these conditions can cause forced labor victims to lose their sense of control, and to become increasingly dependent on those who hold them captive, which oftentimes delays or prevents them from escaping their situation.

In October of 2000, the U.S. Government enacted the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA), which is instrumental in combating the problem of forced labor. TVPA strengthens domestic criminal laws against human trafficking and forced labor. It provides social services and legal benefits to survivors of these crimes. In addition, TVPA grants funding to support protection programs for survivors in the United States as well as those living abroad. One of the important aspects of this act is that it differentiates between victims of trafficking and forced labor from unauthorized migrants. This distinction grants victims authorization to remain in the United States, even if they entered the country illegally. The law also created the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons in the State Department, which oversees all efforts to end human trafficking in the United States and abroad.

Despite these considerable advancements, the TVPA has some notable shortcomings. TVPA stipulates that immigration and social services offered to victims are contingent on the willingness of victims to prosecute their perpetrators. This is problematic because many survivors are terrified that their former captors will seek revenge on them or their families if they collaborate with authorities.

In addition, protective and social services are administered through non-governmental organizations (NGOs) that are not equipped with the personnel or funding necessary to provide the help these individuals need. Finally, the Act makes human trafficking and forced labor a federal crime, enforceable by federal authorities. This causes a severe break down of communication between local and federal law enforcement.

In order to eradicate forced labor, the United States needs to expand and improve its strategy. First, U.S. immigration laws that indirectly contribute to the problem of forced labor must be refined. For example, increasing opportunities for regularized migration and changing visa requirements for foreign workers so that they can change employers would help decrease the vulnerability of workers, and would therefore help to prevent them from falling victim to forced labor. The U.S. government should also increase legal protections of all workers, regardless of their legal standing, and improve the monitoring of working conditions in agriculture, domestic labor, and manufacturing sectors. In addition, the U.S. government needs to promote accountability by making corporations liable for the workers that produce their products. Communication and cooperation between federal and state agencies should be improved. Training on the relevance of forced labor needs to be extended to more agencies and professionals in order to increase their role in identifying, liberating, and supporting victims. Finally, more financial support and training must be offered to NGOs and to social service agencies that work with victims of forced labor.

Annotated Bibliography

Introduction to Forced Labor in the United States

Bales, Kevin. 2004. New Slavery: A Reference Handbook. Second ed. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, Inc.

Annotation: The author of this book offers a detailed overview of contemporary slavery in different countries worldwide. The chapter on slavery in America describes the problem of forced labor in the United States and identifies the steps the country will need to take in order to combat the problem. The first part of the chapter addresses how factors in the economy, the legal system, and immigration policy indirectly support the problem of forced labor in the United States. The chapter then describes different profiles of victims of slavery in the United States, the conditions to which they were exposed while enslaved, and the difficulty they experience in trying to escape their situation. The chapter concludes by stating why increased law enforcement, public awareness, and support for victims and survivors of slavery are necessary for combating this problem.

Gilmore, Janet. 2004. "Modern Slavery Thriving in the U.S." *UC Berkeley News*.
http://www.berkeley.edu/news/media/releases/2004/09/23_16691.shtml

Annotation: This press release by the University of California at Berkeley summarizes major findings of the 2004 report "Hidden Slaves: Forced Labor in the United States." This report was written by the University of California, Berkeley's Human Rights Center and the Washington

D.C.-based, anti-slavery group Free the Slaves. The press release briefly recounts the demographics of victims of forced labor in the United States, the sectors of the economy where forced labor is most prevalent, and the reasons why forced labor has been allowed to persist in the United States. The press release also summarizes five incidents of forced labor in the United States that are described in more detail in the 2004 report.

Human Rights Education Associates. "Slavery and Forced Labor."

<http://www.hrea.org/learn/guides/slavery.html#rights>.

Annotation: This web site offers a guide on forced labor and modern slavery. It gives a brief definition of slavery and a brief description of the 1926 Slavery Convention. The website also describes the different forms of forced labor and slavery that are prevalent in the world today. It also highlights the efforts of large international and regional organizations, such as the United Nations, the Council of Europe, the African Union, and the Organization of American States, to combat the problems of forced labor and slavery in the world. The website additionally provides a list of sources for teachers of forced labor and slavery.

Ralph, Regan E.. 2000. "International Trafficking of Women and Children: Human Rights Watch."

<http://www.hrw.org/background/wrd/trafficking.htm>

Annotation: This report summarizes research conducted by Human Rights Watch on the problem of human trafficking around the world. The author uses this research to highlight consistent patterns that emerge in human trafficking cases, regardless of the victim's situation. In all cases, the author points out, coercive tactics of traffickers, including deception, fraud, intimidation, isolation, threat and use of physical force, and/or debt bondage, are used to recruit and enslave victims. The article then describes how the U.S. Government's efforts to combat trafficking have been inadequate, and how the United States needs to use its influence to promote human rights and women's rights around the world.

Tuller, David. 2005. "Freedom Denied; Forced Labor in California." *The Human Rights Center, UC Berkeley*. http://www.law.berkeley.edu/clinics/ihrcl/pdf/Freedom_Denied.pdf

Annotation: This report lays out the problem of forced labor in California. It highlights the strengths of the U.S. Federal Government's efforts to eradicate the problem, and also demonstrates how these efforts are undermined by deficient state laws. The article calls on state lawmakers to adopt effective legislation that will increase prosecution of perpetrators of human trafficking and forced labor, to provide adequate protections and services to victims and their families, and to establish a statewide coordinating agency that will generate policies and programs aimed at eradicating this problem.

Demographic of Victims of Forced Labor in the United States

Gonzales, David. 2007. "When American Dream Leads to Servitude." *New York Times* April 27, p. B1.

Annotation: This article examines the reasons why many victims of forced labor are foreign-born. Enticed by their captors with promises of better lives and opportunities in the United States, hundreds of thousands of victims of forced labor are trafficked into the United States to perform domestic duties, to work in factories and agricultural fields, or to work as prostitutes. The author of this article points out that although human trafficking has been a federal crime since 2000, states have been slow in adopting similar laws. This has prevented many perpetrators from being prosecuted. In order to illustrate that this problem is not a priority for state officials, the author describes the efforts of New York State Assemblyman Jeffery Dinowitz in his three-year effort to pass a law enabling local law enforcement and prosecutors to go after perpetrators of forced labor.

King, Gilbert. 2004. Woman, Child for Sale: The New Slave Trade in the 21st Century. New York: Chamberlain Brothers.

Annotation: The author of this book describes the process of human trafficking into forced labor. The author uses several case studies of victims of trafficking and forced labor from around the world to illustrate how the industry operates. The book describes how and from where the victims are recruited, in addition to discussing what happens to them once they reach the country in which they are sold. In particular, the book presents a chapter on domestic/internal trafficking within the United States, pointing out that many victims of forced labor are U.S. citizens. The book concludes by highlighting the steps that the U.S. Government has taken to protect victims of forced labor, and by providing suggestions on regarding further action that needs to be taken.

Sex Slaves and Prostitution

U.S Department of State, "Trafficking in Persons Report." 2006. Washington D.C.: U.S Department of State. <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/66086.pdf>.

Annotation: The 6th annual "Trafficking in Persons Report" released by the U.S. Department of State gives an updated, global look at the nature and scope of modern-day slavery, in addition to highlighting the broad range of actions being taken by governments around the world to confront and eliminate this problem. The focus of this year's report is on incidents of slave labor and sexual slavery that occur around the world. The report discusses the public health implications of sexual slavery, as well as the U.S. Government's efforts to reduce the demand for sexual services, both within the United States and abroad. The report also addresses the exploitation of migrant workers. Finally, the report discusses the problem of child-sex tourism and the United States' response to the problem.

Domestic Service

Ehrenreich, Barbara, and Arlie Russell Hochschild, eds. 2002. Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy. New York: Metropolitan Books.

Annotation: This book focuses partially on forced labor in the United States. The author begins with several case studies of foreign women forced to work as maids and caregivers for families in the United States. The author then proceeds to explain how failing economies in developing nations have led to the increased occurrence of forced labor in the United States. Next, the author describes how traffickers manipulate and deceive migrants into agreeing to come to the United States to work. Part of the chapter also depicts the patterns of abuse and exploitation that these workers experience, in addition to the tactics their employers use to prevent them from seeking help. The chapter concludes with possible solutions to combating this problem, such as increased public awareness, stricter legal penalties for perpetrators, and the creation of more social services for victims.

Agricultural

Human Rights Watch. 2005. "Human Rights of Florida's Farm Workers are under Serious Threat." <http://hrw.org/english/docs/2005/03/02/usdom10284.htm>.

Annotation: This letter, submitted by five human rights organizations to the Organization of American States' Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, concerns the question of corporate and government responsibility for the poor human rights conditions of agricultural workers in Florida. The letter addresses human rights violations that are common in this sector, such as forced labor and slavery, poor working conditions, poor health care, and low wages. The letter suggests ways that the U.S. Government can effectively protect agricultural workers in Florida, and how it can prevent further human rights violations from occurring. The letter also points out how the private sector, and the corporate sector in particular, can use their influence to improve the human rights situation in this sector.

_____ 2005. "Immigrant Workers in the United States Meat and Poultry Industry." <http://www.hrw.org/backgrounder/usa/un-sub1005>.

Annotation: This document, submitted by Human Rights Watch (HRW) to the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights' Committee on Migrant Workers, asks the commission to support advocates that are seeking full protection of the rights of immigrant workers in the meat and poultry industry in the United States. The article gives an accurate account of the plight of immigrant workers in this industry. The authors claim that the failure of the U.S. Government to accord rights, recognition, and respect to immigrant workers, despite their significant contributions to the economy, is the main cause of their exploitation. The document includes a review of the 2002 U.S. Supreme Court decision that undermined international human rights

and labor rights standards, which grants all workers—whatever their immigration status—the same basic rights.

“Like Machines in the Fields: Workers without Rights in American Agriculture.” 2004.
http://www.oxfamamerica.org/newsandpublications/publications/research_reports.

Annotation: This report documents the continuing erosion of farm workers’ economic, social, and political rights in the United States. The author demonstrates how the effects of globalization have caused many agricultural companies in the United States to subject their workers to inhumane working conditions, and to pay them low wages in order to be competitive. The authors also show how these conditions are perpetuated by U.S. labor laws, which deny farm workers the protections necessary to organize and join unions, earn overtime pay, protections for child labor, and in the case of farm workers employed on small farms, even minimum wage compensation. The report also explains how poor labor laws have left little protection for the abuse of farm workers, forcing many to work against their will with little or no compensation.

Peterson, Carl. 2004. “Trading People: Slavery and Migration in the 21st Century.” In Transnational America; Contours of Modern US Culture, edited by R. Ducan and C. Juncker. Copenhagen: Museum Tusulanum Press.

Annotation: This chapter attempts to account for the resurgence of slavery in the 21st Century. The author claims that both the legacy of colonialism and the increasing integration of the global economy have caused slavery to increase world-wide. In the article, the author examines the exploitation of Mexican migrant workers in the agricultural industry of the United States. This example illustrates how free trade has led to an increase in the trading of people.

Thompson, Jr., Charles D. and Melinda F. Wiggins, eds. 2002. The Human Cost of Food: Farmworkers’ Lives, Labor and Advocacy. Austin: University of Texas Press.

Annotation: This book contains a collection of essays about migrant farm workers in the United States and concentrates particularly on case studies of migrant farm communities in the southeast. It outlines the challenges these communities face in accessing health care, housing, education, and legal and protective services. In particular, Chapter Five, “Farmworker Exceptionalism under the Law,” examines deficiencies of the U.S. legal system with regard to the protection of farm workers. The chapter demonstrates how this deficiency has contributed to the perpetuation of a situation of poverty and powerlessness amongst farm workers, and addresses how this situation often leads to the exploitation of such workers.

Sweatshop/Factory

Compa, Lance, and Jamie Fellner. 2005. "Meatpacking's Human Toll." *Washington Post*, August 3, 2005, 19A. <http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2005/08/02/AR2005080201936.html>

Annotation: This article raises concerns about the working conditions in U.S. meat and poultry plants. The article shows how the U.S. meat and poultry workers are at risk of serious physical injury, even though the means used to avoid such injury are known and feasible. The majority of workers who face these hazards are increasingly immigrants— mostly from Mexico and Central America. The article points out how meatpacking companies are able to violate the worker's rights by exploiting workers' vulnerabilities: limited English skills, uncertainty of their rights, and concern about their immigration status if they are undocumented workers. In addition, the article explains how the U.S. Government does little to protect meatpacking workers, and to prevent the tactics of fear, intimidation, and interference that companies use to prevent workers from seeking justice.

Human Rights Watch 2004. "Blood, Sweat, and Fear; Workers' Rights in U.S. Meat and Poultry Plants." <http://www.hrw.org/reports/2005/usa0105/usa0105.pdf>.

Annotation: This report examines the lack of workers' rights and the dangerous and difficult conditions that workers face in American beef, pork, and poultry slaughtering and processing plants. The author claims that poor labor laws provide little or no protection for these workers. As a result, many workers, especially those who are immigrants, are exploited. Language difficulties oftentimes prevent immigrant workers from being aware of their rights under the law, and of specific hazards in their work. Immigrant workers who are undocumented, as many are, also risk deportation if they seek to organize and to improve conditions. The report concludes with recommendations for changes in the poultry industry to health/safety and workers' compensation regulations, and for greater protection of workers' rights to organize.

Rosen, Ellen Israel. 2002. Making Sweatshops: The Globalization of the U.S. Apparel Industry Berkeley: University of California Press.

Annotation: The author of this book analyzes the effect of globalization on the U.S. apparel industry. The book takes a historical approach to outline the positive and negative repercussions that globalization has produced. In particular, the chapter entitled "Apparel Retailing in the United States, from Mom-and-Pop Shop to Transnational Corporations" is effective in describing how the globalization of this industry has driven down the price of clothes to a record low, causing an increasing number of companies in the United States to outsource their production to inexpensive overseas labor. In addition, this chapter describes how the consumer demand for low cost apparel has also increased the use of forced labor within the United States.

Varia, Nisha. 2007. "International Trafficking in Persons: Taking Action to Eliminate Modern Day Slavery." Human Rights Watch. <http://hrw.org/english/docs/2007/10/18/usint17127.htm>.

Annotation: This written statement, released by Human Rights Watch (HRW), offers a brief summary of the causes of exploitation of migrant workers around the world. The statement was written to address the House Committee on Foreign Affairs, with regard to a then-upcoming review of the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2005 (TVPRRA). The report summarizes the key findings and recommendations of a five-year study on migrant workers, trafficking, and forced labor. The document singles out inadequate or faulty governmental policies as key factors that place certain groups of migrants and workers at great risk of abuse.

Victims and Perpetrators

Cole, Thomas P. 2007. "Modern Slavery, A Hidden Crime in the U.S." *The Journal of the American Medical Association* 294(5): 2.

Annotation: The author of this brief article seeks to inform the medical community about forced labor issues in the United States. The article highlights the different ways in which individuals are trafficked into slavery, and addresses the reasons why these victims tend to stay with their captors. The article also identifies ways in which the medical community can identify and reach out to victims of forced labor in order to inform them of their rights and to encourage them to leave their situation.

France, David. 2000. "Slavery's New Face:." *Newsweek*, December 18, p.1.

Annotation: This article offers a brief introduction to the growing problem of forced labor in the United States. The article highlights a case study of a Cameroonian women forced to work as a domestic servant in a Washington D.C. household. The author uses this study to demonstrate how victims of forced labor are trafficked from their countries of origin to the United States, and discusses the tactics their perpetrators use to prevent them from seeking help. The article also includes a brief overview of a bill passed during the Clinton Administration that gives temporary asylum to the victims of forced labor, and which makes life in prison a possible penalty for the enslaver.

Henderson, Ky. 1997. "The New Slavery." *Human Rights: Journal of the Section of Individual Rights & Responsibilities*. 24 (4) (Fall).

Annotation: This article briefly describes four cases of large-scale forced labor incidents that involved migrant workers in the agricultural and garment industries of the United States during the Clinton Administration. The author then uses these cases to illustrate how forced labor is

perpetuated in the United States. The claim is made that the large profit made by perpetrators of forced labors, combined with insufficient laws to hold these individuals accountable, are responsible for perpetuating the problem of forced labor in the United States. The article specifically blames current U.S. labor laws that do not hold businesses accountable for laborers hired through middlemen.

Quirk, Joel. 2007. "Trafficked into Slavery." *Journal of Human Rights*. 6 (2):26.

Annotation: This author evaluates the concept of historical slavery, and addresses the effects of these concepts on contemporary understandings of human trafficking and forced labor. The author shows how these concepts, first dominated by the pre-19th Century slave trade and then by the post-WWI image of the sexual slave trade, have dissuaded governments and citizens from recognizing the realities of human trafficking and forced labor in the modern world. The author also suggests that although the problem of forced labor and human trafficking is beginning to be recognized within the United States, many efforts of these anti-trafficking/forced labor advocates are being overshadowed as victims' stories are being merged with the politics that surround immigration and migrant workers in the United States.

The U.S. Government's Role

Bales, Kevin, and Steven Lize. 2005. "Trafficking in Persons in the United States."
<http://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/211980.pdf>.

Annotation: This detailed report uses raw data collected from seventy-three interviews of victims trafficked into slavery in the United States in order to identify how action by law enforcement, civil society, business, and the public would be most effective in leading to a more successful prevention of trafficking. Such action would also enable the discovery, liberation, improved care and rehabilitation of victims, and increase prosecution that will shut down trafficking operations. The report concludes by addressing how these actions can be implemented by the United States Government in order to make the country a harder target for criminal traffickers.

Brinkley, Joel. 2000. "Vast Trade in Forced Labor Portrayed in C.I.A. Report." *New York Times*, April 2, p. 22.

Annotation: This article evaluates the findings of the 2000 C.I.A report - "Internal Trafficking in Women to the United States: A Contemporary Manifestation of Slavery." According to the article, the report is based on over 150 interviews with law enforcement officials, victims, and experts of forced labor in the United States. The article paints a brief picture of the pervasive problem of forced labor in the United States, and describes the difficulty government agencies face in combating the problem. According to the article, the report indicates a consistent increase in the incidents of forced labor in the United States reported by law enforcement. However, these cases prove increasingly difficult to prosecute and to investigate, which indicates that the country does not have sufficient laws aimed at combating this problem.

“Examining U.S. Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking and Slavery: Hearing before the Subcommittee on the Constitution, Civil Rights, and Property Rights of the Committee on the Judiciary.” 2004. Washington D.C.: U.S. G.P.O.
<http://a257.g.akamaitech.net/7/257/2422/17nov20051300/www.access.gpo.gov/congress/senate/pdf/108hrg/96285.pdf>.

Annotation: This lengthy report examines the efforts of the U.S. Government to combat human trafficking and slavery across the United States. The report details testimonies from representatives of five non-governmental organizations, as well as from a series of individuals with experience and expertise in human slavery and forced labor. The report also investigates the U.S. Justice Department’s efforts to protect victims of human trafficking and slavery, to punish the perpetrators, and to prevent others from suffering the same fate. The testimonies include accounts of forced labor and human trafficking that occur along the U.S.-Mexico border, in addition to providing several accounts of children trafficked into sexual slavery. The report also addresses the importance of raising public awareness as an effective tool to combat the problem.

Melby, Todd. 2004. “U.S. Targets Sexual Slavery World Wide and Within Its Borders.” *Contemporary Sexuality* 38 (5):1-5.

Annotation: This article offers a brief introduction to recent efforts made by the United States to combat domestic and international incidents of forced labor and sexual slavery. The author of this article examines the Trafficking Victims Protection Act enacted by the United States Government in 2000. The author claims that this law, which legally requires abusers to pay restitution, allows victims to apply for a U.S. visa, and pressures foreign governments to crack down on sexual slavery and forced labor within their own countries, has been an important step in combating the problem worldwide. The author also offers a brief description of how victims of forced labor can report this information to authorities.

“Modern Day Slavery: Spotlight on the 2006 ‘Trafficking in Persons Report,’ Forced Labor, and Sex Trafficking at the World Cup: Hearing before the Subcommittee on Africa, Global Human Rights, and International Operations of the Committee on International Relations.” 2006. Washington: U.S. G.P.O.
<http://www.internationalrelations.house.gov/archives/109/28104.PDF>.

Annotation: This detailed report describes the findings in the U.S. State Department’s sixth annual “Trafficking in Persons Report.” The report focuses on progress made by the United States Government in combating human trafficking and forced labor. It also addresses significant challenges that remain ahead. Much of the report recounts issues of sex trafficking in connection with the 2006 World Cup Soccer Championship; however, the document does touch on human trafficking and forced labor in the United States. Pages 5-6 report on the problem of trafficking of foreign nationals into the United States, and on the domestic trafficking of U.S.

citizens. Pages 38-40 address forced labor issues in the United States and the tactics used by perpetrators to keep their victims enslaved.

“Monitoring and Combating Trafficking in Persons: How are we Doing? Hearing Before the Subcommittee on Near Eastern and South Asian Affairs of the Committee on Foreign Relations.” 2002. Washington, D.C.: U.S. G.P.O.
<http://bulk.resource.org/gpo.gov/hearings/107s/80844.pdf>.

Annotation: This report assesses the efforts of the U.S. Federal Government to combat forced labor and human trafficking one year after the passage of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000. The document consists of a series of testimonies from experts that explain how various agencies in the U.S. Government have failed to assume the responsibilities imposed upon them by this act. It also examines how poorly designed programs and the lack of interagency coordination prevent victims of trafficking in the United States from getting the assistance they need. In addition, the testimonies suggest that many victims are still not recognized as trafficking victims due to a lack of effective training for local law enforcement.

“The Ongoing Tragedy of International Slavery and Human Trafficking: An Overview: Hearing Before the Subcommittee on Human Rights and Wellness of the Committee on Government Reform, House of Representatives. 2003. Washington, D.C.: U.S. G.P.O.
<http://a257.g.akamaitech.net/7/257/2422/11may20041230/www.access.gpo.gov/congress/ho-use/pdf/108hr9/93282.pdf>.

Annotation: This lengthy report documents the October 29th, 2003 hearing on human trafficking and slavery that was held before the U.S. House of Representatives Subcommittee on Human Rights and Wellness. The report records several testimonies of government officials and outside experts on various forms of human trafficking and slavery around the world. The purpose of the hearing was ultimately to examine the practices of human trafficking and slavery around the world, and to illuminate the ways in which the United States is attempting to combat these illicit practices on both domestic and international levels. Although much of the report focuses primarily on the global problem of slavery and human trafficking, it also touches on trafficking and slavery issues that are prevalent in the United States. In each testimony, experts suggest ways that the U.S. Government can strengthen their own efforts as well as the efforts of other governments to combat this problem.

“Trafficking in Persons: the Federal Government’s Approach to Eradicate this Worldwide Problem: Hearing before the Subcommittee on Human Rights and Wellness of the Committee on Government Reform.” 2004. Washington D.C.: U.S. G.P.O.

http://frwebgate.access.gpo.gov/cgi-bin/getdoc.cgi?dbname=108_house_hearings&docid=f:97774.pdf.

Annotation: This detailed report examines the practice of human trafficking and slavery around the world, and addresses the ways in which the United States is attempting to combat these illicit practices both domestically and on an international scale. The report illustrates how the large profit potential of human trafficking and forced labor perpetuate the problem. It also outlines recent efforts of the U.S. Federal Government to strengthen its policies to combat trafficking and slavery, and examines the work of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) that build programs to address this illicit industry. The report examines how the efforts of these NGOs have enhanced the quality of life for victims of these crimes. The report also details a series of testimonies from experts who debate the public policy implications of trafficking in the United States.

U.S. Department of State. 2005. “The Facts About Human Trafficking for Forced Labor.” Washington D.C.: Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.

<http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/51174.pdf>.

Annotation: This report, released by the U.S. State Department, offers a brief summary of the international problem of human trafficking and forced labor. The report begins with a general definition of human trafficking and summarizes the most common reasons for human trafficking in the world. The article then goes on to describe the most common forms of forced labor around the world, and addresses some of the consequences that the victims suffer while enslaved. The article ends with a bulleted list of procedures the United States is taking to combat the problem of human trafficking, both domestically and abroad.

U.S. Department of State. 2005. “Trafficking in Persons Report.” Washington D.C.

<http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/47255.pdf>.

Annotation: This report, released by the U.S. Department of State in 2005, describes both the global problem of human trafficking and slavery, and the efforts of governments, international organizations, NGOs, and the media to eliminate the problem. Page twenty of the report discusses effective strategies that governments can use to combat trafficking and human slavery. Page 239 gives a detailed description of what the U.S. Government is doing to combat this problem both within the country and within the international community. This description includes a summary of the Protect Act of 2003, which was designed to protect children from slavery and to severely punish those who victimize young people. It also allows law enforcement officers to prosecute American citizens and residents who travel abroad to sexually and commercially abuse minors

U.S. Department of State. 2007. "Trafficking in Persons Report." Washington D.C. <http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/82902.pdf>.

Annotation: This report, released annually by the U.S. State Department, presents an updated, global look at the nature and scope of forced labor. It also addresses the broad range of actions being taken by governments around the world to confront and to eliminate the problem. This Report covers the period from April 2006 through March 2007. Page forty highlights the problem of forced labor in the United States, and outlines what the government is doing to combat the problem. The report discusses the accomplishments of the U.S. Government in terms of what they have done to increase the prosecution of perpetrators, to prevent forced labor incidents from occurring, and to protect victims of this crime.

Conclusion: Suggestions for Strengthening Efforts to Combat the Problem

van den Anker, Christien L., and Jeroen Doomernik, eds. 2006. Trafficking and Women's Rights. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

Annotation: Chapter seven of this book compares the strengths and weaknesses of anti-trafficking legislation in Belgium, Italy, the Netherlands, Sweden, and the United States. The author examines these countries because they are all considered destinations for victims of human trafficking and are rarely the country of origin. The focus of the article is on the importance of viewing human trafficking as a human rights issue, rather than discussing it as a security or immigration issue. The article demonstrates how these approaches do not view these individuals as victims of a crime, but instead view them as an illegal alien or as a law enforcement strategy.

Patten, Wendy. 2004. "U.S. Efforts to Combat Human Trafficking and Slavery." Human Rights Watch. http://hrw.org/english/docs/2004/07/15/usdom9075_txt.htm.

Annotation: This testimony by Human Rights Watch to the Senate Judiciary Committee addresses ways in which the U.S. Government can more effectively prosecute traffickers and protect victims of forced labor in the United States. The author claims that the United States should ratify the Trafficking in Persons Protocol, which requires governments to criminalize human trafficking and to provide assistance and protection to victims. The article also suggests that the U.S. Government provide witness and victim protection services for victims and their families, and that the government expand efforts to train federal law enforcement, prosecutors, and victim-witness personnel. Finally, the author claims that the United States is in a unique position to influence foreign governments to take similar action in order to combat this problem.

Richardson, Amy O'Neill. 1999. "Internal Trafficking in Women to the United States: A Contemporary Manifestation of Slavery in Organized Crime." Center for the Study of Intelligence. <https://www.cia.gov/library/center-for-the-study-of-intelligence/csi-publications/books-and-monographs/trafficking.pdf>

Annotation: The author of this report identifies reasons for the existence of and ways to reduce the incidences of forced labor and human trafficking within the United States. The report explains how weak economies and few job opportunities in foreign countries, low risk of prosecution and enormous profit potential for traffickers, and improved international transportation infrastructures contribute to the rise of human trafficking and forced labor in the United States. The author concludes by explaining how targeted prevention methods and microcredit strategies in the source countries, strengthening penalties and laws against traffickers in the United States, and enhancing assistance and protections for the victims can reduce the problems of forced labor and trafficking.

Shigekane, Rachel. 2007. "Rehabilitation and Community Integration of Trafficking Survivors in the United States." *Human Rights Quarterly* 29(1):112-136.

Annotation: The article describes the rehabilitation process of forced labor victims and addresses the multiple challenges they face in integrating back into society. The article also examines the effectiveness of the variety of services and advocacy programs that were formed after the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, and suggests ways in which these programs can more effectively help victims integrate into new communities. It furthermore outlines different types of rehabilitation services and programs that victims may need in order to live independently and self-sufficiently. Lastly, the article examines the complex reactions of immigrant communities to incidents of trafficking and forced labor.

A Growing Concern: Modern Slavery and Agricultural Production in Brazil and South Asia

By Justin Campbell

The modern use of slave labor in the production of agriculture takes many forms. In Brazil, the ability of powerful landowners to repress poor workers is an important element of large-scale agricultural production. In South Asia, cultural norms and traditions are used to exploit the most vulnerable communities. In both examples, inequity and poverty are implicit, and debt is a tool used to legitimize bondage.

Estimates of the number of slaves in Brazil today, virtually all of whom are involved in agricultural work, range from 25,000 to 100,000. This broad range of figures underscores the difficulty of accurately assessing, much less eradicating, the practice of slavery. Several factors contribute to this difficulty, making slavery a deeply entrenched facet of agricultural production in the country.

In Brazil, slave labor is typically utilized to harvest sugarcane and to clear vast amounts of land for raising cattle and for providing access to valuable timber. The importance of these products to the Brazilian economy is a factor that makes the agricultural sector prone to using slavery. Brazil is the world's largest exporter of sugar; an agricultural model of monoculture for export has influenced the expansion of large sugarcane plantations in frontier areas, simultaneously creating work and limiting other options available to the local population. Similarly, vast cattle ranches and logging operations are continually expanding in rural parts of the country, creating the need for a large workforce to clear land while displacing rural communities.

Corruption is a related facet of agricultural production in Brazil that frustrates efforts to eradicate slavery. This is perhaps inevitable in a country where the richest 10 percent of the population controls more than half of the wealth and almost all of the land. Generally, the Brazilian judicial system is more sympathetic to wealthy landowners who have political clout than to impoverished workers; several sources provide evidence that slaves have been discovered on the estates of prominent national figures, including a secretary of agriculture. Furthermore, these landowners are able to escape responsibility by using contractors to operate their estates and by feigning ignorance of how workers are treated on their land. As one Brazilian explains, "In the hinterland, the landowner is king."

Perhaps the most elemental factor perpetuating the use of slave labor in Brazil is the geography of the country itself. Most slaves work on estates in the extremely remote eastern Amazon region; in the fifth largest country in the world, the atrocities associated with slavery occur well out of view of most of the population. Landowners thus feel little restraint in how they treat their workers. In addition, the remoteness of these areas provides a convenient deterrent to escape.

These basic factors make it possible for landowners to utilize a system of debt, deceit, coercion, and violence to maintain their workforces. Enslavement typically begins with a hired contractor, known as a *gato*, who recruits impoverished men from the slums of large cities or poor, rural villages. By offering cash up front and the promise of decent wages, he is able to entice these men to leave their homes for work on a distant estate. The men are then driven hundreds or thousands of miles to a remote ranch or plantation, where they are informed that they are in debt for the costs of

transportation, food provided on the trip, and even tools. The debts are never erased; the illiterate workers have little recourse, and are thus enslaved.

The use of violence is a common aspect of slavery in Brazil, where slaves typically toil under the gaze of armed guards. Human rights groups have documented the murders of more than 1,200 slaves in Brazil; many more likely murders have been officially labeled as farming accidents. In these lawless regions, even government investigators and human rights advocates who attempt to interfere are targets of violence.

Despite the seemingly intractable nature of slave labor in Brazil, the government has been praised by the international community in recent years for its efforts to eliminate the practice. In 2003, the new president Luiz Inacio Lula da Silva unveiled the “National Plan for the Eradication of Slavery,” which is an ambitious plan that involves harsher penalties for slaveholders and offers improved organization of relevant government agencies. The crux of the plan was providing increased funding for mobile inspection units.

The mobile inspection units are a unique aspect of Brazil’s fight against slavery. These heavily armed squads are charged with the difficult and dangerous task of investigating claims of slave labor in the otherwise lawless countryside. Between 2003 and 2005, the squads were instrumental in freeing almost 7,000 slaves. Kevin Bales, president of Free the Slaves, cited Brazil’s use of these mobile squads as an example that should be emulated by other countries where modern slavery persists.

At the very least, Lula da Silva and his mobile squads represent a uniquely pro-active approach to the problem of modern slavery. Nevertheless, they face an uphill battle; for landowners, the benefits of using slave labor often outweigh the possible costs, and the practice remains a firmly entrenched element of agricultural production in Brazil.

It is important to note that the case of Brazil is only one example of the use of slave labor within agricultural production. The largest numbers of enslaved peoples worldwide are in South Asia, and are toiling in debt-bondage in a number of industries, including agriculture. As in Brazil, landlords in rural, agrarian communities in South Asia use debt to exploit the poor as a cheap source of labor. Whereas slaves clearing jungle at the edge of the Amazon represent an important cog in the economic machinery of export-minded Brazil, laborers bonded by debt in Nepal and Pakistan reflect a system of exploitation deeply rooted in tradition and culture.

The tradition of the Hindu caste system is an important factor in the perpetuation of bonded labor in South Asia. The vast majority of people working in a condition of debt bondage in the region are Dalits and members of indigenous communities. These groups are typically illiterate, live in abject poverty, and have historically been subject to systematic discrimination in all facets of social life. The caste system creates a social hierarchy within which any deviation on the part of an individual or group will incur punishment from the other groups, making it a self-perpetuating element of Hindu culture.

One important element of the caste system is the concept of *begar*, or the requirement of Dalits to provide service without payment. Traditionally, this entailed undertaking the most undesirable jobs as a contribution to the community, a category that includes agricultural work. As a cultural norm, *begar* has endured into modern times, and is often exploited by landowners as a means of sanctioning a system of debt bondage.

The fact that Dalits are typically landless means that they are oftentimes entirely dependent upon their landlords economically. This is particularly true of the indigenous Tharu communities in western Nepal, where most of that country's rice is grown. Within the exploitative debt labor system known as *Kamaiya*, Tharu families depend upon their landlords for even the most basic food and shelter.

Their position at the bottom of the caste system and their complete economic dependence upon landowners make Dalits particularly prone to exploitation. Often they are forced to accept loans from their employers to survive and to meet social obligations associated with death and marriage. These loans are designed to be impossible to pay back, and because Dalits are traditionally denied education, they are left with little recourse but to accept the loans and become indebted to their landlords. Just as one's position in the caste social hierarchy is inherited, so debts are passed from one generation to the next.

Debt bondage in South Asia is implemented with varying degrees of subtlety and coercion. In the Sindh Province in Pakistan, agricultural workers and sharecroppers, most of whom are from indigenous Indian communities, often work under constant watch from guards, and are kept locked up at night. Human rights groups have also documented cases of murder, rape, and assault of these workers. In other areas, a complete lack of options is sufficient to keep workers bonded to their employers.

The International Labor Organization (ILO) is exploring the concept of microfinance lending as a way to provide poor communities in South Asia with alternative options. Microfinance programs are designed to give poor laborers access to appropriate financial services. By gaining access to group-based savings and credit services, communities vulnerable to debt bondage are empowered to build assets and diversify sources of income, and are thus less dependent upon landlords.

Unlike that of Brazil, governments in South Asia have been reluctant to address the issue of slavery within their borders. Although the practice has been formally outlawed in most countries in the region, substantial government efforts to actually address the underlying causes of debt bondage, namely cultural norms and abject poverty, have been slow to materialize. Microfinance projects may prove in time to be an effective strategy, but like the mobile squads in Brazil, these efforts represent only a small first step in what will have to be a sustained campaign to eradicate slavery from the process of agricultural production.

Annotated Bibliography

Alexandroni, Sam. 2007. "Cry for the People Trade." *New Statesman* 137 (4858): 17-18.

Annotation: Marking the 200th anniversary of the abolition of the slave trade in the British Empire, the author emphasizes the need for increased awareness of modern forms of slavery. The brief article provides a short list of examples of modern slavery: bonded labor in Pakistan, coercion and violence on ranches and plantations in Brazil, trafficking of persons in Haiti and the Dominican Republic to work on sugar cane plantations, and household slaves in Mauritania. The article argues for the necessity of a new abolitionist movement, explaining that slavery is oftentimes overlooked because it does not pose a direct economic or security threat. The article

is clear and concise, but offers little in the way of details or possible avenues for further exploration of the issue.

Anti-Slavery International. 2001. "The Enslavement of Dalit and Indigenous Communities in India, Nepal and Pakistan through Debt Bondage." (February).
<http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/PDFbondedlabour.htm>

Annotation: This report addresses how the caste system in South Asia keeps certain members of society trapped in debt bondage. It briefly outlines the existing laws in India, Nepal, and Pakistan that are relevant to debt bondage, and explains why the condition continues to exist. The debate over the actual statistics for debt bondage in the region is discussed, and the report presents a list of recommendations for the three national governments.

Bales, Kevin. 1999. *Disposable People*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Annotation: Bales provides an authoritative overview of modern slavery, explaining how and why twenty-seven million people are enslaved throughout the world. Through case studies that focus on prostitution in Thailand, water delivery in Mauritania, brick making in Pakistan, bonded agricultural labor in India, and charcoal production in Brazil, Bales explores the modern manifestations of slavery in accessible and lively prose.

_____. 2000. "Expendable People: Slavery in the Age of Globalization." *Journal of International Affairs* 53(2): 461.

Annotation: Bales contrasts historical understandings of slavery with its modern forms. Slavery has adapted to changing legal, economic, and social conditions, becoming less visible yet more widespread. Whereas slaves were once regarded as property, in the modern world slaves have become disposable commodities. Bales makes this idea explicit with detailed examples from Mauritania and Sudan. He also provides a succinct, useful comparison of three broad forms of modern slavery: chattel slavery, debt bondage, and contract slavery.

_____. 2002. "The Social Psychology of Modern Slavery." *Scientific American* 286(4): 80.

Annotation: This article focuses primarily on the issue of debt bondage, by which unfair loans keep workers perpetually bonded to their employers. This aspect of modern slavery is discussed in conjunction with the ways in which psychological manipulation is also used to perpetuate modern forms of slavery. The author clearly demonstrates that slavery is not only persisting, but is in fact increasing in the modern world. The role of organized crime in human trafficking is explored as an example of the ways in which modern slavery continues to evolve and grow.

BBC News. 2007. "Slave' Labourers Freed in Brazil." *BBC News* (July 3).
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/6266712.stm>

Annotation: This news report describes a raid in Brazil that freed more than one thousand laborers from inhumane conditions on a sugar cane plantation in the Amazon in July of 2007. The article explains the ways in which rural farmers in Brazil are held in debt slavery and are forced to work far from their homes while living in conditions described as "appalling." This article explains how slavery remains widespread in Brazil, particularly within the sugar cane industry.

Banaji, Jairus. 2003. "The Fictions of Free Labour: Contract, Coercion, and So-Called Unfree Labour." *Historical Materialism* 11(3): 69-95.

Annotation: Banaji provides a theoretical assessment of the concept of contractual labor, arguing that there is little distinction between free and unfree labor within a capitalist system. The author refers mainly to a dichotomy between free and unfree labor in order to demonstrate that free labor is a construct of liberal ideology. Ultimately, according to this view, all wage labor is subject to coercion and bondage in varying degrees of subtlety. The only freedom any worker has is his or her capacity for resistance. Banaji does not clearly express the implications of this worldview for the issue of modern slavery, but the article's emphasis on the blurry distinction between free and unfree labor is a useful tool for determining which circumstances actually constitute slavery.

Belser, Patrick. 2007. "Building a Global Alliance against Forced Labour." *Global Social Policy* 7(1): 17-20.

Annotation: This article addresses the International Labor Organization's (ILO) plans for a "Global Alliance Against Forced Labor." It is a comprehensive source for statistics drawn from the ILO on the scope of modern forced labor. The article also describes the nature of forced labor and provides examples of where it is prevalent. The information is presented as evidence of the need for policy reform, at both national and global levels, in order to better address the issue of forced labor.

Bhukuth, Augendra. 2005. "Child Labour and Debt Bondage: A Case Study of Brick Kiln Workers in Southeast India." *Journal of Asian & African Studies* 40(4): 287-302.

Annotation: This article addresses of child labor in the brick kiln industry in India. Drawing on surveys conducted in Tamil Nadu, India, the author identifies reasons why children are exploited in the brick kiln industry. This is done within the context of existing analyses of the exploitation of children in the labor market in general. By also exploring many facets of the brick kiln industry in particular, the article concludes that although children are not employed directly, the industry is dependent upon child labor.

Caistor, Nick. 2005. "Brazil's 'Slave' Ranch Workers." *BBC News* (May 11).
<http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/americas/4536085.stm>

Annotation: This BBC news story uses Brazilian President Inacio Lula da Silva's trip to Africa, where he apologized for historical slavery in Brazil, to draw attention to the nature of modern slavery as it persists in Brazil. The article succinctly but effectively describes the nature of the practice, and describes how workers become enslaved on large ranches and plantations in the Amazon region. There is a sense of optimism that the Brazilian President's dedication to the issue of slavery will bring about positive changes in the country.

Daru, Patrick, Craig Churchill, and Erik Beemsterboer. 2005. "The Prevention of Debt Bondage with Microfinance-led Services." *European Journal of Development Research* 17(1): 132-154.

Annotation: The article focuses on the use of microfinance-led strategies by the International Labor Organization (ILO) to prevent debt bondage amongst the poorest and most vulnerable populations in South Asia. By addressing the definitions, causes, and forms of bonded labor in the region, the authors provide a context for their assessment of the project; this portion of the article also serves as a succinct overview of bonded labor on its own. The tone is cautiously optimistic, as the authors express some hope that microfinance-led strategies can have a positive impact for bonded laborers in South Asia.

Davidson, Osha Gray, and Andre Lambertson. 2005. "In The Land Of Slavery." *Rolling Stone* (982): 74-80.

Annotation: This informative article describes the means used by landowners in Brazil to deceive workers into becoming slaves on vast cattle ranches and farms known as *fazendas*. It also describes the oftentimes-violent means used to keep workers enslaved. This information, as well as a description of government efforts to fight slavery in Brazil, is provided in the context of a narrative account of an uncommonly successful raid by a federal anti-slavery squad on a *fazenda* isolated deep in the country's rugged interior. The article is an excellent source of first hand information on the violent reality of modern slavery in Brazil.

Dodson, Howard. 2005. "Slavery in the Twenty-First Century." *UN Chronicle* 42(3): 28-29.

Annotation: Dodson contrasts modern slavery with the history of the transatlantic slave trade. His short article does not provide useful details, but the author does attempt to put the magnitude of modern slavery in a historical context in order to draw attention to the issue. Whereas the transatlantic slave trade was legal, unique to particular industries, and thus highly visible, modern slavery is illegal, occurs in many varied industries, and thus goes largely unnoticed. The author calls for a modern revival of the abolitionist movement that is focused on the principle of basic human equality.

Doyle, Rodger. 2006. "Modern Slavery." *Scientific American* 294(1): 30-30.

Annotation: This article describes the ILO's work in identifying the scope of forced labor, but focuses primarily on the aspect of sexual exploitation. Sex-oriented forced labor is discussed within the context of state-imposed exploitation, which Doyle claims represents 20 percent of cases of forced labor worldwide. The short article is a useful source for statistics related to forced labor and its role in the world economy.

Epstein, Jack. 1995. "Slavery Nags Brazil as it Moves Ahead." *Christian Science Monitor* 87(166): 1.

Annotation: The article records efforts made by the government and by other institutions to address the issue of modern slavery in Brazil in the 1990s. At a time when the issue was beginning to attract international attention, the Brazilian government began imposing stricter laws to try to curtail the practice of slave labor. Various human rights groups insist, however, that widespread corruption is a well-entrenched element of slavery in Brazil. The tone of the article is thus doubtful of the effectiveness the measures taken by the government to eradicate slavery.

Hall, Kevin G. 2004. "Slavery Exists Out of Sight in Brazil." *Knight Ridder Newspapers* (September 24). http://www.mongabay.com/external/slavery_in_brazil.htm

Annotation: This online news article uses interviews with former slaves in Brazil to describe how people in the Amazon region are manipulated into working as slaves. The article also addresses the living and working conditions that slaves endure. They are held captive by violence or the threat of violence; for instance, the workers interviewed by the author worked at gunpoint to clear the jungle. The article identifies two reasons for the persistence of slavery in Brazil. First, the ranches and plantations that most often use slave labor are typically located in extremely remote areas of the Amazon rainforest, where law enforcement and the threat of inspection are virtually nonexistent. Second, the use of slaves to clear land is the first step in the lucrative process of exporting a variety of products; the author suggests that to abolish the slave labor would be disruptive to this process.

Human Rights Watch-Asia. 1995. "Contemporary Forms of Slavery in Pakistan." *Human Rights Watch*. <http://www.hrw.org/reports/pdfs/c/crd/pakistan957.pdf>

Annotation: This comprehensive report addresses the issue of modern slavery in Pakistan and provides recommendations for its eradication. The role of credit, the contract system, and the socioeconomic structure of the country are discussed as causes of modern slavery in Pakistan. Slavery is widespread in brick-kilns, carpet-weaving, and agriculture, each of which the author explains in detail, from the nature of the work to the ways in which workers become trapped in a

condition of slavery. The complacent and sometimes coercive role of the government of Pakistan is also identified as a factor that is perpetuating modern slavery in the country.

Human Rights Watch. 2002. "Labor Rights and Trade: Guidance for the United States in Trade Accord Negotiations." <http://hrw.org/press/2002/10/laborrights-bck.htm>

Annotation: Human Rights Watch argues that labor rights should be a priority of the United States in its role in trade accord negotiations. This report details reasons for this position and outlines ways to put it into practice. Freer trade has not prevented millions of people from being marginalized by the process of globalization; trade agreements should include mechanisms for ensuring that globalization does not occur at the expense of human rights.

_____. 2003. "Small Change: Bonded Labor in India's Silk Industry." <http://www.hrw.org/reports/2003/india/>

Annotation: Human Rights Watch provides this extensive report on the role of bonded child labor in India's silk industry. The report provides detailed recommendations for the government of India, the international community, retailers, suppliers, and consumers, on how to eradicate the practice. An exhaustive description of the process of silk production is supplemented by testimonies from child workers interviewed by the organization. Particularly useful is a section that explains the relationship between debt bondage and the caste system in India.

_____. 2004. "Turning a Blind Eye: Hazardous Child Labor in El Salvador's Sugarcane Cultivation." <http://hrw.org/reports/2004/elsalvador0604/index.htm>

Annotation: This extensive report covers many facets of the sugarcane industry in El Salvador, particularly emphasizing its dependence on child labor. The process of sugarcane cultivation, the role of sugar in the Salvadoran economy, the health risks posed to workers and particularly children, and the complacency of particular multinational corporations are all addressed in a comprehensive manner. Human Rights Watch interviewed many child laborers, and reports with authority on the hazardous conditions they face. The article suggests that businesses purchasing sugar from El Salvador are contributing to one of the most dangerous and most widespread examples of child labor anywhere in the world.

Kapstein, Ethan B. 2006. "The New Global Slave Trade." *Foreign Affairs* 85(6): 103-115.

Annotation: Kapstein focuses on human trafficking and the international slave trade. He argues that governments are capable of solving this problem, but that they have not shown a substantial interest in doing so. Within the context of globalization, the benefits of the international slave trade outweigh the costs associated with government sanctions. The author addresses the international treaties that have been formed to prevent human trafficking, and posits the suggestion that those countries most complicit in the act are not adequately punished.

Lerche, Jens. 2007. "A Global Alliance against Forced Labour? Unfree Labour, Neo-Liberal Globalization and the International Labour Organization." *Journal of Agrarian Change* 7 (4): 425-452.

Annotation: Lerche's focus is on the International Labor Organization (ILO) and its approach to forced labor. He begins with a brief history of the ILO, and discusses the organization's most recent report, "A Global Alliance Against Forced Labor," which, he contends, does not adequately address the relation of the global economy to forced labor. The theoretical positions of several contemporary experts on this issue are discussed. An extensive case study on debt bondage in India is provided and explained within the context of the larger relationship of capitalist development to forced labor.

Marrin, Pat. 1997. "Brazilian Poor Used as Slaves, Bishop Charges." *National Catholic Reporter* 33(40): 13.

Annotation: This article focuses on the efforts of American-born Brazilian Bishop Herbert Hermes to draw awareness to the issue of modern slavery in Brazil. The descriptive account of the means by which landowners enslave the poor is particularly interesting. The article also touches on the difficulties involved in documenting human rights concerns in the face of corruption and indifference, and addresses efforts to inform and to warn the poor people of the country. The article eventually wanders from slavery to the issue of displaced peoples in the rural countryside, with little effort made to connect the two. Nevertheless, it is an informative piece on the intractability of modern slavery in Brazil.

Masland, T., and R. Nordland. 1992. "Slavery." *Newsweek* 119(18): 30.

Annotation: This article introduces readers to the realities of modern slavery by using specific cases as well as a contextual overview of the causes and manifestations of the practice. Religion, tradition, and economic necessity are cited as cornerstones of slavery in modern times. Chattel slavery in Mauritania and debt bondage in South Asia are given particular attention, as are the efforts of Anti-Slavery International to fight modern slavery.

Mendonca, Maria Luisa. 2005. "The WTO and the Destructive Impact of the Sugarcane Industry in Brazil." Sao Paulo: Comissao Pastoral da Terra.
<http://www.landaction.org/gallery/cartilhaRedeEmIngles.pdf>.

Annotation: This report focuses on the expansion of the sugarcane industry in Brazil and on the negative consequences of this industry for workers and the environment. The Brazilian government's proposal to negotiate market access within the World Trade Organization (WTO), as well as the resulting monoculture of sugarcane for export, are viewed as causes of widespread devastation of rural communities. The author argues that an agricultural model based on

monoculture and large estates creates unemployment; many workers end up enslaved because of a lack of other options. This article is a useful source of information regarding factors that make slave labor in Brazil so entrenched, although the scope of the article is limited to the sugarcane industry.

Miers, Suzanne. 2000. "Contemporary Forms of Slavery." *Canadian Journal of African Studies* 34(3): 714-747.

Annotation: This article provides a broad overview of contemporary slavery. It provides a short history of slavery since the 1920s before moving on to describe various forms of modern slavery. The section dealing with debt bondage is particularly useful for its succinct description of the processes by which the system is perpetuated; several brief examples provide a solid basis from which to explore the issue further. The other themes covered include: sexual slavery, child slavery, forced labor and sweatshops, servile marriage, and ritual slavery. Anyone looking for information on one of these specific themes would do well to begin with Miers.

_____. 2003. Slavery in the Twentieth Century: The Evolution of a Global Problem. Lanham, MD: Alta Mira Press.

Annotation: Miers recounts the course of development of the anti-slavery movement over the last one hundred years, focusing mainly on Great Britain and Africa. Having provided a broad historical context, the author describes modern forms of slavery and many of the difficulties associated with their eradication. While it is largely a historical study, the book is a useful resource for understanding both causes and manifestations of modern slavery.

Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. 1991. "Fact Sheet No. 14, Contemporary Forms of Slavery." Geneva: United Nations.
<http://www.unhchr.ch/html/menu6/2/fs14.htm>.

Annotation: This short introduction to modern slavery is provided by the United Nations to raise public awareness of the issue. The fact sheet describes several forms of modern slavery: child labor, children in armed conflict, traffic in persons and sexual exploitation, the sale of children, and debt bondage. For each subject there is a very brief description of the general conditions that characterize each form of slavery. However, there is little in the way of hard facts and countries or regions where the practices are prevalent are not addressed. The document also gives an overview of several treaties, declarations, and conventions that deal with slavery, as well as addressing the particular role of the United Nations in eradicating slavery. The report concludes with suggestions for how individuals can help fight slavery.

Oli, Punya Prasad. 2003. "Poverty Reduction and Land Distribution to Kamaiya (Bonded Labor) in Nepal." *FIG Working Week*. Paris.

Annotation: Oli's report is somewhat difficult to read as the translation is imperfect. It is informative, however, and provides a detailed description of the Kamaiya system of bonded labor in Nepal. Oli outlines steps taken by the government in Nepal to eradicate the system. Although there were many difficulties in the implementation of the government plan, Oli's tone is optimistic. The author concludes that efforts made by the government have been largely successful. The extremely narrow focus of the report and the lack of any historical or global context make it unlikely that it would be useful to anyone looking for more than a comprehensive definition of the Kamaiya system.

United Nations Commission on Human Rights. 2002. "Combating Forced and Slave Labour and Violence in the Countryside." E/CN.4/2002/199.
<http://www.unhcr.ch/Huridocda/Huridoca.nsf/0/4f6bd292687f80d1c1256bd0004b1d56?Op=OpenDocument>

Annotation: The Brazilian government provided the United Nations Commission on Human Rights with this report outlining recent Brazilian efforts to combat slave labor. The document describes the campaign to better coordinate the efforts of various branches of the Brazilian government in fighting slavery. It also describes the Special Mobile Inspection Unit, an enforcement unit responsible for inspecting claims of slave labor in the interior. The tone of the document is optimistic, and cites both successes of the newly formed agencies and help from non-governmental organizations working in rural parts of the country as evidence that the situation in Brazil is improving.

Villanger, Espen. 2006. "Is Bonded Labor Voluntary? Evidence from the Liberation of the Kamaiyas in the Far-Western Region of Nepal. In *Bonded Labor in Nepal*." *Working Paper 2006:16*. Bergen, Norway: Chr. Michelsen Institute.

Annotation: Villanger describes in depth the Kamaiya system of bonded labor in Western Nepal, and explores the effects of the Nepalese government's efforts beginning in 2000 to ban the deeply entrenched system. Drawing from numerous interviews with families in several isolated villages where the Kamaiya laborers were given varying degrees of governmental help, the author presents empirical evidence needed to assess whether the system constitutes non-voluntary labor, and whether the government ban was beneficial or harmful to the welfare of the laborers. While the scope of the paper is limited, it could prove useful to anyone seeking a definition of bonded labor. The specific strategies described for its eradication could also be applicable to other similar situations.

Poverty's Captives

By Tim Brauhn

Today's manifestations of bondage are a marked departure from those of pre-modern slavery. Now the value of the human "goods" is so low that slavers do not have to worry about damaging them. Two hundred years ago, slaves had to at least be treated with a modicum of safety, if for no other reason than to ensure continued profitability. But in the 20th and 21st centuries, slavers have become less like "hunters" and more like "gatherers," since their work no longer involves raids and chains, at least in the physical sense. No, today's raids are the false promises of work and money that are employed to lure the poor into situations from which they are unable to escape, due either to violence, or to the threat of violence. Chains persist as the continued destitution of those who are unlucky enough to fall victim to such false promises. So how does poverty contribute to the resurgence and continued growth and profitability of the international slave trade? This section of the Digest investigates the deep-seated role that poverty plays in the recruitment and retention of modern slaves, and investigates policy options aimed at combating both indigence and its sad accomplice, enslavement.

Even conservative statistics point to a massive proportion of people living in poverty worldwide. While many of them may enjoy a greater level of relative safety than did previous generations, they are no less at risk for the predations of slave-traders than their predecessors were. Contemporary slavers prey on the poor because poor people represent opportunities for exploitation. And from the perspective of the poor, slavers offer the promise of attractive jobs and good pay. When the possibility of work (or in some cases, food) arises, a parallel opportunity for potential enslavement comes into being. Oftentimes, the people making these promises of work are members of an extended family, or perhaps even friends. Regardless of the connection, these people are nevertheless slavers. Their numbers are growing, and they target both adults and the young alike.

The occurrence of child labor is also a consequence of poverty. For poor families, allowing (or sending) their child to work is one of the only ways to support the family. If the choice is between starving and eating, what kind of parent would not allow their child to work? It is at this point, when families are at their poorest, that slavers strike. Many parents entrust their young to slavers who promise safety and, at the least, regular meals for their children. Yet the children are seldom treated as well as promised. Compounding this problem is the cultural practice, most common in Africa, of placing children in the care of extended family members in hopes of a better life. Many young people *do* take it upon themselves to work, either to support their family or to further their own education; slavers can exploit this desire without resorting to overt means of ensnarement.

If children are working, they are probably not attending school, which in turn perpetuates the cycle of slavery. Efforts to bring children out of the fields and into school have involved such simple projects as offering free food to students. To families living in indigence, such an incentive might be enough to send their children to school. But these efforts are still only in place on a grassroots level. Even if states have enacted mandatory education standards, economic (survival) interests may supplant those laws. In these cases, the economics of poverty that drive people into a subsistence lifestyle are the same economic structures that slavers can exploit.

For instance, consider the common occurrence of debt-bondage in South Asia. A poor person might borrow money in order to survive, to start a business, etc. When they cannot repay the loan, either due to exorbitant interest rates or to other factors, they become bonded in debt to the original lender. This might sound similar to indentured servitude, but bonded debtors seldom escape the debt cycle. Their employers may “pay” them, but such disbursements will not be enough to repay the original loan. Note that debt-bondage also occurs when regular workers are paid such very low wages by employers that they are forced to eventually borrow money, usually from their employer. Under this system, debts can persist across generations. This perpetual debt bondage is most certainly classifiable as slavery, as it is usually the threat of violence that holds laborers in place. Whatever its particular manifestation, contemporary slavery is a growing problem. Nevertheless, a burgeoning global anti-slavery movement is increasingly making its voice heard.

International institutions are placing slavery high on their lists of concerns more often. Why then, has the practice of modern slavery grown so pervasive? The answer is that it is cheap to initiate the practice, and it is easy to continue making money. Slavers travel to a locale with limited employment opportunities and/or a high level of poverty. They offer jobs to the people. These jobs do not actually have to exist, but if they do, they certainly do not match the description given to the people. Those who are interested in these “jobs” are trafficked across an international border (although not always), their identification is confiscated, and they are put to work in whatever capacity the employer sees fit. Workers are threatened with bodily harm if they attempt to leave. Even if they do escape, their lack of documentation, and the fact that they might be hundreds or even thousands of miles away from home makes it highly likely that they will face further abuses. Systems need to be put in place in order to protect and, perhaps more importantly, to find these people.

But many states, including the United States, still have not defined accurate legal protections for those who manage to escape their employers or those who are freed. In some states, freed slaves have a low social status. This is especially the case with prostitutes, who may carry dangerous sexually-transmitted diseases and who oftentimes suffer from post-traumatic stress disorder. Freed slaves may not have any applicable skills that would allow them to reintegrate into society and make a living. They could therefore end up cycling back into slavery due to the very same lack of opportunity that led them there in the first place. International law is still murky in cases in which slaves have been trafficked to foreign countries; repatriation might not be a desirable option, since the economic conditions that led to enslavement will most likely still exist in their home state.

The alleviation of poverty provides one of the best opportunities for reducing the proliferation and power of the modern slave trade. Cutting in half extreme poverty by 2015 happens to be one of the stated objectives of the United Nations’ Millennium Development Goals, and as such, a great deal of attention has been paid to the eradication of poverty worldwide. The awarding of the 2006 Nobel Peace Prize to the Grameen Bank, the world’s quintessential poverty-combating institution, should therefore come as no surprise. The award follows and lends strength to the explosion of microcredit ventures in the developing world. But microcredit/microfinance is still viewed as an uncertain method of sustainable growth, as it is still perhaps too early to decide whether high repayment rates are the result of true economic growth, or if they are simply the promise of future lending activity. In addition, the literature on microcredit is woefully lacking in its descriptions of concrete policy outcomes from microlending in impoverished communities. While the stated goal of

microcredit is to eliminate/reduce poverty, what does this goal really mean for those most affected by poverty and the slave trade?

If global poverty rates were to drop, the profitability of the slave trade would decrease markedly. Labor costs across the board would rise, and the amount of available cheap or free labor would shrink; there would be fewer poor people to exploit. Undoubtedly, slavers would have to become even bolder in finding targets for enslavement. And if their methods grew in brutality and complexity, they would be unable to remain as deeply underground as they have been up until this point. They would be seen more often, and the accompanying rise in awareness would increase their visibility even more. Poverty, it seems, is not the only self-perpetuating phenomenon. In much the same fashion, increases in living standards would bring about, and be brought about by, the development of educational apparatuses. If people knew what to look out for, they might be better disposed towards avoiding enslavement.

It should be noted, however, that not all victims of slavery are poor or uneducated. Such a generalization would be unfair to the enslaved, and would misrepresent the willingness of slavers to lie to absolutely anyone in order to gain more human capital. Many middle-class people, yearning for adventure or financial inviolability, find themselves enslaved across borders, and even across oceans, as restaurant employees, domestic servants, or even as prostitutes. Even highly-educated people such as college graduates can be tempted into pursuing these phantom job offers in overseas markets. If there is a lack of local employment, these offers could be a very attractive opportunity indeed. Poverty as a lack of financial mobility is at least one part of the problem, but a dearth of potential job offerings can piggyback with poverty, making it possible to attract individuals from many more demographics of a population than only the impoverished.

Slavery is harder to combat now than it was before its official abolition. This statement seems contradictory, but it is quite reasonable. The relative invisibility of modern slaves is due to three main factors: race is not as much of an issue as it was in the past, as anyone can now be enslaved. Since it is an illegal activity, record books of transactions are not in the public business domain. Additionally, globalization has greatly increased the ability of slavers to move these “products” across borders and to coordinate with sending and receiving countries. A possible fourth factor is the relative lack of knowledge, especially in the United States, of the mere existence of modern slavery. Certainly, since there are laws on the books against it, it cannot possibly still be around. But it *is* still around, and as long as great swaths of the earth’s population live in abject poverty, there will still be ready sources of income for slavers.

Eliminating or reducing poverty would provide better living standards for billions of people and, as a byproduct, lower their vulnerability to enslavement. An accompanying rise in health and education could contribute to increased job opportunities, thereby removing a need to emigrate for work. Tracking this progress has proven difficult; while some areas of the globe have decreased their poverty rates, others have actually experienced increased rates. As awareness of the insidious trade in humans grows, greater attention will be paid to poverty’s role in providing exploitable situations. But with a nearly limitless supply of potential slaves living in poverty, can the international community act fast enough to protect them?

Selected Bibliography

Ahmad, Mokbul Morshed. 2003. "Distant Voices: The Views of the Field Workers of NGOs in Bangladesh on Microcredit." *Geographical Journal* 169 (1):65-74.

Annotation: This interesting article records the opinions of non-governmental organization (NGO) field workers in Bangladesh. The opinions are usually not positive, suggesting a disconnect between the management and the workers in the field. The NGOs in question are all microcredit programs. Some of the criticisms leveled at them by the field workers are illustrated. For instance, accessibility to management for the poorest of the poor seems to be a consistent problem. Another question involves the difference between providing microcredit monies and providing services like health or education that could perhaps build stronger societies. The managers of microcredit NGOs are accused of having tunnel vision when it comes to determining the provisions of their organizations, and of actively (but not maliciously) excluding other noble development enterprises.

Anti-Slavery International. 2001. "Discrimination on the Basis of Work and Descent: The Enslavement of Dalit and Indigenous Communities in India, Nepal and Pakistan through Debt Bondage." <http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/goonesekere.pdf>.

Annotation: This Anti-Slavery International document, submitted to the United Nations Sub-Commission on Human Rights, outlines the occurrence of debt bondage in Pakistan, India, and Nepal. It concentrates specifically on the disproportionate numbers of Dalits, or members of the lowest caste in India, who are victims of debt bondage. Also, a disproportionate number of indigenous people are overrepresented among those in debt bondage. These groups are usually at the low end of economic parity within their given state. The poverty that tends to accompany such a status is eminently exploitable by those searching for cheap, bonded labor.

Anti-Slavery International. 2005. "1807-2007: Over 200 Years of Campaigning against Slavery." <http://www.antislavery.org/homepage/resources/PDF/1807-2007.pdf>.

Annotation: This article from Anti-Slavery International describes in great detail the last two hundred years of the international slave trade, from the beginning of the anti-slavery movement in Britain to the present, identifying problems with international trafficking in persons. Anti-Slavery International has been at the vanguard of combating slavery for many years, presenting sound research and methodology. Aside from informing the reader about the changing face of both slavery and its opponents since 1807, this article also paints a picture of hope that things will again change for the better.

Bales, Kevin. 2000. "Expendable People: Slavery in the Age of Globalization." *Journal of International Affairs* 53 (2):461.

Annotation: Bales' influential article (a modified version of his seminal book) lays out contemporary slavery in a very easy to understand manner. Globalization, he contends, has contributed to the growth of slavery by allowing downward pressure on wage rates in the developing world. This economic vulnerability, combined with a high population growth and lack of regulation, creates space for, in a manner of speaking, the commercialization of humans. Aside from contributing to the proliferation and elaboration of contemporary slavery, globalization has also made possible the cooperation of world agencies and states in combating the practice today.

Bales, Kevin. 2001. "Going Cheap." *New Internationalist* (337):14.

Annotation: This article begins by noting the worldwide media attention placed on the "slave ship of Benin," a ship carrying two hundred enslaved children. The ship was refused docking at Gabon and Cameroon, and when it finally docked in Benin, there were only forty-three children left. They were sold into slavery in Gabon. The rest of the article explains the economics of the new slavery, and points to slavery's ties in the cocoa, carpet, sugar, and jewelry industries. The author comments that the global anti-slavery movement is still in its infancy.

Bales, Kevin, and Peter T. Robbins. 2001. "'No One Shall Be Held in Slavery or Servitude': A Critical Analysis of International Slavery Agreements and Concepts of Slavery." *Human Rights Review* 2 (2):18.

Annotation: This article traces shifting definitions of slavery since the first laws of abolition were passed in 1815. The authors identify three dimensions of modern slavery: loss of free will, appropriation of labor power, and violence or the threat of violence. They then explicate the different forms that slavery takes, and show that, while all three dimensions might not be present at once in any given situation, at least one will be present. Definitional issues aside, this article does a fine job of showing slavery's continued prevalence, and suggests options for reducing its power.

Besley, Timothy, and Robin Burgess. 2003. "Halving Global Poverty." *The Journal of Economic Perspectives* 17 (3):3-22.

Annotation: This article provides a number of policy recommendations for achieving the United Nations' Millennium Development Goals' target of halving of global poverty. The article details areas of social existence that can cause impoverishment, and which may in fact be improved by a reduction in poverty. It does not specifically mention slavery, but it does provide a great deal of information about attempts to control poverty. The authors place the onus of poverty reduction not on states, but on an institution-level approach, which is more in line with current microeconomic theories.

Bhukuth, Augendra. 2005. "Child Labour and Debt Bondage: A Case Study of Brick Kiln Workers in Southeast India." *Journal of Asian & African Studies* 40 (4):287-302.

Annotation: The line between child work and child labor is a thin one, and is further complicated by the International Labor Organization's (ILO) attempts to define the "worst forms of child labor." The authors of this article point out the conditions of poverty that can lead to child exploitation as laborers. The article focuses on child workers in brick kilns in India, and addresses the role that their parents might play in sending their children away to work. The author mentions how children can be sent to work when the family income falls below the household survival level. The article provides a very concise look at the issues surrounding child labor.

Blagbrough, Jonathan, and Edmund Glynn. 1999. "Child Domestic Workers: Characteristics of the Modern Slave and Approaches to Ending Such Exploitation." *Childhood* 6 (1):51.

Annotation: This article addresses the prevalence of child domestic workers (domestics) and the work being done to reduce and to eventually do away with the practice itself. The authors note some of the potential abuses that domestics may face, including long hours and physical abuse. What makes the problem so difficult to combat is that in many cases, the sending family allows their children to become domestic workers because it is seen as an acceptable thing to do. The authors of this article do not shy away from criticizing this "cultural" practice. They recommend a gradualist methodology, combined with increased governmental involvement, in order to combat the problem.

Chuang, Janie. 2006. "Beyond a Snapshot: Preventing Human Trafficking in the Global Economy." *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies* 13 (1):137-163.

Annotation: This article details the frequent reluctance or inability of states to properly attend to or even address the root causes behind the global trade of human beings. The author notes that states often attempt prosecution as opposed to prevention, and that a comprehensive plan to promote the socioeconomic status of vulnerable people is necessary if the problem is to be addressed comprehensively. This plan, she notes, would be built on a framework of human rights. The plan's implementation worldwide would do much to curb the trade of humans. Also discussed is the lack of proper bylaws to handle slaves who happen to be involved in illegal activities.

Dodson, Howard. 2005. "Slavery in the Twenty-First Century." *UN Chronicle* 42 (3):28-29.

Annotation: The author uses this short article to lay out the modern-day institution of slavery. He discusses how it is not only more prevalent today than it was during the 400-plus years of the transatlantic slave trade, but that it is also much more powerful and dangerous. This is due to

three main factors: (1) slavery is now illegal, so records of transactions and, of course, the slaves themselves, must be kept secret; (2) slavery is no longer racially-based, so nearly anyone can now become enslaved; (3) there is no guarantee that a slave will stay in his or her home country, as they stand a chance of being trafficked to the other side of the world. Like many articles of its ilk, this piece serves very well to introduce the problem of contemporary slavery.

Dottridge, Mike. 2002. "Trafficking in Children in West and Central Africa." *Gender and Development* 10 (1):38-42.

Annotation: Dottridge describes the trafficking of children in West Africa by stating in his first sentence that "Poverty is a central factor in the decision of parents to send their children away to work." The rest of the article addresses the ways in which children are separated from their families in order to supposedly make money to support them. The work of various NGOs is also explained. The author mentions the difference in gender roles with respect to child labor, and suggests complicity on the part of some West African governments in allowing the slave trade to continue on their soil. His contention is that if the majority of the poor who are being turned over to traffickers and slavers were male rather than female, perhaps additional action might be taken to combat poverty and/or slavery.

Elahi, Khandakar Q., and Constantine P. Danopoulos. 2004. "Microfinance and Third World Development: A Critical Analysis." *Journal of Political & Military Sociology* 32 (1):61-77.

Annotation: Microfinance/microcredit is a controversial topic, and this article does not shy away from its status as such. The authors investigate whether microfinance ventures in the developing world have actually done more good than harm. The tough questions, they argue, are simply not being asked often enough; the answers certainly haven't been forthcoming. Does repayment of loans occur at a high level because of increased economic ability, or does the mere promise of more loans promote repayment? The article's overall tone is cautious, as it is understood that such studies will necessarily have to occur over a very long period of time.

Engerman, Stanley L. 2000. "Slavery at Different Times and Places." *The American Historical Review* 105 (2):480-484.

Annotation: This interesting article highlights what the author considers to be shortcomings within the scholarship on slavery as it has occurred in the past, and how these shortcomings might affect policy decisions in the present day. He argues that slavery rarely develops as a series of cut-and-dry factors. Instead, the author focuses on misperceptions, especially in the West, that reduce slavery to considerations of racism and power. This is incorrect, the author notes, and points to a number of periods in the past when slavery may have been more "desirable," read safer, than the current system of rule. He also makes an interesting correlation between development and slavery, noting that when a society rises above subsistence, it actually increases the possibility and profitability of slavery.

Fitzgibbon, Kathleen. 2003. "Modern-Day Slavery? The Scope of Trafficking in Persons in Africa." *African Security Review* 12 (1):9.

Annotation: The article's author, the senior reporting officer for Africa in the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons of the United States Department of State, explains the various definitions and manifestations of trafficking in Africa. She notes the various causes of contemporary slavery and its effects on human rights, public health, human capital, and social exclusion. These are the effects most often associated with illicit trade in humans, but the author goes a step further and identifies the effects of trafficking on the erosion of governmental authority in the presence of organized crime. Although it is a short piece, the article's mention of the political dimension of slavery is a welcome addition to the discourse on the topic.

Godrej, Dinyar. 2001. "Of Human Bondage." *New Internationalist* (337):9.

Annotation: Godrej's article focuses on the semantic difficulties in describing the concept of "debt bondage," the most prevalent form of modern slavery. An estimated twenty million of the world's slaves are debt-bonded. Godrej posits a clear distinction between those who are actually in debt bondage, and those who are, in all respects, slaves. The line is a thin one, to be sure. His main contention is that a person in debt bondage becomes a slave when they are no longer allowed to leave, physically, the location of their bondage. In most other respects, those who are bonded are simply being exploited economically for a debt that they will probably never repay.

Gunnell, Barbara. 2004. "Nothing to Sell but their Bodies." *New Statesman* 133 (4677):32-33.

Annotation: This short article excoriates, in a roundabout way, the lack of concern that Western Europeans have for the crushing poverty that so often drives people into slave status. It focuses on Nepal, where the government spends three times more money fighting Maoist rebels than it does educating its population. This disregard for the proper development of its own citizens, combined with misguided efforts of international NGOs, contributes greatly to the continuing strength of economically-motivated slavery in the modern world.

International Labor Organization - Department for International Development. 2007. "Breaking the Chains: Eliminating Slavery, Ending Poverty."

http://www.britainusa.com/sections/articles_show_nt1.asp?d=0&i=41063&L1=41063&L2=0&a=46086

Annotation: The Department for International Development (DFID) of the International Labor Organization (ILO) released this "promotional" material to inform members of the general public about contemporary slavery. The year 2007 marks the bicentenary of the Abolition of the Slave Trade Act, which officially outlawed the slave trade in the British Empire. The article

details the state of modern slavery, and addresses steps being taken by the ILO and DFID to combat it. It is a readable presentation of fairly shocking information.

International Labor Office. 2005. "A Global Alliance against Forced Labour"
http://www.ilo.org/dyn/declaris/DECLARATIONWEB.DOWNLOAD_BLOB?Var_DocumentID=5059

Annotation: This International Labor Organization (ILO) report explains the current state of forced labor. The report is worth reading; the section on poverty as it relates to forced labor is especially interesting. It shows how poverty can be not only a cause of slavery, but how it can also be a result of slavery. Real wages lost in the slave trade, money that could be used by the slaves, is simply not being spent. This depresses local economies, in addition to creating a worldwide ripple effect. As slaves are freed, they actually contribute to the economy.

Jones, Loring, David W. Engstrom, Tricia Hilliard, and Mariel Diaz. 2007. "Globalization and Human Trafficking." *Journal of Sociology & Social Welfare* 34 (2):107-122.

Annotation: In this article, the authors present an easy-to-understand yet detailed breakdown of human trafficking. Not only does the piece concern itself with the causes, manifestations, and policy implications of trafficking but it also addresses the "human" side of the illicit trade of humans, as told specifically from the view of social workers. Additionally, the authors address the semantic difficulties present in even topical discussions of slavery. The article is a worthy introductory look at the international institution of human trafficking.

Lancet. 2003. "Slavery Today." *Lancet* 361 (9375):2093.

Annotation: This editorial is a very compact piece that touches on many of the most pressing issues regarding the illicit trade in humans. The author notes the occurrence of debt-bondage and its reliance on un-payable fees in order to keep cheap laborers. The extreme reach of slavery is also mentioned, as is the difficulty of combating it on both a global scale and a state level. The author suggests policy options and commonsense notions for freeing, protecting, and then shielding slaves from further exploitation.

Leuchtag, Alice. 2003. "Human Rights Sex Trafficking and Prostitution." *Humanist* 63 (1):10.

Annotation: In her article, Leuchtag reprises the life narrative of a prominent Thai sex worker. She then details the sex tourism industry of Thailand, a nation that is, in so many of her words, driven by international monetary policy into allowing flagrant abuses of human rights. Her contention is that Thailand will take no concrete steps to curb this abuse since it derives a massive amount of its gross domestic product (GDP) from its sex workers. The author then mentions some of the many pitfalls of legalized prostitution, and expresses a hope that the

United Nations' Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons would eventually be extended to such "acceptable" sex-industry activities.

Maier, Katrin. 2006. "Inquiry." *Journal of Children & Poverty* 12 (2):175-185.

Annotation: This interview with Richard Danziger, head of the Counter-Trafficking Division of the International Organization for Migration (IOM), covers a broad range of topics related to the study of contemporary slavery. Although it focuses primarily on how slavery is aggravated by trafficking, Danziger also addresses prostitution, poverty, and globalization in various contexts. He notes initiatives that the IOM is promoting among the developed and underdeveloped countries of the world, and how treaties and conventions can only do so much to stem the flow of slaves and the growth of the industries that rely on slave labor.

Manzo, Kate. 2005. "Exploiting West Africa's Children: Trafficking, Slavery and Uneven Development." *Area* 37 (4):393-401.

Annotation: The author of this article is concerned with semantic problems that are encountered when describing a slave; this article in particular focuses on child labor in the form of slavery and its relationship to child trafficking. The author notes the media sensationalism surrounding the "exploitation" of child labor, even when such labor is not exploitative. The only substantive portion of the article, from the point of view of a researcher, is the presentation of a theory that uneven development, in this case Western Africa, greatly increases the likelihood of labor exploitation. Inhabitants of impoverished countries with high unemployment are easily trapped by false promises of economic relief across borders.

Miers, Suzanne. 2000. "Contemporary Forms of Slavery." *Canadian Journal of African Studies / Revue Canadienne des Etudes Africaines* 34 (3):714-747.

Annotation: This article is a perfect starting point for research of, and discussion about, contemporary slavery. Not only does the author investigate the twisted history of terminology inherent in discussions of slavery; she also follows the growth of bureaucratic apparatuses to deal with its various forms. These forms are illuminated at length in the different sections of the article. It is a well-researched and very reasonable attempt at explaining contemporary slavery in all of its forms. For seasoned and beginning researchers alike, the author offers a very easy-to-approach style.

Miller, John R. 2006. "Slave Trade." *Harvard International Review* 27 (4):70-73.

Annotation: This article serves to explicate modern day slavery, or what the author terms "trafficking in persons" (TIP). It also aims to inform the reader of the very human costs of the trade, including post-traumatic stress disorder, disease, and violence. The article is concerned with the global trade of people for sexual exploitation. The author notes that even though global

poverty has decreased slightly in recent years, the slave trade has surged markedly. This, he contends, is due in large part to an increased ease of communication and transportation.

Minitzer, Richard. 1999. "The False Promise of Slave Redemption." *Atlantic Monthly* 284 (1):63-70.

Annotation: This is a fascinating article that explains in no uncertain terms how the popular practice of "buying" the freedom of slaves, in this case southern Sudanese, actually contributes to further enslavement. Western NGOs in the early to mid-1990s raised many thousands of dollars to buy and free slaves in Sudan. This practice, which is deliciously profitable for slave-owners, does not cause them to stop slaving. On the contrary, they have recognized such purchases as an even greater incentive for raiding villages for slaves. Well-meaning activism makes it pointless to even consider setting slaves free when their freedom might be purchased in the future.

Morrison, Tamsin. 2005. "The Effect of Just a £20 Loan." *New African* (436):50-51.

Annotation: This article tells the story of Alice Jere, a Zambian woman, who after receiving a £20 loan from a microlending institution, became a successful entrepreneur. Ms. Jere stopped working in a copper mine to support her family, and instead bought fifty chickens. She now has 800 chickens, sells cooking oil and sugar, and even employs other members of her community. A very small institutional investment brought Ms. Jere out of poverty; she is now helping others to do the same. Her initial loan is a perfect example of how microfinancing can work when it works well. Other success stories are also mentioned in the article.

Opondo, Maggie, and Seniorina Wendoh. 2006. "Old Wine in New Skins: A Marshall Plan for Africa?" *Antipode* 38 (4):686-690.

Annotation: This short letter from the Editorial Board of the journal *Antipode* mockingly refers to a "Marshall Plan" for Africa, and excoriates the developed world's attempts to "help" Africa along in its development. Citing numerous examples of failed initiatives and mis-focused Western empathy towards the continent, the authors point out that the one thing that must change in order to stop and to reverse the perceived downward slide of Africa is to hold the heads of its governments accountable for their actions. Development can still occur from the outside inward, but without structures in place to guide it along, it could all be for naught.

Posel, Dori. 1997. "Counting the Poor: Who Gets What in Which Households?" *Agenda* (33):49-60.

Annotation: This article explains the role that statistical analysis plays in the reporting of poverty risks. At stake are differences in gender-based research and the role that spending plays within households. The main thrust of the article is that even though the label of "poverty" can be applied to diverse situations based on a preset earning amount, deeper investigations of the data reveal a great deal more about a given economic situation. Although primarily concerned with

data on South African poverty statistics, the article's findings can be applied to a variety of geographical locations.

Ravallion, Martin, Gaurav Datt, and Dominique van de Walle. 1991. "Quantifying Absolute Poverty in the Developing World." *Review of Income & Wealth* 37 (4):345-361.

Annotation: Although this is not an article dealing specifically with either the causes of poverty or its effects on the rise of contemporary slavery, this piece investigates statistical data and attempts (in terms of the early 1990s) to provide a more reasonable approximation of what constitutes extreme poverty. For those unfamiliar with statistical interpretation, much of the article will appear unreadable. However, for those attempting to gain a deeper understanding of poverty statistics and the functional-financial options available to policymakers, the article works well. The piece also quantifies the need for increased consumption levels on the part of the poor.

Skrivankova, Klara. 2006. "Combating Trafficking in Human Beings." *International Review of Law, Computers & Technology* 20 (1/2):229-232.

Annotation: This article focuses on the lack of state protections for victims of the global slave trade. Persons revealed to be slaves are seldom afforded the necessary legal protection to prevent them from being re-trafficked or harmed while they await the authorities' actions. Status as a trafficked person is oftentimes accorded with illegality, and, in the European Union especially, slaves are unable to seek proper legal redress. The author notes that numerous conventions to support the basic legal rights of trafficked persons are frequently left unenforced or remain unsigned. These basic legal privileges would greatly increase the ability of slaves to break out of the cycle of servitude.

Staiger, Ines. 2005. "Trafficking in Children for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation in the EU." *European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law & Criminal Justice* 13 (4):603-624.

Annotation: This article looks at the development of the European Union's attempts to combat the trafficking of humans, especially children, for the purpose of sexual slavery. Concerning herself mainly with the legal definitions of such vague terms as consent, sexual exploitation, and smuggling, the author also profiles child sex traffickers, the children themselves, and those for whom the slaves are provided. The author also describes in great detail Germany's legal code with respect to child sex trafficking. Unless one is concerned especially with child sex trafficking in Germany, the last few pages are of no consequence, save the concluding remarks on the inefficiency and ineptitude of both Germany's and the European Union's child sex laws.

Tavip, Saepul. 2006. "A Kind of Modern Slavery: Labor Flexibility Comes to Indonesia: An Interview with Saepul Tavip." *Multinational Monitor* 27(4).

Annotation: This interview with Mr. Saepul Tavip, a member and past chair of the Indonesian Association of Trade Unions, illuminates the role of labor unions in the reform age after the departure of Suharto in Indonesia. Involuntary termination of employment is instilled in the Indonesian business community, and when combined with Western interests for cheap labor, the positions of industrial workers are tenuous at best. The interview provides information about further changes to union laws that make workers even less well-protected. To avoid the risk of termination, much bargaining power is lost, and benefits and wages are generally decided entirely by the employer to the detriment of the employee.

Wilson, Deborah G., William F. Walsh, and Sherilyn Kleuber. 2006. "Trafficking in Human Beings: Training and Services among US Law Enforcement Agencies." *Police Practice & Research* 7 (2):149-160.

Annotation: This article's main focus is on the perception of human trafficking within United States law enforcement at the local level. A comprehensive survey was distributed to police departments nationwide, and the results quite clearly show that while local law enforcement officers are far more likely to uncover potential and actual victims/operations of human trafficking, they believe that the federal government should be the primary enforcer of anti-trafficking legislation. It appears from the results of the study that in most cases officers do not know modern slavery when they see it. The author notes that even when trafficking cases are revealed, they often involve female sex slaves, and that officers tend to view these victims first as prostitutes and then as trafficked persons, a worldview that is exactly backwards. The United States, as an affluent nation, is and will continue to be a receiver of trafficked people. It is the duty of local law enforcement agencies to train and prepare for the continued influx of these persons.

Woolman, Stu, and Michael Bishop. 2006. "State as Pimp: Sexual Slavery in South Africa." *Development Southern Africa* 23 (3):385-400.

Annotation: This article by a duo of constitutional lawyers details the sex slave trade in South Africa. The authors note the importation of slaves from as far away as Thailand, which boasts its own massive sex industry. Many of these Thai sex slaves are actually educated women who are tricked into pursuing lucrative restaurant jobs in major South African cities. The same is true of slaves "stolen" from across South Africa's borders. Such women are, in essence, kidnapped from border villages by businessmen and truck drivers, relocated to South Africa, and raped before being released. Sadly, a lack of constitutional protection, as well as continuing poverty, may drive these women back into slavery.

World Bank. 2004. "Poverty Analysis: Overview." <http://go.worldbank.org/K7LWQUT9L0>.

Annotation: The World Bank's PovertyNet presents this well-built piece explaining poverty. Far simpler than a set of definitions, it presents methods for measuring poverty, and explains how these methods have changed. PovertyNet presents information on poverty trends, noting wide regional disparities in modern times. The piece also comprehensively discusses the United Nations' Millennium Development Goals and the work that is being done in order to meet the targets set by the United Nations. The structure of the global "attack" on poverty is laid out in a very detailed fashion. When taken as a whole, the article presents a multi-dimensional picture of poverty in the present era.

Zenaida, Agnes. 1999. "Family, Child Labour and Migration: Child Domestic Workers in Metro Manila." *Childhood* 6 (1):57.

Annotation: This case study of child domestic workers in metro Manila, Philippines, highlights and dispels some common stereotypes of child laborers and serves to better explain the motivations of children who seek work in cities. The study reveals that in most cases, children go to work to support their family or siblings. Interestingly, many of the children interviewed responded that they are also working to pay either for their own education or for the education of their siblings. While all of the families of the children involved were indeed living under the poverty line, the study shows that approximately eighty percent of the cases the decision to work was that of the child. This study, the first of its kind, helps to better understand the world of child labor, at least in the Philippines.

Under the Iron Thumb: Forced Labor in Myanmar

By Anil Raj

Introduction

The fight for human rights in Myanmar goes back to its independence in 1948. The Myanmar military (*tatmadaw*) has engaged in shocking violations of almost every right in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The issue of forced labor, however, is of particular concern. Forced labor is employed primarily in development projects, agricultural enterprises, and the military. It is used to impose collective punishment on civilians, to build highly profitable development that strengthens military rule, and to allow the military access and logistical support in the most remote regions of insurgent-occupied territories. Forced labor is a central means by which the *tatmadaw* attempts to control all facets of Burmese society.

Background

Prior to Myanmar's independence, the British had full administrative control over the regions around Yangon (Myanmar's present capital city). The Northern hill tribes, as well as other parts of the border regions, contained ethnic minorities to whom the British Raj granted autonomous rule. At the time of independence, it was a formidable task to unite the two Burmas, and as a response to this problem, authoritarian roots took hold. Some ethnic minorities in the border regions of Burma still continue their insurgency. The country has made fifteen cease-fire agreements with ethnic minority insurgency groups, but by no means have they eliminated the insurgency.

After independence, Burma pursued the "Burmese way to Socialism," which was essentially a failed attempt to create a socialist economic policy platform. The discontent that resulted from these socialist endeavors culminated in the slaughter of some three thousand individuals, when mass demonstrations engulfed the nation on August 8, 1988. Consequentially, Burma opened up the economy to foreign investment, most notably in tourism, the exploitation of natural gas, and other foreign-backed development initiatives.

Politically, the State Law and Order Restoration Council (SLORC, now renamed as the State Peace and Development Council, SPDC) held elections in 1990, where the National League for Democracy (NLD) won over eighty percent of the votes. However, SLORC has refused to turn over power to the NLD. Instead, it has stated that the National Convention would first need to draft a constitution before the newly elected parliament could convene. Myanmar has been politically stagnant at this point ever since.

Forced Labor in Development Projects

International bodies and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have documented forced labor in development projects dealing with a wide array of development initiatives. Arguably, the most unreported use of forced labor has been on the Asian Highway, sponsored by the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP). The Highway is an

ambitious venture that is intended to promote the development of international road transport within the region by linking 32 Asian nations via a 141,000-kilometer network of roads.

In a grave breach of international law, the Myanmar government, along with its proxy armies, has forcibly conscripted local villagers to build part of the highway that crosses into Myanmar's Karen state, as well to dig drainage ditches that run alongside the road. During construction, agricultural land has been confiscated or severely damaged, forcing entire villages into poverty. Many people have been forced to relocate and to seek refuge from future atrocities, frequently in Burma's dense jungles. Not only is the construction of roads conducive to fostering trade and providing income for military rule; it also allows the military to retain control of civilian populations.

The highway project has been funded by a combination of international donors and member states, in addition to receiving implicit funding from the Asia Development Bank (ADB). NGOs such as Earth Rights International have called upon the ADB to cease all forms of funding or logistical support of projects that are fueling human rights violations across Myanmar; yet such calls have failed to stop the funding. To date, the U.N. humanitarian coordinator in Burma, along with ESCAP's transport and tourism director, have continued to deny any allegations of forced labor along the Asian Highway.

The most notorious case of forced labor has taken place during the construction of the Yadana gas pipeline, via a joint venture between France's Total and the United States' Unocal (now Chevron). Because the \$1.2 billion pipeline stretches through insurgent-occupied territory, the government of Myanmar agreed to provide security for Unocal officials. In 1990, the *tatmadaw* began to force the civilian population to provide the preliminary preparation for the pipeline's construction, and marked civilians to provide the labor for the project. Thousands of villagers were forced to cut down trees, dig out stumps, and build barracks and helipads, or risk fatal consequences. Those villagers who refused, attempted to escape, or could not physically manage to sustain the brutal conditions, were subject to beatings, rape, torture, and extra-judicial killings. Even more alarming has been the detailed documentation by several NGOs that entire villages have been razed and/or its inhabitants forcibly relocated in order to make way for construction along the thirty-nine mile stretch of the pipeline.

Military Portering

Another prevalent source of forced labor has been in the form of military porters, as government troops have continued to use members of the civilian population as porters for the military. Men, women, children, and the physically disabled continue to carry large loads of equipment, serve as messengers and guides into hostile enemy territory, assist in setting up military camps, participate in de-mining operations, crop cultivation on military-owned land, and provide food and supplies, with no form of compensation.

There is a positive correlation between development zones and the militarization of these regions. Oftentimes, the SPDC will erect new camps or military outposts along development zones, claiming that such zones must be "protected" from sabotage by ethnic insurgents. Flowing from these policies, villagers residing in development zones become easy targets for forced labor policies.

Such policies also serve as collective punishment and intimidation in ethnic minority regions, which are oftentimes thought to be hotbeds for anti-government activity.

Consequentially, the increased militarization of these zones substantially increases the reach of the military into areas that were once off-limits to government forces. Additionally, the sustained presence of the military often means that civilians will be forcibly conscripted to act as military porters with no compensation, giving them little to no time to take part in paid work, or to tend to their crops. What often ensues, then, are food shortages, sharp declines in health, and humanitarian catastrophes. Such gross and systematic violations arguably amount to crimes against humanity.

Agricultur and Forced Labor

In recent years, Thailand has been pushing for greater trade relations amongst its neighbors. In the process, it has established export-minded special economic zones (SEZ) along the Thai-Burma border. In May of 2007, the two states finalized agreements that would allow Thai agribusinesses to engage in large-scale, tax-free cultivation of Myanmar's ethnically inhabited border regions via investments from China, Thailand, and behind-the-scenes backing from the ADB.

NGOs like the Karen Human Rights Group have documented the human costs of such agri-development projects, most notably forced evictions from targeted cultivation sites, forced labor to construct access roads and harvesting crops, and the use of extortion to force villagers to hand over money which is then used to subsidize the projects themselves. In 2006, the Karen Human Rights Group reported that ethnic Shan farmers along the China-Myanmar border had protested an increase in land confiscations, most notably a 15,000-hectare region for a contract rubber cultivation zone.

Ethnic farmers have also been forced to purchase hybrid rice seeds (*sinn shewli*) from the SPDC and its proxy armies, and from Chinese businesses, in yet another *tatmawdaw* backed initiative, to convert opium fields into rice. This Chinese-funded project has set the stage for Chinese corporations to command the rice production in the Shan ethnic state, which now accounts for over forty percent of rice cultivation within the state. The rice arguably has a better yield, but requires substantially more water, fertilizers, pesticides, and mechanized farming equipment, all of which are nearly non-existent amongst these populations. While the SPDC has maintained that the seeds are free to farmers, human rights monitors argue that farmers are forced to pay for the seeds, which must be bought annually (unlike traditional rice seeds). With the costs for fertilizers and related costs, it has pushed many into debt, where the only means of financial freedom is to sell off the land, or watch it be confiscated forcibly.

Conclusion

The use of forced labor in development zones, military, and agriculture serves only to empower the rule of the *tatmadaw*, economically and politically. Due to the courageous initiatives of human rights activists, accountability for forced labor has been met with some success. Earth Rights International, on behalf of Burmese villagers, filed suit against Unocal for its complicity in the use of

forced labor under the U.S. Alien Tort Claims Act. Unocal eventually settled out of court, but the lawsuit nevertheless set a precedent for future violators. However, formidable challenges remain.

The developing economies of China and India stimulate great appetites for Myanmar's raw resources, most importantly its gas. China has often blocked any meaningful United Nations Security Council resolutions against the tyrannical regime, in order to defend its own economic interests. The International Labor Organization (ILO) has been actively seeking to engage Myanmar, but progress is questionable. In early 2007, the ILO and Myanmar signed an agreement that would have provided victims of forced labor with a mechanism to file complaints. Yet instead of victims' grievances being investigated, they have been met with intimidation and threats by the authorities.

Combating forced labor in Myanmar will require altering the elements by which it is fueled, namely the economic underpinnings that support military rule. It will also require the international community to force Myanmar to remove its veil, and to become transparent as justice is brought to victims. Lastly, strengthening the prosecution of those foreign companies operating in Myanmar and those violating international human rights can, and has, proven to be a deterrent. Finding a way to fund development without exacerbating the human rights situation will be an initiative that major U.N. bodies and affiliated agencies will have to recalculate if current human rights violations are to subside.

Selected Bibliography

Alamgir, Jalal. 1997. "Against the Current: The Survival of Authoritarianism in Burma." *Pacific Affairs, University of British Columbia* 70 (3): 333-350.

Annotation: Alamgir looks at the structural and strategic means by which authoritarianism has survived in Burma. He analyzes various theories that explain the endurance of military rule—modernization, socialism, and nationalism. He attributes military rule to the fact that the military had to hold onto power in order to see the country through the turbulent times that were brought upon by Burma's differing historical eras. The article provides clear insight into the historical and cultural contexts of Burma's authoritarian rule.

ALTSEAN - BURMA. 2006. Forced Labor in Burma: Time For Action.
<http://www.altsean.org/Reports/ForcedLabor.php>.

Annotation: The forced labor situation in Burma has not improved in the six years since the International Labor Organization (ILO) first addressed the issue in November 2000. While the regime has responded to ILO pressure with positive measures, any gains have been lost as soon as pressure has been eased. Most recently, the SPDC failed to comply with the ILO recommendations on forced labor issues made in June 2006.

Amnesty International. 2007. The State of the World's Human Rights 2007.

<http://thereport.amnesty.org/eng/Regions/Asia-Pacific/Myanmar>.

Annotation: Amnesty International continues to report that forced labor is continuing, most notably in the Kayin, Mon, Rakhine, and Kachin states. The vast majority of the reported forced labor in 2007 was in the form of military portering. Despite pressure from the ILO, Myanmar authorities have failed to cooperate with ILO authorities in prosecuting violators; however authorities did promise a six-month moratorium on the prosecution of those making complaints about forced labor.

Chamber, Rachael. 2005. The Unocal Settlement. *Labor Rights*,

http://www.laborrights.org/press/Unocal/settlement_humanrightsbrief_0106.pdf.

Annotation: This report provides a comparative analysis of the legal settlements between Unocal and Khulumani. Both were cases brought against multi-national corporations (MNCs) for their complicity in gross human rights violations. However, the understandings of what complicity means before the court in these two cases were very different. The report ultimately bases the differing interpretations on the political alignment, either liberal or conservative, of the judges serving the Supreme Court at the time of these cases. In the long run, the Unocal settlement has served as a landmark decision, and has set a precedent for holding MNCs responsible for human rights violations abroad. However, the differences between the cases have made the accountability of MNCs relatively unclear, and still in need of clarification.

CIA World Factbook. CIA World Factbook - Burma.

<https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/bm.html#Econ>.

Annotation: The CIA World Factbook provides key statistics on a host of areas including foreign direct investment, gross domestic product, natural resources, trade/export outputs, life expectancy, infant mortality, and others. These are all key indicators of economic, social, and political life in Burma.

Clapp, Prascilla A., ed. 2007. Burma: Poster Child for Entrenched Repression. Edited by R. I. Rotberg, *Worst of the Worst*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press.

Annotation: In this edited volume, the author's chapter on Burma provides a succinct overview of history, policy, and the nature of authoritarian rule in Burma. The author traces authoritarian rule in Burma to its colonial past, the military's domination over its economy, and the sheer power and penetration by the state into Burmese society. It also documents dire human rights conditions in Burma, most notably the restrictions on freedom of speech, religion, forced labor, and censorship.

Earth Rights International. 2005. "Another Snake in the Jungle? Shwe Gas development in Western Burma." *Earth Rights International*,
http://www.earthrights.org/files/Reports/another_snake_in_the_jungle.pdf.

Annotation: Earth Rights International presents the case of the Shwe gas development, potentially the largest natural gas development in the country, and the one with the largest return on its investment. The report is detailed and comprehensive, providing maps, photography, and other "hard" evidence to support the claims of gross human rights violations. The main concern is that such projects have all the indicators of human rights and environmental disaster, similar to the projects by which they have been preceded, most notably the Unocal Yadana pipeline. Energy hungry China and India are fighting for development rights, but ignoring the consequences that may arise will force all parties involved to bare the cost of destruction.

Earth Rights International. 2006. "Gas Politics: Shwe Gas Development in Burma." *Earth Rights International*,
http://www.earthrights.org/files/Reports/gas_politics_shwe_gas_development_in_burma.pdf.

Annotation: Earth Rights International analyzes the politics, economics, and human rights concerns behind what could possibly be Burma's large gas line. With China, India, South Korea, and Thailand all as possible investors, there is no lack in resources or will to develop the project, which would potentially bring in \$18 billion over the life of the Shwe gas deposit. Needless to say, the profits would be stuffed into the pockets of the ruling military, while thousands would be plagued by forced displacement, murder, forced labor, land confiscation, and environmental degradation.

Earth Rights International. 2007. The ADB's Legitimization of Burma's Military Junta.
http://www.earthrights.org/images/stories/adb_legitimization-4.30.07.pdf.

Annotation: Earth Rights International presents the background and substance behind the finances that drive development projects in Myanmar, which oftentimes end up as violations of forced labor and other gross human rights. Earth Rights International presents the role of the Asia Development Bank in providing the funds that are intended for projects such as the Asian Highway and the Ta Sang Dam. The report calls on the ADB to cease providing any assistance, and not to resume relations until democracy is restored.

Eviatar, Daphne. 2003. "Unocal's Pipeline in Burma Becomes a Test Case in Corporate Accountability." *The Nation Magazine*,
http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Oil_watch/ProfitGunpoint_UnocalBurma.html.

Annotation: This article delves into the issue of forced labor and murder in the case of Unocal and Total's Yadana gas pipeline project. More specifically, the author examines the legal battle that Unocal now faces in California courts, having been sued by Burmese victims of the project, who are backed by several NGOs under the U.S. Alien Tort Claims Act. Former Attorney

General John Ashcroft has expressed dissent over the court battle and the use of the Alien Tort Claims Act because it supposedly undermines U.S. foreign policy and its war on terror initiative. He has even argued that previous use of the legislation has been “wrong.” Unocal has asked the State Department to intervene and dismiss the case, as was previously done by a suit brought against Exxon Mobil.

Federation of Trade Unions - Burma. 2007. Forced Labor in Union of Burma.

<http://www.ftub.org/files/ForcedLabour.php>.

Annotation: The Federation of Trade Unions - Burma (FTUB) highlights ongoing human rights violations in Burma relating to labor rights and working conditions. The FTU has documented reports of individual cases of forced labor, engaged in dialogue with the International Labor Organization (ILO) over rights violations, and has pushed for the ILO and other members of the international community to place pressure on Burmese authorities over human rights conditions. The report presented here documents the status of forced labor in Burma, and provides three options that can be employed to combat forced labor: compulsory International Court of Justice (ICJ) jurisdiction, an advisory ICJ opinion, or the establishment of a tribunal under the ILO jurisdiction.

Free Burma Rangers. 2007. “Burma Army Persecution Forces People to Flee and Beatings Paralyze One Man in Chin State, Western Burma.”

<http://www.freeburmarangers.org/Reports/2007/20071016.html>.

Annotation: In this report by Free Burma Rangers, the authors present the findings of four interviews conducted in Burma’s Chin State. The interviews highlight abuses of forced labor, extortion, rape, beatings, extra-judicial killings, refugees, and ill-treatment, all due to the policies and presence of the Burmese army in civilian territories. The report also contains pictures and testimony from victims of the abuses documented within the interviews. The report lacks analysis, but it provides detailed accounts of atrocities ongoing in the State.

Human Rights Watch. 2001. “Burma Still Using Forced Labor.”

<http://hrw.org/english/docs/2001/06/12/burma181.htm>.

Annotation: Human Rights Watch (HRW) has documented the violations of forced labor standards in Burma. HRW reports that thus far, no one has been prosecuted of violations of forced labor laws under section 374 of Burma's penal code. HRW reports that people as young as ten years old have been victims of forced labor. Moreover, they are routinely beaten, tortured, and threatened with death if they do not comply, or if they attempt to escape. HRW urges the Myanmar authorities to cooperate with the ILO and other independent monitors, and urges the international community to keep up pressure.

Human Rights Watch. 2007. "Burma: Natural Gas Project Threatens Human Rights."
<http://www.hrw.org/english/docs/2007/03/24/burma15557.htm>.

Annotation: Human Rights Watch expresses concern over a proposed plan to build gas pipelines through ventures with Indian and South Korean firms. Such ventures in the past have led to serious violations of human rights such as land confiscation, forced labor, and murder. Profits from gas exports are directly funding the Burmese junta, which is a regime that has one of the poorest human rights records worldwide. Human Rights Watch calls on these foreign firms, along with the Burmese junta, to uphold all ethical business practices and international human rights norms.

International Crisis Group. 2006. "Myanmar: New Threats to Humanitarian Aid."
<http://www.crisisgroup.org/home/index.cfm?id=4565&l=1>.

Annotation: This report highlights the different obstacles that Myanmar has created against allowing humanitarian aid to enter the country. While the dire human rights and humanitarian situation in Myanmar continues, the government is placing greater restrictions on aid agencies, forcing some key ones to pull out. Groups abroad have also placed pressure on aid agencies not to operate, which has only exacerbated the morbid conditions. Ethnic minority populations are increasingly vulnerable, as the government is continuing their military operations whilst tightening their grip on aid agencies attempting to operate in the areas. The International Crisis Group warns that such a move could lead to greater social and political instability within the country.

International Labour Organization. 2005. "Developments concerning the question of the observance by the Government of Myanmar of the Forced Labor Convention, 1930 (No. 29)."
<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/relm/gb/docs/gb294/pdf/gb-6-2.pdf>.

Annotation: The International Labour Organization's (ILO) report provides a detailed account of forced labor issues in Myanmar. It examines the cooperation of Myanmar authorities, their relative lack and failure to cooperate, individual cases, and policy recommendations. Most notably, the ILO reports that when victims file complaints of forced labor, they are often met with threats from the authorities in order to discourage further complaints. These threats have even been sent to the Liaison Officer of the ILO. The ILO encourages Myanmar to remain a member of the ILO in the face of threats that Myanmar may opt to withdraw its membership.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2005. "Nyaunglebin District: Food Supplies Destroyed, Villagers Forcibly Displaced, and Region-wide Forced Labour as SPDC Forces Seek Control Over Civilians." <http://www.khrg.org/khrg2005/khrg05f4.html>.

Annotation: This report presents evidence of the SPDC using people in relocation sites and villages they control as forced labor to strengthen the network of roads and Army camps - the main tools of military control over the civilian population—while Army officers plunder

people's belongings for personal gain. In both hills and plains, increased militarization is bringing on food shortages and poverty.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2005. "Toungoo District: Civilians Displaced by Dams, Roads, and Military Control." <http://www.khrg.org/khrg2005/khrg05f7.html>.

Annotation: 'Development' as implemented by the SPDC in Toungoo District of northern Karen State means dams, roads, military camps, and relocation sites. This report gives examples of how dams and roads are restricting the movement of civilians, bringing more forced labour to villages, and bringing more extortion and taxation to the people. New military camps are confiscating hundreds of acres of productive farmland. Villagers are being forced to fill military roles as sentries for roads and military installations. Forced relocation sites are depriving people not only of their homes and fields, but more importantly of their freedom to support themselves.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2006. "Forced Labour, Extortion and the State of Education in Dooplaya District." <http://www.khrg.org/khrg2007/khrg07f8.html>.

Annotation: The Karen River Watch group documents human rights violations being committed in the Karen (Kayin) minority region on the Burma-Thai border. Forced labor is reported as a tool of the military junta to not only obtain free labor, but also as a means of subjugating ethnic minority populations that have high levels of insurgency. Such blanket policies force gross and systematic violations of human rights on civilians as a means of deterring the insurgency.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2006. "Surviving in Shadow: Widespread Militarization and the Systematic Use of Forced Labour in the Campaign for Control of Thaton District." <http://www.khrg.org/khrg2006/khrg0601a.htm>.

Annotation: This report examines the role of militarization in facilitating human rights violations in the Thaton District. The villagers are regularly called upon to fulfill the unrelenting array of demands for forced labor, building materials, food, and money. The military government, along with breakaway factions of armed groups that have signed cease-fire agreements with government troops, are conscripting villagers into forced labor. Military camps have been built in the region, placing great restrictions on the movement of villagers. Food shortages have also proven problematic.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2007. "Development by Decree: The Politics of Poverty and Control in Karen State." <http://www.khrg.org/khrg2007/khrg0701.html>.

Annotation: The report highlights the ongoing militarization of the Karen State by the State Peace and Development Council (SPDC), Myanmar's military government. By building grand development projects in the state, villagers have often had to provide the labor and resources for

construction. While the government maintains that these development projects are beneficial and are supported by the local people, it is argued in this report that these projects are simply another means for state military to gain access to remote regions, control civilian life, and extend its rule.

Karen Human Rights Group. 2007. "State Repression and the Creation of Poverty in Southern Karen State." <http://khrig.org/khrig2007/khrig07f2.html>.

Annotation: The Karen Human Rights Group presents a report on forced labor in Burma. It is a well-documented account, which uses testimonials from victims and researchers stationed inside Burma. It also provides solid background information on the issues underlying the human rights violations specific to Burma.

Karen River Watch. 2004. "Damming At Gunpoint." <http://www.salweenwatch.org/downloads/Damming-at-gunpoint.pdf>.

Annotation: The Karen River Watch group documents human rights violations that are being committed in the Karen (Kayin) minority region on the Burma-Thai border, most specifically pertaining to the construction of dams.

Landmine Monitor. 2005. Burma (Myanmar), Landmine Monitor Report 2005. <http://www.icbl.org/lm/2005/burma.html>.

Annotation: The Landmine Monitor provides a well-documented report on Myanmar's landmine conditions. The Landmine Monitor reports that the Burmese Army light infantry brigade 439 is alleged to have forcibly conscripted civilians to act as porters for the military in landmine de-mining operations. This process has inevitably led to civilian amputations, serious injuries, and even death. Rehabilitation of landmine victims, although improving, is still severely lacking due to the neglect of civilian populations across the country.

Loveman, Alisa. 2006. "Burma Activists Reject Weakening of Safeguard Standards at the Asia Development Bank." http://www.earthrights.org/burmafeature/adb_continues_to_promote_harmful_infrastructure_projects_in_burma.html.

Annotation: This press release by Earth Rights International documents a growing concern of accountability and transparency over funding and support for development projects that use forced labor and forced relocations of populations within the state. International organizations, most notably the Asia Development Bank (ADB), are continuing to provide technical and monetary support for development initiatives that only exacerbate human rights violations in Burma. The ADB estimates that it spends \$59,482 per year to attend conferences and

workshops. Earth Rights International has repeatedly called for the ADB to stop funding projects that are known to be complicit in human rights violations.

Marwaan, Macan-Markar. 2007. "BURMA: Asia Highway to Disaster?" *International Press Service*, <http://ipsnews.net/news.asp?idnews=37499>.

Annotation: This article documents the alleged use of forced labor along the Asian Highway Project that has been sponsored by the U.N. Economic and Social Commission for the Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP). The segment of the road that cuts through Myanmar has reportedly been built via forced labor, land confiscation, and through other violations of human rights. Unfortunately, U.N. officials have responded to the allegations as though they were either unaware of such occurrences, or have denied any such findings. Furthermore, regions that are in desperate need of humanitarian assistance have been left to fend for themselves, as aid agencies have been restricted from serving certain vulnerable populations.

Matthews, Bruce. 1998. "The Present Fortune of Tradition-Bound Authoritarianism in Myanmar." Vol. 71, *Pacific Affairs*, University of British Columbia.

Annotation: This article seeks to understand authoritarianism in Burma through the lens of political culture. The author examines the persistence of authoritarian rule in Burma by examining the contribution of Burmese culture and history, which include its historical military dominance and loyalty within the military. However, the article indicates that due to changing economic and social conditions, authoritarianism is ending slowly.

Matthews, Bruce, ed. 2001. The Legacy of Tradition and Authority: Buddhism and the Nation in Myanmar. Edited by I. Harris, *Buddhism and Politics in Twentieth Century Asia*. Continuum International Publishing Group. New York.

Annotation: Bruce Matthews looks at the ways in which culture, and more specifically, Buddhist culture, has played a role in the survival of authoritarianism in Myanmar. His argument is that Buddhism was oftentimes the common factor that linked the people of Myanmar together in its early stages of independence, which gave rise to many ethnic separatist movements. Secondly, Matthews sheds light on the political activism with which the Buddhist sangha was involved throughout its history. He notes that in the decades following military rule, the role of Buddhism has diminished significantly, although it still remains important within the civilian population.

McCarthy, Stephen. 2000. "Ten Years of Chaos in Burma: Foreign Investment and Economic Liberalization under the SLORC-SPDC, 1988-1998." *Pacific Affairs*, University of British Columbia 73 (2): 233-262.

Annotation: This article reviews the economic policies of the ruling military government of Myanmar. It traces Burma from its days of socialism to its current era of foreign investment and

economic liberalization. It examines the laws that were employed that allowed for foreign investment and economic liberalization, and ultimately argues that the government's liberalization initiatives failed due to shortsightedness and misguided policymaking.

McCoy, Clifford. 2007. "Capitalizing the Thai-Burma Border." *Asia Times Online*, http://www.atimes.com/atimes/Southeast_Asia/IF21Ae02.html.

Annotation: *Asia Times* highlights the ongoing problem of forced labor and forced evictions in Burma. Myanmar and Thai officials are creating large-scale farms that would allow for the confiscation of local ethnic farmers' lands, which would force the farmers to farm commercial farms. Farmers are given no compensation, and some of have been displaced and forced to seek placement in refugee camps along the Thai-Burma border.

McCoy Clifford. 2007. "Seedlings of Evil Growing in Myanmar." *Asia Times Online*, http://www.atimes.com/atimes/Southeast_Asia/IH23Ae01.html.

Annotation: This article speaks to yet another military-backed economic endeavor that is intended to bring about development and profit for the country at large costs for the civilian populations. Through a joint venture, mainly through Chinese investors, villagers are being forced to buy and cultivate hybrid rice seeds. Due to the costs of fertilizers, pesticides, and mechanized farming tools that these seeds require, farmers cannot afford to operate. Many are finding themselves in debt, and thus are forced to sell their lands or risk its confiscation by government authorities.

Migdal, Joel S., Atul Kohli, and Vivienne Shue. 1994. State Power and Social Forces: Domination and Transformation in the Third World. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Annotation: The authors of this article examine the role of the 'state' in the developing world. Their main argument is that the state and society have a recursive relationship, influencing each other constantly. However, it is ultimately the state that is the principal subject in the international community.

National Coalition of the Union of Burma, Human Rights Documentation Unit. 2006. "Chapter 1: Forced Labor and Forced Conscription." <http://www.ibiblio.org/obl/docs4/HRDU2006-CD/labour.html>.

Annotation: This is a comprehensive report that documents all aspects of forced labor issues in Myanmar through the government-in-exile. The report documents serious cases of forced labor due to the conscription of military porters, forced labor in development projects, and forced convict labor. It also provides a detailed list of forced labor victims and their villages, Myanmar's negotiations with the International Labor Organization, and forced labor incidents within each state.

Burma Human Rights Yearbook 2006. 2006. "Chapter 3: Arbitrary Detention, Enforced and Involuntary Disappearances." <http://www.ibiblio.org/obl/docs4/HRDU2006-CD/arrest.html>.

Annotation: This is another comprehensive report that documents all aspects of forced labor issues in Myanmar through the government-in-exile. The report documents serious cases of forced labor due to the conscription of military porters, forced labor in development projects, and forced convict labor. It also provides a detailed list of forced labor victims and their villages, Myanmar's negotiations with the International Labor Organization, and forced labor incidents within each state.

Parker, Clive. 2006. "Naypyidaw: A Dusty Work in Progress." http://www.irrawaddy.org/article.php?art_id=6427.

Annotation: The Irrawaddy reports that the new capital city of Naypyidaw has been partly built on the backs of local villagers, without pay or compensation. Since construction first started, some 2,800 alleged victims have filed formal complaints to the International Labor Organization for acts of forced labor. Laborers were largely responsible for building military camps for three army battalions and an air force battalion. Additionally, villages were forced to provide roofing and construction materials for the projects. The International Labor Organization is fearful that victims will be persecuted in retaliation for filing the complaints.

Rotberg, Robert I., ed. 2007. Worst of the Worst. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press.

Annotation: The chapter on Myanmar, presented by Prascilla Clapp, briefly describes the incidents of forced labor in Burma. Forced labor is mainly used by the local military authority to expand their reach into dense jungle locations, to porter military supplies, and to provide other military services. Nonetheless, in 2005, several local military officers were charged with violations of forced labor and were sentenced to sixteen months in jail. This is the only known example accountability for forced labor practices in Myanmar.

Selth, Andrew. 2002. Burma's Armed Forces: Power Without Glory. Norwalk: Eastbridge.

Annotation: Selt describes the history, formation, development, role, and policies of the Burmese military. He seeks to understand the pivotal role that the Burmese military has played in Burmese society, especially in keeping tight control over Burmese society. He also seeks to explain and understand the army's ambitions, as it remains a powerful presence in the region.

Soros, George. Country In Crisis - Human Rights. <http://www3.soros.org/burma/CRISIS/hr.html>.

Annotation: Soros provides a general overview of the human rights conditions in Myanmar. Specifically, the article notes the violations of forced labor in ethnic minority regions where

forced labor persists in the form of military pottering, serving as a policy-like tactic to discourage ethnic insurgencies. It is also prevalent in the southeast regions, where UNOCAL and Total and building their pipelines. The synopsis also addresses the International Labor Organization's attempts to work with the authorities, and acknowledges Burma's lack of sincere cooperation in dealing with the matter. The website has live links to a host of other organizations working on human rights in Burma.

Thomson, Curtis N. 1995. "Political Stability and Minority Groups in Burma." *Geographical Reviews* 85 (3): 269-285.

Annotation: This journal article explains the many challenges facing ethnic minorities in Burma. It traces their present discontent back to colonial times. Thomson states that because the minorities are so fragmented in their desires, goals, needs, and language, it will be very hard for ethnic minorities in Burma to reach a collective bargain with the military. Although they share a common enemy, there has been too much splintering amongst the ethnic groups themselves. To conclude, Thomson sets out criteria that need to be met in order for the ethnic groups to reach their goals within Burmese society.

United Nations Human Rights Council. 2007. "Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Situation of Human Rights in Myanmar, Paulo Sergio Pinheiro." <http://daccessdds.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G07/107/31/PDF/G0710731.pdf?OpenElement>.

Annotation: This U.N. document provides testimony from the U.N. Special Rapporteur (SR) to Myanmar on a variety of human rights issues. Most notably, it states that issues of forced labor have been reported in the country, and although the Myanmar government has said it would investigate such crimes, impunity prevails. Moreover, without access into the country, the SR can neither confirm nor deny these allegations; meanwhile, the Myanmar government continues to claim that such reports are invalid. The report ends with recommendations to implement International Labor Organization recommendations to end forced labor.

United States Government Accountability Office. 2007. "International Organizations: Assistance Programs Constrained in Burma." <http://www.gao.gov/new.items/d07457.pdf>.

Annotation: This U.S. report lists the restrictions that the Burmese government has placed on international organizations, thus impeding their work. It addresses in particular the areas of labor and prison conditions.

United States Department of Labor, Bureau of International Labor Affairs. 1998. "Report on Labor Practices in Burma." <http://www.dol.gov/ilab/media/reports/ofr/burma1998/main.htm#ES>.

Annotation: The 1998 U.S. Department of Labor report is a comprehensive documentation of labor issues, violations, practices, and policies of Myanmar (Burma). Although this document is a bit outdated, it provides valuable insights into labor issues and violations on Burma, including forced labor for a variety of infrastructure and development projects, while at the same time providing an overview of applicable international laws.

Wellner, Pamela. 1994. "A Pipeline Killing Field: Exploitation of Burma's Natural Gas." *The Ecologist* 24 (5): 189.

Annotation: The author describes how development projects, as in the case of the Yadana oil line that was funded by European, U.S., and regional powers, have led to massive human rights violations and environmental degradation. Such development projects have forcibly removed villagers, and have harmed rare species in vast rain forests. The author documents working conditions in these labor projects, in addition to addressing environmental and ecological degradation.

Wilkison, Roger. 2006. "UN Labor Agency Considers Taking Burma to International Court over Forced Labor." *Voice of America*, <http://www.voanews.com/tibetan/archive/2006-11/2006-11-17-voa2.cfm>.

Annotation: After six years of no progress in talks between the International Labor Organization (ILO) and the government of Burma, the ILO in 2006 prepared to submit the case over to the U.N. Security Council. There, the Security Council could decide to send the case to the jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court (ICC) as well as the International Court of Justice. If sent to the ICC, the issue of forced labor could be tried under the ICC's jurisdiction over crimes against humanity and war crimes.